Rule 4-202.11. Vexatious record requester
Intent:
To establish the rights and procedures governing requests for relief from a vexatious record requester.
Applicability:
This rule applies to the judicial branch.
Statement of the Rule:
(1) Definitions.
(1)(A) "Committee" means the Management Committee of the Council.
(1)(B) "Executive secretary" means an individual designated as executive secretary by the Committee for purposes of this rule.
(1)(C) "Respondent" means a person the petitioner claims is a vexatious record requester.
(2) <b>Petition.</b> The Office of General Counsel may submit a petition to the Committee requesting
relief from a person alleged to be a vexatious record requester.
(2)(A) A copy of the petition shall be sent to the state court administrator and the
respondent on the day the petition is submitted to the Committee in accordance with
paragraph (3)(B). Service by mail or electronic means is complete upon sending.
(2)(B) The petition shall include:
(2)(B)(i) the respondent's name, email address, and mailing address submitted
by the respondent in his or her most recent record request;
(2)(B)(ii) a description of the conduct that demonstrates the respondent is a
vexatious record requester; and
(2)(B)(iii) a statement of the relief the petitioner seeks.
(2) By my a statement of the foliar the positioner seeks.
(3) Scheduling and notice.
(3)(A) <b>Scheduling.</b> Except as provided in (3)(C), no later than 7 business days after
receiving the petition, the executive secretary shall send a copy of the petition to the Committee chair and schedule a hearing for the Committee to consider the petition:
Committee chair and schedule a hearing for the Committee to consider the petition.
(3)(A)(i) at the next regularly scheduled Committee meeting falling at least 15,
but no later than 30, business days after the petition is submitted; or
(2)(A)(ii) at a regularly eshadylad Committee manting many than 20 hypinas
(3)(A)(ii) at a regularly scheduled Committee meeting more than 30 business days after the petition is submitted, if the Committee chair determines the
Committee will not have sufficient time to hold a hearing at an earlier meeting
date

(3)(B) **Notice**. The executive secretary shall send notice of the date, time, and location of the Committee meeting at which the petition will be heard to the Office of General Counsel, respondent, and state court administrator. Notice may be sent to the respondent via email at the email address last used by the respondent in communications with the court. If the respondent is incarcerated or is otherwise unable to communicate by email, notice shall be sent to the respondent via the last known method of communication used by the respondent. Public notice will be posted in accordance with paragraph (6).

DRAFT: June 2, 2023

(3)(C) **Denial without a hearing.** The Committee chair may direct the executive secretary not to schedule a hearing if the Committee chair and at least one other member of the Committee determine that the petition is without merit. In making that determination, the Committee chair may request that the respondent submit a written response to the petition.

(3)(C)(i) If the Committee chair declines to schedule a hearing, the executive secretary shall send notice to the Office of General Counsel, respondent, and state court administrator that the petition has been denied and the reasons for the denial. Notice shall be sent in accordance with paragraph (3)(B).

(3)(C)(ii) The petition, a response if received under paragraph (3)(C), and the Committee chair's denial decision shall be provided to the Committee in advance of the next regularly scheduled Committee meeting. If a majority of the Committee disagrees with the chair's decision to deny the petition, the Committee shall direct the executive secretary to schedule a hearing. Committee discussions about the chair's denial decision may be held in an executive session.

- (4) **Response.** No later than 5 business days before the hearing, the respondent shall submit to the executive secretary and the Office of General Counsel a written statement in response to the petition. The written statement may be the same document as the respondent's written response under paragraph (3)(C).
- (5) **Hearing.** The Committee will allow the Office of General Counsel and respondent a reasonable opportunity to present facts, authority, and argument at the hearing. The order of presentation and time permitted to each party shall be decided by the Committee. The Committee may permit any other person whose interests might be substantially affected by a decision to participate in the hearing. Discovery is prohibited, but the Committee may require either party to produce additional evidence in support of their claim or position. If the respondent fails to appear at the hearing, the Committee may cancel the hearing and deliberate the petition, or hold the hearing without the respondent.
- (6) **Open and closed meeting.** Committee deliberations are closed and may be held in an executive session. Presentations by the Office of General Counsel, respondent, and any other person permitted to appear at the hearing are open to the public and notice of the hearing shall be given in accordance with Rule 2-103.
- (7) **Order.** No later than 10 business days after the hearing, or the date on which the hearing was canceled under paragraph (5) was scheduled to be held, the Committee shall determine

CJA 4-202.11 (NEW) DRAFT: June 2, 2023

100 whether the Office of General Counsel has demonstrated that the respondent is a vexatious record requester and issue a signed order that grants or denies the petition in whole or in part. 101 102 103 (7)(A) In determining whether the Office of General Counsel has demonstrated that the respondent is a vexatious record requester, the Committee may consider: 104 105 (7)(A)(i) the interests described in Rule 4-202; 106 107 108 (7)(A)(ii) the total number of record requests the respondent has submitted to the judicial branch, including: 109 110 (7)(A)(ii)(a) the number of pending record requests; 111 112 (7)(A)(ii)(b) the number of record requests approved; 113 114 (7)(A)(ii)(c) the number of record requests denied; and 115 116 (7)(A)(ii)(d) the number of appeals taken from record request denials, 117 including information related to the results of such appeals. 118 119 (7)(A)(iii) the scope, content, and subject matter of record requests the 120 respondent has submitted to the judicial branch; 121 122 (7)(A)(iv) the nature of any communications from the respondent to court 123 employees or judicial officers related to a record request: 124 125 (7)(A)(v) any pattern of conduct that the Committee determines to constitute: 126 127 (7)(A)(v)(a) an abuse of the right of access to information; or 128 129 (7)(A)(v)(b) substantial interference with the operations of the judicial 130 branch; 131 132 (7)(A)(vi) any prior petitions, findings, and orders regarding respondent as a 133 vexatious record requester; and 134 135 (7)(A)(vii) any other factor or information the Committee considers relevant. 136 137 (7)(B) If the Committee grants the petition in whole or in part, it may order any relief 138 requested by the Office of General Counsel, or any other relief the Committee deems 139 140 appropriate. 141 (7)(C) The Committee's order granting the petition in whole or in part shall contain a 142 statement of the reasons for the Committee's decision, and a statement that the 143 respondent may petition for judicial review of the Committee's decision by filing a 144 complaint in the Third Judicial District Court in accordance with the Utah Rules of Civil 145 Procedure. If the Committee denies the petition, in whole or in part, the Office of General 146 Counsel may also seek judicial review of the Committee's decision in accordance with 147 this subsection. Any complaint filed under this subsection shall be filed no later than 30 148 calendar days from the date of the Committee's order. 149

150

CJA 4-202.11 (NEW) DRAFT: June 2, 2023

151	(8) Appeals. A record request that the Office of General Counsel is not required to fulfill in
152	accordance with an order issued under this rule may not be the subject of an appeal under Rule
153	<u>4-202.07.</u>
154	
155	(9) The time periods in this rule may be extended by mutual agreement.
156	
157	Effective: November 1, 2023