UTAH JUDICIAL COUNCIL POLICY AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING AGENDA

Judicial Council Room (N301), Matheson Courthouse 450 South State Street, Salt Lake City, Utah 84114 December 7, 2018 – 12:00 p.m. to 2:00 p.m.

12:00	Welcome and Approval of Minutes	Discussion / Action	Tab 1	Judge Pullan
12:05	HR 590 – Interns and Work Conflicts - Continued discussion of new proposed HR policy to address intern conflicts.	Discussion / Action	Tab 2	Justice Himonas Nancy Sylvester
12:40	Rules back from public comment: - CJA 1-205 (IDC and commissioner on committees) – ONE COMMENT - 4-202.02 (juvenile abstracts as "private") – NO COMMENTS - 4-508 (standing committee on forms approves form for motion to waive fees) – NO COMMENTS - Appendix I ("Criminal investigations" as "Public unless otherwise ordered") – NO COMMENTS	Discussion / Action	Tab 3	Michael Drechsel
12:45	Court Commissioner Conduct Committee - Rule 3-201.02 (and Rule 3-201, as necessary) - review draft language prepared as result of last meeting discussions	Discussion / Action	Tab 4	Michael Drechsel
1:20	HR 480 – Employee Exercise Policy (draft)	Discussion	Tab 5	Michael Drechsel
1:45	Election of Chair for 2019	Discussion / Action		Judge Pullan
2:00	Adjourn			

COMMITTEE WEB PAGE: https://www.utcourts.gov/utc/policyplan/

UPCOMING MEETING SCHEDULE:

Meetings are held at the Matheson Courthouse in the Judicial Council Room (N301), on the first Friday of each month from 12:00 noon to 2:00 p.m. (unless otherwise specifically noted):

January 4, 2019
February 1, 2019 – 2nd Floor Board Room (N231)
March 1, 2019 – 2nd Floor West Conference Room (N213)
April 5, 2019
May 3, 2019 – 1st Floor Large Conf. Room (W19A) – 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.

June 7, 2019 August 2, 2019 September 6, 2019 October 4, 2019 November 1, 2019 – 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. December 6, 2019

TAB 1

Minutes from November 2, 2018

NOTES:

UTAH JUDICIAL COUNCIL POLICY AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Judicial Council Room (N301), Matheson Courthouse 450 South State Street, Salt Lake City, Utah 84114 November 2, 2018 – 9:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m.

DRAFT

MEMBERS:	PRESENT	EXCUSED
Judge Derek Pullan, <i>Chair</i>	•	
Judge Kevin Allen		•
Judge Augustus Chin (arrived at 11:00)	•	
Judge Ryan Evershed (via phone 11:27 to 14:18)	•	
Judge John Walton	•	
Mr. Rob Rice	•	

GUESTS: John Bell

Jim Peters
Tom Langhorn
Rick Schwermer
Jacey Skinner
Brent Johnson
Nancy Sylvester
Rob Parkes
Jessica Van Buren

STAFF:

Michael Drechsel
Minhvan Brimhall (recording secretary)

(1) WELCOME AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

NACNADEDC.

Judge Pullan welcomed the committee members to the meeting. At the commencement of the meeting, there was not a quorum to make and vote upon motions. As a result, review of the meeting minutes from October (and any other matters requiring a quorum) was postponed until later in the meeting.

(2) RULE 4-405 – JUROR AND WITNESS FEES:

John Bell reported that this rule required revisions to address changing business practices. State Finance changed the per diem rate to \$5.00. Mr. Bell proposed that the current rule be updated to reflect this change. The proposed changes would also clarify that the rate was "not to exceed state per diem rate." The committee discussed additional language changes to rule 4-405 to further reflect alignment with current business practice. The changes also provide clarification for the issuance of payment of juror and witness fees and expenses. Payment will be processed and completed within 10 days of the juror and/or witness date. The committee asked questions of Mr. Bell to better understand the implications of the proposed changes.

With no quorum present, the committee tabled the matter for further discussion and possible vote when a quorum was present.

(3) RULE 3-403 - JUDICIAL BRANCH EDUCATION:

The committee welcomed Jim Peters and Tom Langhorn to the meeting. Mr. Peters discussed proposed changes to rule 3-403 in regards to the number of training hours required of justice court clerks. The current rule states that justice court clerks need 10 hours. Justice court clerks are employed by counties / municipalities, while district

court clerks are employees of the court. Mr. Peters would like to develop a program that would allow justice court clerks to get the same amount of training as district court clerks. The current policy needs clarification on required training hours for justice court clerk staff.

The committee recommended distinguishing between state employees and local employees as a means to distinguish differences between required training hours. The committee discussed changing the language to read: "All court staff employed by local government shall complete 20 hours of approved coursework." The committee also discussed language changes to clarify the certification and reporting location of justice court training on an annual basis.

Mr. Peters will meet with the court administrators to discuss the recommended changes made by this committee. Mr. Peters will return at the next meeting to provide this committee with an update. The matter was tabled until that time.

(4) RULE 4-202.02 – RECORD CLASSIFICATION (TABLE FORMAT)

Mr. Drechsel sought clarification regarding a project that had started prior to Mr. Drechsel's employment with the Courts. The committee re-affirmed that it wanted to move forward with creating a convenience version of Rule 4-202.02 that is formatted in a table layout. Mr. Drechsel was assigned to finalize preparations of the table-based version of the rule so that it can be added to the code website. Because this version is solely for convenience and merely restates the actual rule, no further process is required on this matter.

(5) RULES 3-201.02 / 3-201 – COMMISSIONER CONDUCT RULES:

The committee welcomed Mr. Rick Schwermer and Ms. Jacey Skinner to the meeting. They discussed potential proposed changes to the commissioner complaint process. Currently there are two different processes for complaints, one for formal complaints and one for informal complaints. The need to make changes to rule 3-201.0 and 3-201 is to provide clarification on the types of complaints filed against a commissioner and who addresses those complaints. Ms. Skinner reported that commissioners are often times aware that a complaint has been filed against them, but do not have clear knowledge of the complaint and who is addressing the complaint. Mr. Schwermer stated that commissioners are court employees and are not under the jurisdiction of the Judicial Conduct Commission, and therefore the complaint process would not be processed by the JCC, nor should the process necessarily be the same. Ms. Skinner described the details of the current process and procedures.

The committee discussed distinctions between informal and formal complaints against a commissioner. The committee discussed who is best situated to address a complaint. The committee discussed the possibility of having two complaint processes, one to address ethical complaints, and the other to address administrative/performance complaints. Judge Pullan stated that a presiding judge should not be a screener for commissioner complaints, but rather that the chairperson of the conduct commission would better serve in this capacity. Judge Pullan noted that ethical complaints are recommended to be addressed by the commissioner's presiding judge. Upon further discussion and consideration, the committee determined that there was not a meaningful was to distinguish between those complaints that might be classified as "ethical" as opposed to "administrative" in nature. All complaints appear to implicate ethical considerations.

The committee discussed specific draft provisions for possible revision of the rule. The committee then instructed Mr. Drechsel to create a draft for further consideration at the next meeting.

(6) APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Judge Chin then arrived at the meeting. With a quorum was present, the committee considered the minutes from the October 5th, 2018 meeting. With no objections or amendments, Mr. Rice moved to approve the draft minutes. Judge Chin seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion passed unanimously.

(7) RULE 4-405 – CONTINUED DISCUSSION FROM #2 ABOVE

The committee turned its attention back to this matter. Prior to a vote, Judge Chin was updated by the committee members regarding the information presented by John Bell, as well as the committee's discussions. After reviewing the matter, Judge Walton made motion to recommend to the Judicial Council that the proposed revisions to Rule 4-405 be published for public comment. Mr. Rice seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion passed unanimously.

(8) DISCUSSION OF PREVIOUSLY IDENTIFIED RULES WHERE NO CHANGE IS RECOMMENDED / CORRECTION OF MINOR PUNCTUATION:

Mr. Drechsel then briefly updated the committee members regarding several rules that the committee had identified at the October 5th meeting. Mr. Drechsel reported that, after doing further research on these matters, he was recommending to the committee that the rules did not need any revisions at this time. Particular details, as follows:

Rule 3-417: The court is required as a public entity by the ADA to have a procedure to address rules and grievances concerns. The reason this is a public-facing rule and not just an internal policy is so the public can be aware of the information and act accordingly when the situation warrants.

Rules 3-303 and **3-302**: Describes the role of the clerks of court. Mr. Drechsel reported that he had made contact with Kim Allard, Jim Peters, and Shane Bahr about any perceived need to amend these rules. None of those individuals believed any changes were warranted at this time.

Rule 3-202: The rule regarding court referees is not implicated by the domestic case tracking pilot currently taking place. No amendment is necessary.

Rule 3-102: Assumption of judicial office. The October review revealed that several commas could be added to the rule. The committee discussed whether it was better to simply make the change, push the changes through the full rulemaking process (even though it was merely three commas), or leave the rule alone. After discussion, it was decided to leave the rule alone.

After a review of all of the above, the committee determined that these rules did not need any revision at this time. No further action was taken by the committee in connection with these matters at this time.

(9) RULE 3-101(4) – JUDICIAL PERFORMANCE STANDARDS

The committee began its discussion of this rule, which deals with the standards for assessing judges. Shortly after beginning this conversation, the committee paused the discussion to accommodate guests who had joined the meeting to discuss the next agenda topic.

(10) RECORDING / PHOTOGRAPHY IN COURTHOUSES

Mr. Brent Johnson was welcomed to the meeting. Mr. Johnson had been invited to discuss a proposed rule to allow for recording or photographing in courthouses. There are three different common scenarios of recording in courthouses: the media; commercial use of the building; and regular patrons of the court. The Management Committee had asked Mr. Johnson to review the current policy and bring a proposed policy to Policy and Planning Committee for review. Mr. Johnson states that one proposal being discussed is to have judges dictate when and where recording should be allowed in their specific courtroom.

Mr. Johnson will conduct additional research on courtroom recording policies, and make additional revision to the proposed rule. Mr. Johnson will return at another date and provide additional information to this committee.

(11) RULE 4-403 – ELECTRONIC SIGNATURE AND SIGNATURE STAMP USE

Judge Evershed joined the meeting via phone just a few minutes into addressing this agenda item. Rule 4-403 allows for court clerks to electronically sign and use signature stamps on behalf of a judge or commissioner on orders and motions, with prior permission of the judge or commissioner. The proposed revisions would permit clerks to sign the equivalent of federal transport orders (i.e., "writs of habeas corpus and prosequendum and testificandum"). This same draft also would permit the use of signature stamps on orders of "domestic relations injunctions" under future URCP 109. The committee discussed the merits of these proposed changes.

After reviewing the matter, Mr. Rice made motion to recommend to the Judicial Council that the proposed revisions to Rule 4-403 be published for public comment. Judge Walton seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion passed unanimously.

(12) RULE 4-202.09 – MISCELLANEOUS

Mr. Drechsel discussed that Rule 4-202.09 currently requires parties to label documents that are filed with a classification (private, protected, safeguarded, etc.). Many documents are not being filed with the required designation. Mr. Drechsel stated that e-filing has automated the designations based upon the filing type. The recommendation is that the requirement to classify the record at the top of the page be removed from this rule.

The committee discussed the deletion of this requirement and determined it would be appropriate; however, the Advisory Committee on Civil Procedures should review the entirety of Rule 4-202.09(10) to determine if action should be taken to move those provisions to the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure.

After reviewing the matter, Judge Walton made motion to recommend to the Judicial Council that the proposed revisions to Rule 4-202.09 be published for public comment. Mr. Rice seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion passed unanimously.

(13) HR 590 - INTERNS AND WORK CONFLICTS

Ms. Nancy Sylvester discussed HR 590 that addresses the availability of court interns to hold a second job. The current policy does not allow court interns to maintain their current position with the court, while maintaining employment or volunteering in a law firm / other legal work. The proposed HR policy would require interns to screen themselves from cases in which their other employment or volunteer position is associated with the case. If the court intern is employed with a law firm that has presence before the court, the intern will recuse themselves from that case.

Judge Pullan raised concern that there is an automatic conflict of interest for a court intern to continuing to maintain employment with a law firm that appears before court. The court intern will have access to information pertaining to the case. The court intern may be perceived as having unlimited access to the case information, that could be shared with opposing counsel. Members of the committee were concerned about the appearance of conflict.

Mr. Rob Parkes stated that all court interns are subjected to court's HR policies.

The committee made recommendations for language changes to the proposed policy. Even after the revisions were drafted, the committee was still not convinced that such a policy was advisable. The committee asked Ms.

Sylvester to invite members of the Supreme Court to attend the next committee meeting to help the committee better understand the situation so that a solution might be crafted, if at all possible. Ms. Sylvester agreed to return for the next meeting and will provide updated information to this committee.

(14) RULE 1-205 – STANDING AND AD HOC COMMITTEES

Mr. Drechsel explained that rule 1-205 is currently out for public comment for some earlier-approved revisions. This proposed amendment to Rule 1-205 is to include the court security director to the court facilities planning committee. The current court security director, Mr. Chris Palmer, has been attending these meetings as a non-voting participant. That committee suggested that Mr. Palmer be added as a member of the committee so that he may be able to may provide input and vote.

The committee did not have other additional concerns or questions regarding the proposed amendments. After reviewing the matter, Judge Walton made motion to recommend to the Judicial Council that the proposed revisions to Rule 1-205 be published for public comment. Mr. Rice seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion passed unanimously.

(15) RULE 4-508 – GUIDELINES FOR RULING ON A MOTION TO WAIVE FEES

Mr. Drechsel briefly discussed an amendment to rule 4-508. This rule is currently out for public comment on other revisions. This additional amendment would clarify a party filing a motion to waive fees would only need to provide documentation in support of the affidavit if requested by the court. The committee discussed the matter.

After reviewing the matter, Judge Chin made motion to recommend to the Judicial Council that the proposed revisions to Rule 4-508 be published for public comment. Judge Walton seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion passed unanimously.

(16) RULE 3-101(4) - CONTINUED DISCUSSION FROM #9 ABOVE

The committee resumed discussion of this item. Rick Schwermer re-joined the committee for this portion of the meeting. Judge Pullan suggested that this committee hold off making any changes to this rule until the committee can better understand the implications of proposing changes. The committee discussed whether the "intent" section of the rule is accurate and drafted language that was more descriptive of the actual intent of the rule. This rule will be brought back in January for further discussion.

(17) RULES 3-103, 3-104, AND 3-111 – PRESIDING JUSTICE COURT JUDGES

Mr. Drechsel reminded the committee that several rules needed to be updated in light of the recent adoption of a rule creating presiding judges in justice courts. These rules had been identified by Judge Pullan as needing attention from the committee for this purpose. The committee discussed minor revisions to each rule that would bring consistency to certain responsibilities of being a presiding judge, regardless of whether the involved court is a district court or a justice court.

After reviewing the matter, Judge Chin made motion to recommend to the Judicial Council that the proposed revisions to Rules 3-103, 3-104, and 3-111 be published for public comment. Mr. Rice seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion passed unanimously.

(18) RULES 3-106 AND 3-107 – JUDICIAL COUNCIL OPTIONS ON LEGISLATIVE / EXECUTIVE INITIATIVES

Rule 3-106: clarifies the Judicial Council's ability to endorse, oppose and recommend amendments to, or take no position on Legislative (3-106) and Executive (3-107) matters.

After reviewing the matter, Mr. Rice made motion to recommend to the Judicial Council that the proposed revisions to Rules 3-106 and 3-107 be published for public comment. Judge Chin seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion passed unanimously.

(19) RULE 2-208 - PUBLICATION AND DISTRIBUTION OF CJA

Rule 2-208(2) was identified by Judge Pettit prior to her reassignment. The rule appeared to be out of date in requiring the AOC and each TCE to "maintain" a copy of the Code for public access and review. The committee reviewed draft language that would bring the rule into a more modern age where the internet is the primary source of information for the public.

After reviewing the matter, Mr. Rice made motion to recommend to the Judicial Council that the proposed revisions to Rule 2-208 be published for public comment. Judge Walton seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion passed unanimously.

(20) RULE 3-501 – INSURANCE BENEFITS UPON RETIREMENT

Rule 3-501 discusses ongoing insurance benefits for retired judges, justices, and commissioners. Judges, justices, and commissioners can qualify for 8 months of coverage if they do not use more than 4 sick leave days in the year. Currently, maternity leave is counted as sick leave. The proposed rule also designates parental leave as sick leave. The proposed language makes the rule more gender neutral. The committee briefly discussed the proposal.

After reviewing the matter, Mr. Rice made motion to recommend to the Judicial Council that the proposed revisions to Rule 3-501 be published for public comment. Judge Walton seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion passed unanimously.

(21) RULE 3-109 - ETHICS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

At the last meeting, Judge Pullan identified this rule for a potential revision. Rule 3-109 currently provides the Board of District Court Judges 30 days to request a reconsideration of an ethics opinion. The proposed revision would change this to 28 days, being an amount of time that is divisible by 7 (as many other time period have become over the last several years). During the discussions, the committee determined that there was a need for the time period to be at least 30 full days, so that the Board would have an opportunity to meet prior to the request for reconsideration being required. After discussion, the committee decided to not pursue any change to this rule at this time.

(22) RULE 3-413 – JUDICIAL LIBRARY RESOURCES

Mr. Schwermer and Ms. Jessica Van Buren were welcomed as guests to the meeting. The committee discussed proposed language changes that have been proposed to rule 3-413 to reflect current practices. At the time the rule was created, electronic research resources were not as robust as print publications. The proposed revisions, therefore, also reflect the increasing importance of electronic research resources in court activities. The proposed revisions makes no change to actual current practices.

Ms. Van Buren indicated that the court has electronic access to Westlaw and HeinOnline, as well as other free resources. The committee discussed the need for printed copies, as opposed to electronic copies. Many judges

prefer printed copies. The committee recognized that both types of research materials are important. The committee discussed the proposed revisions in detail.

Following further discussion and additional minor language changes for clarification, Mr. Rice made motion to recommend to the Judicial Council that the proposed revisions to Rule 3-413 be published for public comment. Judge Chin seconded the motion. During this conversation, Judge Evershed was disconnected from the meeting (at approximately 2:20 p.m.). A vote was taken with a quorum still present and the motion passed unanimously.

(23) ADJOURN

The meeting adjourned at approximately 2:38 p.m. The next meeting will be held on December 7th, 2018, starting at 12:00 noon.

TAB 2

HR 590 – Interns and Work Conflicts

NOTES:

HR Policy 580. New.

INTERNS AND WORK CONFLICTS POLICY 580

Purpose

The purpose of this policy is to define how the courts treat interns who are engaged in secondary employment and other volunteer activities.

Draft: July 30, 2018

Scope

This policy establishes an exception to the general rule that an individual working for the courts may not engage in other employment and volunteer activities that conflict with the interests of the courts or create the appearance of a conflict of interest.

Policy and Procedure

For purposes of this policy, an extern is the same as an intern.

Interns may engage in other employment and volunteer activities that conflict with the interests of the courts or create the appearance of a conflict of interest as defined in <u>Sections 500.8</u> and <u>500.11</u>, subject to the following conditions:

1. If an intern has worked or is working on a case currently before the court in the intern's other employment or volunteer work, the intern shall <u>notify the court, and the court shallrecuse and be screened the intern from the case.</u>

2. If an intern has worked or volunteered for, or is currently working or volunteering for, a law firm or entity that has appeared or is appearing before the court, the intern shall recurred the court, and the court shall be-screened the intern from any cases involving that law firm or entity.

Commented [MCD1]: What about when the CASES are different, but the underlying ISSUES are consistent / involved?

TAB 3

Rules Back from Public Comment

NOTES:

1 Rule 1-205. Standing and Ad Hoc Committees.

- 2 Intent:
- 3 To establish standing and ad hoc committees to assist the Council and provide
- 4 recommendations on topical issues.
- 5 To establish uniform terms and a uniform method for appointing committee members.
- 6 To provide for a periodic review of existing committees to assure that their activities are
- 7 appropriately related to the administration of the judiciary.
- 8 Applicability:
- 9 This rule shall apply to the internal operation of the Council.

10 Statement of the Rule:

11	(1)	Standing	Committees.

12	(1)(A)	Establishment. The following standing committees of the Council are hereby		
13		established:		
14		(1)(A)(i) Technolog	y Committee;	
15		(1)(A)(ii) Uniform F	ne Schedule Committee;	
16		(1)(A)(iii) Ethics Adv	visory Committee;	
17		(1)(A)(iv) Judicial Br	ranch Education Committee;	
18		(1)(A)(v) Court Fac	lity Planning Committee;	
19		(1)(A)(vi) Committee	e on Children and Family Law;	
20		(1)(A)(vii) Committee	e on Judicial Outreach;	
21		(1)(A)(viii) Committee	e on Resources for Self-represented Parties;	
22		(1)(A)(ix) Language	Access Committee;	
23		(1)(A)(x) Guardian	ad Litem Oversight Committee;	
24		(1)(A)(xi) Committee	e on Model Utah Civil Jury Instructions;	
25		(1)(A)(xii) Committee	e on Model Utah Criminal Jury Instructions;	
26		(1)(A)(xiii) Committee	e on Pretrial Release and Supervision; and	
27		(1)(A)(xiv) Committee	e on Court Forms.	
28	(1)(B)	Composition.		
29		(1)(B)(i) The Techr	nology Committee shall consist of:	
30		(1)(B)(i)(a)	one judge from each court of record;	
31		(1)(B)(i)(b)	one justice court judge;	

32		(1)(B)(i)(c)	one lawyer recommended by the Board of Bar
33			Commissioners;
34		(1)(B)(i)(d)	two court executives;
35		(1)(B)(i)(e)	two court clerks; and
36		(1)(B)(i)(f)	two staff members from the Administrative Office.
37	(1)(B)(ii)	The Uniform I	Fine/Bail Schedule Committee shall consist of:
38		(1)(B)(ii)(a)	one district court judge who has experience with a
39			felony docket;
40		(1)(B)(ii)(b)	three district court judges who have experience with a
41			misdemeanor docket;
42		(1)(B)(ii)(c)	one juvenile court judge; and
43		(1)(B)(ii)(d)	three justice court judges.
44	(1)(B)(iii)	The Ethics Ac	dvisory Committee shall consist of:
45		(1)(B)(iii)(a)	one judge from the Court of Appeals;
46		(1)(B)(iii)(b)	one district court judge from Judicial Districts 2, 3, or 4;
47		(1)(B)(iii)(c)	one district court judge from Judicial Districts 1, 5, 6, 7,
48			or 8;
49		(1)(B)(iii)(d)	one juvenile court judge;
50		(1)(B)(iii)(e)	one justice court judge; and
51		(1)(B)(iii)(f)	an attorney from either the Bar or a college of law.
52	(1)(B)(iv)	The Judicial E	Branch Education Committee shall consist of:
53		(1)(B)(iv)(a)	one judge from an appellate court;
54		(1)(B)(iv)(b)	one district court judge from Judicial Districts 2, 3, or 4;
55		(1)(B)(iv)(c)	one district court judge from Judicial Districts 1, 5, 6, 7,
56			or 8;
57		(1)(B)(iv)(d)	one juvenile court judge;
58		(1)(B)(iv)(e)	the education liaison of the Board of Justice Court
59			Judges;
60		(1)(B)(iv)(f)	one state level administrator;
61		(1)(B)(iv)(g)	the Human Resource Management Director;
62		(1)(B)(iv)(h)	one court executive;
63		(1)(B)(iv)(i)	one juvenile court probation representative;
64		(1)(B)(iv)(j)	two court clerks from different levels of court and
65			different judicial districts;

66		(1)(B)(iv)(k)	one data processing manager; and
67		(1)(B)(iv)(I)	one adult educator from higher education.
68		(1)(B)(iv)(m)	The Human Resource Management Director and the
69			adult educator shall serve as non-voting members. The
70			state level administrator and the Human Resource
71			Management Director shall serve as permanent
72			Committee members.
73	(1)(B)(v)	The Court Fac	cility Planning Committee shall consist of:
74		(1)(B)(v)(a)	one judge from each level of trial court;
75		(1)(B)(v)(b)	one appellate court judge;
76		(1)(B)(v)(c)	the state court administrator;
77		(1)(B)(v)(d)	a trial court executive; and
78		(1)(B)(v)(e)	two business people with experience in the
79			construction or financing of facilities.
80	(1)(B)(vi)	The Committee	ee on Children and Family Law shall consist of:
81		(1)(B)(vi)(a)	one Senator appointed by the President of the Senate;
82		(1)(B)(vi)(b)	one Representative appointed by the Speaker of the
83			House;
84		(1)(B)(vi)(c)	the Director of the Department of Human Services or
85			designee;
86		(1)(B)(vi)(d)	one attorney of the Executive Committee of the Family
87			Law Section of the Utah State Bar;
88		(1)(B)(vi)(e)	one attorney with experience in abuse, neglect and
89			dependency cases;
90		(1)(B)(vi)(f)	one attorney with experience representing parents in
91			abuse, neglect and dependency cases;
92		(1)(B)(vi)(g)	one representative of a child advocacy organization;
93		(1)(B)(vi)(h)	one mediator;
94		(1)(B)(vi)(i)	one professional in the area of child development;
95		(1)(B)(vi)(j)	one representative of the community;
96		(1)(B)(vi)(k)	the Director of the Office of Guardian ad Litem or
97			designee;
98		(1)(B)(vi)(I)	one court commissioner;
99		(1)(B)(vi)(m)	two district court judges; and

100		(1)(B)(vi)(n)	two juvenile court judges.
101		(1)(B)(vi)(o)	One of the district court judges and one of the juvenile
102			court judges shall serve as co-chairs to the committee.
103			In its discretion the committee may appoint non-
104			members to serve on its subcommittees.
105	(1)(B)(vii)	The Committe	ee on Judicial Outreach shall consist of:
106		(1)(B)(vii)(a)	one appellate court judge;
107		(1)(B)(vii)(b)	one district court judge;
108		(1)(B)(vii)(c)	one juvenile court judge;
109		(1)(B)(vii)(d)	one justice court judge; one state level administrator;
110		(1)(B)(vii)(e)	a state level judicial education representative;
111		(1)(B)(vii)(f)	one court executive;
112		(1)(B)(vii)(g)	one Utah State Bar representative;
113		(1)(B)(vii)(h)	one communication representative;
114		(1)(B)(vii)(i)	one law library representative;
115		(1)(B)(vii)(j)	one civic community representative; and
116		(1)(B)(vii)(k)	one state education representative.
117		(1)(B)(vii)(I)	Chairs of the Judicial Outreach Committee's
118			subcommittees shall also serve as members of the
119			committee.
120	(1)(B)(viii)	The Committee	ee on Resources for Self-represented Parties shall
121		consist of:	
122		(1)(B)(viii)(a)	two district court judges;
123		(1)(B)(viii)(b)	one juvenile court judge;
124		(1)(B)(viii)(c)	two justice court judges;
125		(1)(B)(viii)(d)	three clerks of court – one from an appellate court, one
126			from an urban district and one from a rural district;
127		(1)(B)(viii)(e)	one member of the Online Court Assistance
128			Committee;
129		(1)(B)(viii)(f)	one representative from the Self-Help Center;
130		(1)(B)(viii)(g)	one representative from the Utah State Bar;
131		(1)(B)(viii)(h)	two representatives from legal service organizations
132			that serve low-income clients;

133		(1)(B)(viii)(i)	one private attorney experienced in providing services
134			to self-represented parties;
135		(1)(B)(viii)(j)	two law school representatives;
136		(1)(B)(viii)(k)	the state law librarian; and
137		(1)(B)(viii)(I)	two community representatives.
138	(1)(B)(ix)	The Language	e Access Committee shall consist of:
139		(1)(B)(ix)(a)	one district court judge;
140		(1)(B)(ix)(b)	one juvenile court judge;
141		(1)(B)(ix)(c)	one justice court judge;
142		(1)(B)(ix)(d)	one trial court executive;
143		(1)(B)(ix)(e)	one court clerk;
144		(1)(B)(ix)(f)	one interpreter coordinator;
145		(1)(B)(ix)(g)	one probation officer;
146		(1)(B)(ix)(h)	one prosecuting attorney;
147		(1)(B)(ix)(i)	one defense attorney;
148		(1)(B)(ix)(j)	two certified interpreters;
149		(1)(B)(ix)(k)	one approved interpreter;
150		(1)(B)(ix)(I)	one expert in the field of linguistics; and
151		(1)(B)(ix)(m)	one American Sign Language representative.
152	(1)(B)(x)	The Guardian	ad Litem Oversight Committee shall consist of:
153		(1)(B)(x)(a)	seven members with experience in the administration
154			of law and public services selected from public, private
155			and non-profit organizations.
156	(1)(B)(xi)	The Committee	ee on Model Utah Civil Jury Instructions shall consist of:
157		(1)(B)(xi)(a)	two district court judges;
158		(1)(B)(xi)(b)	four lawyers who primarily represent plaintiffs;
159		(1)(B)(xi)(c)	four lawyers who primarily represent defendants; and
160		(1)(B)(xi)(d)	one person skilled in linguistics or communication.
161	(1)(B)(xii)	The Committe	ee on Model Utah Criminal Jury Instructions shall consist
162		of:	
163		(1)(B)(xii)(a)	two district court judges;
164		(1)(B)(xii)(b)	one justice court judge;
165		(1)(B)(xii)(c)	four prosecutors;
166		(1)(B)(xii)(d)	four defense counsel;

167		(1)(B)(xii)(e)	one professor of criminal law; and
168		(1)(B)(xii)(f)	one person skilled in linguistics or communication.
169	(1)(B)(xiii)	The Committee	e on Pretrial Release and Supervision shall consist of:
170		(1)(B)(xiii)(a)	two district court judges;
171		(1)(B)(xiii)(b)	one juvenile court judge;
172		(1)(B)(xiii)(c)	two justice court judges;
173		(1)(B)(xiii)(d)	one prosecutor;
174		(1)(B)(xiii)(e)	one defense attorney;
175		(1)(B)(xiii)(f)	one county sheriff;
176		(1)(B)(xiii)(g)	one representative of counties;
177		(1)(B)(xiii)(h)	one representative of a county pretrial services agency;
178		(1)(B)(xiii)(i)	one representative of the Utah Insurance Department;
179		(1)(B)(xiii)(j)	one representative of the Utah Commission on
180			Criminal and Juvenile Justice;
181		(1)(B)(xiii)(k)	one commercial surety agent;
182		(1)(B)(xiii)(I)	one state senator;
183		(1)(B)(xiii)(m)	one state representative;
184		(1)(B)(xiii)(n)	one member of the Utah Indigent Defense
184 185		(1)(B)(xiii)(n)	one member of the Utah Indigent Defense Commission; and
185	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o)	Commission; and
185 186	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committe	Commission: and the court's general counsel or designee.
185 186 187	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committe (1)(B)(xiv)(a)	Commission; and the court's general counsel or designee. se on Court Forms shall consist of:
185 186 187 188	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committe (1)(B)(xiv)(a) (1)(B)(xiv)(b)	Commission; and the court's general counsel or designee. e on Court Forms shall consist of: one district court judge; one court commissioner;
185 186 187 188 189	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committe (1)(B)(xiv)(a) (1)(B)(xiv)(b) (1)(B)(xiv)(c)	Commission; and the court's general counsel or designee. e on Court Forms shall consist of: one district court judge; one court commissioner;
185 186 187 188 189	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committe (1)(B)(xiv)(a) (1)(B)(xiv)(b) (1)(B)(xiv)(c)	Commission; and the court's general counsel or designee. e on Court Forms shall consist of: one district court judge; one court commissioner; one juvenile court judge; one justice court judge;
185 186 187 188 189 190	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committe (1)(B)(xiv)(a) (1)(B)(xiv)(b) (1)(B)(xiv)(c) (1)(B)(xiv)(d)	Commission; and the court's general counsel or designee. e on Court Forms shall consist of: one district court judge; one court commissioner; one juvenile court judge; one justice court judge;
185 186 187 188 189 190 191	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committe (1)(B)(xiv)(a) (1)(B)(xiv)(b) (1)(B)(xiv)(c) (1)(B)(xiv)(d) (1)(B)(xiv)(e)	Commission; and the court's general counsel or designee. e on Court Forms shall consist of: one district court judge; one court commissioner; one juvenile court judge; one justice court judge; one court clerk;
185 186 187 188 189 190 191 192	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committee (1)(B)(xiv)(a) (1)(B)(xiv)(b) (1)(B)(xiv)(c) (1)(B)(xiv)(d) (1)(B)(xiv)(e) (1)(B)(xiv)(f)	Commission; and the court's general counsel or designee. e on Court Forms shall consist of: one district court judge; one court commissioner; one juvenile court judge; one justice court judge; one court clerk; one appellate court staff attorney;
185 186 187 188 189 190 191 192 193	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committe (1)(B)(xiv)(a) (1)(B)(xiv)(b) (1)(B)(xiv)(c) (1)(B)(xiv)(d) (1)(B)(xiv)(e) (1)(B)(xiv)(f) (1)(B)(xiv)(g)	Commission; and the court's general counsel or designee. e on Court Forms shall consist of: one district court judge; one court commissioner; one juvenile court judge; one justice court judge; one court clerk; one appellate court staff attorney; one representative from the Self-Help Center;
185 186 187 188 189 190 191 192 193 194	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committee (1)(B)(xiv)(a) (1)(B)(xiv)(b) (1)(B)(xiv)(c) (1)(B)(xiv)(d) (1)(B)(xiv)(e) (1)(B)(xiv)(f) (1)(B)(xiv)(g) (1)(B)(xiv)(h)	Commission; and the court's general counsel or designee. e on Court Forms shall consist of: one district court judge; one court commissioner; one juvenile court judge; one justice court judge; one court clerk; one appellate court staff attorney; one representative from the Self-Help Center; the State Law Librarian;
185 186 187 188 189 190 191 192 193 194 195	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committee (1)(B)(xiv)(a) (1)(B)(xiv)(b) (1)(B)(xiv)(c) (1)(B)(xiv)(d) (1)(B)(xiv)(f) (1)(B)(xiv)(f) (1)(B)(xiv)(g) (1)(B)(xiv)(h) (1)(B)(xiv)(i)	Commission; and the court's general counsel or designee. e on Court Forms shall consist of: one district court judge; one court commissioner; one juvenile court judge; one justice court judge; one court clerk; one appellate court staff attorney; one representative from the Self-Help Center; the State Law Librarian; the Court Services Director;
185 186 187 188 189 190 191 192 193 194 195 196	(1)(B)(xiv)	(1)(B)(xiii)(o) The Committee (1)(B)(xiv)(a) (1)(B)(xiv)(b) (1)(B)(xiv)(c) (1)(B)(xiv)(d) (1)(B)(xiv)(f) (1)(B)(xiv)(f) (1)(B)(xiv)(g) (1)(B)(xiv)(h) (1)(B)(xiv)(i)	Commission; and the court's general counsel or designee. e on Court Forms shall consist of: one district court judge; one court commissioner; one juvenile court judge; one justice court judge; one court clerk; one appellate court staff attorney; one representative from the Self-Help Center; the State Law Librarian; the Court Services Director; one member selected by the Online Court Assistance

Commented [MCD1]: One comment received:

Joanna Landau

Joanna Landau
jlandau@utah.gov
date: 20180928
GREAT IDEA. But if you want a *particular* staff
member rather than a member, the language might say
"a person to represent the Utah Indigent Defense
Commission, who is designated by the Commission's
Chair." Or compthing to that offect, since poly the Chair." Or something to that effect, since only the Director is both staff and "a member."

After reviewing the comment, it would be better to state "the Director of the Indigent Defense Commission or designee"

201		(1)(B)(xiv)(I) one paralegal;
202		(1)(B)(xiv)(m) one educator from a paralegal program or law school;
203		(1)(B)(xiv)(n) one person skilled in linguistics or communication; and
204		(1)(B)(xiv)(o) one representative from the Utah State Bar.
205		(1)(C) Standing committee chairs. The Judicial Council shall designate the chair of
206		each standing committee. Standing committees shall meet as necessary to
207		accomplish their work. Standing committees shall report to the Council as
208		necessary but a minimum of once every year. Council members may not serve,
209		participate or vote on standing committees. Standing committees may invite
210		participation by others as they deem advisable, but only members designated by
211		this rule may make motions and vote. All members designated by this rule may
212		make motions and vote unless otherwise specified. Standing committees may
213		form subcommittees as they deem advisable.
214		(1)(D) Committee performance review. At least once every six years, the
215		Management Committee shall review the performance of each committee. If the
216		Management Committee determines that committee continues to serve its
217		purpose, the Management Committee shall recommend to the Judicial Council
218		that the committee continue. If the Management Committee determines that
219		modification of a committee is warranted, it may so recommend to the Judicial
220		Council.
221		(1)(D)(i) Notwithstanding subsection (1)(D), the Guardian ad Litem Oversight
222		Committee, recognized by Section 78A-6-901, shall not terminate.
223	(2)	Ad hoc committees. The Council may form ad hoc committees or task forces to consider
224		topical issues outside the scope of the standing committees and to recommend rules or
225		resolutions concerning such issues. The Council may set and extend a date for the
226		termination of any ad hoc committee. The Council may invite non-Council members to
227		participate and vote on ad hoc committees. Ad hoc committees shall keep the Council
228		informed of their activities. Ad hoc committees may form sub-committees as they deem
229		advisable. Ad hoc committees shall disband upon issuing a final report or
230		recommendations to the Council, upon expiration of the time set for termination, or upon
231		the order of the Council.
232	(3)	General provisions.
233		(3)(A) Appointment process.

234 (3)(A)(i) Administrator's responsibilities. The state court administrator's responsibilities. The state court administrator select a member of the administrative staff to serve as the administrator for committee appointments. Except as othe provided in this rule, the administrator shall: 238 (3)(A)(i)(a) announce expected vacancies on standing two months in advance and announce vacancies on the months in advance and announce vacancies on standing two months in advance and announce vacancies on the	nerwise ng committees cancies on ad n of
provided in this rule, the administrator shall: (3)(A)(i)(a) announce expected vacancies on standin two months in advance and announce vac hoc committees in a timely manner;	ng committees cancies on ad
238 (3)(A)(i)(a) announce expected vacancies on standing two months in advance and announce variable hoc committees in a timely manner;	cancies on ad
239 two months in advance and announce vac 240 hoc committees in a timely manner;	cancies on ad
240 hoc committees in a timely manner;	n of
241 (3)(A)(i)(b) for new appointments, obtain an indication	
242 willingness to serve from each prospective	e appointee
243 and information regarding the prospective	appointee's
244 present and past committee service;	
245 (3)(A)(i)(c) for reappointments, obtain an indication of	of willingness
246 to serve from the prospective reappointee	e, the length of
247 the prospective reappointee's service on the prospective reappoint of	the
248 committee, the attendance record of the p	prospective
249 reappointee, the prospective reappointee'	's
250 contributions to the committee, and the pr	rospective
251 reappointee's other present and past com	nmittee
252 assignments; and	
253 (3)(A)(i)(d) present a list of prospective appointees at	nd
254 reappointees to the Council and report on	١
255 recommendations received regarding the	appointment
256 of members and chairs.	
257 (3)(A)(ii) Council's responsibilities. The Council shall appoint the	ne chair of
258 each committee. Whenever practical, appointments shall	ll reflect
geographical, gender, cultural and ethnic diversity.	
260 (3)(B) Terms. Except as otherwise provided in this rule, standing committee	ee members
shall serve staggered three year terms. Standing committee member	ers shall not
serve more than two consecutive terms on a committee unless the	Council
263 determines that exceptional circumstances exist which justify service	e of more
than two consecutive terms.	
265 (3)(C) Expenses. Members of standing and ad hoc committees may receive	ive
266 reimbursement for actual and necessary expenses incurred in the e	execution of
267 their duties as committee members.	

	Rule 1-205	DRAFT: 08/17/2018
268 269	(3)(D)	Secretariat. The Administrative Office shall serve as secretariat to the Council's committees.

270

Effective May/November 1, 20____

1 Rule 4-202.02. Records Classification.

- 2 Intent:
- 3 To classify court records as public or non-public.
- 4 Applicability:
- 5 This rule applies to the judicial branch.
- 6 Statement of the Rule:
- 7 (1) **Presumption of Public Court Records.** Court records are public unless otherwise
- 8 classified by this rule.
- 9 (2) **Public Court Records.** Public court records include but are not limited to:
- 10 (2)(A) abstract of a citation that redacts all non-public information;
- 11 (2)(B) aggregate records without non-public information and without personal identifying
- 12 information;
- 13 (2)(C) appellate filings, including briefs;
- 14 (2)(D) arrest warrants, but a court may restrict access before service;
- 15 (2)(E) audit reports;
- 16 (2)(F) case files;
- 17 (2)(G) committee reports after release by the Judicial Council or the court that
- 18 requested the study;
- 19 (2)(H) contracts entered into by the judicial branch and records of compliance with the 20 terms of a contract:
- 21 (2)(I) drafts that were never finalized but were relied upon in carrying out an action or policy;
- 23 (2)(J) exhibits, but the judge may regulate or deny access to ensure the integrity of the exhibit, a fair trial or interests favoring closure:
- 25 (2)(K) financial records;
- 26 (2)(L) indexes approved by the Management Committee of the Judicial Council,
- 27 including the following, in courts other than the juvenile court; an index may
- 28 contain any other index information:
- 29 (2)(L)(i) amount in controversy;
- 30 (2)(L)(ii) attorney name;
- 31 (2)(L)(iii) case number;

32		(2)(L)(iv) case status;
33		(2)(L)(v) civil case type or criminal violation;
34		(2)(L)(vi) civil judgment or criminal disposition;
35		(2)(L)(vii) daily calendar;
36		(2)(L)(viii) file date;
37		(2)(L)(ix) party name;
38	(2)(M)	name, business address, business telephone number, and business email
39		address of an adult person or business entity other than a party or a victim or
40		witness of a crime;
41	(2)(N)	name, address, telephone number, email address, date of birth, and last four
42		digits of the following: driver's license number; social security number; or account
43		number of a party;
44	(2)(O)	name, business address, business telephone number, and business email
45		address of a lawyer appearing in a case;
46	(2)(P)	name, business address, business telephone number, and business email
47		address of court personnel other than judges;
48	(2)(Q)	name, business address, and business telephone number of judges;
49	(2)(R)	name, gender, gross salary and benefits, job title and description, number of
50		hours worked per pay period, dates of employment, and relevant qualifications of
51		a current or former court personnel;
52	(2)(S)	unless classified by the judge as private or safeguarded to protect the personal
53		safety of the juror or the juror's family, the name of a juror empaneled to try a
54		case, but only 10 days after the jury is discharged;
55	(2)(T)	opinions, including concurring and dissenting opinions, and orders entered in
56		open hearings;
57	(2)(U)	order or decision classifying a record as not public;
58	(2)(V)	private record if the subject of the record has given written permission to make
59		the record public;
60	(2)(W)	probation progress/violation reports;
61	(2)(X)	publications of the administrative office of the courts;
62	(2)(Y)	record in which the judicial branch determines or states an opinion on the rights
63		of the state, a political subdivision, the public, or a person;
64	(2)(Z)	record of the receipt or expenditure of public funds;
65	(2)(AA)	record or minutes of an open meeting or hearing and the transcript of them;

66		(2)(BB)	record of	formal discipline of current or former court personnel or of a person				
67			regulated	by the judicial branch if the disciplinary action has been completed, and				
88			all time pe	eriods for administrative appeal have expired, and the disciplinary action				
69			was susta	ined;				
70		(2)(CC)	record of	a request for a record;				
71		(2)(DD)	reports us	reports used by the judiciary if all of the data in the report is public or the Judicia				
72			Council de	esignates the report as a public record;				
73		(2)(EE)	rules of th	e Supreme Court and Judicial Council;				
74		(2)(FF)	search wa	arrants, the application and all affidavits or other recorded testimony on				
75			which a w	arrant is based are public after they are unsealed under Utah Rule of				
76			Criminal F	Procedure 40;				
77		(2)(GG)	statistical	data derived from public and non-public records but that disclose only				
78			public dat	a; and				
79		(2)(HH)	notwithsta	inding subsections (6) and (7), if a petition, indictment, or information is				
30			filed charg	ging a person 14 years of age or older with a felony or an offense that				
31			would be	a felony if committed by an adult, the petition, indictment or information,				
32			the adjudi	cation order, the disposition order, and the delinquency history				
33			summary	of the person are public records. The delinquency history summary				
34			shall conta	ain the name of the person, a listing of the offenses for which the				
35			person wa	as adjudged to be within the jurisdiction of the juvenile court, and the				
36			disposition	n of the court in each of those offenses.				
37	(3)	Sealed	Court Rec	ords. The following court records are sealed:				
88		(3)(A)	records in	the following actions:				
39			(3)(A)(i)	Title 78B, Chapter 6, Part 1 – Utah Adoption Act six months after the				
90				conclusion of proceedings, which are private until sealed;				
91			(3)(A)(ii)	Title 78B, Chapter 15, Part 8 – Gestational Agreement, six months				
92				after the conclusion of proceedings, which are private until sealed;				
93			(3)(A)(iii)	Section 76-7-304.5 – Consent required for abortions performed on				
94				minors; and				
95			(3)(A)(iv)	Section 78B-8-402 – Actions for disease testing;				
96		(3)(B)	expunged	records;				
97		(3)(C)	orders au	thorizing installation of pen register or trap and trace device under Utah				
98			Code Sec	tion 77-23a-15;				
99		(3)(D)	records sh	nowing the identity of a confidential informant;				

100		(3)(E)	records re	lating to the possession of a financial institution by the commissioner of				
101			financial ir	nstitutions under Utah Code Section 7-2-6;				
102		(3)(F)	wills depo	sited for safe keeping under Utah Code Section 75-2-901;				
103		(3)(G)	records de	ecords designated as sealed by rule of the Supreme Court;				
104		(3)(H)	record of a	ecord of a Children's Justice Center investigative interview after the conclusion				
105			of any lega	of any legal proceedings; and				
106		(3)(I)	other reco	rds as ordered by the court under Rule 4-202.04.				
107	(4)	Private	Court Rec	ords. The following court records are private:				
108		(4)(A)	records in	the following actions:				
109			(4)(A)(i)	Section 62A-15-631, Involuntary commitment under court order;				
110			(4)(A)(ii)	Section 76-10-532, Removal from the National Instant Check System				
111				database;				
112			(4)(A)(iii)	Title 78B, Chapter 6, Part 1, Utah Adoption Act, until the records are				
113				sealed; and				
114			(4)(A)(iv)	Title 78B, Chapter 15, Part 8, Gestational Agreement, until the				
115				records are sealed; and				
116			(4)(A)(v)	cases initiated in the district court by filing an abstract of a juvenile				
117				court restitution judgment.				
118		(4)(B)	records in	the following actions, except that the case history, judgments, orders,				
119			decrees, le	etters of appointment, and the record of public hearings are public				
120			records:					
121			(4)(B)(i)	Title 30, Husband and Wife, including qualified domestic relations				
122				orders, except that an action for consortium due to personal injury				
123				under Section 30-2-11 is public;				
124			(4)(B)(ii)	Title 77, Chapter 3a, Stalking Injunctions;				
125			(4)(B)(iii)	Title 75, Chapter 5, Protection of Persons Under Disability and their				
126				Property;				
127			(4)(B)(iv)	Title 78B, Chapter 7, Protective Orders;				
128			(4)(B)(v)	Title 78B, Chapter 12, Utah Child Support Act;				
129			(4)(B)(vi)	Title 78B, Chapter 13, Utah Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction and				
130				Enforcement Act;				
131			(4)(B)(vii)	Title 78B, Chapter 14, Uniform Interstate Family Support Act;				
132			(4)(B)(viii)	Title 78B, Chapter 15, Utah Uniform Parentage Act; and				

133		(4)(B)(ix) an action to modify or enforce a judgment in any of the actions in this				
134		subparagraph (B);				
135	(4)(C)	affidavit of indigency;				
136	(4)(D)	an affidavit supporting a motion to waive fees;				
137	(4)(E)	aggregate records other than public aggregate records under subsection (2);				
138	(4)(F)	alternative dispute resolution records;				
139	(4)(G)	applications for accommodation under the Americans with Disabilities Act;				
140	(4)(H)	jail booking sheets;				
141	(4)(I)	citation, but an abstract of a citation that redacts all non-public information is				
142		public;				
143	(4)(J)	judgment information statement;				
144	(4)(K)	judicial review of final agency action under Utah Code Section 62A-4a-1009;				
145	(4)(L)	the following personal identifying information about a party: driver's license				
146		number, social security number, account description and number, password,				
147		identification number, maiden name and mother's maiden name, and similar				
148		personal identifying information;				
149	(4)(M)	the following personal identifying information about a person other than a party or				
150		a victim or witness of a crime: residential address, personal email address,				
151		personal telephone number; date of birth, driver's license number, social security				
152		number, account description and number, password, identification number,				
153		maiden name, mother's maiden name, and similar personal identifying				
154		information;				
155	(4)(N)	medical, psychiatric, or psychological records;				
156	(4)(O)	name of a minor, except that the name of a minor party is public in the following				
157		district and justice court proceedings:				
158		(4)(O)(i) name change of a minor;				
159		(4)(O)(ii) guardianship or conservatorship for a minor;				
160		(4)(O)(iii) felony, misdemeanor, or infraction;				
161		(4)(O)(iv) protective orders; and				
162		(4)(O)(v) custody orders and decrees;				
163	(4)(P)	nonresident violator notice of noncompliance;				
164	(4)(Q)	personnel file of a current or former court personnel or applicant for employment;				
165	(4)(R)	photograph, film, or video of a crime victim;				

166		(4)(S)	record of a	a court hearing closed to the public or of a child's testimony taken
167			under UR	CrP 15.5:
168			(4)(S)(i)	permanently if the hearing is not traditionally open to the public and
169				public access does not play a significant positive role in the process;
170				or
171			(4)(S)(ii)	if the hearing is traditionally open to the public, until the judge
172				determines it is possible to release the record without prejudice to the
173				interests that justified the closure;
174		(4)(T)	record sub	omitted by a senior judge or court commissioner regarding performance
175			evaluation	and certification;
176		(4)(U)	record sub	omitted for in camera review until its public availability is determined;
177		(4)(V)	reports of	investigations by Child Protective Services;
178		(4)(W)	victim imp	act statements;
179		(4)(X)	name of a	prospective juror summoned to attend court, unless classified by the
180			judge as s	safeguarded to protect the personal safety of the prospective juror or
181			the prospe	ective juror's family;
182		(4)(Y)	records file	ed pursuant to Rules 52 - 59 of the Utah Rules of Appellate Procedure,
183			except bri	efs filed pursuant to court order;
184		(4)(Z)	records in	a proceeding under Rule 60 of the Utah Rules of Appellate Procedure;
185			and	
186		(4)(AA)	other reco	rds as ordered by the court under Rule 4-202.04.
187	(5)	Protect	ed Court R	tecords. The following court records are protected:
188		(5)(A)	attorney's	work product, including the mental impressions or legal theories of an
189			attorney o	r other representative of the courts concerning litigation, privileged
190			communic	cation between the courts and an attorney representing, retained, or
191			employed	by the courts, and records prepared solely in anticipation of litigation or
192			a judicial,	quasi-judicial, or administrative proceeding;
193		(5)(B)	records th	at are subject to the attorney client privilege;
194		(5)(C)	bids or pro	oposals until the deadline for submitting them has closed;
195		(5)(D)	budget an	alyses, revenue estimates, and fiscal notes of proposed legislation
196			before iss	uance of the final recommendations in these areas;
197		(5)(E)	budget red	commendations, legislative proposals, and policy statements, that if
198			disclosed	would reveal the court's contemplated policies or contemplated
199			courses of	faction;

200		(5)(F)	court security plans;		
201		(5)(G)	investigation and analysis of loss covered by the risk management fund;		
202		(5)(H)	memorandum prepared by staff for a member of any body charged by law with		
203			performing a judicial function and used in the decision-making process;		
204		(5)(I)	confidential business records under Utah Code Section 63G-2-309;		
205		(5)(J)	record created or maintained for civil, criminal, or administrative enforcement		
206			purposes, audit or discipline purposes, or licensing, certification or registration		
207			purposes, if the record reasonably could be expected to:		
208			(5)(J)(i) interfere with an investigation;		
209			(5)(J)(ii) interfere with a fair hearing or trial;		
210			(5)(J)(iii) disclose the identity of a confidential source; or		
211			(5)(J)(iv) concern the security of a court facility;		
212		(5)(K)	record identifying property under consideration for sale or acquisition by the court		
213			or its appraised or estimated value unless the information has been disclosed to		
214			someone not under a duty of confidentiality to the courts;		
215		(5)(L)	record that would reveal the contents of settlement negotiations other than the		
216			final settlement agreement;		
217		(5)(M)	record the disclosure of which would impair governmental procurement or give		
218			an unfair advantage to any person;		
219		(5)(N)	record the disclosure of which would interfere with supervision of an offender's		
220			incarceration, probation, or parole;		
221		(5)(O)	record the disclosure of which would jeopardize life, safety, or property;		
222		(5)(P)	strategy about collective bargaining or pending litigation;		
223		(5)(Q)	test questions and answers;		
224		(5)(R)	trade secrets as defined in Utah Code Section 13-24-2;		
225		(5)(S)	record of a Children's Justice Center investigative interview before the conclusion		
226			of any legal proceedings;		
227		(5)(T)	presentence investigation report;		
228		(5)(U)	except for those filed with the court, records maintained and prepared by juvenile		
229			probation; and		
230		(5)(V)	other records as ordered by the court under Rule 4-202.04.		
231	(6)	Juvenil	e Court Social Records. The following are juvenile court social records:		
232		(6)(A)	correspondence relating to juvenile social records;		

233		(6)(B)	custody evaluations, parent-time evaluations, parental fitness evaluations,
234			substance abuse evaluations, domestic violence evaluations;
235		(6)(C)	medical, psychological, psychiatric evaluations;
236		(6)(D)	pre-disposition and social summary reports;
237		(6)(E)	probation agency and institutional reports or evaluations;
238		(6)(F)	referral reports;
239		(6)(G)	report of preliminary inquiries; and
240		(6)(H)	treatment or service plans.
241	(7)	Juveni	le Court Legal Records. The following are juvenile court legal records:
242		(7)(A)	accounting records;
243		(7)(B)	discovery filed with the court;
244		(7)(C)	pleadings, summonses, subpoenas, motions, affidavits, calendars, minutes,
245			findings, orders, decrees;
246		(7)(D)	name of a party or minor;
247		(7)(E)	record of a court hearing;
248		(7)(F)	referral and offense histories
249		(7)(G)	and any other juvenile court record regarding a minor that is not designated as a
250			social record.
251	(8)	Safegu	arded Court Records. The following court records are safeguarded:
252		(8)(A)	upon request, location information, contact information, and identity information
253			other than name of a petitioner and other persons to be protected in an action
254			filed under Title 77, Chapter 3a, Stalking Injunctions or Title 78B, Chapter 7,
255			Protective Orders;
256		(8)(B)	upon request, location information, contact information and identity information
257			other than name of a party or the party's child after showing by affidavit that the
258			health, safety, or liberty of the party or child would be jeopardized by disclosure
259			in a proceeding under Title 78B, Chapter 13, Utah Uniform Child Custody
260			Jurisdiction and Enforcement Act or Title 78B, Chapter 14, Uniform Interstate
261			Family Support Act or Title 78B, Chapter 15, Utah Uniform Parentage Act;
262		(8)(C)	location information, contact information, and identity information of prospective
263			jurors on the master jury list or the qualified jury list;
264		(8)(D)	location information, contact information, and identity information other than
265			name of a prospective juror summoned to attend court;
266		(8)(E)	the following information about a victim or witness of a crime:

267	(8)(E)(i)	business and personal address, email address, telephone number,
268		and similar information from which the person can be located or
269		contacted;
270	(8)(E)(ii)	date of birth, driver's license number, social security number, account
271		description and number, password, identification number, maiden
272		name, mother's maiden name, and similar personal identifying
273		information.
27/	Effective May/November	-1 20

DRAFT: 08/17/2018

1 Rule 4-508. Guidelines for Ruling on a Motion to Waive Fees.

- 2 Intent:
- 3 To promote statewide consistency in deciding motions to waive fees in civil cases and in the
- 4 expungement of criminal records in which the moving party is not a prisoner.
- 5 To promote statewide consistency in deciding motions to waive fees in juvenile court cases in
- 6 which the moving party is not a prisoner.
- 7 Nothing in this rule should be interpreted as limiting the discretion of the judge to decide a
- 8 motion to waive fees.

9 Applicability:

- 10 This rule applies to all civil and small claims cases and in the expungement of criminal records
- in which the moving party is not a prisoner.
- 12 This rule applies to all juvenile court cases in which the moving party is not a prisoner.
- 13 As used in this rule "fee waiver" and similar phrases include waiving the fee in full or in part, as
- 14 may be ordered by the judge.

15 **Statement of the Rule:**

- 16 (1) The moving party must complete a motion to waive fees and a financial affidavit approved
 17 by the Board of District Court Judges or, in the juvenile court, by the Board of Juvenile
 18 Court Judges Judicial Council's Standing Committee on Court Forms. The moving party
 19 must provide supporting documentation of the claims made in the affidavit. In juvenile
 20 court, the minor or a minor's parent, guardian or authorized representative may move to
 21 waive fees.
- Upon the filing of a motion to waive fees and financial affidavit, the court, sheriff or any other provider of a service offered by or through a government entity shall do what is necessary and proper as promptly as if the fee had been fully paid.
- 25 (3) A motion to waive fees may be decided without notice to the other parties, requires no
 26 response, request to submit for decision or hearing. The court will review the affidavit and
 27 make an independent determination whether the fee should be waived. The court should
 28 apply a common sense standard to the information and evaluate whether the information
 29 is complete, consistent and true. Section 78A-2-304 requires a party to pay a full or partial

30			e financial affidavit and any further questioning demonstrate the party is
31	(4)		ably able to pay a fee.
32	(4)	•	ral, a party is reasonably able to pay a fee if:
33		(4)(A)	gross monthly income exceeds 100% of the poverty guidelines updated
34			periodically in the Federal Register by the U.S. Department of Health and Human
35			Services under the authority of 42 U.S.C. 9902(2).
36		(4)(B)	the moving party has liquid assets that can be used to pay the fee without
37			harming the party's financial position;
38		(4)(C)	the moving party has credit that can be used to pay the fee without harming the
39			party's financial position;
40		(4)(D)	the moving party has assets that can be liquidated or borrowed against without
41			harming the party's financial position;
42		(4)(E)	expenses are less than net income;
43		(4)(F)	Section 30-3-3 applies and the court orders another party to pay the fee of the
44			moving party; or
45		(4)(G)	in the judge's discretion, the moving party is reasonably able to pay some part of
46			the fee.
47	(5)	If the m	oving party is represented by private counsel, the motion to waive fees may be
48		granted	in proportion to the attorney's discount of the attorney fee. The moving party's
49		attorney	y must provide an affidavit describing the fee agreement and what percentage of
50		the atto	rney's normal, full fee is represented by the discounted fee.
51	(6)	A motio	n to waive fees should be ruled upon within ten days after being filed.
52		(6)(A)	If the fee is fully waived, the court, sheriff or any other provider of a service
53			offered by or through a government entity shall do what is necessary and proper
54			as promptly as if the fee had been fully paid.
55		(6)(B)	If the fee is not fully waived, the court, sheriff or any other provider of a service
56			offered by or through a government entity may require payment of the fee before
57			doing what is necessary and proper. If the service has already been performed,
58			the court, sheriff or service provider may do what is necessary and proper to
59			collect the fee, including dismissal of the case.
60		(6)(C)	If the fee is not fully waived, the court shall notify the party in writing of the fee
61			amount, the procedure to challenge the fee; and the consequences of failing to
62			pay the fee.

DRAFT: 08/17/2018

(6)(D) If the motion is rejected because of a technical error, such as failure to complete a form correctly or to attach supporting documentation, the court shall notify the moving party, and the moving party may file a corrected motion and affidavit within 14 days after being notified of the decision.

- (7) In addition to any statutory remedies, an order granting a fee waiver may be reviewed at any time if the court has jurisdiction of the case. If the court determines, after waiving a fee, that the moving party is reasonably able to pay the fee, including from the proceeds of a judgment, the court may modify its previous order. The court may allocate the fee among the parties under Utah Rule of Civil Procedure 54, Utah Code Section 30-3-3, or as otherwise provided by law.
- 73 Effective May/November 1, 20____

1 Appendix I. Summary of Classification of Court Records

- 2 This chart is intended for use as a summary of how case record series are treated given
- 3 classification of the case. "Public," "Private," "Protected," and "Sealed" have the meanings
- 4 given them by Rule 4-202.03.
- 5 "Semi-private" is an administrative description of a case in which the documents generally are
- 6 private, but case identification is a matter of public record, as are the case history and the
- 7 orders, judgments, and decrees. See Rule 4-202.02(4)(B)(i)-(ix).
- 8 Select documents and other records in a "Public" or "Semi-private" case may be otherwise
- 9 classified by court order or because of the nature of the record or the nature of information
- 10 within a record.

Case Type	Summary Classification	Case Identification Is:	Case History Is:	Documents Are:	Judgment Is:
Abstract of Judgment	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Adjudication of Marriage / Common Law Marriage	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
Administrative Agency Review	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Administrative Search Warrant	Private until 20 days after filing	Private until 20 days after filing	Private until 20 days after filing	Private until 20 days after filing	
Adoption	Sealed within 6 months after decree	Private until Sealed	Private until Sealed	Private until Sealed	Private until Sealed
Asbestos	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Attorney Discipline	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Child Support Lien	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Civil Rights	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Civil Stalking	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
Cohabitant Abuse	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
Condemnation	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public

Conservatorship	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
Contract	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Criminal Investigations	ProtectedPublic unless otherwise ordered	ProtectedPublic unless otherwise ordered	ProtectedPublic unless otherwise ordered	ProtectedPublic unless otherwise ordered	ProtectedPublic unless otherwise ordered
Custody and Support	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
Debt Collection	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Deposit of Will	Sealed	Sealed	Sealed	Sealed	Sealed
Divorce	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
Estate/personal representative	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Eviction	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Extradition	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Felony	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Foreign Judgment	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Forfeiture of Property	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Gestational Agreement	Sealed within 6 months after decree	Private until Sealed	Private until Sealed	Private until Sealed	Private until Sealed
Grandparent Visitation	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
Guardianship	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
Hospital Lien	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Infraction	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Interpleader	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Involuntary Commitment	Private	Private	Private	Private	Private
Judgment By Confession	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public

	1				
Juvenile Court case types	Private	Private	Private	Private	Private
Lien Mortgage Foreclosure	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Malpractice	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Minors Settlement	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Miscellaneous	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Misdemeanor	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Name Change	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Other Civil	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Parking	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Paternity	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
Personal Injury	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Petition to Modify	Determined by the classification of the case in which the petition is filed.			ed.	
Post-Conviction Relief	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Probate	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Property Damage	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Property Rights	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Renew Judgment	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Separate Maintenance	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
Sexual Harassment	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Small Claims	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Small Claims Trial De Novo	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Subpoena for Deposition	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public

Supervised Administration	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Tax Court	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Tax Lien	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Tax Protest	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Traffic	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Trust	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
UCCJA Action	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
UISFSA Action	Semi-private	Public	Public	Private	Public
Water Rights	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Workforce Services Liens	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Writs	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Wrongful Death	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public
Wrongful Termination	Public	Public	Public	Public	Public

Effective May/November 1, 20____

11

TAB 4

Court Commissioner Conduct Committee

NOTES:

- 1 Rule 3-201.02. Court Commissioner Conduct Committee.
- 2 Intent:

6

7

- 3 To establish a procedure for the review of complaints filed against court commissioners.
- 4 Applicability:
- 5 This rule shall apply to all trial courts of record.

Statement of the Rule:

(1) Court Commissioner Conduct Committee.

8 Membership. The Court Commissioner Conduct Committee (in this rule 9 "committee") shall consist of the following members: 10 (1)(A)(i)as chair, the Court of Appeals member of the Ethics Advisory 11 Committee, who shall serve as chair of the committee; two presiding judges from judicial districts with a court commissioner, 12 (1)(A)(ii) 13 which presiding judges shall be from districts other than the district the 14 complained-of court commissioner primarily serves; 15 (1)(A)(iii) the immediate past Bar Commissioner member of on the Judicial 16 Council; and (1)(A)(iv) the chair of the Supreme Court Advisory Committee on Rules of 17 18 Professional Conduct. 19 Recusal of committee members. Circumstances which that would require (1)(B)20 recusal of a judge shall require recusal of a committee member from participation 21 in committee action. 22 (1)(B)(i) If the chair is recused, a majority of the remaining members shall 23 select from among themselves a chair pro tempore. 24 (1)(B)(ii) If a presiding judge is recused, the chair shall temporarily appoint a 25 presiding judge of another judicial district with a commissioner. 26 (1)(B)(iii) If the immediate past Bar Commissioner member of on the Judicial 27 Council is recused, the chair shall temporarily appoint another past 28 Bar Commissioner member of on the Judicial Council. 29 (1)(B)(iv) If the chair of the Supreme Court Advisory Committee on Rules of 30 Professional Conduct is recused, the chair shall temporarily appoint

Commented [MCD1]: Should complaints have deadlines (i.e., filed within 90 days of the alleged conduct)?

Rule 2-211: There is an "allegation" process for judicial and quasi-judicial failure to comply with the CJA and CJC already in place in Rule 2-211. How does this complaint review process dovetail with that rule?

Statute governing commissioners = 78A-5-107

31			another member of the Supreme Court Advisory Committee on Rules
32			of Professional Conduct.
33	(2)	Compla	
34		(2)(A)	Each complaint shall be in writing and shall contain:
35			(2)(A)(i) the complainant's name and contact information;
36			(2)(A)(ii) the name of the involved commissioner; and
37			(2)(A)(iii) a description of the commissioner's actions in sufficient detail to
38			inform the committee of the nature and date of the conduct.
39		(2)(B)	A person who has a complaint against a commissioner shall start the complaint
40			review process by delivering a copy of the written complaint to the committee
41			<u>chair.</u>
42		(2)(C)	Confidentiality. All proceedings and materials related to a complaint shall be
43			kept confidential. The following individuals shall have access to the complaint,
44			any materials produced in connection with the complaint review process, and the
45			hearing conducted in regard to the complaint under subsection (3), as necessary
46			for a fair determination of the issue, as follows:
47			(2)(C)(i) the committee chair;
48			(2)(C)(ii) the commissioner, if the complaint is not dismissed after the chair's
49			initial review:
50			(2)(C)(iii) the presiding judge of the district the court commissioner primarily
51			serves, if the complaint raises performance issues that should most
52			appropriately be addressed immediately by the presiding judge or if
53			the complaint is not dismissed after the chair's initial review;
54			(2)(C)(iv) the Presiding Officer of the Council, upon request or in connection
55			with the Judicial Council's authority and obligations under Rule 3-201;
56			(2)(C)(v) the committee members, if the committee is required to address any
57			issue related to the complaint; and
58			(2)(C)(vi) any other person upon the agreement of a majority of the committee
59			or the Presiding Officer of the Council.
60		(2)(D)	Initial Review. The chair shall make an initial review of the complaint. If the
61			complaint is not sufficiently clear in its allegations, the chair may elect to request
62			additional written information from the complainant, refer the matter for
63			investigation, or dismiss the matter under (2)(E). The purpose of the initial
64			review is to determine:
			

Commented [MCD2]: The commissioner receives notice of the dismissal of the complaint if dismissed after the chair's initial review (see (2)(E) below). Is there a policy reason for NOT providing notice of the complaint to the commissioner all of the time? Perhaps it discourages complaints if the complainant knows the commissioner will immediately be made aware?

Commented [MCD3]: This provision was specifically discussed for inclusion at the November meeting so that commissioner performance can be addressed immediately (not waiting to address ongoing performance until the end of the complaint process), but is it necessary to limit presiding judge access? It seems like the presiding judge, as supervisor (78A-5-107(6)(b)), should always have notice of the complaint.

Commented [MCD4]: I.e., allows the state court administrator, TCE, general counsel, etc. to have access and be involved as necessary, but only with committee or Council approval.

65		(2)(D)(i)	whether the complaint raises performance issues that should be
66			addressed immediately by the presiding judge of the district the
67			commissioner primarily serves;
68		(2)(D)(ii)	whether any issues require investigation by the committee; or
69		(2)(D)(iii)	whether the complaint is without merit and should be dismissed.
70	<u>(2)(</u>	E) Dismissa	I of complaint after initial review or investigation. The chair may
71		dismiss a	complaint if the initial review shows that the complaint is without merit.
72		The chair	of the committee shall provide notice of and basis for the dismissal to
73		the compl	ainant, the presiding judge, and the commissioner. The chair, upon
74		initial revie	ew, or the committee, after investigation, may consider a complaint to
75		be without	t merit if the complaint:
76		(2)(E)(i)	raises only issues of law or fact for which the remedy is the review of
77			the case by the trial court judge or by an appellate court;
78		(2)(E)(ii)	fails to state any basis for the committee to question the
79			commissioner's compliance with the provisions of this Code or the
80			Code of Judicial Conduct; or
81		(2)(E)(iii)	is investigated by the committee, the result of which shows that there
82			is no basis to question the commissioner's compliance with the
83			provisions of this Code or the Code of Judicial Conduct.
84	<u>(2)(</u>	F) Investiga	tion. The committee may investigate a complaint that is not dismissed
85		under par	agraph (2)(E). This investigation shall be conducted to more fully
86		understan	d the issues raised in the complaint and to determine whether
87		dismissal	or a hearing is appropriate.
88		(2)(F)(i)	The committee may request that the state court administrator appoint
89			a staff person within the administrative office to perform any
90			investigation and make any presentations to the committee or the
91			Council. The committee may request as much investigation as
92			necessary for a full determination of the issue.
93		(2)(F)(ii)	At the conclusion of the investigation, the committee shall deliberate
94			upon the information received, and if warranted, schedule the matter
95			for a hearing. Any complaint that is not scheduled for a hearing shall
96			be dismissed.
97	(2) Info	rmal complair	nt. An informal complaint against a court commissioner may be filed
98	with	the presiding j	udge of the court the court commissioner serves. The presiding judge

Commented [MCD5]: They get notice of the dismissal, so perhaps they need notice of the complaint to put the dismissal in context. Or perhaps the complaint is not initially provided and the chair's dismissal explains that a complaint had been filed and reviewed?

99		shall co	nduct such investigation and take such corrective action as warranted by the
100		complai	nt.
101	(3)	Formal	complaint.
102		(3)(A)	A formal complaint against a court commissioner shall be in writing and filed with
103			the presiding officer of the Council. The presiding officer shall refer the complaint
104			to the committee and provide a copy of the complaint to the court commissioner
105			and to the presiding judge of the court the commissioner serves.
106		(3)(B)	All proceedings and materials related to a formal complaint shall be kept
107			confidential.
108		(3)(C)	The chair or the committee shall dismiss a frivolous complaint. The chair or the
109			committee shall dismiss a complaint found to raise only issues of law or fact for
110			which a remedy is the review of the case by the trial court judge or by an
111			appellate court. The chair of the committee shall provide notice of and basis for
112			the dismissal to the complainant, the presiding judge and the commissioner.
113		(3)(D)	The committee may investigate a complaint that is not dismissed under
114			paragraph (3)(C). This investigation shall be conducted to determine whether
115			dismissal or a hearing is appropriate.
116		(3)(E)	The committee may request that the state court administrator appoint a staff
117			person within the administrative office to perform any investigation and make any
118			presentations to the Committee or the Council.
119	(4) (3	<u>)</u> Hearing	gs of the Court Commissioner Conduct Committee.
120		(4)(A) (3)(A) The hearings of the committee Committee hearings shall be closed to the
121			public. The committee shall interview the complainant, the court commissioner,
122			and any witnesses determined to have relevant information. The commissioner
123			has the right to testify. The commissioner and complainant may be present at
124			any hearing of the committee and have the assistance of counsel. The
125			commissioner may present and examine and cross-examine witnesses.
126			Testimony shall be presented under oath and a record of the proceedings
127			maintained. The commissioner may obtain a copy of the record upon payment of
128			any required fee.
129		(4)(B) (3	
130			findings concerning the merits of the complaint and provide a copy of the findings
131			to the complainant, the court commissioner, and the presiding judges of the any
132			court the commissioner serves.

Commented [MCD6]: Should this include to the Council? This would trigger the review in (4)(B)(i) and the time to file objections in (4)(B)(ii) . . .

133	(4)(C)(3)(C) If, after the hearing, the committee finds the complaint to have merit, the
134	committee shall recommend to the Council that a-sanctions be imposed under
135	CJA Rule 3-201(6). The committee shall dismiss any complaint found after
136	hearing to be without merit.
137	(5)(4) Council Review.
138	(5)(A)(4)(A) Complaints dismissed without a hearing. The chair of the committee
139	shall report to the Council not less than annually on the committee's work
140	including a general description of any complaint dismissed without a hearing.
141	(5)(B)(4)(B) Complaints with a committee hearing.
142	(5)(B)(i)(4)(B)(i) Upon request, Tthe Council shall review the record of the
143	committee hearing to determine the correct application of procedures
144	and to determine the sanction to be imposed.
145	(5)(B)(ii)(4)(B)(ii) The complainant, the commissioner, or any presiding
146	judges of athe districts the commissioner serves shall file any
147	objections to the committee's findings in writing with the Council. No
148	person is entitled to attend the Council meeting at which the complaint
149	is reviewed.
150	Effective May/November 1, 20

Commented [MCD7]: Or is the council wanting to be obligated to review every hearing?

Commented [MCD8]: What is the time frame for filing written objections? 15 days after written findings are delivered to the Council?

UTAH JUDICIAL CONDUCT COMMISSION – COMPLAINT RESOLUTION PROCESS

INITIAL SCREENING



PRELIMINARY INVESTIGATION



FULL INVESTIGATION



FORMAL PROCEEDINGS



SUPREME COURT



Executive Director reviews each "complaint" to determine whether it is a complaint within the JCC's jurisdiction.

Staff returns non-JCC complaints (i.e., complaints against bar members or court employees) to complainant with appropriate instructions.

For JCC complaints, staff prepares electronic and hard-copy files, sends acknowledgment letter to complainant, and returns hard-copy file to Executive Director.

Executive Director assigns investigator.

Note: Information received in any form other than a written complaint is submitted directly to JCC members, who review and discuss the information and vote to either take no action or to have staff conduct a preliminary investigation.

Investigator conducts preliminary investigation, writes preliminary

investigation report, and recommends whether to dismiss or to proceed to full investigation as to some or all allegations.

Executive Director reviews preliminary investigation report and recommendation, and may revise either.

Staff distributes preliminary investigation report and recommendation, along with pertinent materials, to JCC members.

JCC meets, reviews and discusses preliminary investigation report and recommendation, and votes to dismiss, to have staff conduct additional preliminary investigation, or to proceed to full investigation as to some or all allegations.

Staff provides judge with pertinent materials and asks judge to respond in writing to identified allegations.

Investigator conducts additional investigation, if necessary, as to issues raised in judge's response. Investigator may write supplemental investigation report and may make recommendation whether to dismiss or to proceed to formal proceedings.

Staff distributes judge's response and any supplemental investigation report and recommendation, along with pertinent materials, to JCC members.

JCC meets, reviews and discusses judge's response and any supplemental investigation report and recommendation, and votes to dismiss, to have staff conduct additional investigation, or to proceed to formal proceedings as to some or all allegations.

Staff prepares formal complaint and serves same upon judge via certified mail.

Judge may file written response.

Matter may be resolved by dismissal, stipulated resolution or confidential hearing.

A stipulated resolution may recommend:

Reprimand
Censure
Suspension
Removal from Office
Involuntary Retirement

After a confidential hearing, the JCC may dismiss the matter or may recommend:

Reprimand
Censure
Suspension
Removal from Office
Involuntary Retirement

Staff files JCC's recommendation and statutorily required materials with Supreme Court.

JCC'S recommendation becomes public upon filing. All other materials become public only upon Supreme Court order.

Supreme Court reviews the JCC's proceedings as to both law and fact, and implements, modifies or rejects JCC's recommendation.

Note: JCC dismissals are not reviewed by the Supreme Court.

TAB 5

HR 480 – Employee Exercise Policy

NOTES:

RULE AMENDMENT REQUEST Policy and Planning

Policy and Planning is an executive committee of the Judicial Council and is responsible for recommending to the Council new and amended rules for the Code of Judicial Administration and the Human Resource Policies and Procedures Manual.

Instructions: Unless the proposal is coming directly from the Utah Supreme Court, Judicial Council, or Management Committee, this Request Form must be submitted along with a draft of the proposed rule amendment before they will be considered by the Policy and Planning Committee. Once completed, please e-mail this form and the proposed rule changes to Keisa Williams at keisaw@utcourts.gov. **REQUESTER CONTACT INFORMATION:** E-mail: Phone Number: Name of Requester: Date of Request: **RULE AMENDMENT:** Rule Number: Location of Rule: **Brief Description of Proposed Amendment:** Reason Amendment is Needed: Is this proposal urgent? If Yes, provide an estimated deadline date and explain why it is urgent: No

Yes

List all stakeholders:

Select each entity that has approved this proposal:

Board of Appellate Court Judges

Accounting Manual Committee Legislative Liaison Committee

ADR Committee Licensed Paralegal Practitioner Committee

Board of District Court Judges Model Utah Criminal Jury Instructions Committee

Model Utah Civil Jury Instructions Committee

Board of Justice Court Judges Policy and Planning member

Board of Juvenile Court Judges Pretrial Release and Supervision Committee

Board of Senior Judges Resources for Self-represented Parties Committee

Children and Family Law Committee Rules of Appellate Procedure Advisory Committee

Court Commissioner Conduct Committee Rules of Civil Procedure Advisory Committee

Court Facility Planning Committee Rules of Criminal Procedure Advisory Committee

Court Forms Committee Rules of Evidence Advisory Committee

Ethics Advisory Committee Rules of Juvenile Procedure Advisory Committee

Ethics and Discipline Committee of the Utah Supreme Court Rules of Professional Conduct Advisory Committee

General Counsel State Court Administrator

Guardian ad Litem Oversight Committee TCE's

Judicial Branch Education Committee Technology Committee

Judicial Outreach Committee Uniform Fine and Bail Committee

Language Access Committee WINGS Committee

Law Library Oversight Committee NONE OF THE ABOVE

If the approving entity is not listed above, please list it here:

Requester's Signature: Supervisor's Signature (if requester is not a manager or above):

FOR POLICY AND PLANNING USE ONLY

Proposal Accepted? Queue Priority Level: Committee Notes/Comments:

Yes Red
No Yellow
Green

Date Committee Approved for Public Comment:

Date Committee Approved for Final Recommendation to Judicial Council:

EXERCISE POLICY 480 (Draft)

PURPOSE

The purpose of this policy is to promote the general physical and emotional well being of Court employees by establishing an opportunity for employees to participate in an exercise program which will:

- A. Improve the overall health and well-being of employees;
- B. Encourage a personal commitment among employees to adopt healthy activities as a permanent lifestyle:
- C. Help reduce stress and the risk of cardiovascular disease factors in employees;
- D. Improve productivity in the workplace, which will benefit both the Court and the employees;
- E. Promote employee job satisfaction, and
- F. Attract and retain quality employees.

SCOPE

This policy establishes guidelines and procedures for an employee interested in starting or maintaining an exercise program.

This policy applies to all court employees.

POLICY AND PROCEDURE

- I. General
 - I.I Full-time benefited employees are eligible for the option of using 30 compensated minutes a day for up to three days per week during their scheduled work hours to participate in an exercise program.
 - 1.1.1 Employees working a 4/10 work schedule have the option of 30 compensated minutes a day for up to two days per week.
 - 1.2 This time is for an appropriate exercise program promoting physical fitness and is not intended to provide extra time for personal matters other than physical fitness exercise that consists of 30 consecutive minutes of cardiovascular, strength training, or conditioning.
 - 1.3 Employees, with the approval of their supervisor, may use the 30 minutes in conjunction with their scheduled lunch hour.
 - 1.4 Supervisors may not authorize employees to use the 30 minute period at the start of the workday to delay arrival, nor at the end of the workday to allow early departure.
 - 1.5 Exercise time is not cumulative (that is, exercise time not used during the week cannot be carried over into any subsequent day or week).
 - 1.6 Exercise time should not result in the accrual of excess hours.

2. Guidelines

- 2.1 Participation in the exercise program is neither an employee right nor a guaranteed benefit.
- 2.2 Exercise time must be pre-approved by the employee's immediate supervisor to ensure that normal operations will be maintained.
- 2.3 Authorization to participate in this program may be revoked if the provisions of the program are violated or if it interferes with the employee's ability to accomplish work assignments in a timely and accurate manner.
- 2.4 Employees are encouraged to consult with their personal physician to ensure they are physically capable of participating in this exercise program.
- 2.5 Employees participating in this program do so at their own risk. The Courts are not responsible for any and all injuries, illnesses, and other consequences suffered by the employee while participating in this program. Injuries incurred during compensated exercise time will not be considered work-related injuries for purposes of workers compensation benefits.
- 2.6 Authorization to participate in this program shall be revoked if the provisions of this policy are violated. This includes repeated violation of the basic intent of the program which is to adopt a regular program of exercise to enhance and improve physical conditioning. Policy violations may result in disciplinary action.
- 2.7 Authorization to participate in this program shall be revoked if the employee is subject to disciplinary action or placed on a Performance Improvement Plan (PIP), but may be reauthorized after successful completion of the PIP.

3. Procedures

- 3.1 An employee requests approval from the supervisor to participate in this program.
- 3.2 An employee approved to participate in this program completes the "Utah Courts Employee Fitness Agreement" and secures the signature of the supervisor.
- 3.3 An employee approved for participation in this program records exercise time as hours worked in ESS.

UTAH COURTS EMPLOYEE FITNESS AGREEMENT

In accordance with Exercise Policy 480 the employee listed below agrees to comply with the policy and participate in an appropriate exercise program promoting physical fitness that is not intended to provide extra time for personal matters other than physical fitness exercise that consists of 30 consecutive minutes of cardiovascular, strength training, or conditioning.

Employee Name (please print)	District
The following time schedule will be observed	ed:
Day(s) of the week:	
Time(s):	
Note: any modifications to the schedule sta supervisor.	ted above must be coordinated with and approved by your
Employee Signature	Date
Supervisor Signature	 Date

EXERCISE POLICY 480 (Draft)

PURPOSE

The purpose of this policy is to promote the general physical and emotional well being of Court employees by establishing an opportunity for employees to participate in an exercise program which will:

- A. Improve the overall health and well-being of employees;
- B. Encourage a personal commitment among employees to adopt healthy activities as a permanent lifestyle;
- C. Help reduce stress and the risk of cardiovascular disease factors in employees;
- D. Improve productivity in the workplace, which will benefit both the Court and the employees;
- E. Promote employee job satisfaction, and
- F. Attract and retain quality employees.

SCOPE

This policy establishes guidelines and procedures for an employee interested in starting or maintaining an exercise program.

This policy applies to all court employees.

POLICY AND PROCEDURE

I. General

- 1.1 Full-time employees are eligible for the option of using 30 compensated minutes a day for up to three days per week during their scheduled work hours to participate in an exercise program.
 - I.I.I Employees working a 4/10 work schedule have the option of 30 compensated minutes a day for up to two days per week.
 - 1.1.2 Employees working a 4/9 and a 4 work schedule have the option of 30 compensated minutes a day for up to two days per week.
 - 1.1.3 Part time employees working 30 hours per week have the option of 30 compensated minutes a day for up to two days per week.
 - 1.1.4 Part time employees working 20 hours per week have the option of 30 compensated minutes for one day a week.
- 1.2 This time is for an appropriate exercise program promoting physical fitness and is not intended to provide extra time for personal matters other than physical fitness exercise that consists of 30 consecutive minutes of cardiovascular, strength training, or conditioning.
- 1.3 Employees, with the approval of their supervisor, may use the 30 minutes in conjunction with their scheduled lunch hour.
- 1.4 Supervisors may not authorize employees to use the 30 minute period at the start of the workday to delay arrival, nor at the end of the workday to allow early departure.

- 1.5 Exercise time is not cumulative (that is, exercise time not used during the week cannot be carried over into any subsequent day or week).
- 1.6 Exercise time should not result in the accrual of excess hours.

2. Guidelines

- 2.1 Participation in the exercise program is neither an employee right nor a guaranteed benefit.
- 2.2 Exercise time must be pre-approved by the employee's immediate supervisor to ensure that normal operations will be maintained.
- 2.3 Authorization to participate in this program may be revoked if the provisions of the program are violated or if it interferes with the employee's ability to accomplish work assignments in a timely and accurate manner.
- 2.4 Employees are encouraged to consult with their personal physician to ensure they are physically capable of participating in this exercise program.
- 2.5 Employees participating in this program do so at their own risk. The Courts are not responsible for any and all injuries, illnesses, and other consequences suffered by the employee while participating in this program.
- 2.6 Authorization to participate in this program shall be revoked if the provisions of this policy are violated. This includes repeated violation of the basic intent of the program which is to adopt a regular program of exercise to enhance and improve physical conditioning. Policy violations may result in disciplinary action.
- 2.7 Authorization to participate in this program shall be revoked if the employee is subject to disciplinary action or placed on a Performance Improvement Plan (PIP), but may be reauthorized after successful completion of the PIP.

3. Procedures

- 3.1 An employee requests approval from the supervisor to participate in this program.
- 3.2 An employee approved to participate in this program completes the "Utah Courts Employee Fitness Agreement" and secures the signature of the supervisor.
- 3.3 An employee approved for participation in this program records exercise time as hours worked in ESS.

UTAH COURTS EMPLOYEE FITNESS AGREEMENT

In accordance with Exercise Policy 480 the employee listed below agrees to comply with the policy and participate in an appropriate exercise program promoting physical fitness that is not intended to provide extra time for personal matters other than physical fitness exercise that consists of 30 consecutive minutes of cardiovascular, strength training, or conditioning.

Employee Name (please print)	District
The following time schedule will be observed:	
Day(s) of the week:	
Time(s):	
Note: any modifications to the schedule stated supervisor.	above must be coordinated with and approved by your
Employee Signature	Date
Supervisor Signature	 Date