Draft: February 22, 2017

1 Rule 37. Statement of discovery issues: Sanctions: Failure to admit, to attend deposition or to 2 preserve evidence. 3 (a) Statement of discovery issues. 4 (a)(1) A party or the person from whom discovery is sought may request that the judge enter an 5 order regarding any discovery issue, including: 6 (a)(1)(A) failure to disclose under Rule 26; 7 (a)(1)(B) extraordinary discovery under Rule 26; 8 (a)(1)(C) a subpoena under Rule 45; 9 (a)(1)(D) protection from discovery; or 10 (a)(1)(E) compelling discovery from a party who fails to make full and complete discovery. 11 (a)(2) Statement of discovery issues length and content. The statement of discovery issues 12 must be no more than 4 pages, not including permitted attachments, and must include in the following 13 order: 14 (a)(2)(A) the relief sought and the grounds for the relief sought stated succinctly and with 15 particularity; 16 (a)(2)(B) a certification that the requesting party has in good faith conferred or attempted to 17 confer with the other affected parties in person or by telephone in an effort to resolve the dispute 18 without court action: 19 (a)(2)(C) a statement regarding proportionality under Rule 26(b)(2); and 20 (a)(2)(D) if the statement requests extraordinary discovery, a statement certifying that the 21 party has reviewed and approved a discovery budget. 22 (a)(3) Objection length and content. No more than 7 days after the statement is filed, any other 23 party may file an objection to the statement of discovery issues. The objection must be no more than 24 4 pages, not including permitted attachments, and must address the issues raised in the statement. 25 (a)(4) Permitted attachments. The party filing the statement must attach to the statement only a 26 copy of the disclosure, request for discovery or the response at issue. 27 (a)(5) Proposed order. Each party must file a proposed order concurrently with its statement or 28 objection. 29 (a)(6) Decision. Upon filing of the objection or expiration of the time to do so, either party may 30 and the party filing the statement must file a Request to Submit for Decision under Rule  $\frac{7(q)}{q}$ . The 31 court will promptly: 32 (a)(6)(A) decide the issues on the pleadings and papers; 33 (a)(6)(B) conduct a hearing by telephone conference or other electronic communication; or 34 (a)(6)(C) order additional briefing and establish a briefing schedule. 35 (a)(7) Orders. The court may enter orders regarding disclosure or discovery or to protect a party or 36 person from discovery being conducted in bad faith or from annoyance, embarrassment, oppression, or 37 undue burden or expense, or to achieve proportionality under Rule 26(b)(2), including one or more of the 38 following: 39 (a)(7)(A) that the discovery not be had or that additional discovery be had; 40 (a)(7)(B) that the discovery may be had only on specified terms and conditions, including a 41 designation of the time or place;

42 (a)(7)(C) that the discovery may be had only by a method of discovery other than that 43 selected by the party seeking discovery; 44 (a)(7)(D) that certain matters not be inquired into, or that the scope of the discovery be limited 45 to certain matters; 46 (a)(7)(E) that discovery be conducted with no one present except persons designated by the 47 court: 48 (a)(7)(F) that a deposition after being sealed be opened only by order of the court; 49 (a)(7)(G) that a trade secret or other confidential information not be disclosed or be disclosed 50 only in a designated way; 51 (a)(7)(H) that the parties simultaneously deliver specified documents or information enclosed 52 in sealed envelopes to be opened as directed by the court; 53 (a)(7)(I) that a question about a statement or opinion of fact or the application of law to fact 54 not be answered until after designated discovery has been completed or until a pretrial 55 conference or other later time; 56 (a)(7)(J) that the costs, expenses and attorney fees of discovery be allocated among the 57 parties as justice requires; or 58 (a)(7)(K) that a party pay the reasonable costs, expenses and attorney fees incurred on 59 account of the statement of discovery issues if the relief requested is granted or denied, or if a 60 party provides discovery or withdraws a discovery request after a statement of discovery issues is 61 filed and if the court finds that the party, witness, or attorney did not act in good faith or asserted a 62 position that was not substantially justified. 63 (a)(8) Request for sanctions prohibited. A statement of discovery issues or an objection may 64 include a request for costs, expenses and attorney fees but not a request for sanctions. 65 (a)(9) Statement of discovery issues does not toll discovery time. A statement of discovery 66 issues does not suspend or toll the time to complete standard discovery. 67 l (b) Motion for sanctions. Except as provided in paragraph (e), Uunless the court finds that the 68 failure was substantially justified, the court, upon motion, may impose appropriate sanctions for the failure 69 to follow its orders, including the following: 70 (b)(1) deem the matter or any other designated facts to be established in accordance with the 71 claim or defense of the party obtaining the order; 72 (b)(2) prohibit the disobedient party from supporting or opposing designated claims or defenses 73 or from introducing designated matters into evidence; 74 (b)(3) stay further proceedings until the order is obeyed: 75 (b)(4) dismiss all or part of the action, strike all or part of the pleadings, or render judgment by 76 default on all or part of the action; 77 (b)(5) order the party or the attorney to pay the reasonable costs, expenses, and attorney fees, 78 caused by the failure; 79 80 examination, as contempt of court; and 81 (b)(7) instruct the jury regarding an adverse inference. 82 83 84

85

(b)(6) treat the failure to obey an order, other than an order to submit to a physical or mental (c) Motion for costs, expenses and attorney fees on failure to admit. If a party fails to admit the genuineness of a document or the truth of a matter as requested under Rule 36, and if the party requesting the admissions proves the genuineness of the document or the truth of the matter, the party requesting the admissions may file a motion for an order requiring the other party to pay the reasonable Rule 37. Draft: February 22, 2017

costs, expenses and attorney fees incurred in making that proof. The court must enter the order unless it finds that:

- (c)(1) the request was held objectionable pursuant to Rule <u>36(a)</u>;
- (c)(2) the admission sought was of no substantial importance;
- (c)(3) there were reasonable grounds to believe that the party failing to admit might prevail on the matter:
  - (c)(4) that the request was not proportional under Rule 26(b)(2); or
  - (c)(5) there were other good reasons for the failure to admit.
- (d) Motion for sanctions for failure of party to attend deposition. If a party or an officer, director, or managing agent of a party or a person designated under Rule 30(b)(6) to testify on behalf of a party fails to appear before the officer taking the deposition after service of the notice, any other party may file a motion for sanctions under paragraph (b). The failure to appear may not be excused on the ground that the discovery sought is objectionable unless the party failing to appear has filed a statement of discovery issues under paragraph (a).
- **(e) Failure to preserve evidence.** Except as provided in paragraph (e)(1), Nnothing in this rule limits the inherent power of the court to take any action authorized by paragraph (b) if a party destroys, conceals, alters, tampers with or fails to preserve a document, tangible item, electronic data or other evidence in violation of a duty.
  - (e)(1) Failure to Preserve Electronically Stored Information. If electronically stored information that should have been preserved in the anticipation or conduct of litigation is lost because a party failed to take reasonable steps to preserve it, and it cannot be restored or replaced through additional discovery, the court:
    - (e)(1)(A) upon finding prejudice to another party from loss of the information, may order measures no greater than necessary to cure the prejudice; or
    - (e)(1)(B) only upon finding that the party acted with the intent to deprive another party of the information's use in the litigation may:
      - (e)(1)(B)(1) presume that the lost information was unfavorable to the party:
      - (e)(1)(B)(2) instruct the jury that it may or must presume the information was unfavorable to the party; or
        - (e)(1)(B)(3) dismiss the action or enter a default judgment.
    - (e)(1)(C) Absent exceptional circumstances, a court may not impose sanctions under these rules on a party for failing to provide electronically stored information lost as a result of the routine, good-faith operation of an electronic information system.

## **Advisory Committee Notes**

New note (add to Advisory Committee Notes):

The 2017 amendments to paragraph (e) merged the 2015 amendments to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 37(e). The federal amendments "addressed the serious problems resulting from the continued exponential growth in the volume of [electronically stored] information" by providing "measures a court may employ if information that should have been preserved is lost." Fed. R. Civ. P. 37, Advisory Committee Notes, 2015 Amendment. Unlike the federal rule, Utah's Rule 37(e) also addressed non-electronically stored evidence; the committee preserved the language addressing that subject.

It is the advisory committee's view that subsection (e) concerns sanctions available for the destruction of electronically stored information and is limited to such sanctions. It does not limit the court's ability to sanction in other circumstances (see e.g., 37(b)(7)), and does not bar (1) the parties from litigating the issue of the loss or destruction of electronically stored information before the finder of fact, (2) the finder

Rule 37. Draft: February 22, 2017

of fact from making whatever inferences it deems appropriate from the totality of the evidence, or (3) the court from giving general instructions regarding permissible inferences from a failure to produce evidence formerly in a party's possession.

Regarding missing evidence instructions, this note represents a departure from the approach

Regarding missing evidence instructions, this note represents a departure from the approach articulated in the federal committee's note.

135