## Agenda

## Supreme Court Advisory Committee Utah Rules of Civil Procedure April 26, 2023 4:00 to 6:00 p.m.

## via <u>WebEx</u>

Welcome and approval of Feb. minutes	Tab 1	Lauren DiFrancesco		
Rule 26(g)				
Rules Returning from Public Comment - 4, 7, 83, 100A, and 10(d)	Tab 2	Lauren DiFrancesco		
Rule 42 - Comments from Supreme Court	Tab 3	Lauren DiFrancesco		
Rule 47 – attorney voir dire – update	Tab 4	Lauren DiFrancesco and Judge Holmberg		
HJR2 – amendment of Rule 65A	Tab 5	Lauren DiFrancesco		
Rule 30(b)(6)	Tab 6	Justin Toth		
MSJ Deadline	Tab 7	Rod Andreason		
Rule 45 - Comments from Supreme Court	Tab 8	Lauren DiFrancesco		
Consent agenda - None				
<ul> <li>Pipeline items:</li> <li>Rule 60 (Judge Cornish &amp; Subcommittee)</li> <li>Rules 69A, 69B, and 69C (Chad Rasmussen)</li> <li>Remote Hearings (Tim Pack &amp; Subcommittee)</li> <li>Rule 74 (Steve Leech &amp; Subcommittee)</li> <li>Rule 104 (Susan Vogel &amp; Subcommittee)</li> <li>Rule 101 (Jim Hunnicutt &amp; Subcommittee)</li> <li>Eviction Expungements (Lauren DiFrancesco &amp; Subcommittee)</li> <li>Rule 3(a)(2) (Trevor Lee &amp; Subcommittee)</li> </ul>		Lauren DiFrancesco		

## Next Meeting: May 24 (Hybrid)

Meeting Schedule: 4th Wednesday at 4pm unless otherwise scheduled

Committee Webpage: <a href="http://www.utcourts.gov/committees/civproc/">http://www.utcourts.gov/committees/civproc/</a>

# Tab 1

#### UTAH SUPREME COURT ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE

#### Summary Minutes – March 22, 2023 In-Person and via Webex

### DUE TO THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC AND PUBLIC HEALTH EMERGENCY THIS MEETING WAS CONDUCTED ELECTRONICALLY VIA WEBEX

Committee members	Present	Excused	Guests/Staff Present			
Rod N. Andreason, Vice-Chair	X		Stacy Haacke, Staff			
Lauren DiFrancesco, Chair	X		Keri Sargent			
Judge Kent Holmberg	X		Brent Salazar-Hall			
James Hunnicutt	X		Nicole Salazar-Hall			
Trevor Lee	X		Nick Stiles			
Ash McMurray	X		Lacey Cherrington			
Michael Stahler	X		Greg Constantino			
Timothy Pack	X		Quinn Kofford			
Loni Page	X		Tim Clark			
Bryan Pattison		X				
Judge Laura Scott	X					
Judge Clay Stucki		X				
Judge Andrew H. Stone	X					
Justin T. Toth	X					
Susan Vogel	X					
Tonya Wright	X					
Judge Rita Cornish	X					
Commissioner Catherine Conklin	X					
Giovanna Spiess	X					
Jonas Anderson						
Heather Lester	X					
Jensie Anderson	X					
Emeritus Seats Vacant						

#### (1) **INTRODUCTIONS**

The meeting started at 4:00 p.m. after forming a quorum. Ms. Lauren DiFrancesco welcomed the Committee and guests. Ms. DiFrancesco also announced the new Committee members. All current and new members introduced themselves.

#### (2) APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Ms. DiFrancesco asked for approval of the February Minutes subject to amendments noted by the Minutes subcommittee. There were a few small changes and misspelled names that were amended. \_\_\_\_\_ moved to adopt the Minutes as amended. Mr. Hunnicutt seconded. The Minutes were unanimously approved.

## (3) RULE 53A. SPECIAL MASTERS FOR CHILD-RELATED ISSUES IN DOMESTIC RELATIONS ACTIONS.

Mr. Salazar-Hall explained the current status of this new rule, the comments and changes that have been made recently. The Supreme Court Justices had a few suggestions that did not match Rule 7(b) and the subcommittee was going to make the change but the language "domestic relations actions" appears throughout the rules and the only place where "domestic law matters" shows up is in the title. Will need to explain to the Justices that we respectfully disagree with this requested change. If the Justices direct the change be made, then it should be made throughout the rules.

In regards to quasi-judicial immunity, the case law indicate this applies to special masters. A rule of procedure is not the best place for this, rather it should be per statute or case law, so this language was removed.

As to an administrative rule on training, education and ethical requirements, there were initially two subcommittees created per the legislative audit and this specific requirement was tasked to the other subcommittee. Mr. Salazar-Hall will follow up on this other subcommittee and whether an administrative rule for the Judicial Council is being crafted.

Judge Scott moved to send the rule to the Supreme Court and out for public comment. Mr. Hunnicutt seconded. All approve.

#### (4) **SUBCOMMITTEES DISCUSSION.**

Ms. DiFrancesco has sent emails to Committee members to either follow up on the current status of subcommittee work, or create new subcommittees. Ms. Lester and Ms. Spiess would like

to be added to the Rule 3 subcommittee. Judge Cornish is taking over the lead for the Rule 60 subcommittee. No further discussion.

#### (5) RULE 3(A)(2). COMMENCEMENT OF ACTION.

Mr. Lee begins the discussion and review of the changes made to Rule 3(a)(2). Quinn Kofford who represents some of the large debtors in the state, makes a few comments. In his experience it is the language in the summons that causes the confusion, not the process. He believes this new language is better, but it would be good for laypersons to look at it as well. On his cases they will attempt to contact individuals forty times via phone, email, and text before filing. Some will not respond to informal attempts to resolve these issues. When they serve people before filing, they are able to resolve forty percent of the cases. He does not agree with the "may" language because if the person does not respond, then they "will" file.

Greg Constantino and Lacey Cherrington also provide comments on the proposed changes to the rule. Ms. Cherrington will attempt to contact individuals multiple times and ways. Sometimes the only way to get a response is via filing. Her experience in talking to court clerks is that it is not a problem and they are not overwhelmed by phone calls by individuals calling to ask for phone numbers.

Susan Vogel states the Self-Help Center gets a lot of phone calls from individuals and questions how the court is supposed to send individuals information after a case is filed when they are so hard to track down for service of process. There is further discussion on the burden on the party filing to provide notice to the other party when a case is filed, whether that notice can be accomplished by sending it to the same place as service, and that notices is as of the date it was sent, not received.

Additional discussions on referrals to the MyCase program, whether certified mail is a good option and the amount of time and money spent on skip tracing to find individuals. Also, some people cannot receive mail where they are being served. There is a suggestion that a simple form answer be included when an individual is served, and that even if notice is sent, there should still be a burden on the person to timely file an answer and check on the status of their case.

The issues and amendments are sent back to the subcommittee for further discussion and review.

## (6) **RULE 5.** SERVICE AND FILING OF PLEADINGS AND OTHER PAPERS.

Loni Page reviews the history and amendments to this rule. The rule was sent out for comment at the end of 2021 and the subcommittee has been working on changes to the rule based upon comments and discussions. Changes are being made to MyCase, but this is not happening as quickly as the rule is being changed. Additionally, the subcommittee would like to be consistent in

the use of terminology. Also, a question that has arisen is what to do with an undeliverable email, and since there is a process currently being used by the court internally, the language in the rule has been removed.

Other issues discussed include who serves signed orders, whether subsection (2) is necessary regarding defaults when a plaintiff may not have an address for a respondent so they are being asked to do the impossible, and changing "appear" to "file and serve" may have unintended consequences in some cases where there may be a default after a party fails to appear. Furthermore, the Committee is being asked whether to use the language "licensed attorney or paralegal" throughout the rule or just "legal professional" given the language of Rule 86. The Committee prefers the language "licensed attorney and paralegal" or "attorney(s)" over the use of "legal professional," and this terminology should be used throughout. Finally, Michael Stahler mentions the addition to (b)(5)(C) is good but some lawyers may not catch this change and should make sure they are aware.

There was a directive from the Supreme Court to address specific language and amendments so the Committee must either resolve the issue raised or explain why no changes is recommended. The rule will go back to the subcommittee for further discussion and review. Mr. Stahler is added to the Rule 5 subcommittee.

#### (7) ADJOURNMENT.

The meeting adjourned at 5:59 p.m.

# Tab 2

#### **Rules Returning from Public Comment**

### Rule 4

You got to love Judge Orme's concurrence in Jordan Credit Union v. Sullivan, 2022 UT App 120; well worth your time to look up and read.

--Jason F. Barnes

I agree with the change to Rule 4. Personal service is preferable to substitute service and the current rule does not allow personal service on incarcerated individuals as noted in the Jordan Credit Union decision. This rule change will offer additional protections as substitute service on incarcerated individuals allows for the opportunity for default when the incarcerated individual would have had no notice.

-- Peter Vanderhooft

I am the appellant in the Jordan Credit Union case and I likewise agree that an amendment to the rule would be wise. The current language is clear and concise and does not allow personal service directly on an incarcerated individual.

Being the appellant in the Jordan Credit Union case I agree that an amendment to the rule would be both fair and appropriate. While it is a technicality which resulted in a reversal of a default judgment, the current verbage and language is clear.

--Patrick Sullivan

#### Rule 7

I also agree with the change to Rule 7 regarding motions to appear remotely. There is no reason why these motions should receive a full briefing, especially where the Courts are continuing to hold some hearings remotely. This resolves an access to justice issue where it would be a burden for the parties and their counsel to go in to the court, especially for motions that do not require testimony or introduction of evidence.

-- Peter Vanderhooft

I support the changes to Rule 7. Remote appearances work well for motions and status conferences, etc.

-- J. Bogart

#### Rule 83

I have no substantive comments regarding the rule changes as they apply to vexatious litigants.

-- Peter Vanderhooft

Re URCP 83: It is not clear how petitions for interlocutory appeals are to be treated – by implication the vexatious litigant needs to get pre-approval from the trial court (because only appeal as of right is mentioned). If the aim is to keep the trial court out of both sorts of appeals, perhaps rephrase to include express reference to the rules, URAP 3-4 & 5.

-- J. Bogart

#### Rule 10(d)

Well, I appreciate appreciate that the courts have gone to an all Electronic Filing, many private attorneys, Especially smaller, firm attorneys, still maintain paper files and carry paper files to and from the court to argue cases. They still need the one and a half inch margin at the top. It does no harm to leave the margin at one and a half inches and as I've indicated, I believe a significant number of members of the bar still use paper files, even if it is in conjunction with Electronic stored files. Therefore I believe it would be Appropriate to not change the rule at this time.

-- David Maddox

Rule 10 - I'm glad to see this change!

-- Justin Caplin

The proposed change to page margins (URCP010) will be the straw that breaks the judicial system's back. The change will overwhelm the courts by giving attorneys the opportunity to cram even more meaningless and unnecessary language into their filings. On a 25-page motion for summary judgment, this change could mean up to 25 additional lines of argument! Judicial efficiency will suffer. Eye care insurance for court employees will skyrocket. The printer ink supply will crater. Greenfiling will crash (although this may not be related). And there will be less space on printed filings for members of the bench and bar to doodle on while pretending to take notes.

Just kidding. This change is long overdue. Due to the default 1-inch setting for all margins in Microsoft Word, the current rule is often flouted without consequence. Thus, only those who follow the rules at the cost of 1 line per page are "punished." In any event, a one-inch margin will be enough space even for vertical file folders (just as the current one-inch left margin is sufficient for those who use three-ring binders).

-- Adam Bondy

### Rule 100A

No comments.

1 Rule 4. Process.

(a) Signing of summons. The summons must be signed and issued by the plaintiff or
the plaintiff's attorney. Separate summonses may be signed and issued.

(b) Time of service. Unless the summons and complaint are accepted, a copy of the summons and complaint in an action commenced under Rule 3(a)(1) must be served no later than 120 days after the complaint is filed, unless the court orders a different period under Rule 6. If the summons and complaint are not timely served, the action against the unserved defendant may be dismissed without prejudice on motion of any party or on the court's own initiative.

10 (c) Contents of summons.

11 (1) The summons must:

- (A) contain the name and address of the court, the names of the parties to theaction, and the county in which it is brought;
- 14 (B) be directed to the defendant;
- 15 (C) state the name, address and telephone number of the plaintiff's attorney, if 16 any, and otherwise the plaintiff's address and telephone number;
- 17 (D) state the time within which the defendant is required to answer the 18 complaint in writing;
- (E) notify the defendant that in case of failure to answer in writing, judgment bydefault may be entered against the defendant;
- (F) state either that the complaint is on file with the court or that the complaintwill be filed with the court within 10 days after service; and
- 23 (G) include the bilingual notice set forth in the form summons approved by the24 Utah Judicial Council.
- 25 (2) If the action is commenced under Rule 3(a)(2), the summons must also:
- 26 (A) state that the defendant need not answer if the complaint is not filed within27 10 days after service; and
- (B) state the telephone number of the clerk of the court where the defendant maycall at least 14 days after service to determine if the complaint has been filed.
- 30 (3) If service is by publication, the summons must also briefly state the subject
  31 matter and the sum of money or other relief demanded, and that the complaint is on
  32 file with the court.

(d) Methods of service. The summons and complaint may be served in any state or
 judicial district of the United States. Unless service is accepted, service of the summons
 and complaint must be by one of the following methods:

(1) Personal service. The summons and complaint may be served by any person 18
 years of age or older at the time of service and not a party to the action or a party's
 attorney. If the person to be served refuses to accept a copy of the summons and
 complaint, service is sufficient if the person serving them states the name of the
 process and offers to deliver them. Personal service must be made as follows:

- (A) Upon any individual other than one covered by paragraphs (d)(1)(B),
  (d)(1)(C) or (d)(1)(D), by delivering a copy of the summons and complaint to the
  individual personally, or by leaving them at the individual's dwelling house or
  usual place of abode with a person of suitable age and discretion who resides
  there, or by delivering them to an agent authorized by appointment or by law to
  receive process;
- (B) Upon a minor under 14 years old by delivering a copy of the summons and
  complaint to a parent or guardian of the minor or, if none can be found within
  the state, then to any person having the care and control of the minor, or with
  whom the minor resides, or by whom the minor is employed;
- 51 (C) Upon an individual judicially declared to be incapacitated, of unsound mind, 52 or incapable of conducting the individual's own affairs, by delivering a copy of 53 the summons and complaint to the individual and to the guardian or conservator 54 of the individual if one has been appointed; the individual's legal representative 55 if one has been appointed, and, in the absence of a guardian, conservator, or legal 56 representative, to the person, if any, who has care, custody, or control of the 57 individual;
- 58 (D) Upon an individual incarcerated or committed at a facility operated by the 59 state or any of its political subdivisions, by delivering a copy of the summons 60 and complaint to <u>the individual personally, to</u> the person who has the care, 61 custody, or control of the individual, or to that person's designee or to the 62 guardian or conservator of the individual if one has been appointed. The person 63 to whom the summons and complaint are delivered must promptly deliver them 64 to the individual;
- (E) Upon a corporation not otherwise provided for in this rule, a limited liability
  company, a partnership, or an unincorporated association subject to suit under a
  common name, by delivering a copy of the summons and complaint to an officer,

a managing or general agent, or other agent authorized by appointment or law to
receive process and by also mailing a copy of the summons and complaint to the
defendant, if the agent is one authorized by statute to receive process and the
statute so requires. If no officer or agent can be found within the state, and the
defendant has, or advertises or holds itself out as having, a place of business
within the state or elsewhere, or does business within this state or elsewhere,
then upon the person in charge of the place of business;

- (F) Upon an incorporated city or town, by delivering a copy of the summons and
  complaint as required by statute, or in the absence of a controlling statute, to the
  recorder;
- (G) Upon a county, by delivering a copy of the summons and complaint as
  required by statute, or in the absence of a controlling statute, to the county clerk;
- 80 (H) Upon a school district or board of education, by delivering a copy of the 81 summons and complaint as required by statute, or in the absence of a controlling 82 statute, to the superintendent or administrator of the board;
- (I) Upon an irrigation or drainage district, by delivering a copy of the summons
  and complaint as required by statute, or in the absence of a controlling statute, to
  the president or secretary of its board;
- (J) Upon the state of Utah or its department or agency by delivering a copy of the
  summons and complaint to the attorney general and any other person or agency
  required by statute to be served; and
- (K) Upon a public board, commission or body by delivering a copy of the
  summons and complaint as required by statute, or in the absence of a controlling
  statute, to any member of its governing board, or to its executive employee or
  secretary.
- 93 (2) Service by mail or commercial courier service.
- 94 (A) The summons and complaint may be served upon an individual other than
  95 one covered by paragraphs (d)(1)(B) or (d)(1)(C) by mail or commercial courier
  96 service in any state or judicial district of the United States provided the
  97 defendant signs a document indicating receipt.
- (B) The summons and complaint may be served upon an entity covered by
  paragraphs (d)(1)(E) through (d)(1)(I) by mail or commercial courier service in
  any state or judicial district of the United States provided defendant's agent

- authorized by appointment or by law to receive service of process signs adocument indicating receipt.
- 103 (C) Service by mail or commercial courier service shall be complete on the date104 the receipt is signed as provided by this rule.
- 105 (3) Acceptance of service.
- (A) Duty to avoid expenses. All parties have a duty to avoid unnecessary
   expenses of serving the summons and complaint.
- (B) Acceptance of service by party. Unless the person to be served is a minor
  under 14 years old or an individual judicially declared to be incapacitated, of
  unsound mind, or incapable of conducting the individual's own affairs, a party
  may accept service of a summons and complaint by signing a document that
  acknowledges receipt of the summons and complaint.
- (i) Content of proof of electronic acceptance. If acceptance is obtained
  electronically, the proof of acceptance must demonstrate on its face that the
  electronic signature is attributable to the party accepting service and was
  voluntarily executed by the party. The proof of acceptance must demonstrate
  that the party received readable copies of the summons and complaint prior
  to signing the acceptance of service.
- (ii) Duty to avoid deception. A request to accept service must not be
  deceptive, including stating or implying that the request to accept service
  originates with a public servant, peace officer, court, or official government
  agency. A violation of this paragraph may nullify the acceptance of service
  and could subject the person to criminal penalties under applicable Utah law.
- (C) Acceptance of service by attorney for party. An attorney may accept service
   of a summons and complaint on behalf of the attorney's client by signing a
   document that acknowledges receipt of the summons and complaint.
- 127 **(D) Effect of acceptance, proof of acceptance.** A person who accepts service of 128 the summons and complaint retains all defenses and objections, except for 129 adequacy of service. Service is effective on the date of the acceptance. Filing the 130 acceptance of service with the court constitutes proof of service under Rule 4(e).
- (4) Service in a foreign country. Service in a foreign country must be made asfollows:

(A) by any internationally agreed means reasonably calculated to give notice,
such as those means authorized by the Hague Convention on the Service Abroad
of Judicial and Extrajudicial Documents;

- (B) if there is no internationally agreed means of service or the applicable
  international agreement allows other means of service, provided that service is
  reasonably calculated to give notice:
- (i) in the manner prescribed by the law of the foreign country for service inthat country in an action in any of its courts of general jurisdiction;
- (ii) as directed by the foreign authority in response to a letter of requestissued by the court; or
- (iii) unless prohibited by the law of the foreign country, by delivering a copy
  of the summons and complaint to the individual personally or by any form of
  mail requiring a signed receipt, addressed and dispatched by the clerk of the
  court to the party to be served; or
- 147 (C) by other means not prohibited by international agreement as may be directed148 by the court.

## 149 **(5)** Other service.

150 (A) If the identity or whereabouts of the person to be served are unknown and 151 cannot be ascertained through reasonable diligence, if service upon all of the 152 individual parties is impracticable under the circumstances, or if there is good 153 cause to believe that the person to be served is avoiding service, the party 154 seeking service may file a motion to allow service by some other means. An 155 affidavit or declaration supporting the motion must set forth the efforts made to 156 identify, locate, and serve the party, or the circumstances that make it 157 impracticable to serve all of the individual parties.

- (B) If the motion is granted, the court will order service of the complaint and
  summons by means reasonably calculated, under all the circumstances, to
  apprise the named parties of the action. The court's order must specify the
  content of the process to be served and the event upon which service is complete.
  Unless service is by publication, a copy of the court's order must be served with
  the process specified by the court.
- (C) If the summons is required to be published, the court, upon the request of the
  party applying for service by other means, must designate a newspaper of
  general circulation in the county in which publication is required.

### 167 (e) Proof of service.

168 (1) The person effecting service must file proof of service stating the date, place, and 169 manner of service, including a copy of the summons. If service is made by a person 170 other than by an attorney, sheriff, constable, United States Marshal, or by the 171 sheriff's, constable's or marshal's deputy, the proof of service must be by affidavit or 172 unsworn declaration as described in Title 78B, Chapter 18a, Uniform Unsworn 173 Declarations Act.

(2) Proof of service in a foreign country must be made as prescribed in these rules
for service within this state, or by the law of the foreign country, or by order of the
court.

(3) When service is made pursuant to paragraph(d)(4)(C), proof of service must
include a receipt signed by the addressee or other evidence of delivery to the
addressee satisfactory to the court.

(4) Failure to file proof of service does not affect the validity of the service. The courtmay allow proof of service to be amended.

182

183 Effective: <u>May/Nov.</u>1, 202\_

184

- 1 Rule 7. Pleadings allowed; motions, memoranda, hearings, orders.
- 2 (a) **Pleadings.** Only these pleadings are allowed:
- 3 (1) a complaint;
- 4 (2) an answer to a complaint;
- 5 (3) an answer to a counterclaim designated as a counterclaim;
- 6 (4) an answer to a crossclaim;
- 7 (5) a third-party complaint;
- 8 (6) an answer to a third party complaint; and
- 9 (7) a reply to an answer if ordered by the court.

10 (b) Motions. A request for an order must be made by motion. The motion must be in writing unless

- 11 made during a hearing or trial, must state the relief requested, and must state the grounds for the
- 12 relief requested. Except for the following, a motion must be made in accordance with this rule.
- (1) A motion, other than a motion described in paragraphs (b)(2), (b)(3) or (b)(4), made in
  proceedings before a court commissioner must follow Rule <u>101</u>.
- 15 (2) A request under <u>Rule 26</u> for extraordinary discovery must follow Rule <u>37(a)</u>.
- 16 (3) A request under Rule <u>37</u> for a protective order or for an order compelling disclosure or
- 17 discovery—but not a motion for sanctions—must follow Rule <u>37(a)</u>.
- 18 (4) A request under Rule 45 to quash a subpoena must follow Rule 37(a).

(5) A motion for summary judgment must follow the procedures of this rule as supplemented
by the requirements of Rule <u>56</u>.

- 21 (c) Name and content of motion.
- (1) The rules governing captions and other matters of form in pleadings apply to motions andother papers.
- (2) Caution language. For all dispositive motions, the motion must include the following
   caution language at the top right corner of the first page, in bold type: This motion requires
   you to respond. Please see the Notice to Responding Party.
- 27 (3) **Bilingual notice.** All motions must include or attach the bilingual Notice to Responding
  28 Party approved by the Judicial Council.
- (4) Failure to include caution language and notice. Failure to include the caution language
   in paragraph (c)(2) or the bilingual notice in paragraph (c)(3) may be grounds to continue the
   hearing on the motion, or may provide the non-moving party with a basis under Rule 60(b) for
   excusable neglect to set aside the order resulting from the motion. Parties may opt out of
- 33 receiving the notices set forth in paragraphs (c)(2) and (c)(3) while represented by counsel.

(5) Title of motion. The moving party must title the motion substantially as: "Motion [short
 phrase describing the relief requested]."

36 (6) Contents of motion. The motion must include the supporting memorandum. The motion
 37 must include under appropriate headings and in the following order:

- 38 (A) a concise statement of the relief requested and the grounds for the relief requested; and
- (B) one or more sections that include a concise statement of the relevant facts claimed by
  the moving party and argument citing authority for the relief requested.
- 41 (7) If the moving party cites documents, interrogatory answers, deposition testimony, or other
  42 discovery materials, relevant portions of those materials must be attached to or submitted with
  43 the motion.
- (8) Length of motion. If the motion is for relief authorized by Rule <u>12(b)</u> or <u>12(c)</u>, Rule<u>56</u> or
  Rule <u>65A</u>, the motion may not exceed 25 pages, not counting the attachments, unless a longer
  motion is permitted by the court. Other motions may not exceed 15 pages, not counting the
  attachments, unless a longer motion is permitted by the court.

### 48 (d) Name and content of memorandum opposing the motion.

- 49 (1) A nonmoving party may file a memorandum opposing the motion within 14 days after the
  50 motion is filed. The nonmoving party must title the memorandum substantially as:
  51 "Memorandum opposing motion [short phrase describing the relief requested]." The
  52 memorandum must include under appropriate headings and in the following order:
- (A) a concise statement of the party's preferred disposition of the motion and the grounds
  supporting that disposition;
- (B) one or more sections that include a concise statement of the relevant facts claimed by
   the nonmoving party and argument citing authority for that disposition; and
- 57 (C) objections to evidence in the motion, citing authority for the objection.
- 58 (2) If the non-moving party cites documents, interrogatory answers, deposition testimony, or 59 other discovery materials, relevant portions of those materials must be attached to or submitted
- 60 with the memorandum.
- (3) If the motion is for relief authorized by Rule <u>12(b)</u> or <u>12(c)</u>, Rule <u>56</u> or Rule <u>65A</u>, the
  memorandum opposing the motion may not exceed 25 pages, not counting the attachments,
  unless a longer memorandum is permitted by the court. Other opposing memoranda may not
  exceed 15 pages, not counting the attachments, unless a longer memorandum is permitted by
  the court.

#### 66 (e) Name and content of reply memorandum.

67 (1) Within 7 days after the memorandum opposing the motion is filed, the moving party may 68 file a reply memorandum, which must be limited to rebuttal of new matters raised in the memorandum opposing the motion. The moving party must title the memorandum
 substantially as "Reply memorandum supporting motion [short phrase describing the relief
 requested]." The memorandum must include under appropriate headings and in the following
 order:

- 73 (A) a concise statement of the new matter raised in the memorandum opposing the motion;
- (B) one or more sections that include a concise statement of the relevant facts claimed by
  the moving party not previously set forth that respond to the opposing party's statement of
  facts and argument citing authority rebutting the new matter;
- (C) objections to evidence in the memorandum opposing the motion, citing authority forthe objection; and
- 79 (D) response to objections made in the memorandum opposing the motion, citing authority80 for the response.

(2) If the moving party cites documents, interrogatory answers, deposition testimony, or other
 discovery materials, relevant portions of those materials must be attached to or submitted with
 the memorandum.

(3) If the motion is for relief authorized by Rule <u>12(b)</u> or <u>12(c)</u>, Rule <u>56</u> or Rule <u>65A</u>, the reply
memorandum may not exceed 15 pages, not counting the attachments, unless a longer
memorandum is permitted by the court. Other reply memoranda may not exceed 10 pages, ot
counting the attachments, unless a longer memorandum is permitted by the court.

(f) Objection to evidence in the reply memorandum; response. If the reply memorandum includes an objection to evidence, the nonmoving party may file a response to the objection no later than 7 days after the reply memorandum is filed. If the reply memorandum includes evidence not previously set forth, the nonmoving party may file an objection to the evidence no later than 7 days after the reply memorandum is filed, and the moving party may file a response to the objection no later than 7 days after the objection is filed. The objection or response may not be more than 3 pages.

(g) Request to submit for decision. When briefing is complete or the time for briefing has
expired, either party may file a "Request to Submit for Decision," but, if no party files a request,
the motion will not be submitted for decision. The request to submit for decision must state whether
a hearing has been requested and the dates on which the following documents were filed:

- 99 (1) the motion;
- 100 (2) the memorandum opposing the motion, if any;
- 101 (3) the reply memorandum, if any; and
- 102 (g)(4) the response to objections in the reply memorandum, if any.

103 **(h) Hearings.** The court may hold a hearing on any motion. A party may request a hearing in the 104 motion, in a memorandum or in the request to submit for decision. A request for hearing must be separately identified in the caption of the document containing the request. The court must grant a

- 106 request for a hearing on a motion under Rule 56 or a motion that would dispose of the action or
- any claim or defense in the action unless the court finds that the motion or opposition to the motion
- 108 is frivolous or the issue has been authoritatively decided. A motion hearing may be held remotely,
- 109 consistent with the safeguards in Rule 43(b).

(i) Notice of supplemental authority. A party may file notice of citation to significant authority that comes to the party's attention after the party's motion or memorandum has been filed or after oral argument but before decision. The notice may not exceed 2 pages. The notice must state the citation to the authority, the page of the motion or memorandum or the point orally argued to which the authority applies, and the reason the authority is relevant. Any other party may promptly file a response, but the court may act on the motion without waiting for a response. The response may

- 116 not exceed 2 pages.
- 117 (j) Orders.
- (1) Decision complete when signed; entered when recorded. However designated, the
   court's decision on a motion is complete when signed by the judge. The decision is entered
   when recorded in the docket.
- (2) Preparing and serving a proposed order. Within 14 days of being directed by the court
   to prepare a proposed order confirming the court's decision, a party must serve the proposed
   order on the other parties for review and approval as to form. If the party directed to prepare a
   proposed order fails to timely serve the order, any other party may prepare a proposed order
   confirming the court's decision and serve the proposed order on the other parties for review
   and approval as to form.
- (3) Effect of approval as to form. A party's approval as to form of a proposed order certifies
  that the proposed order accurately reflects the court's decision. Approval as to form does not
  waive objections to the substance of the order.
- (4) Objecting to a proposed order. A party may object to the form of the proposed order byfiling an objection within 7 days after the order is served.
- 132 (5) Filing proposed order. The party preparing a proposed order must file it:
- (A) after all other parties have approved the form of the order (The party preparing the
  proposed order must indicate the means by which approval was received: in person; by
  telephone; by signature; by email; etc.);
- (B) after the time to object to the form of the order has expired (The party preparing the
  proposed order must also file a certificate of service of the proposed order.); or
- 138 (C) within 7 days after a party has objected to the form of the order (The party preparing 139 the proposed order may also file a response to the objection.).

(6) Proposed order before decision prohibited; exceptions. A party may not file a proposed
 order concurrently with a motion or a memorandum or a request to submit for decision, but a
 proposed order must be filed with:

- 143 (A) a stipulated motion;
- 144 (B) a motion that can be acted on without waiting for a response;
- 145 (C) an ex parte motion;
- 146 (D) a statement of discovery issues under Rule 37(a); and
- 147 (E) the request to submit for decision a motion in which a memorandum opposing the 148 motion has not been filed.
- (7) Orders entered without a response; ex parte orders. An order entered on a motion under
   paragraph (l) or (m) can be vacated or modified by the judge who made it with or without
   notice.
- (8) Order to pay money. An order to pay money can be enforced in the same manner as if itwere a judgment.
- (k) Stipulated motions. A party seeking relief that has been agreed to by the other parties mayfile a stipulated motion which must:
- 156 (1) be titled substantially as: "Stipulated motion [short phrase describing the relief requested]";
- 157 (2) include a concise statement of the relief requested and the grounds for the relief requested;
- 158 (3) include a signed stipulation in or attached to the motion and;
- (4) be accompanied by a request to submit for decision and a proposed order that has beenapproved by the other parties.
- 161 (I) Motions that may be acted on without waiting for a response.
- 162 (1) The court may act on the following motions without waiting for a response:
- 163 (A) motion to permit an over-length motion or memorandum;
- 164 (B) motion for an extension of time if filed before the expiration of time;
- 165 (C) motion to appear pro hac vice;
- (D) motion to strike a document filed by a vexatious litigant in violation of Rule 83(d); and
- 167 (E) motion to appear remotely; and
- 168 (D)(F) other similar motions.
- 169 (2) A motion that can be acted on without waiting for a response must:
- 170 (A) be titled as a regular motion;

- (B) include a concise statement of the relief requested and the grounds for the reliefrequested;
- (C) cite the statute or rule authorizing the motion to be acted on without waiting for aresponse; and
- 175 (D) be accompanied by a request to submit for decision and a proposed order.

(m) Ex parte motions. If a statute or rule permits a motion to be filed without serving the motionon the other parties, the party seeking relief may file an ex parte motion which must:

- 178 (1) be titled substantially as: "Ex parte motion [short phrase describing the relief requested]";
- 179 (2) include a concise statement of the relief requested and the grounds for the relief requested;
- 180 (3) cite the statute or rule authorizing the ex parte motion;
- 181 (4) be accompanied by a request to submit for decision and a proposed order.

(n) Motion in opposing memorandum or reply memorandum prohibited. A party may not
 make a motion in a memorandum opposing a motion or in a reply memorandum. A party who
 objects to evidence in another party's motion or memorandum may not move to strike that
 evidence. Instead, the party must include in the subsequent memorandum an objection to the
 evidence.

(o) Overlength motion or memorandum. The court may permit a party to file an overlength
 motion or memorandum upon a showing of good cause. An overlength motion or memorandum
 must include a table of contents and a table of authorities with page references.

(p) Limited statement of facts and authority. No statement of facts and legal authorities beyond
 the concise statement of the relief requested and the grounds for the relief requested required in
 paragraph (c) is required for the following motions:

- 193 (1) motion to allow an over-length motion or memorandum;
- (2) motion to extend the time to perform an act, if the motion is filed before the time to performthe act has expired;
- 196 (3) motion to continue a hearing;
- 197 (4) motion to appoint a guardian ad litem;
- 198 (5) motion to substitute parties;
- (6) motion to refer the action to or withdraw it from alternative dispute resolution under Rule4-510.05;
- 201 (7) motion for a conference under Rule <u>16</u>; and
- 202 (8) motion to approve a stipulation of the parties.

203

Redline

204 <u>Effective: May/Nov. 1, 202\_</u>.

### 1 Rule 83. Vexatious litigants.

## 2 (a) Definitions.

- 3 (1) The court may find a person to be a "vexatious litigant" if the person, with or
  4 without legal representation, including an attorney acting pro se, does any of the
  5 following:
- 6 (A) In the immediately preceding seven years, the person has filed at least five 7 claims for relief, other than small claims actions, that have been finally determined 8 against the person, and the person does not have within that time at least two 9 claims, other than small claims actions, that have been finally determined in that 10 person's favor.
- (B) After a claim for relief or an issue of fact or law in the claim has been finally
  determined, the person two or more additional times re-litigates or attempts to relitigate the claim, the issue of fact or law, or the validity of the determination
  against the same party in whose favor the claim or issue was determined.
- (C) In any action, the person three or more times does any one or any combinationof the following:
- 17 (i) files unmeritorious pleadings or other papers,
- (ii) files pleadings or other papers that contain redundant, immaterial,impertinent or scandalous matter,
- 20 (iii) conducts unnecessary discovery or discovery that is not proportional to21 what is at stake in the litigation, or
- (iv) engages in tactics that are frivolous or solely for the purpose of harassmentor delay.

24 (D) The person purports to represent or to use the procedures of a court other than 25 a court of the United States, a court created by the Constitution of the United States 26 or by Congress under the authority of the Constitution of the United States, a tribal 27 court recognized by the United States, a court created by a state or territory of the 28 United States, or a court created by a foreign nation recognized by the United 29 States.

- 30 (2) "Claim" and "claim for relief" mean a petition, complaint, counterclaim, cross
  31 claim or third-party complaint.
- (b) Vexatious litigant orders. The court may, on its own motion or on the motion of any
   party, enter an order requiring a vexatious litigant to:

(1) furnish security to assure payment of the moving party's reasonable expenses, 34 costs and, if authorized, attorney fees incurred in a pending action; 35 36 (2) obtain legal counsel before proceeding in a pending action; (3) obtain legal counsel before filing any future claim for relief; 37 (4) abide by a prefiling order requiring the vexatious litigant to obtain the court's leave 38 permission of the court before filing any paper, pleading, or motion, in a pending 39 action;, except that the court may not require a vexatious litigant to obtain the court's 40 permission before filing a notice of appeal; 41 (5) abide by a prefiling order requiring the vexatious litigant to obtain the court's leave 42 permission of the court before filing any future claim for relief in any court; or 43 (6) take any other action reasonably necessary to curb the vexatious litigant's abusive 44 conduct. 45 (c) Necessary findings and security. 46 (1) Before entering an order under subparagraph (b), the court must find by clear and 47 convincing evidence that: 48 (A) the party subject to the order is a vexatious litigant; and 49 (B) there is no reasonable probability that the vexatious litigant will prevail on the 50 claim. 51 (2) A preliminary finding that there is no reasonable probability that the vexatious 52 litigant will prevail is not a decision on the ultimate merits of the vexatious litigant's 53 claim. 54 (3) The court shall identify the amount of the security and the time within which it is 55 to be furnished. If the security is not furnished as ordered, the court shall dismiss the 56 vexatious litigant's claim with prejudice. 57 (d) Prefiling orders in a pending action. 58 59 (1) If a vexatious litigant is subject to a prefiling order in a pending action requiring leave the court's permission of the court to file any paper, pleading, or motion, the 60 vexatious litigant shall submit any proposed paper, pleading, or motion, except for a 61 notice of appeal, to the judge assigned to the case and must: 62 (A) demonstrate that the paper, pleading, or motion is based on a good faith 63 dispute of the facts; 64

- (B) demonstrate that the paper, pleading, or motion is warranted under existing
  law or a good faith argument for the extension, modification, or reversal of existing
  law;
- 68 (C) include an oath, affirmation or declaration under criminal penalty that the 69 proposed paper, pleading or motion is not filed for the purpose of harassment or 70 delay and contains no redundant, immaterial, impertinent or scandalous matter;
- (2) A prefiling order in a pending action shall be effective until a final determinationof the action on appeal, unless otherwise ordered by the court.
- (3) After a prefiling order has been effective in a pending action for one year, the
  person subject to the prefiling order may move to have the order vacated. The motion
  shall be decided by the judge to whom the pending action is assigned. In granting the
  motion, the judge may impose any other vexatious litigant orders permitted in
  paragraph (b).
- (4) All papers, pleadings, and motions filed by a vexatious litigant subject to a
  prefiling order under this paragraph (d) shall include a judicial order authorizing the
  filing and any required security. If the order or security is not included, the clerk or
  court shall reject the paper, pleading, or motion.

## 82 (e) Prefiling orders as to future claims.

- (1) A vexatious litigant subject to a prefiling order restricting the filing of future claims
  shall submit an application seeking an order before filing. The presiding judge of the
  judicial district in which the claim is to be filed shall decide the application. The
  presiding judge may consult with the judge who entered the vexatious litigant order
  in deciding the application. In granting an application, the presiding judge may
  impose in the pending action any of the vexatious litigant orders permitted under
  paragraph (b).
- 90 (2) To obtain an order under paragraph (e)(1), the vexatious litigant's application 91 must:
- 92 (A) demonstrate that the claim is based on a good faith dispute of the facts;
- (B) demonstrate that the claim is warranted under existing law or a good faithargument for the extension, modification, or reversal of existing law;
- 95 (C) include an oath, affirmation, or declaration under criminal penalty that the 96 proposed claim is not filed for the purpose of harassment or delay and contains no 97 redundant, immaterial, impertinent or scandalous matter;

- 98 (D) include a copy of the proposed petition, complaint, counterclaim, cross-claim, 99 or third party complaint; and
- (E) include the court name and case number of all claims that the applicant has
  filed against each party within the preceding seven years and the disposition of
  each claim.
- (3) A prefiling order limiting the filing of future claims is effective indefinitely unlessthe court orders a shorter period.
- (4) After five years a person subject to a pre-filing order limiting the filing of future
  claims may file a motion to vacate the order. The motion shall be filed in the same
  judicial district from which the order entered and be decided by the presiding judge
  of that district.
- (5) A claim filed by a vexatious litigant subject to a prefiling order under thisparagraph (e) shall include an order authorizing the filing and any required security.
- 111 If the order or security is not included, the clerk of court shall reject the filing.
- 112 (f) Notice of vexatious litigant orders.
- (1) The clerks of court shall notify the Administrative Office of the Courts that a pre-filing order has been entered or vacated.
- (2) The Administrative Office of the Courts shall disseminate to the clerks of court alist of vexatious litigants subject to a prefiling order.

(g) Statute of limitations or time for filing tolled. Any applicable statute of limitations
or time in which the person is required to take any action is tolled until 7 days after notice
of the decision on the motion or application for authorization to file.

- (h) Contempt sanctions. Disobedience by a vexatious litigant of a pre-filing order maybe punished as contempt of court.
- (i) Other authority. This rule does not affect the authority of the court under otherstatutes and rules or the inherent authority of the court.
- (j) Applicability of vexatious litigant order to other courts. After a court has issued a
   vexatious litigant order, any other court may rely upon that court's findings and order its
   own restrictions against the litigant as provided in paragraph (b).
- 127 <u>Effective: May/Nov. 1, 202\_.</u>

# Tab 3

#### Rule 42. Consolidation; separate trials; venue transfers.

Amendment history and request from Supreme Court.

The amendments to this rule started with a change from "new" to "single" in (a)(3). After further discussions there was also an addition made to (a)(2) that would allow any party "to either action to be consolidated" could file or oppose a motion to consolidate. These changes to (a)(2) and (a)(3) were presented to the Supreme Court and were acceptable.

The Justices also requested the Committee consider additional language regarding no need to intervene being added to the rule.

#### 1 Rule 42. Consolidation; separate trials; venue transfer.

(a) Consolidation. When actions involving a common question of law or fact or arising 2 from the same transaction or occurrence are pending before the court in one or more 3 judicial districts, the court may, on motion of any party or on the court's own initiative: 4 order that the actions are consolidated in whole or in part for any purpose, including 5 6 for discovery, other pretrial matters, or a joint hearing or trial; stay any or all of the 7 proceedings in any action subject to the order; transfer any or all further proceedings in 8 the actions to a location in which any of the actions is pending after consulting with the presiding judge of the transferee court; and make other such orders concerning 9 proceedings therein as may tend to avoid unnecessary costs or delay. 10

11 (1) In determining whether to order consolidation and the appropriate location for the consolidated proceedings, the court may consider, among other factors: the 12 complexity of the actions; the importance of any common question of fact or law to 13 the determination of the actions; the risk of duplicative or inconsistent rulings, 14 orders, or judgments; the relative procedural postures of the actions; the risk that 15 consolidation may unreasonably delay the progress, increase the expense, or 16 complicate the processing of any action; prejudice to any party that far outweighs 17 the overall benefits of consolidation; the convenience of the parties, witnesses, and 18 19 counsel; and the efficient utilization of judicial resources and the facilities and personnel of the court. 20

(2) A motion to consolidate may be filed or opposed by any party to either action to
<u>be consolidated</u>. The motion must be filed in and heard by the judge assigned to the
first action filed and must be served on all parties in each action pursuant to <u>Rule 5</u>.
A notice of the motion must be filed in each action. The movant must, and any party
may, file in each action notice of the order denying or granting the motion.

(3) If the court orders consolidation, a <u>new single</u> case number will be used for all
subsequent filings in the consolidated case. The court may direct that specified

parties pay the expenses, if any, of consolidation. The presiding judge of thetransferee court may assign the consolidated case to another judge for good cause.

(b) Separate trials. The court in furtherance of convenience or to avoid prejudice may
order a separate trial of any claim, cross claim, counterclaim, or third party claim, or of
any separate issue or of any number of claims, cross claims, counterclaims, third party
claims, or issues.

#### 34 (c) Venue Transfer.

(1) On timely motion of any party, where transfer to a proper venue is available, thecourt must transfer any action filed in an improper venue.

(2) The court must give substantial deference to a plaintiff's choice of a proper 37 venue. On timely motion of any party, a court may: transfer venue of any action, 38 in whole or in part, to any other venue for any purpose, including for discovery, 39 other pretrial matters, or a joint hearing or trial; stay any or all of the proceedings in 40 41 the action; and make other such orders concerning proceedings therein to pursue the 42 interests of justice and avoid unnecessary costs or delay. In determining whether to 43 transfer venue and the appropriate venue for the transferred proceedings, the court may consider, among other factors, whether transfer will: increase the likelihood of a 44 45 fair and impartial determination in the action; minimize expense or inconvenience to parties, witnesses, or the court; decrease delay; avoid hardship or injustice otherwise 46 caused by venue requirements; and advance the interests of justice. 47

48

(3) The court may direct that specified parties pay the expenses, if any, of transfer.

49

#### 50 Advisory Committee Notes

51 *Note adopted* **2020** 

52 The addition of paragraph (c) arose in part from the Supreme Court's decision in *Davis* 

53 *County v. Purdue Pharma, L.P,* 2020 UT 17.

## 55 Effective January 1, 2020.

## Tab 4



Jessica A. Reynolds

October... Read More

Jessica Perez Reynolds is a partner with Pendley, Baudin, & Coffin, L.L.P., joining the firm as an associate in

#### JUMP TO:

Presenters Agenda Credit How to Attend More

#### Summary

This webinar will cover important concepts and tools for effective jury selection, including jury selection in tough venues. The primary focus will center on using jury selection and storytelling to explore the concepts that will be crucial for jurors to understand in order to render a verdict in your client's favor. The presentation will provide useful tips on how to organize jury selection, how to decide what topics to question potential jurors about, how to walk potential jurors for cause, and will address myths about what to do and not do during voir dire.

#### SWL-18619

#### Presenters



Darin L. Schanker Darin has had the good fortune to try different types of injury cases in federal and state courts all around the country. ... Read More

#### Zachary Wool Zachary L. Wool is a true litigator,

comfortable in front of both a judge or a jury. Born and raised in the New Orleans area,... Read More

#### Agenda

5 Minutes - Introduction 60 Minutes - Presentation 10 Minutes - Live Q&A with the Speaker

#### Credit

If applicable, you may obtain credit in multiple jurisdictions simultaneously for this program (see pending/approved list below). Registrants in jurisdictions not listed below will receive a Certificate of Attendance/Completion that may or may not meet credit requirements in other jurisdictions. Where applicable, credit will be only awarded to a paid registrant attending the live program at their own computer and phone.

Click on jurisdiction for specific details:

AL	AR	AZ CA	СО	DE	FL	GA	KS	KY	MN	MO	MS	MT
NB	NC	NFLD	NH	NJ	NM	NS	NV	OR	PA	PEI	SC	SK
TN	UT	WI W	Ŷ									

#### Register Now 🔉

Need login details? Can't attend? Tuesday, March 7, 2023

2PM CENTRAL (12:00 PT / 1:00 MT / 3:00 ET)

Copy to Calendar: E Copy to Calendar: Reminder: Adding to your calendar does not register you for the webinar.

- Price
   \$99 for Association Member
   \$129 for Non-Member
- ✗ 75 minutes

#### 🚔 Publisher

Montana Trial Lawyers Association

Questions

**Already Registered?** Refer to confirmation e-mail for connection instructions.

Something else? Please consult our FAQ page. If you're unable to find the answer you need, please call 737-201-2059 (M-F, 8am-6pm CT) or e-mail customer service.

#### Alabama

#### Alabama Association for Justice

**Pending**. Credit has been submitted and is pending approval with the Alabama State Bar for **1 General credit**. The Alabama Association for Justice is a sponsor of MCLE programs in Alabama.

The Alabama State Bar's MCLE Commission has extended its suspension of MCLE Regulation 3.1 through Dec. 31, 2022. Regulation 3.1 requires that a minimum of 6 credit hours of the 12 credit hours required annually must be earned through attendance at in-person or live streamed ASB-approved programs. This accommodation allows Alabama attorneys the flexibility of satisfying their full annual CLE requirement (12 hours, including 1 ethics hour) with approved on-demand and/or virtual courses.

#### How to Attend

Join the live program from your office, home, or hotel room using a computer with high speed internet. You may ask questions, participate in surveys, and post comments from your computer during the program. Please note that credit (if available) is only provided to registered attendees participating at their own computer and phone. Simple instructions with a link to the program will be sent when you register and again the day before the webinar.

#### More

Refund Policy SeminarWeb and Utah Association for Justice programs are non-refundable.

Privacy Statement

We respect and are committed to protecting your privacy. Read Statement.



Find a Lawyer | Join UAJ | Need to renew? | Home | Contact Us | Login

## Tab 5

JOINT RESOLUTION AMENDING RULES OF CIVIL					
<b>PROCEDURE ON INJUNCTIONS</b>					
2023 GENERAL SESSION					
STATE OF UTAH					
	Chief Sponsor: Brady Brammer				
	Senate Sponsor: Daniel McCay				
LON	IG TITLE				
Gene	eral Description:				
	This joint resolution amends the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure, Rule 65A, regarding				
injun	ctions.				
High	lighted Provisions:				
	This resolution:				
	► amends the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure, Rule 65A, regarding injunctions.				
Special Clauses:					
	This resolution provides a special effective date.				
Utah	Rules of Civil Procedure Affected:				
AME	ENDS:				
	Rule 65A, Utah Rules of Civil Procedure				
Be it	resolved by the Legislature of the state of Utah, two-thirds of all members elected to each				
of the	e two houses voting in favor thereof:				
As provided in Utah Constitution Article VIII, Section 4, the Legislature may amend					
rules of procedure and evidence adopted by the Utah Supreme Court upon a two-thirds vote of					
all members of both houses of the Legislature:					
Section 1. Rule 65A, Utah Rules of Civil Procedure is amended to read:					
	Rule 65A. Injunctions.				
	(a) Preliminary injunctions.				

## H.J.R. 2

## **Enrolled Copy**

29 (a) (1) Notice. No preliminary injunction shall be issued without notice to the adverse
30 party.

(a) (2) Consolidation of hearing. Before or after the commencement of the hearing of an application for a preliminary injunction, the court may order the trial of the action on the merits to be advanced and consolidated with the hearing of the application. Even when this consolidation is not ordered, any evidence received upon an application for a preliminary injunction which would be admissible at the trial on the merits becomes part of the trial record and need not be repeated at the trial. This subdivision (a)(2) shall be so construed and applied as to save to the parties any rights they may have to trial by jury.

38

## (b) Temporary restraining orders.

(b) (1) Notice. No temporary restraining order shall be granted without notice to the adverse party or that party's attorney unless (A) it clearly appears from specific facts shown by affidavit or by the verified complaint that immediate and irreparable injury, loss, or damage will result to the applicant before the adverse party or that party's attorney can be heard in opposition, and (B) the applicant or the applicant's attorney certifies to the court in writing as to the efforts, if any, that have been made to give notice and the reasons supporting the claim that notice should not be required.

(b) (2) Form of order. Every temporary restraining order shall be endorsed with the date and hour of issuance and shall be filed forthwith in the clerk's office and entered of record. The order shall define the injury and state why it is irreparable. The order shall expire by its terms within such time after entry, not to exceed 14 days, as the court fixes, unless within the time so fixed the order, for good cause shown, is extended for a like period or unless the party against whom the order is directed consents that it may be extended for a longer period. The reasons for the extension shall be entered of record.

(b) (3) **Priority of hearing.** If a temporary restraining order is granted, the motion for a
preliminary injunction shall be scheduled for hearing at the earliest possible time and takes
precedence over all other civil matters except older matters of the same character. When the

- 2 -

# **Enrolled Copy**

H.J.R. 2

56 motion comes on for hearing, the party who obtained the temporary restraining order shall have 57 the burden to show entitlement to a preliminary injunction; if the party does not do so, the court 58 shall dissolve the temporary restraining order.

(b) (4) **Dissolution or modification.** On 48 hours' notice to the party who obtained the temporary restraining order without notice, or on such shorter notice to that party as the court may prescribe, the adverse party may appear and move its dissolution or modification. In that event the court shall proceed to hear and determine the motion as expeditiously as the ends of justice require.

64 (c) Security.

65 (c) (1) **Requirement.** The court shall condition issuance of the order or injunction on 66 the giving of security by the applicant, in such sum and form as the court deems proper, unless 67 it appears that none of the parties will incur or suffer costs, attorney fees or damage as the 68 result of any wrongful order or injunction, or unless there exists some other substantial reason 69 for dispensing with the requirement of security. No such security shall be required of the 70 United States, the State of Utah, or of an officer, agency, or subdivision of either; nor shall it be 71 required when it is prohibited by law.

(c) (2) Amount not a limitation. The amount of security shall not establish or limit the
amount of costs, including reasonable attorney fees incurred in connection with the restraining
order or preliminary injunction, or damages that may be awarded to a party who is found to
have been wrongfully restrained or enjoined.

(c) (3) Jurisdiction over surety. A surety upon a bond or undertaking under this rule submits to the jurisdiction of the court and irrevocably appoints the clerk of the court as agent upon whom any papers affecting the surety's liability on the bond or undertaking may be served. The surety's liability may be enforced on motion without the necessity of an independent action. The motion and such notice of the motion as the court prescribes may be served on the clerk of the court who shall forthwith mail copies to the persons giving the security if their addresses are known.

- 3 -

# H.J.R. 2

# **Enrolled Copy**

83	(d) Form and scope. Every restraining order and order granting an injunction shall set			
84	forth the reasons for its issuance. It shall be specific in terms and shall describe in reasonable			
85	detail, and not by reference to the complaint or other document, the act or acts sought to be			
86	restrained. It shall be binding only upon the parties to the action, their officers, agents, servants,			
87	employees, and attorneys, and upon those persons in active concert or participation with them			
88	who receive notice, in person or through counsel, or otherwise, of the order. If a restraining			
89	order is granted without notice to the party restrained, it shall state the reasons justifying the			
90	court's decision to proceed without notice.			
91	(e) <b>Grounds.</b> A restraining order or preliminary injunction may issue only upon a			
92	showing by the applicant that:			
93	(e) (1) there is a substantial likelihood that the applicant will prevail on the merits of			
94	the underlying claim;			
95	(e) [(1) The] (2) the applicant will suffer irreparable harm unless the order or			
96	injunction issues;			
97	(e) [(2) The] (3) the threatened injury to the applicant outweighs whatever damage the			
98	proposed order or injunction may cause the party restrained or enjoined; and			
99	(e) [(3) The] (4) the order or injunction, if issued, would not be adverse to the public			
100	interest[ <del>; and</del> ].			
101	[(e) (4) There is a substantial likelihood that the applicant will prevail on the merits of			
102	the underlying claim, or the case presents serious issues on the merits which should be the			
103	subject of further litigation.]			
104	(f) Motion for reconsideration.			
105	(f) (1) A party enjoined or restrained by a restraining order or a preliminary injunction			
106	on February 14, 2023, may move the court to reconsider whether the order or injunction should			
107	remain in effect if the order or injunction:			
108	(A) is in writing;			
109	(B) is restraining or enjoining the enforcement of a law; and			

# **Enrolled Copy**

110	(C) explicitly states that the court granted the order or injunction on the ground that the		
111	case presented serious issues on the merits which should be the subject of further litigation.		
112	(f) (2) A motion for reconsideration under this paragraph (f) may be filed at any time		
113	before the final determination of the case.		
114	(f) (3) Upon a motion for reconsideration, the court must determine whether the		
115	issuance of the restraining order or preliminary injunction meets the requirements in paragraph		
116	(e) regardless of the requirements for the issuance of the order or injunction on the day on		
117	which the order or injunction was issued.		
118	(f) (4) If the court determines that the issuance of the restraining order or preliminary		
119	injunction does not meet the requirements of paragraph (e), the court must terminate the order		
120	or injunction.		
121	[(f)] (g) Domestic relations cases. Nothing in this rule shall be construed to limit the		
122	equitable powers of the courts in domestic relations cases.		
123	Section 2. Effective date.		
124	As provided in Utah Constitution Article VIII, Section 4, this resolution takes effect		

125 upon a two-thirds vote of all members elected to each house.

# Tab 6

### Rule 30(b)(6) Requirements in Utah (Federal and State)

(b)(6). A party may name as the witness a corporation, a partnership, an association, or a governmental agency, describe with reasonable particularity the matters on which questioning is requested, and direct the organization to designate one or more officers, directors, managing agents, or other persons to testify on its behalf. <u>Before or promptly after the notice or subpoena is served</u>, the serving party and the organization must confer in good faith about the matters for examination and any objections. If the parties are unable to resolve the objections prior to the date of the deposition, either party may seek resolution from the court in accordance with Rule 37. If the objections are not resolved before the set date of the deposition, the deposition may proceed on the matters not addressed by the statement of discovery issues. The organization shall state, for each person designated, the matters on which the person will testify. A subpoena shall advise a nonparty organization of its duty to make such a designation. The person so designated shall testify as to matters known or reasonably available to the organization.

Key Principles to Amended Utah R. Civ. P. 30(b)(6)

1. Like the amended FRCP 30(b)(6), the amendment encourages practitioners to engage in "[c]andid exchanges about the purposes of the deposition and the organization's information structure [that] may clarify and focus the matters for examination and enable the organization to designate and to prepare an appropriate witness or witnesses, thereby avoiding later disagreements."

2. Like the amended FRCP 30(b)(6), this amendment to URCP 30(b)(6) seeks to "facilitate collaborative efforts to achieve the proportionality goals" expressed in Rules 1 and 26(b)(1) of the URCP.

3. Consistent with the discussion from the Committee last month, the amendments do *not* (1) add time deadlines to service of the notice, objections or the meet-and-confer process or (2) provide additional limitations on the number of topics that may be set forth in the motion. The assumption is that those issues can be addressed by counsel and the Court under Rule 37 and any scheduling order from the Court.

**Formatted:** Font: 14 pt, Not Highlight

Formatted: Font: 14 pt, Not Highlight

#### Relevant Language of FRCP and DCiv-R 30(b)(6)

#### Fed. R. Civ. P. 30(b)(6)

Notice or Subpoena Directed to an Organization. In its notice or subpoena, a party may name as the deponent a public or private corporation, a partnership, an association, a governmental agency, or other entity and must describe with reasonable particularity the matters for examination. The named organization must designate one or more officers, directors, or managing agents, or designate other persons who consent to testify on its behalf; and it may set out the matters on which each person designated will testify. Before or promptly after the notice or subpoena is served, the serving party and the organization must confer in good faith about the matters for examination. A subpoena must advise a nonparty organization of its duty to confer with the serving party and to designate each person who will testify. The persons designated must testify about information known or reasonably available to the organization. This paragraph (6) does not preclude a deposition by any other procedure allowed by these rules.

.....

#### DUCivR 30-2 NOTICES REQUIRED FOR DEPOSITIONS UNDER FED. R. CIV. P. 30(b)(6)

The 30(b)(6) notice must be served at least 28 days prior to the scheduled deposition and at least 45 days before the discovery cutoff date. Within 7 days of being served with the notice, the noticed entity may serve written objections. If the parties are unable to resolve the objections within 7 days of service of the objections, either party may seek resolution from the court in accordance with DUCivR 37-1. If the motion is not resolved before the set date of the deposition, the deposition may proceed on subject matters not addressed by the motion.

Unless otherwise agreed to by the parties or ordered by the Court upon a showing of good cause, the notice must not exceed more than 20 topics, including subparts, the deposition of all corporate representatives produced in response to such notice must not exceed 7 hours in length, and a party may not serve more than one notice on any particular party or non-party. If a request for documents accompanies the notice, it is subject to the provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 34. If a subpoena duces tecum accompanies the notice, it is subject to the applicable Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and Local Rules.

# Tab 7

## To: Advisory Committee, Utah Rules of Civil Procedure

# <u>From</u>: MSJ Deadline Subcommittee (Rod Andreason, Tonya Wright, Jensie Anderson, Michael Stahler)

### Date: April 26, 2023

<u>Issue</u>: Can the Rules set a clearer deadline for parties to file motions for summary judgment and take other actions dependent on the close of discovery?

<u>Background</u>: The deadline for parties to file motions for summary judgment is "no later than 28 days after the close of all discovery." UTAH R. CIV. P. 56(b). Expert discovery (if any) is almost always the last part of discovery; thus, the end (or confirmed absence) of expert discovery also marks the end of "all discovery."

Rule 26(a)(4)(C) lists the types, sequence, and timing of expert discovery tasks. However, at any point in the sequence, a party may decide to not perform the next task—whether it be serving a notice electing a report, serving a non-burden disclosure, designating a rebuttal witness, or any other in that section. The issue has arisen: when does "all discovery" close and the deadline for filing motions for summary judgment begin running—when the last expert discovery task has been performed, the time has run for the next task to be performed, or at some other point? Parties often need the full 28 days to draft summary judgment motions but want to receive all discovery first. Opposing parties sometimes seek to limit that time (potentially in gamesmanship) to file summary judgment motions by claiming that much or all of the time has run to file such motions while the filing party waited for the next expert discovery task to occur. The date for the close of all discovery may also pertain to other case deadlines or tasks. There is also some challenge in identifying the last item that can occur in expert discovery, since it could be service of the first or last rebuttal expert report or taking of the first or last rebuttal expert deposition.

<u>Proposed Solution</u>: The Subcommittee proposes creating a new subsection URCP 26(a)(4)(C)(iv) to address this issue:

(iv) Unless otherwise stipulated by the parties or ordered by the court, to calculate any remaining deadlines in the case that are based on the close of discovery, expert discovery is complete on the first date that either (1) the last rebuttal expert report is served or rebuttal expert deposition is taken; or (2) any party fails to meet any of the prior expert discovery deadlines listed above.

The second clause seems somewhat redundant, but the Subcommittee deemed it a helpful explanation.

A redline of the current rule, showing the proposed insertion of the above subsection, is attached.

- 1 Rule 26. General provisions governing disclosure and discovery.
- 2 *Effective: 5/4/2022*
- 3 4

(a) **Disclosure.** This rule applies unless changed or supplemented by a rule governing disclosure and discovery in a practice area.

5 6

7 (1) Initial disclosures. Except in cases exempt under paragraph (a)(3), a party must, without
8 waiting for a discovery request, serve on the other parties:

9 (A) the name and, if known, the address and telephone number of:

(i) each individual likely to have discoverable information supporting its claims or defenses,
 unless solely for impeachment, identifying the subjects of the information; and

- (ii) each fact witness the party may call in its case-in-chief and, except for an adverse party, a
   summary of the expected testimony;
- 14 (B) a copy of all documents, data compilations, electronically stored information, and tangible

15 things in the possession or control of the party that the party may offer in its case-in-chief, except

16 charts, summaries, and demonstrative exhibits that have not yet been prepared and must be

- 17 disclosed in accordance with paragraph (a)(5);
- 18 (C) a computation of any damages claimed and a copy of all discoverable documents or
- evidentiary material on which such computation is based, including materials about the natureand extent of injuries suffered;
- 21 (D) a copy of any agreement under which any person may be liable to satisfy part or all of a
- judgment or to indemnify or reimburse for payments made to satisfy the judgment; and
- 23
- 24 (E) a copy of all documents to which a party refers in its pleadings.
- 25

(2) Timing of initial disclosures. The disclosures required by paragraph (a)(1) must be servedon the other parties:

- (A) by a plaintiff within 14 days after the filing of the first answer to that plaintiff's complaint;and
- 30 (B) by a defendant within 42 days after the filing of that defendant's first answer to the
- 31 complaint.
- 32
- 33 (3) Exemptions.
- (A) Unless otherwise ordered by the court or agreed to by the parties, the requirements ofparagraph (a)(1) do not apply to actions:
- 36 (i) for judicial review of adjudicative proceedings or rule making proceedings of an
- 37 administrative agency;
- 38
- 39 (ii) governed by Rule  $\underline{65B}$  or Rule  $\underline{65C}$ ;
- 40 (iii) to enforce an arbitration award;

(iv) for water rights general adjudication under <u>Title 73, Chapter 4</u>, Determination of Water
 Rights.

(B) In an exempt action, the matters subject to disclosure under paragraph (a)(1) are subject to
 discovery under paragraph (b).

45

# 46 (4) Expert testimony.

47

(A) Disclosure of retained expert testimony. A party must, without waiting for a discovery 48 49 request, serve on the other parties the following information regarding any person who may be used at trial to present evidence under Rule702 of the Utah Rules of Evidence and who is 50 retained or specially employed to provide expert testimony in the case or whose duties as an 51 employee of the party regularly involve giving expert testimony: (i) the expert's name and 52 qualifications, including a list of all publications authored within the preceding 10 years, and a 53 list of any other cases in which the expert has testified as an expert at trial or by deposition 54 55 within the preceding four years, (ii) a brief summary of the opinions to which the witness is expected to testify, (iii) the facts, data, and other information specific to the case that will be 56 57 relied upon by the witness in forming those opinions, and (iv) the compensation to be paid for the witness's study and testimony. 58

59

(B) Limits on expert discovery. Further discovery may be obtained from an expert witness
either by deposition or by written report. A deposition must not exceed four hours and the party
taking the deposition must pay the expert's reasonable hourly fees for attendance at the
deposition. A report must be signed by the expert and must contain a complete statement of all
opinions the expert will offer at trial and the basis and reasons for them. Such an expert may not
testify in a party's case-in-chief concerning any matter not fairly disclosed in the report. The
party offering the expert must pay the costs for the report.

67

# 68 (C) Timing for expert discovery.

(i) The party who bears the burden of proof on the issue for which expert testimony is offered

71 must serve on the other parties the information required by paragraph (a)(4)(A) within 14 days

72 after the close of fact discovery. Within 14 days thereafter, the party opposing the expert may  $\frac{1}{2}$ 

respectively serve notice electing either a deposition of the expert pursuant to paragraph (a)(4)(B) and Rule 30, or a written report pursuant to paragraph (a)(4)(B). The deposition must occur, or the

Rule  $\underline{30}$ , or a written report pursuant to paragraph (a)(4)(B). The deposition must occur, or the report must be served on the other parties, within 42 days after the election is served on the other

75 report must be served on the other parties, within 42 days after the election is served on the other parties. If no election is served on the other parties, then no further discovery of the expert must

- <sup>77</sup> be permitted.
- 78

(ii) The party who does not bear the burden of proof on the issue for which expert testimony is

80 offered must serve on the other parties the information required by paragraph (a)(4)(A) within 14

- 81 days after the later of (A) the date on which the disclosure under paragraph (a)(4)(C)(i) is due, or
- 82 (B) service of the written report or the taking of the expert's deposition pursuant to paragraph
- 83 (a)(4)(C)(i). Within 14 days thereafter, the party opposing the expert may serve notice electing
- either a deposition of the expert pursuant to paragraph (a)(4)(B) and Rule 30, or a written report
- pursuant to paragraph (a)(4)(B). The deposition must occur, or the report must be served on the

- other parties, within 42 days after the election is served on the other parties. If no election is 86 87 served on the other parties, then no further discovery of the expert must be permitted. 88 89 (iii) If the party who bears the burden of proof on an issue wants to designate rebuttal expert witnesses, it must serve on the other parties the information required by paragraph (a)(4)(A)90 within 14 days after the later of (A) the date on which the election under paragraph (a)(4)(C)(ii)91 is due or (B) service of the written report or the taking of the expert's deposition pursuant to 92 93 paragraph (a)(4)(C)(ii). Within 14 days thereafter, the party opposing the expert may serve notice electing either a deposition of the expert pursuant to paragraph (a)(4)(B) and Rule 30, or a 94 95 written report pursuant to paragraph (a)(4)(B). The deposition must occur, or the report must be served on the other parties, within 42 days after the election is served on the other parties. If no 96 election is served on the other parties, then no further discovery of the expert must be permitted. 97 The court may preclude an expert disclosed only as a rebuttal expert from testifying in the case 98 in chief. 99 100 (iv) Unless otherwise stipulated by the parties or ordered by the court, to calculate any remaining 101 deadlines in the case that are based on the close of discovery, expert discovery is complete on the 102 first date that either (1) the last rebuttal expert report is served or rebuttal expert deposition is 103 taken; or (2) any party fails to meet any of the prior expert discovery deadlines listed above. 104 105 (D) Multiparty actions. In multiparty actions, all parties opposing the expert must agree on 106 107 either a report or a deposition. If all parties opposing the expert do not agree, then further discovery of the expert may be obtained only by deposition pursuant to paragraph (a)(4)(B) and 108 109 Rule 30. 110 (E) Summary of non-retained expert testimony. If a party intends to present evidence at trial 111 under Rule 702 of the Utah Rules of Evidence from any person other than an expert witness who 112 is retained or specially employed to provide testimony in the case or a person whose duties as an 113 employee of the party regularly involve giving expert testimony, that party must serve on the 114 115 other parties a written summary of the facts and opinions to which the witness is expected to testify in accordance with the deadlines set forth in paragraph (a)(4)(C). Such a witness cannot 116 be required to provide a report pursuant to paragraph (a)(4)(B). A deposition of such a witness 117 may not exceed four hours and, unless manifest injustice would result, the party taking the 118 deposition must pay the expert's reasonable hourly fees for attendance at the deposition. 119 120
- 121 (5) Pretrial disclosures.
- 122 (A) A party must, without waiting for a discovery request, serve on the other parties:
- (i) the name and, if not previously provided, the address and telephone number of each witness,
- unless solely for impeachment, separately identifying witnesses the party will call and witnessesthe party may call;
- (ii) the name of witnesses whose testimony is expected to be presented by transcript of adeposition;
- 128 (iii) designations of the proposed deposition testimony; and

- 129 (iv) a copy of each exhibit, including charts, summaries, and demonstrative exhibits, unless
- solely for impeachment, separately identifying those which the party will offer and those whichthe party may offer.
- 132
- (B) Disclosure required by paragraph (a)(5)(A) must be served on the other parties at least 28
- 134 days before trial. Disclosures required by paragraph (a)(5)(A)(i) and (a)(5)(A)(ii) must also be
- filed on the date that they are served. At least 14 days before trial, a party must serve any counter
- designations of deposition testimony and any objections and grounds for the objections to the use
- 137 of any deposition, witness, or exhibit if the grounds for the objection are apparent before trial.
- 138 Other than objections under Rules 402 and 403 of the Utah Rules of Evidence, other objections
- 139 not listed are waived unless excused by the court for good cause.
- 140
- 141 (6) Form of disclosure and discovery production. Rule 34 governs the form in which all
- documents, data compilations, electronically stored information, tangible things, and evidentiary material should be produced under this Pule
- 143 material should be produced under this Rule.

# Tab 8

## Rule 45. Subpoena.

Amendment history and request from Supreme Court.

This rule has been through several revisions and meetings with the Supreme Court. Proposed changes have included the addition of an Advisory Committee Note regarding LPPs ability to sign and issue subpoenas, the addition of a paragraph regarding foreign subpoenas, and finally small changes to paragraphs (e)(3) and (e)(4).

The Supreme Court initially asked the Committee to consider the interaction of Rule 45 with Rule 7. Rule 7(b)(4) provides that "[a] request under Rule 45 to quash a subpoena must follow Rule 37(a)." The Committee discussed possibly changing Rule 45(e)(3) to provide as follows: "Although not required, [t]he person subject to the subpoena or a non-party affected by the subpoena may object file a motion to quash under Rule 37 if the subpoena: . . . ." However, after discussion, the Committee felt this would likely add confusion, as all of the grounds stated in subparagraph (e)(3) for moving to quash a subpoena would also be grounds for a mere objection. Regarding this subparagraph, the Committee therefore proposed to merely to delete the "under Rule 37" language.

After meeting on April 12, the Supreme Court now requests the Committee make sure the language in Rules 7, 37, and 45 are clear as to parties, non-parties, objections and motions to quash.

URCP 45. AMEND.

Redline

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

1	Rule 45. Subpoena.				
2	(a) Form; issuance.				
3	(1) Every subpoena shall:				
4	(A) issue from the court in which the action is pending;				
5 6 7	(B) state the title and case number of the action, the name of the court from which it is issued, and the name and address of the party or attorney responsible for issuing the subpoena;				
8	(C) command each person to whom it is directed				
9	(i) to appear and give testimony at a trial, hearing or deposition, or				
10 11 12	(ii) to appear and produce for inspection, copying, testing or sampling documents, electronically stored information or tangible things in the possession, custody or control of that person, or				
13 14 15 16	(iii) to copy documents or electronically stored information in the possession, custody or control of that person and mail or deliver the copies to the party or attorney responsible for issuing the subpoena before a date certain, or				
17	(iv) to appear and to permit inspection of premises;				
18 19 20	(D) if an appearance is required, give notice of the date, time, and place for the appearance and, if remote transmission is requested, instructions for participation and whom to contact if there are technical difficulties; and				
21 22 23 24	(E) include a notice to persons served with a subpoena in a form substantially similar to the approved subpoena form. A subpoena may specify the form or forms in which electronically stored information is to be produced.				
25 26 27 28	(2) The clerk shall issue a subpoena, signed but otherwise in blank, to a party requesting it, who shall complete it before service. An attorney admitted to practice in Utah may issue and sign a subpoena as an officer of the court.				
29	(b) Service; fees; prior notice.				
30 31	(1) A subpoena may be served by any person who is at least 18 years of age and not a party to the case. Service of a subpoena upon the person to whom it				

{01954540-1 }

32

Redline

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

33	(2) If the subpoena commands a person's appearance, the party or attorney	
34	responsible for issuing the subpoena shall tender with the subpoena the fees	

is directed shall be made as provided in Rule 4(d).

- for one day's attendance and the mileage allowed by law. When the subpoena
  is issued on behalf of the United States, or this state, or any officer or agency of
  either, fees and mileage need not be tendered.
- (3) If the subpoena commands a person to copy and mail or deliver documentsor electronically stored information, to produce documents, electronically
- 40 stored information or tangible things for inspection, copying, testing or
- 41 sampling or to permit inspection of premises, the party or attorney responsible
- 42 for issuing the subpoena shall serve each party with the subpoena by delivery
- 43 or other method of actual notice before serving the subpoena.

44 (c) Appearance; resident; non-resident.

- 45 (1) A person who resides in this state may be required to appear: (A) at a trial or hearing in the county in which the case is pending; and 46 (B) at a deposition, or to produce documents, electronically stored 47 information or tangible things, or to permit inspection of premises only 48 in the county in which the person resides, is employed, or transacts 49 50 business in person, or at such other place as the court may order. 51 (2) A person who does not reside in this state but who is served within this 52 state may be required to appear: 53 (A) at a trial or hearing in the county in which the case is pending; and
- (B) at a deposition, or to produce documents, electronically stored
  information or tangible things, or to permit inspection of premises only in
  the county in which the person is served or at such other place as the court
  may order.
- 58 (d) Payment of production or copying costs. The party or attorney responsible for
- issuing the subpoena shall pay the reasonable cost of producing or copying
- documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things. Upon the
- 61 request of any other party and the payment of reasonable costs, the party or
- attorney responsible for issuing the subpoena shall provide to the requesting
- 63 party copies of all documents, electronically stored information or tangible things

{01954540-1 }

URCP 45. AMEND.

Redline

DRAFT: Feb. 22, 2023

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

64 65	obtained in response to the subpoena or shall make the tangible things available for inspection.			
66	(e) Protection of persons subject to subpoenas; objection.			
67 68 69 70 71 72	(1) The party or attorney responsible for issuing a subpoena shall take reasonable steps to avoid imposing an undue burden or expense on the person subject to the subpoena. The court shall enforce this duty and impose upon the party or attorney in breach of this duty an appropriate sanction, which may include, but is not limited to, lost earnings and a reasonable attorney fee.			
73 74 75 76 77	(2) A subpoena to copy and mail or deliver documents or electronically stored information, to produce documents, electronically stored information or tangible things, or to permit inspection of premises shall comply with Rule 34(a) and (b)(1), except that the person subject to the subpoena must be allowed at least 14 days after service to comply.			
78 79	(3) The person subject to the subpoena or a non-party affected by the subpoena may object <del>under Rule 37</del> if the subpoena:			
80	(A) fails to allow reasonable time for compliance;			
81 82 83	(B) requires a resident of this state to appear at other than a trial or hearing in a county in which the person does not reside, is not employed, or does not transact business in person;			
84 85 86	(C) requires a non-resident of this state to appear at other than a trial or hearing in a county other than the county in which the person was served;			
87 88	(D) requires the person to disclose privileged or other protected matter and no exception or waiver applies;			
89 90	(E) requires the person to disclose a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information;			
91	(F) subjects the person to an undue burden or cost;			
92 93	(G) requires the person to produce electronically stored information in a form or forms to which the person objects;			
94 95	(H) requires the person to provide electronically stored information from sources that the person identifies as not reasonably accessible			

{01954540-1 }

information not describing specific events or occurrences in dispute and resulting from the expert's study that was not made at the request of a party. (4) Timing and form of objections. (A) If the person subject to the subpoena or a non-party affected by the subpoena objects, the objection must be made in writing and made before the date for compliance. (B) The objection shall be stated in a concise, non-conclusory manner. (C) If the objection is that the information commanded by the subpoena is privileged or protected and no exception or waiver applies, or requires the person to disclose a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information, the objection shall sufficiently describe the nature of the documents, communications, or things not produced to enable the party or attorney responsible for issuing the subpoena to contest the objection. (D) If the objection is that the electronically stored information is from sources that are not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost, the person from whom discovery is sought must show that the information sought is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. (E) The objection shall be served on the party or attorney responsible for issuing the subpoena. The party or attorney responsible for issuing the subpoena shall serve a copy of the objection on the other parties. (5) If objection is made, or if a party requests a protective order, the party or attorney responsible for issuing the subpoena is not entitled to compliance but may request an order to compel compliance under Rule 37(a). The

objection or request shall be served on the other parties and on the person 124 subject to the subpoena. An order compelling compliance shall protect the 125 126 person subject to or affected by the subpoena from significant expense or 127 harm. The court may quash or modify the subpoena. If the party or attorney 128 responsible for issuing the subpoena shows a substantial need for the

{01954540-1 }

Redline

(I) requires the person to disclose an unretained expert's opinion or

because of undue burden or cost; or

URCP 45. AMEND.

96

97

98

99

100

101

102

103

104

105

106

107

108

109

110

111 112

113

114

115

116

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

DRAFT: Feb. 22, 2023.

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

	URCP 45. AMEND.	Redline	DRAFT: Feb. 22, 2023		
129 130					
131	(f) Duties in responding to subpoena.				
132 133 134 135 136	(1) A person commanded to copy and mail or deliver documents or electronically stored information or to produce documents, electronically stored information or tangible things shall serve on the party or attorney responsible for issuing the subpoena a declaration under penalty of law stating in substance:				
137	(A) that the declara	nt has knowledge of the facts	contained in the declaration;		
138 139		nts, electronically stored info are a full and complete respo			
140 141		ents, electronically stored info that a copy is a true copy of th			
142 143		cost of copying or producing t l information or tangible thing			
144 145 146 147 148	electronically stored in stored information or ta kept in the usual course	ed to copy and mail or deliver formation or to produce docu angible things shall copy or p e of business or shall organize tegories in the subpoena.	ments, electronically roduce them as they are		
149 150 151 152	electronically stored in produce the information	not specify the form or forms f formation, a person respondin on in the form or forms in which n or forms that are reasonably	ng to a subpoena must ch the person ordinarily		
153 154 155 156 157 158 159 160 161	of privilege or of protect the claim may notify and the basis for it. After be or destroy the specified disclose the information promptly present the in the claim. If the receiving	roduced in response to a subp ction as trial-preparation mate by party who received the info eing notified, the party must p l information and any copies o n until the claim is resolved. A nformation to the court under ng party disclosed the informate steps to retrieve the informate	erial, the person making ormation of the claim and promptly return, sequester, of it and may not use or A receiving party may e seal for a determination of ation before being notified,		
	{01954540-1 }				

Redline

DRAFT: Feb. 22, 2023

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

- produced the information must preserve the information until the claim isresolved.
- (g) **Contempt.** Failure by any person without adequate excuse to obey asubpoena served upon that person is punishable as contempt of court.

(h) Procedure when witness evades service or fails to attend. If a witness evades
service of a subpoena or fails to attend after service of a subpoena, the court may
issue a warrant to the sheriff of the county to arrest the witness and bring the
witness before the court.

- 170 (i) **Procedure when witness is an inmate.** If the witness is an inmate as defined in
- 171 Rule 6(e)(1), a party may move for an order to examine the witness in the
- institution or to produce the witness before the court or officer for the purpose of
- being orally examined.
- (j) Subpoena unnecessary. A person present in court or before a judicial officer
  may be required to testify in the same manner as if the person were in
- 175 may be required to testiny in the same manner as in the person v
- attendance upon a subpoena.
- 177
- 178
- 179
- 180 Effective May 1, 2021