UCJA11201. Amend. Redline.

## 1 Rule 11-201. Senior Judges.

- 2 Intent:
- 3 To establish the qualifications, term, authority, appointment, reappointment, and assignment for

Draft: May 21, 2024

- 4 senior judges.
- 5 Applicability:
- 6 This rule shall apply applies to senior judges of courts of record. The term "judge" includes justices of
- 7 the Supreme Court.
- 8 Statement of the Rule:
- 9 (a)(1) **Qualifications.** (1)(A) A judge may apply to become a senior judge, on either inactive or active 10 status.
- 11 (1)  $\frac{(1)(B)}{(B)}$  Inactive senior judge. A judge is qualified to be an inactive senior judge if the judge:
- 12 (A)  $\frac{(1)(B)(i)}{(B)(i)}$  was retained in the last election for which the judge stood for election;
- 13 (B) (1)(B)(ii) voluntarily resigned from judicial office, voluntarily retired upon reaching the
- 14 mandatory retirement age, or, if involuntarily retired due to disability, but recovered from or
- 15 accommodated that disability;
- 16 (C) did not resign from office as a result of negotiations with the Judicial Conduct Commission
- or while a complaint against the judge was pending before the Supreme Court or the Judicial
- 18 Conduct Commission;
- 19 (D) has not been subject to any order of discipline for conduct as a judge;
- 20 (E) does not have any criminal charge, other than an infraction, pending at the time of the
- 21 application;
- 22 (F) (1)(B)(iii) demonstrates appropriate ability and character;
- 23  $(G) \frac{(1)(B)(iv)}{(iv)}$  is admitted to the practice of law in Utah and holds an active or inactive Utah State
- 24 Bar license, but does not practice law; and
- 25 (H)  $\frac{(1)(B)(v)}{(B)(v)}$  is eligible to receive compensation under the Judges' Retirement Act, subject only
- 26 to attaining the appropriate age.; and
- 27 (1)(B)(vi) is appointed by the Supreme Court

53

54

<del>judges;</del>

- (2) (1)(C) Active senior judge. A judge is qualified to be an active senior judge if the 28 judge: 29 30 (A) (1)(C)(i) meets the qualifications of an inactive senior judge; (B) was not suspended during the judge's final term of office or final six years 31 in office, whichever is greater; 32 (C) (1)(C)(ii) is a current resident of Utah and is available to take cases; 33 34 (D) (1)(C)(iii) is physically and mentally able to perform the duties of judicial office; 35 (E) (1)(C)(iv) maintains familiarity is familiar with current statutes, rules, case law, 36 remote hearing technology, and court case management systems, such as CORIS for 37 district courts, CARE for juvenile courts, AIS for appellate courts, and Workspace; 38 and remote hearing technology; (F)  $\frac{(1)(C)(v)}{(1)(C)(v)}$  satisfies the education requirements of an active judge set forth in Rule 39 40 3-403; 41 (1)(C)(vi) attends the annual judicial conference; (1)(C)(vii) accepts assignments, subject to being called, at least two days per calendar 42 43 <del>year;</del> 44 (G) (1)(C)(viii) agrees to conform to the Code of Judicial Administration and the 45 Code of Judicial Conduct and other rules of the Supreme Court; and and the Code of Judicial Administration; and rules of the Supreme Court; 46 47 (H) maintains an active Utah State Bar license. (1)(C)(ix) obtains results on the most recent judicial performance evaluation 48 prior to termination of service sufficient to have been recommended for 49 retention, regardless of whether the evaluation was conducted for self-improvement 50 or certification; 51 (1)(C)(x) continues to meet the requirements for judicial retention as those 52
- (1)(C)(xi) undergoes a performance evaluation every eighteen months following an 55

requirements are determined by the Judicial Council to be applicable to active senior

	UCJA11201. Amend. Redline.	Draft: May 21, 2024
56	6 initial term as an active senior judge;	
57	7 (1)(C)(xii) takes and subscribes an oath of o	ffice to be maintained by the state court
58	8 administrator or the administrator's designee; and	
59	9 (1)(C)(xiii) is appointed by the Supreme Cor	<del>ırt as an active senior judge.</del>
60	0 (2) Disqualifications. A judge is not qualified to be	an active senior judge if the judge:
61	1 (2)(A) was removed from office or involuntarily	retired on grounds other than disability;
62	2 (2)(B) was suspended during the judge's final t	erm of office or final six years in office, whichever
63	3 <del>is greater;</del>	
64	4 (2)(C) has resigned from office as a result of neg	otiations with the Judicial Conduct Commission or
65	5 while a complaint against the applicant was pe	nding before the Supreme Court or pending before
66	6 the Judicial Conduct Commission after a findin	<del>g of reasonable cause</del> ; and
67	7 (2)(D) has been subject to any order of disciplin	e for conduct as a senior judge.
68	68 (b) (5) Application and appointment.	
69	9 $(1)$ - $(5)(A)$ To be appointed a senior judge, a judge	ge <del>shall</del> must:
70	0 (A) Submit an application to the Administra	tive Office of the Courts (AOC) on a form provided
71	1 by the AOC. apply to the Judicial Coun	cil for either inactive or active status and shall
72	2 submit relevant information as requested by	the Judicial Council.
73	3 (B) Declare on the application that the appl	icant meets each relevant qualification as set forth
74	4 in paragraph (a).	
75	5 (C) If applying for active senior judge st	atus, submit results on the most recent judicial
76	6 performance evaluation prior to termination	n of service sufficient to have been recommended
77	7 for retention.	
78	8 (5)(B) The applicant shall:	
79	9 (5)(B)(i) provide the Judicial Council with	the record of all orders of discipline entered by the
80	0 Supreme Court;	
81	1 (5)(B)(ii) declare whether at the time of the	ne application there is any complaint against the
82	2 applicant pending before the Supreme Court or pending before the Judicial Conduct	
83	3 Commission after a finding of reasonable ca	use; and

- (5)(B)(iii) declare whether at the time of the application there is any criminal charge, other than 84 an infraction, pending against the applicant. 85 86 (5)(B)(iv) Judges who decline to participate in an attorney survey in anticipation of retirement 87 may use the results of an earlier survey to satisfy paragraph (1)(C)(ix). (2) After receiving the required senior judge application, the AOC will provide the application 88 to the Judicial Council, and a copy to the applicant. For applicants for active senior judge 89 status, the AOC will also provide the most recent judicial performance evaluation to the 90 Judicial Council, and a copy to the applicant. 91 92 (3) (5)(c)(i) After considering all information in a session closed in compliance with Rule 2-93 103, including any performance evaluation conducted under rule 3-111, the most recent Judicial Performance Evaluation Commission evaluations and the need for senior judges, the 94 95 Judicial Council shall will determine and notify the Supreme Court that whether the applicant meets the qualifications for an appointment as an active or inactive senior judge. 96 97 (5)(C)(ii) the applicant meets the qualifications for appointment as an active or inactive senior judge, and the Council recommends the appointment of the applicant 98 as an inactive or active senior judge; 99 (5)(C)(iii) the applicant meets the qualifications for appointment as an inactive or active 100 senior judge, but based on the need for senior judges at the time of application, the 101 Council does not recommend appointment of the applicant; or 102 103 (5)(C)(iv) the applicant does not meet the qualifications for appointment as an inactive or active senior judge. 104 105 (4) (6)(A) The Judicial Council shall will inform an applicant, in writing, if the Judicial Council 106 notifies the Supreme Court that the applicant does not meet qualifications for appointment. or if the Council does not recommend appointment. 107 108 (5) (6) (B) An applicant who receives notice from the Judicial Council under paragraph (6) (A) (4) may, within 14 days of the date the Judicial Council sent the notice, submit to the Supreme 109 110 Court Appellate Court Administrator a written explanation on why the applicant should be 111 appointed as an active or inactive senior judge. (6) (6)(C) The Supreme Court shall will review each applicant's information. and the 112
- 113 recommendation of the Judicial Council. With the concurrence of a majority of the members

Draft: May 21, 2024

- 115 judge.
- 116 (7) Active senior judges must take and subscribe an oath of office with the original to be
- maintained by the State Archives and a copy to be maintained by the State Court
- 118 Administrator or the Administrator's designee.
- 119 (c) Reappointment qualifications.
- 120 (1) An active senior judge is qualified for reappointment if the judge:
- (A) is physically and mentally able to perform the duties of judicial office;
- 122 (B) maintains familiarity with current statutes, rules, case law, remote hearing technology,
- and court case management systems, such as CORIS for district courts, CARE for juvenile
- 124 courts, AIS for appellate courts, and Workspace;
- 125 (C) satisfied the education requirement of completing 30 hours of education per fiscal year
- as set forth in Rule 3-403;
- (D) attended the annual judicial conference and the annual senior judge bench meeting
- during each year of the senior judge term;
- (E) volunteered for a minimum of two case assignments per fiscal year during the current
- term, subject to being called;
- (F) met standards of performance as provided in paragraph (f);
- (G) continues to conform to the Code of Judicial Administration and the Code of Judicial
- 133 Conduct and other rules of the Supreme Court; and
- (H) continues to meet the qualifications for an active senior judge set forth paragraph
- 135 (a)(2).
- 136 (2) An inactive senior judge is qualified for reappointment if the judge continues to meet
- qualifications set forth in paragraph (a)(1).
- 138 (d) **Reappointment application.** To be reappointed as a senior judge, a judge must apply to the Judicial
- 139 Council for either inactive or active status.
- 140 (1) Active and inactive senior judges seeking reappointment must submit the senior judge
- application by February 1 in the last year of their current term.

- UCJA11201. Amend. Redline. Draft: May 21, 2024 142 (A) An applicant for active senior judge status must submit an application to the AOC 143 declaring whether the applicant meets qualifications as an active senior judge set forth in 144 paragraphs (a)(2) and (c). 145 (B) An applicant for inactive senior judge status must submit an application to the AOC 146 declaring whether the judge continues to meet qualifications set forth in paragraph (a)(1). 147 (2) After receiving an application, the AOC will, for active senior judges, assemble the judicial 148 education records, survey scores, records of formal and informal sanctions, performance 149 improvement plans, if any, and any information requested by the Judicial Council. The AOC 150 will provide the application and any assembled information to the Judicial Council, with a 151 copy to the applicant for reappointment as an active or inactive senior judge. 152 (3) After considering all information in a session closed in compliance with Rule 2-103, the 153 Judicial Council will determine whether: (A) The applicant for reappointment as an active senior judge meets qualifications for 154 155 reappointment set forth in paragraphs (a)(2) and (c), and standards of performance set forth in paragraph (f). 156 157 (B) The applicant for reappointment as an inactive senior judge meets qualifications for 158 reappointment set forth in paragraph (a)(1). 159 (4) If the Judicial Council finds that the applicant does not meet qualifications for 160 reappointment or the standards of performance, the Council will:
- (A) Notify the applicant of the Judicial Council's decision within five days of the Judicial Council's meeting, including a description of the reasons for the Council's decision;
- (B) Invite the applicant to meet with the Judicial Council and provide information challenging the Judicial Council's decision on qualifications or standards of performance; and
- (C) In a session closed in compliance with Rule 2-103, review information challenging the
  Council's decision and provide the applicant adequate time to present evidence and
  arguments in favor of reappointment.
- 169 (5) The Judicial Council will:
- 170 (A) In an open session, approve its final decisions regarding each applicant's

- 171 qualifications for reappointment as a senior judge;
- 172 (B) Notify the applicant in writing if the Judicial Council's final decision is that the applicant does not meet the qualifications for reappointment; and
- 174 (C) Notify the Supreme Court of the final decisions regarding each applicant's qualifications for reappointment as a senior judge.
- 176 (6) An applicant who receives notice from the Judicial Council under paragraph (5) may,
- within 14 days of the date the Judicial Council sent the notice, submit to the Appellate Court
- 178 Administrator a written explanation on why the applicant should be reappointed as an
- inactive senior judge or active senior judge.
- 180 (7) The Supreme Court will review each applicant's information. With the concurrence of a
- majority of the members of the Supreme Court, the Chief Justice may reappoint the judge as
- an inactive senior judge or active senior judge.
- 183 (e) Performance Evaluation.
- 184 (1) The performance of active senior judges is evaluated based on surveys completed by:
- 185 (A) Attorneys appearing before the active senior judge;
- 186 (B) For non-appellate active senior judges,
- (i) the presiding judge, the trial court executive or clerk of court, and court staff in thedistrict in which the senior judge primarily serves; and
- (ii) jurors, if any, involved in cases tried by the senior judge.
- (C) For appellate active senior judges, the Court of Appeals presiding judge, the clerk ofcourt, court staff, and appellate law clerks, involved in cases assigned to the senior judge.
- (2) The AOC will administer, compile, and score the surveys. Attorney, juror, law clerk, andcourt staff survey responses and scores will be anonymized.
- (3) The AOC will provide a summary of survey responses and scores to the senior judge, thepresiding judge, and the Judicial Council.
- 196 (f) Standards of performance for active senior judges.
- 197 (1) Standards of performance on surveys by attorneys evaluate whether the senior judge:
- 198 (A) Demonstrates understanding of the substantive law and any relevant rules of

ι	CJA11201. Amend. Redline. Draft: May 21, 2024	
199	procedure and evidence;	
200	(B) Is attentive to factual and legal issues before the court;	
201	(C) Adheres to precedent and is able to clearly explain departures from precedent;	
202 203	(D) Grasps the practical impact on the parties of the senior judge's rulings, including the effect of delay and increased litigation expense;	
204 205	(E) Is able to clearly explain the factual and legal basis for the judge's ruling in any written orders or decisions;	
206	(F) Demonstrates courtesy toward attorneys, court staff, and others in the court;	
207	(G) Maintains decorum in the courtroom;	
208 209	(H) Demonstrates judicial demeanor and personal attributes that promote public trust and confidence in the judicial system;	
210	(I) Is prepared for hearings or oral argument;	
211	(J) Avoids impropriety or the appearance of impropriety;	
212	(K) Displays fairness and impartiality toward all parties; and	
213	(L) Issues orders and decisions without unnecessary delay.	
214 215		
216	(A) Demonstrates willingness to regularly accept assignments;	
217	(B) Demonstrates ability and willingness to comply with established practices in the district;	
218 219	(C) Demonstrates ability and willingness to use the courts' case management systems and applications in all cases;	
220	(D) Effectively manages court calendars;	
221 222	(E) Complies with performance and training recommendations or performance planestablished by the presiding judge;	
223	(F) Demonstrates courtesy toward attorneys, court staff, and others in the court;	
224 225	(G) Demonstrates judicial demeanor and personal attributes that promote public trust and confidence in the judicial system;	

UCJA11201. Amend. Redline. Draft: May 21, 2024

- 226 (H) Is prepared for hearings or oral argument;
- (I) Avoids impropriety or the appearance of impropriety; and
- 228 (J) Issues orders and decisions without unnecessary delay.
- 229 (3) Survey scoring.
- 230 (A) Each question on the survey has six possible responses: Far Above Standards (5),
- Above Standards (4), Meets Standards (3), Below Standards (2), Far Below Standards (1),
- or No Personal Knowledge.
- (B) The overall performance of an active senior judge is satisfactory if the average score
- on all questions is three or above.
- 235 (4) Performance Improvement.
- (A) A presiding judge of the district that an active senior judge primarily serves may
- prepare a performance improvement plan if the survey scores indicate below standards
- performance by the senior judge or if the presiding judge identifies performance concerns.
- 239 If the senior judge serves multiple districts, the performance improvement plan may be
- prepared in consultation with presiding judges from those districts.
- 241 (B) The performance improvement plan must outline specific expectations and areas
- 242 needing improvement.
- 243 (C) The presiding judge will review a senior judge's progress on the performance
- improvement plan 90 days after the plan is initially drafted. The presiding judge may
- continue the performance improvement plan for another 90 days or conclude the plan.
- 246 (g) (3) Term of office.
- 247 (1) Active senior judges. (3)(A) The initial term of office of an inactive senior judge is until
- 248 December 31 of the second year following appointment. The initial term of office of an active
- senior judge less than age 75 years is until December 31 June 30 of the second year following
- 250 appointment or until December 31 of the year in which the judge reaches age 75, whichever
- 251 <u>is shorter.</u> The initial term of office of an active senior judge age 75 years or more is until
- 252 December 31 June 30 of the first year following appointment. (3)(B) A subsequent term of
- 253 <u>office of an inactive senior judge is for three years.</u> A subsequent term of office of an active
- senior judge less than 75 years is three years or until December 31 June 30 of the year in

- which the judge reaches age 75, whichever is shorter. A subsequent term of office of an active senior judge age 75 years or more is for one year.
- 257 (2) Inactive senior judges. The initial term of office of an inactive senior judge is until June
- 258 30 of the third year following appointment. A subsequent term of office of an inactive senior
- judge is three years.
- 260 (3) (3)(C) All subsequent appointments begin on January 1 July 1.
- 261 (4) (3)(D) The Supreme Court may <u>modify the terms or</u> withdraw an appointment with or without cause.
- 262 (h) (8) Changes to senior judge status.
- 263 (1) (8)(A)(i) An active senior judge may convert to inactive status during the term of
- 264 appointment if the senior judge sends written notice of the change in status to the Cehief
- 265 Justice of the Supreme Court and the Setate Ceourt Aadministrator or the
- Aadministrator's designee. An active senior judge who converts to inactive status may
- 267 not receive an incentive benefit under Rule 3-501 while on inactive status.
- 268 (2) (8)(A)(ii) A senior judge who converts to inactive status may return to active status
- for the remainder of the senior judge's unexpired term if the senior judge sends written
- 270 notice of the judge's intent to return to active status to the Cehief Justice of the Supreme
- 271 Court and to the Sstate Ccourt Aadministrator or the Aadministrator's designee.
- 272 (3) (8)(A)(iii) A senior judge who resigns from senior judge service during the term of
- appointment shall must send written notice to the Cehief Justice of the Supreme Court
- and to the Sstate Ccourt Aadministrator or the Aadministrator's designee.
- 275 (i)(4) Authority. An active or inactive senior judge may solemnize marriages and administer
- 276 oaths of office. An active senior judge, during an assignment, has all the authority of the office
- 277 of a judge of the court to which the assignment is made.
- 278 (7) Assignment.
- 279 (7)(11)(A) An active senior judge may be assigned to any court other than the Supreme Court.
- 280 (7)(11)(B) The state court administrator or the administrator's designee shall provide
- 281 such assistance to the presiding judge and chief justice as requested and shall exercise
- such authority in making assignments as delegated by the presiding judge and chief
- 283 <del>justice.</del>

(7)(11)(C) Notice of an assignment made under this rule shall be in writing and maintained by the state court administrator or the administrator's designee.