

Agenda
Pretrial Release & Supervision Committee Meeting
January 5, 2017
12:00 – 2:00 p.m.

Administrative Office of the Courts
Scott M. Matheson Courthouse
450 South State Street

Executive Dining Room, 1st Floor, W18A

12:00	Welcome and Approval of Minutes	Discussion	Tab 1	Judge Paige Petersen
12:05	Update on PSA and Harvard Study	Discussion		Keisa Williams
1:05	Rule Amendments – Time to File Information	Discussion		Brent Johnson Judge Brendan McCullagh
1:45	Subcommittee Direction	Discussion	Tab 3	Keisa Williams
2:00	Adjourn			

Meeting Schedule:

March 16, 2017 (Council Room)
May 4, 2017 (Exec. Dining Room)
July 6, 2017 (Council Room)
September 7, 2017 (Exec. Dining Room)
November 2, 2017 (Exec. Dining Room)

Tab 1

Pretrial Release and Supervision Committee

Matheson Courthouse
Council room
450 South State St.
Salt Lake City, Utah 84111

November 3, 2016

Draft

Members Present

Judge Paige Petersen- Chair
Brett Barratt
Wayne Carlos
Patrick Corum
Judge George Harmond
Robert Hilder
Senator Hillyard
Brent Johnson
Pat Kimball
Judge Brendan McCullagh
Rick Schwermer
Judge Todd Shaughnessy
Jennifer Valencia
Sheriff Jim Winder

Staff

Keisa L. Williams
Jeni Wood - recording secretary

Members Excused

Representative Eric Hutchings
Judge Angela Fannesbeck
Adam Trupp
Judge Rick Romney

Guests

Judge Matthew Bates
Dan Becker
Ray Wahl
Kim Allard
Tom Langhorne
Zachary Dal Pra
Billie Grobe
Chris Griffin
Shane Bahr

(1) Welcome.

Judge Paige Peterson welcomed the committee to the meeting. Judge Peterson introduced herself as the new chair of this committee. The committee then addressed the September 8, 2016 minutes. With one change (changing minimize to maximize), Rick Schwermer moved to approve the minutes. Judge Brendan McCullagh seconded the motion. The motioned carried unanimously. The three members from the Arnold Foundation were introduced: Zachary Dal Pra, Chris Griffin, and Billie Grobe.

(2) Laura and John Arnold Foundation PSA Tool Overview.

Zachary Dal Pra presented information on the Arnold Foundation, the creation and validation of the Public Safety Assessment (PSA), criminal pretrial statistics throughout the country, etc. A 2-year study has been completed showing that when low-risk defendants spend just a day or two in jail, their recidivism rates are much higher than those released immediately.

The committee wondered if there was a way to create pretrial services for smaller, more rural counties. Mr. Dal Pra stated yes, that most of the smaller counties in Arizona have pretrial service programs, with supervision and reporting. Mr. Dal Pra stated that there have been multiple studies proving the effectiveness of simple court reminders or call-ins, on appearance rates. However, there isn't a general consensus on whether call-ins to live people vs. automated systems are more successful.

Mr. Dal Pra said, as always, it's important to remember these people are not convicted. Some of the monitoring items can be phone-in for lower risk defendants or reporting in person depending on the risk score. The other options are alcohol monitoring, ankle monitors, or even house-arrest.

Mr. Dal Pra said the Arnold Foundation will work with the committee's working-group to create the decision framework that will accompany the PSA. The defendant's score determines what type of monitoring will be recommended.

Mr. Dal Pra said there isn't an interview component to the PSA. That instead, the information is static and pulled from various databases. Dan Becker asked how many jurisdictions have been given access to the PSA, but are not using it appropriately. Mr. Dal Pra said there isn't a study on how many judges are using the tools given.

Brent Johnson asked why violence against property isn't included in the PSA risk factors. Mr. Dal Pra explained that it wasn't deemed as predictive as the 9 factors ultimately included. The risk factors include: age, current violent offense, pending charge at the time of offense, prior misdemeanor or felony convictions (these are only yes or no, they do not count each conviction), prior failure to appear, and prior sentence to incarceration. It was asked whether the sentence was suspended or not. Mr. Dal Pra stated that it doesn't matter whether the sentence was suspended or not. Judge Peterson asked about the date of filings in comparison to new charges. Mr. Dal Pra said that it's based on the filing date not the date of the crime. Judge Brendan McCullagh asked what defines failure to appear. Mr. Dal Pra stated only pretrial failures to appear are counted.

Mr. Dal Pra explained to the committee that the ultimate goal is to automate the system so a live person does not need to populate or score the PSA. Keisa Williams mentioned that Ron Bowmaster has met with various entities and believes that our court system can fully automate this program.

Mr. Dal Pra stated there are four steps: 1) complete the PSA; 2) determine if any charges or circumstances are present in which the majority of the time a recommendation of detention would be appropriate regardless of the risk (these are the serious offenses such as murder, rape, robbery, abduction). If the defendant is a violent offender, they should not be released; 3) if the defendant is eligible for release, the outcome depends on the type of pretrial services available in each jurisdiction; and 4) determine if any charges or circumstances are present that would need an increase in the risk level (these are domestic violence, stalking, etc.).

Judge Shaughnessy asked about over-supervision. Mr. Dal Pra stated that over-supervision is a common problem for new pretrial programs. Studies show more failures when a defendant is over-supervised. Judges will need to be trained to prevent over-supervision.

Senator Lyle Hillyard asked how this would all work as far as defendants who might be suicidal or other civil commitments that a judge believes are necessary for mental health reasons. Mr. Dal Pra stated that the PSA is not validated to assess those situations.

Mr. Dal Pra next discussed implementation. He stated the purpose of this visit was to determine Utah's unique strengths and weaknesses. The group will then prepare a report for the Arnold Foundation recommending whether Utah should be granted access to the PSA and including any necessary requirements for implementation. Once the MOU is drafted, negotiated and signed, JSP will begin the implementation process. This would start by training, identifying violent offenses and customizing a decision-making framework.

Mr. Carlos asked if the Foundation has approached the bail industry to see what impact this would have. Mr. Dal Pra stated he has not and does not know if the Foundation has discussed this or not. What he does know is that the Foundation does not want monetary bail included in the decision matrix.

Mr. Dal Pra was thanked for his time.

(3) PSA Randomized Control Trial

Chris Griffin was welcomed. Mr. Griffin said that the Harvard Access to Justice Lab has received a grant from the Arnold Foundation to study the effectiveness of the PSA. This would be accomplished through a randomized control trial (RCT). On the same date the PSA is implemented, the RCT would begin. Mr. Griffin stated judges would receive the PSA in a completely random manner – for example, judges would only receive the PSA for odd-numbered cases. The study would last approximately 2 years and would assess the effectiveness of the PSA in Utah specifically. In Utah, it has been determined that if Utah participates in the RCT, the trial would be conducted in 2nd and 4th districts only.

The committee discussed how the RCT might affect the rights of those for whom a PSA is not provided. Mr. Griffin stated that while the PSA has been validated to predict FTA and recidivism, its effectiveness as compared to the effectiveness of a pretrial program alone has not been studied. No scientific benefit has been proven, especially in regard to Utah specifically. Therefore, there would not be an equal protection violation for those who do not receive the PSA unless and until we can prove the PSA provides a benefit to defendants.

Dan Becker asked if the Foundation was paying the various states to do studies. Mr. Griffin said some counties have received limited funding. Those are primarily counties that are in need of assistance. He said the goal is not to cost the states money.

Mr. Griffin said the judges are the test subjects in the RCT. Patrick Corum stated from a defense standpoint the concern isn't the person who gets the PSA, but it's the person who doesn't. Judge McCullagh asked whether an issue would arise if a judge didn't follow the recommendations of the PSA, especially if the defense attorneys and prosecutors have access to the report. Mr. Griffin said the court has discretion to make a determination outside the recommendations of the PSA. The RCT will track those decisions for accuracy.

(4) Other Business.

The next meeting was scheduled for January 5, 2017. There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 2:09 pm.

Tab 2

Pretrial Release & Supervision Committee
Data Collection Subcommittee

Updated January 3, 2017

Keisa Williams, STAFF Associate General Counsel Administrative Office of the Court 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel: (801) 578-3821 keisaw@utcourts.gov	*Judge Angela Fannesbeck - CHAIR First District Juvenile Court 135 North 100 West Logan, UT 84321 Tel: (435) 750-1300 afannesbeck@utcourts.gov	Ron Bowmaster Director, Information Technology Administrative Office of the Court 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel: (801) 578-3872 ronb@utcourts.gov
Patty Fox Internal Services Manager Salt Lake County Criminal Justice Services 145 East 1300 South Suite #501 Salt Lake City, UT 84115 Tel: (385) 468-3512 pfox@slco.org	*Judge George Harmond Seventh District Court 149 East 100 South Price, UT 84501 Tel: (435) 636-3400 gmharmond@utcourts.gov	*Senator Lyle Hillyard 320 State Capitol P.O. Box 145115 Salt Lake City, Utah 84114 Tel: (435) 752-2610 lhillyard@le.utah.gov
Heather Marshall Information Analyst Administrative Office of the Court 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel: (801) 578-3825 heathermn@utcourts.gov	Dave Nicoll Internal Services Manager Salt Lake County Criminal Justice Services 145 East 1300 South Suite #501 Salt Lake City, UT 84115 Tel: (385) 468-3452 dnicoll@slco.org	Clayson Quigley District Court Program Admin. Administrative Office of the Court 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel: (801) 578-3938 claysonq@utcourts.gov
*Sheriff Jim Winder Salt Lake County 3415 South 900 West Salt Lake City, Utah 84119 Tel: (385) 468-9762 jwinder@slco.org		

*Member of Pretrial Release & Supervision Committee

**Pretrial Release & Supervision Committee
Legal & Processes Subcommittee**

Updated January 3, 2017

<p>Keisa Williams, STAFF Associate General Counsel Administrative Office of the Court 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel: (801) 578-3821 keisaw@utcourts.gov</p>	<p>*Brent Johnson - CHAIR General Counsel Administrative Office of the Court 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel: (801) 578-3884 brentj@utcourts.gov</p>	<p>*Bret Barratt Deputy Commissioner Utah Insurance Department State Office Bldg, Ste 3110 Capitol Hill Complex 450 N State St Salt Lake City, UT 84114-6901 Tel: (801) 538-3870 bbarratt@utah.gov</p>
<p>*Wayne Carlos President, Utah Association of Professional Bondsmen and Agents (UAPBA) 2632 S 2975 W West Haven, UT 84401 Tel: (801) 392-1088 uapba@q.com</p>	<p>Roger Hayes Aladdin Bail Bond Representative Triton Management Services, LLC 1000 Aviara Parkway, Suite #300 Carlsbad, CA 92011 Office: (760) 431-9911 Cell: (713) 416-7874 roger.hayes@tritonmsllc.com</p>	<p>*Robert Hilder Summit County Attorney 60 N. Main St. P.O. Box 128 Coalville, UT 84017 Tel: (435) 336-3209 rhilder@summitcounty.org</p>
<p>Brad Jenkins Chair – Utah Bailbond Oversight Board A Sportsmans Bail Bonds 3363 South 700 West Salt Lake City, UT 84119 Tel: (801) 262-6060 bailbond@comcast.net</p>	<p>*Judge Brendan McCullagh West Valley Justice Court 3636 South Constitution Blv West Valley City, Utah 84119 Tel: (801) 963-3590 bmccullagh@utcourts.gov</p>	<p>*Jennifer Valencia Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice Utah State Capitol, Senate Bldg., Suite 330 P.O. Box 142330 Salt Lake City, UT 84114 Tel: (801) 538-1645 jvalencia@utah.gov</p>

*Member of Pretrial Release & Supervision Committee

Pretrial Release & Supervision Committee
Risk Assessment Tool and Monitoring Program Subcommittee

Updated January 3, 2017

Keisa Williams, STAFF Associate General Counsel Administrative Office of the Court 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel: (801) 578-3821 keisaw@utcourts.gov	*Patrick Corum, CHAIR Salt Lake Legal Defenders Association 424 E 500 S # 300 Salt Lake City, UT 84111 Tel: (801) 532-5444 pcorum@sllda.com	Judge Matthew Bates Third District Court 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel: (801) 238-7378 mbates@utcourts.gov
Dan Becker State Court Administrator Administrative Office of the Court 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel: (801) 578-3807 danb@utcourts.gov	*Representative Eric Hutchings Utah House of Representatives 350 North State, Suite 350 P.O. Box 145030 Salt Lake City, Utah 84114 Tel: (801) 538-1029 ehutchings@le.utah.gov	*Pat Kimball Director, Salt Lake County Pretrial Services 145 East 1300 South Suite #501 Salt Lake City, UT 84115 Tel: (385) 468-3500 pkimball@slco.org
Debra Moore District Court Administrator Administrative Office of the Court 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel: (801) 578-3971 debram@utcourts.gov	*Judge Rick Romney Provo City Justice Court 75 East 1700 South Provo, Utah 84606 Tel: 801-852-6878, 801-852-7177 rromney@utcourts.gov	*Rick Schwermer Assistant Court Administrator Administrative Office of the Court 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel: (801) 578-3816 ricks@utcourts.gov
*Adam Trupp Utah Association of Counties 5397 South Vine Street Murray, UT 84107 Tel: (801) 265-1331 adam@uacnet.org	Doreen Weyland JRI Coordinator State Capitol Complex Senate Building Suite 330 PO Box 142330 SLC UT 84114-2330 Tel: (801) 538-1323 dweyland@utah.gov	

*Member of Pretrial Release & Supervision Committee