



# Administrative Office of the Courts

Chief Justice Matthew B. Durrant  
Utah Supreme Court  
Chair, Utah Judicial Council

## MEMORANDUM

Daniel J. Becker  
State Court Administrator  
Raymond H. Wahl  
Deputy Court Administrator

**To:** Policy and Planning Committee  
**From:** Nancy Sylvester *Nancy D. Sylvester*  
**Date:** September 30, 2016  
**Re:** Tax records and confidentiality

Mark Buchi and Steve Young, attorneys at Holland and Hart, contacted Rick Schwermer about preserving taxpayer confidentiality in appeals to the Utah Tax Court from the Utah State Tax Commission. To accomplish this they proposed amending Rule 4-202.02 of the Utah Code of Judicial Administration to add a subsection (5)(V) as follows:

(5) The following court records are protected:

\* \* \*

(5)(V) records of tax cases appealed to district court pursuant to Utah Code Section 59-1-601;

They also proposed that Rule 6-103(6) be amended as follows:

(6) If a tax judge decides a taxation case of first impression, or one which creates new law or gives new guidance, the tax judge shall cause an opinion of the case to be published. An opinion need not be published where the case deals with settled rules of law. An opinion shall be published only after the taxpayer has had the opportunity to review the decision and redact information the taxpayer deems to be confidential, as approved by the tax judge.

Rick will attend the meeting to discuss the background behind the request. The committee may invite Mr. Buchi and Mr. Young to November's meeting to gather more information about their proposal.

The mission of the Utah judiciary is to provide the people an open, fair, efficient, and independent system for the advancement of justice under the law.

**Rule 4-202.02. Records classification.****Intent:**

To classify court records as public or non-public.

**Applicability:**

This rule applies to the judicial branch.

**Statement of the Rule:**

(1) Court records are public unless otherwise classified by this rule.

(2) Public court records include but are not limited to:

(2)(A) abstract of a citation that redacts all non-public information;

(2)(B) aggregate records without non-public information and without personal identifying information;

(2)(C) appellate filings, including briefs;

(2)(D) arrest warrants, but a court may restrict access before service;

(2)(E) audit reports;

(2)(F) case files;

(2)(G) committee reports after release by the Judicial Council or the court that requested the study;

(2)(H) contracts entered into by the judicial branch and records of compliance with the terms of a contract;

(2)(I) drafts that were never finalized but were relied upon in carrying out an action or policy;

(2)(J) exhibits, but the judge may regulate or deny access to ensure the integrity of the exhibit, a fair trial or interests favoring closure;

(2)(K) financial records;

(2)(L) indexes approved by the Management Committee of the Judicial Council, including the following, in courts other than the juvenile court; an index may contain any other index information:

(2)(L)(i) amount in controversy;

(2)(L)(ii) attorney name;

(2)(L)(iii) case number;

(2)(K)(iv) case status;

(2)(L)(v) civil case type or criminal violation;

(2)(L)(vi) civil judgment or criminal disposition;

(2)(L)(vii) daily calendar;

(2)(L)(viii) file date;

(2)(M) party name;

(2)(N) name, business address, business telephone number, and business email address of an adult person or business entity other than a party or a victim or witness of a crime;

(2)(O) name, address, telephone number, email address, date of birth, and last four digits of the following: driver's license number; social security number; or account number of a party;

(2)(P) name, business address, business telephone number, and business email address of a lawyer appearing in a case;

(2)(Q) name, business address, business telephone number, and business email address of court personnel other than judges;

(2)(R) name, business address, and business telephone number of judges;

(2)(S) name, gender, gross salary and benefits, job title and description, number of hours worked per pay period, dates of employment, and relevant qualifications of a current or former court personnel;

(2)(T) unless classified by the judge as private or safeguarded to protect the personal safety of the juror or the juror's family, the name of a juror empaneled to try a case, but only 10 days after the jury is discharged;

(2)(U) opinions, including concurring and dissenting opinions, and orders entered in open hearings;

(2)(V) order or decision classifying a record as not public;

(2)(W) private record if the subject of the record has given written permission to make the record public;

(2)(X) probation progress/violation reports;

(2)(Y) publications of the administrative office of the courts;

(2)(Z) record in which the judicial branch determines or states an opinion on the rights of the state, a political subdivision, the public, or a person;

(2)(AA) record of the receipt or expenditure of public funds;

(2)(BB) record or minutes of an open meeting or hearing and the transcript of them;

(2)(CC) record of formal discipline of current or former court personnel or of a person regulated by the judicial branch if the disciplinary action has been completed, and all time periods for administrative appeal have expired, and the disciplinary action was sustained;

(2)(DD) record of a request for a record;

(2)(EE) reports used by the judiciary if all of the data in the report is public or the Judicial Council designates the report as a public record;

(2)(FF) rules of the Supreme Court and Judicial Council;

(2)(GG) search warrants, the application and all affidavits or other recorded testimony on which a warrant is based are public after they are unsealed under Utah Rule of Criminal Procedure 40;

(2)(HH) statistical data derived from public and non-public records but that disclose only public data;

(2)(II) Notwithstanding subsections (6) and (7), if a petition, indictment, or information is filed charging a person 14 years of age or older with a felony or an offense that would be a felony if committed by an adult, the petition, indictment or information, the adjudication order, the disposition order, and the

delinquency history summary of the person are public records. The delinquency history summary shall contain the name of the person, a listing of the offenses for which the person was adjudged to be within the jurisdiction of the juvenile court, and the disposition of the court in each of those offenses.

(3) The following court records are sealed:

(3)(A) records in the following actions:

(3)(A)(i) Title 78B, Chapter 6, Part 1, Utah Adoption Act six months after the conclusion of proceedings, which are private until sealed;

(3)(A)(ii) Title 78B, Chapter 15, Part 8, Gestational Agreement, six months after the conclusion of proceedings, which are private until sealed; and-

(3)(A)(iii) Title 76, Chapter 7, Part 304.5, Consent required for abortions performed on minors; and

(3)(B) expunged records;

(3)(C) orders authorizing installation of pen register or trap and trace device under Utah Code Section 77-23a-15;

(3)(D) records showing the identity of a confidential informant;

(3)(E) records relating to the possession of a financial institution by the commissioner of financial institutions under Utah Code Section 7-2-6;

(3)(F) wills deposited for safe keeping under Utah Code Section 75-2-901;

(3)(G) records designated as sealed by rule of the Supreme Court;

(3)(H) record of a Children's Justice Center investigative interview after the conclusion of any legal proceedings; and

(3)(I) other records as ordered by the court under Rule 4-202.04.

(4) The following court records are private:

(4)(A) records in the following actions:

(4)(A)(i) Section 62A-15-631, Involuntary commitment under court order;

(4)(A)(ii) Section 76-10-532, Removal from the National Instant Check System database;

(4)(A)(iii) Title 78B, Chapter 6, Part 1, Utah Adoption Act, until the records are sealed; and

(4)(A)(iv) Title 78B, Chapter 15, Part 8, Gestational Agreement, until the records are sealed;

and

(4)(B) records in the following actions, except that the case history; judgments, orders and decrees; letters of appointment; and the record of public hearings are public records:

(4)(B)(i) Title 30, Husband and Wife, including qualified domestic relations orders, except that an action for consortium due to personal injury under Section 30-2-11 is public;

(4)(B)(ii) Title 77, Chapter 3a, Stalking Injunctions;

(4)(B)(iii) Title 75, Chapter 5, Protection of Persons Under Disability and their Property;

(4)(B)(iv) Title 78B, Chapter 7, Protective Orders;

(4)(B)(v) Title 78B, Chapter 12, Utah Child Support Act;

(4)(B)(vi) Title 78B, Chapter 13, Utah Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction and Enforcement Act;

(4)(B)(vii) Title 78B, Chapter 14, Uniform Interstate Family Support Act;

(4)(B)(viii) Title 78B, Chapter 15, Utah Uniform Parentage Act; and

(4)(B)(ix) an action to modify or enforce a judgment in any of the actions in this subparagraph (B);

(4)(C) an affidavit supporting a motion to waive fees;

(4)(D) aggregate records other than public aggregate records under subsection (2);

(4)(E) alternative dispute resolution records;

(4)(F) applications for accommodation under the Americans with Disabilities Act;

(4)(G) jail booking sheets;

(4)(H) citation, but an abstract of a citation that redacts all non-public information is public;

(4)(I) judgment information statement;

(4)(J) judicial review of final agency action under Utah Code Section 62A-4a-1009;

(4)(K) the following personal identifying information about a party: driver's license number, social security number, account description and number, password, identification number, maiden name and mother's maiden name, and similar personal identifying information;

(4)(L) the following personal identifying information about a person other than a party or a victim or witness of a crime: residential address, personal email address, personal telephone number; date of birth, driver's license number, social security number, account description and number, password, identification number, maiden name, mother's maiden name, and similar personal identifying information;

(4)(M) medical, psychiatric, or psychological records;

(4)(N) name of a minor, except that the name of a minor party is public in the following district and justice court proceedings:

(4)(N)(i) name change of a minor;

(4)(N)(ii) guardianship or conservatorship for a minor;

(4)(N)(iii) felony, misdemeanor or infraction;

(4)(N)(iv) child protective orders; and

(4)(N)(v) custody orders and decrees;

(4)(O) nonresident violator notice of noncompliance;

(4)(P) personnel file of a current or former court personnel or applicant for employment;

(4)(Q) photograph, film or video of a crime victim;

(4)(R) record of a court hearing closed to the public or of a child's testimony taken under URCrP 15.5:

(4)(R)(i) permanently if the hearing is not traditionally open to the public and public access does not play a significant positive role in the process; or

(4)(R)(ii) if the hearing is traditionally open to the public, until the judge determines it is possible to release the record without prejudice to the interests that justified the closure;

(4)(S) record submitted by a senior judge or court commissioner regarding performance evaluation and certification;

(4)(T) record submitted for in camera review until its public availability is determined;

(4)(U) reports of investigations by Child Protective Services;

(4)(V) victim impact statements;

(4)(W) name of a prospective juror summoned to attend court, unless classified by the judge as safeguarded to protect the personal safety of the prospective juror or the prospective juror's family;

(4)(X) records filed pursuant to Rules 52 - 59 of the Utah Rules of Appellate Procedure, except briefs filed pursuant to court order;

(4)(Y) records in a proceeding under Rule 60 of the Utah Rules of Appellate Procedure; and

(4)(Z) other records as ordered by the court under Rule 4-202.04.

(5) The following court records are protected:

(5)(A) attorney's work product, including the mental impressions or legal theories of an attorney or other representative of the courts concerning litigation, privileged communication between the courts and an attorney representing, retained, or employed by the courts, and records prepared solely in anticipation of litigation or a judicial, quasi-judicial, or administrative proceeding;

(5)(B) records that are subject to the attorney client privilege;

(5)(C) bids or proposals until the deadline for submitting them has closed;

(5)(D) budget analyses, revenue estimates, and fiscal notes of proposed legislation before issuance of the final recommendations in these areas;

(5)(E) budget recommendations, legislative proposals, and policy statements, that if disclosed would reveal the court's contemplated policies or contemplated courses of action;

(5)(F) court security plans;

(5)(G) investigation and analysis of loss covered by the risk management fund;

(5)(H) memorandum prepared by staff for a member of any body charged by law with performing a judicial function and used in the decision-making process;

(5)(I) confidential business records under Utah Code Section 63G-2-309;

(5)(J) record created or maintained for civil, criminal, or administrative enforcement purposes, audit or discipline purposes, or licensing, certification or registration purposes, if the record reasonably could be expected to:

(5)(J)(i) interfere with an investigation;

(5)(J)(ii) interfere with a fair hearing or trial;

(5)(J)(iii) disclose the identity of a confidential source; or

(5)(J)(iv) concern the security of a court facility;

(5)(K) record identifying property under consideration for sale or acquisition by the court or its appraised or estimated value unless the information has been disclosed to someone not under a duty of confidentiality to the courts;

(5)(L) record that would reveal the contents of settlement negotiations other than the final settlement agreement;

(5)(M) record the disclosure of which would impair governmental procurement or give an unfair advantage to any person;

(5)(N) record the disclosure of which would interfere with supervision of an offender's incarceration, probation or parole;

(5)(O) record the disclosure of which would jeopardize life, safety or property;

(5)(P) strategy about collective bargaining or pending litigation;

(5)(Q) test questions and answers;

(5)(R) trade secrets as defined in Utah Code Section 13-24-2;

(5)(S) record of a Children's Justice Center investigative interview before the conclusion of any legal proceedings;

(5)(T) presentence investigation report;

(5)(U) except for those filed with the court, records maintained and prepared by juvenile probation; and

(5)(V) records of tax cases appealed to district court pursuant to Utah Code Section 59-1-601;

~~(5)(W)~~ other records as ordered by the court under Rule 4-202.04.

(6) The following are juvenile court social records:

(6)(A) correspondence relating to juvenile social records;

(6)(B) custody evaluations, parent-time evaluations, parental fitness evaluations, substance abuse evaluations, domestic violence evaluations;

(6)(C) medical, psychological, psychiatric evaluations;

(6)(D) pre-disposition and social summary reports;

(6)(E) probation agency and institutional reports or evaluations;

(6)(F) referral reports;

(6)(G) report of preliminary inquiries; and

(6)(H) treatment or service plans.

(7) The following are juvenile court legal records:

(7)(A) accounting records;

(7)(B) discovery filed with the court;

(7)(C) pleadings, summonses, subpoenas, motions, affidavits, calendars, minutes, findings, orders, decrees;

(7)(D) name of a party or minor;

(7)(E) record of a court hearing;

(7)(F) referral and offense histories

(7)(G) and any other juvenile court record regarding a minor that is not designated as a social record.

(8) The following are safeguarded records:

(8)(A) upon request, location information, contact information and identity information other than name of a petitioner and other persons to be protected in an action filed under Title 77, Chapter 3a, Stalking Injunctions or Title 78B, Chapter 7, Protective Orders;

(8)(B) upon request, location information, contact information and identity information other than name of a party or the party's child after showing by affidavit that the health, safety, or liberty of the party or child would be jeopardized by disclosure in a proceeding under Title 78B, Chapter 13, Utah Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction and Enforcement Act or Title 78B, Chapter 14, Uniform Interstate Family Support Act or Title 78B, Chapter 15, Utah Uniform Parentage Act;

(8)(C) location information, contact information and identity information of prospective jurors on the master jury list or the qualified jury list;

(8)(D) location information, contact information and identity information other than name of a prospective juror summoned to attend court;

(8)(E) the following information about a victim or witness of a crime:

(8)(E)(i) business and personal address, email address, telephone number and similar information from which the person can be located or contacted;

(8)(E)(ii) date of birth, driver's license number, social security number, account description and number, password, identification number, maiden name, mother's maiden name, and similar personal identifying information.



**Rule 6-103. District court tax judges.**

Intent:

To designate certain district court judges as tax judges.

To establish a procedure whereby district court tax cases are heard by designated tax judges.

To designate a supervising tax judge.

Applicability:

This rule shall apply to district court judges.

Statement of the Rule:

(1) The Judicial Council shall formally designate at least three district court judges who volunteer as tax judges. In making the designation, the Judicial Council shall consider the knowledge and experience of the judge in relation to the theory and practice of ad valorem, excise, income, sales and use, and corporate taxation.

(2) If a party to a case involving taxation makes a request, as part of the complaint, petition for review, or first responsive pleading, to have the case assigned to a tax judge, the case will be assigned to a tax judge. Thereafter, a request to have the case assigned to a tax judge may be granted in the discretion of the judge assigned to the case.

(3) Assignment of cases involving taxation to a tax judge shall be made on a random basis. Assignment will include an adjustment in the judge's calendar to allow the judge to handle the case.

(4) For purposes of this Rule 6-103, cases involving taxation include:

(i) appeals from and petitions for review of decisions of the Utah State Tax Commission;

(ii) actions brought for recovery of a tax or portion of a tax paid under protest; and

(iii) cases which originate under Section 59-2-402 of the Utah Code relating to transitory personal property.

(5) The tax judges shall elect one of the tax judges to be the supervising tax judge. The term of office of the supervising tax judge is two years beginning July 1. The supervising tax judge shall be primarily responsible for:

(i) the assignment of taxation cases to tax judges;

(ii) the coordination of schedules of tax judges and the assignment of courtrooms and facilities in conjunction with the state court administrator and the presiding judge of each district court;

(iii) addressing concerns of tax judges, other district court judges, or the Judicial Council regarding the management of district court taxation cases;

(iv) overseeing the tax education of the tax judges, in conjunction with the Standing Committee on Judicial Branch Education and the Education Division of the Administrative Office of the Courts;

(v) presiding over meetings of the tax judges; and

(vi) the use of law clerk resources to develop tax expertise, to assist the tax judges, and to facilitate consistency in the development of case precedents in the tax area and otherwise assist in the transition as new tax judges are designated.

(6) If a tax judge decides a taxation case of first impression, or one which creates new law or gives new guidance, the tax judge shall cause an opinion of the case to be published. An opinion need not be published where the case deals with settled rules of law. An opinion shall be published only after the taxpayer has had the opportunity to review the decision and redact information the taxpayer deems to be confidential, as approved by the tax judge.

(7) Tax judges shall serve only so long as they are district court judges. Tax judges may, however, resign as tax judges, at their own request or the request of the Judicial Council, while still serving as district court judges.

(8) If a tax judge does not have a full workload of taxation cases, the judge shall hear non-tax district court cases to maintain a full workload of cases.