

# Agenda

# **Utah Supreme Court Advisory Committee Utah Rules of Appellate Procedure**

Chris Ballard, Chair Nathalie Skibine, Vice Chair

Location: Meeting held through Webex and in person at:

Matheson Courthouse, Council Room, N. 301

450 S. State St.

Salt Lake City, Utah 84111

https://utcourts.webex.com/utcourts/j.php?MTID=m538581f9082cdad50ff1e74adef124f9

Date: March 7, 2024

Time: 12:00 to 1:30 p.m.

<b>Action</b> : Welcome and approval of February 1, 2024 Minutes	Tab 1	Chris Ballard, Chair
<b>Action:</b> Final Approval of Rules 3, 5, 14, 19, 48, 21, 26 and 27	Tab 2	Chris Ballard
Action: Rule 42	Tab 3	Clark Sabey, Michelle Quist, Judge Christiansen Forster
Action: Rule 8	Tab 4	Stan Purser
<b>Discussion:</b> Rule 23C – concerns on creating a standard for the grant of emergency relief		Clark Sabey, Mary Westby, Troy Booher
Discussion: Old/new business		Chris Ballard, Chair

Committee Webpage: <a href="https://legacy.utcourts.gov/utc/appellate-procedure/">https://legacy.utcourts.gov/utc/appellate-procedure/</a>

# **2024 Meeting schedule:**

April 4, 2024	September 5, 2024	December 5, 2024
May 2, 2024	October 3, 2024	
June 6, 2024	November 7, 2024	

# TAB 1



#### **Minutes**

# Supreme Court's Advisory Committee on the Utah Rules of Appellate Procedure

Administrative Office of the Courts 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84114

In Person and by WebEx Videoconference Thursday, February 1, 2024 12:00 pm to 1:30 pm

None

PRESENT

Debra Nelson

EXCUSED

Emily Adams

Glassia Dalla Glassia Gregory Orme

Christopher Ballard—Chair
Troy Booher—
Tera Peterson

Emeritus Member Stanford Purser
Judge Michele Challen

Christiansen Forster Clark Sabey

Nathalie Skibine —

Lisa Collins Nathalie Skibine-Carol Funk Vice Chair

Amber Griffith—Staff

Scarlet Smith

Michael Judd—Recording Nick Stiles—Staff

Secretary Mary Westby

# 1. Action: Chris Ballard

# **Approval of December 2023 Minutes**

The committee reviewed the December minutes and identified a needed correction in Section 3.

After that review, Mary Westby moved to approve the December 2023 minutes as amended, as they appeared in the committee's materials. Judge Michele Christiansen Forster seconded that motion, and it passed without objection by unanimous consent.

# 2. Action: Chris Ballard

### Final Approval of Rules 11, 22, and 52

With respect to Rule 11, the committee reviewed a public comment related to exhibits on appeal but concluded that the language in the proposed amendment remains the best approach, as in the committee's view, both considered and offered exhibits should be included in the scope of Rule 11.

Following that discussion, Ms. Westby moved to approve the three rules and Stan Purser seconded. The motion passed without objection by unanimous consent.

# 3. Action: Mary Westby Rule 10

The proposed change to Rule 10 had been considered previously as an amendment to Rule 4, but the committee believes the amendment fits better within Rule 10. The intent of the amendment is to allow the appellate courts—likely through staff attorneys—to dismiss appeals for failure to prosecute. The committee discussed the interaction between the draft Rule 10 and the existing provisions of Rule 58A of the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure. The committee also discussed stylistic and ordering changes.

Following that discussion, Emily Adams moved to approve the amendments to Rule 10 as they appeared on the screen at the committee's meeting, subject to certain future adjustments to the numbering and format. Ms. Westby seconded that motion, and it passed without objection by unanimous consent.

# 4. Action: Mary Westby Rule 57

The proposed amendment to Rule 57 is intended to better align the process for child-welfare appeals with the process for other appeals. The committee worked to revise language for clarity.

Following that discussion, Judge Christiansen Forster moved to approve the amendments to Rule 57 as they appeared on the screen at the committee's meeting. Mr. Purser seconded that motion, and it passed without objection by unanimous consent.

#### 5. Discussion:

#### **Nick Stiles**

## **Appellate Court Disqualification**

The committee returned to the concept of an appellate-court disqualification rule, building on a prior draft and prior concepts. Nick Stiles agreed to take the lead, in consultation with several other committee members, on assembling a new draft of a proposed rule.

## 6. Discussion:

Chris Ballard Nathalie Skibine

# Items Referred by the Supreme Court

The committee discussed several teams and subcommittees to handle the initial stages of planning and drafting associated with several items referred by the Supreme Court:

**Rule 23(b)—Child Welfare.** Tera Peterson, Debra Nelson, and Ms. Westby will lead, seeking input from other governmental child-welfare specialists as appropriate.

Rule 3. Mr. Purser will lead.

**A rule regarding retention.** Clark Sabey, Michelle Quist, and Judge Christiansen Forster will lead.

**Rule 23C—Standard.** Mr. Sabey, Ms. Westby, and Troy Booher will lead.

#### 7. Discussion:

**Chris Ballard** 

Additional Old/New Business

None.

# 8. Adjourn

**Chris Ballard** 

Following the business described above, Judge Greg Orme moved to adjourn, and Ms. Westby seconded. The committee adjourned. The committee's next meeting will take place in March 2024.

# TAB 2

One thought on "Rules of Appellate Procedure – Comment Period Closed February 17, 2024"

1. J. Bogart January 4, 2024 at 9:04 am

Why the 7 megabyte limit on pdf size in 21(a)(1)?

- 1 Rule 3. Appeal as of right - how taken.
- 2 (a) Filing the notice of appeal.
- 3 (1) Except as otherwise provided by law, a party may appeal a final order or judgment
- from a district or juvenile court to the appellate court by filing a notice of appeal with 4
- the trial court clerk within the time allowed by Rule 4. 5
- 6 (2) An appellant's failure to take any step other than timely filing a notice of appeal
- 7 does not affect the validity of the appeal, but is ground only for the appellate court to
- 8 act as it considers appropriate, including dismissing the appeal or other sanctions
- short of dismissal, and awarding attorney fees. 9
- 10 (b) **Joint or consolidated appeals.** If two or more parties are entitled to appeal from a
- judgment or order and their interests are such as to make joinder practicable, they may 11
- file a joint notice of appeal or may join in an appeal of another party after filing separate 12
- 13 timely notices of appeal. Joint appeals may proceed as a single appeal with a single
- appellant. Individual appeals may be consolidated by order of the appellate court upon 14
- 15 its own motion or upon motion of a party, or by stipulation of the parties to the separate
- appeals. 16
- 17 (c) Party Designation. The party taking the appeal is known as the appellant and the
- 18 adverse party as the appellee. Unless otherwise directed by the appellate court, the
- 19 appeal will not change the title of the action or proceeding. For original proceedings in
- 20 the appellate court, the party making the original application is known as the petitioner
- 21 and any other party as the respondent.
- 22 (d) **Notice of appeal contents.** The notice of appeal must:
- 23 (1) specify the party or parties taking the appeal;
- (2) designate the judgment, order, or part thereof being appealed; 24
- 25 (3) name the court from which the appeal is taken; and
- 26 (4) name the court to which the appeal is taken.

- 27 (e) **Serving the notice of appeal.** The appellant must serve the notice of appeal on each
- 28 party to the judgment or order in accordance with the requirements of the court from
- 29 which the appeal is taken. If counsel of record is served, the certificate of service must
- 30 include the name of the party represented by that counsel.
- 31 (f) **Filing fee in civil appeals.** When filing any notice of separate, joint, or cross appeal in
- a civil case, the party taking the appeal or cross appeal must, pursuant to FRule 21, pay
- 33 the filing fee established by law to the trial court clerk, unless waived by the trial court.
- 34 The trial court clerk must accept a notice of appeal regardless of whether the filing fee
- 35 has been paid. Failure to pay the filing fee within a reasonable time may result in
- 36 dismissal.
- 37 (g) Docketing of appeal.
- 38 (1) **Transmitting notice of appeal to the appellate court.** After an appellant files the
- 39 notice of appeal, the trial court clerk must immediately email a copy of the notice of
- 40 appeal to the appellate court clerk. The email will include:
- 41 (A) the date the notice of appeal was filed, and
- (B) the clerk's statement declaring whether the filing fee was paid and whether the
- cost bond required by Rule 6 was filed.
- 44 (2) **Docketing the appeal.** Upon receiving the copy of the notice of appeal from the
- 45 trial court clerk, the appellate court clerk will enter the appeal on the docket. An
- appeal will be docketed under the title given to the action in the trial court, with the
- 47 appellant identified as such, but if the title does not contain the name of the appellant,
- such name will be added to the title.

(a) Petition for permission to appeal. Any party may seek an appeal from an 2 interlocutory order by filing a petition for permission to appeal from the interlocutory 3 order with the appellate court with jurisdiction over the case. The petition must be filed 4 and served on all other parties to the action within 21 days after the entry of the trial 5 court's order. If the trial court enters an order on a Saturday, Sunday, or legal holiday, 6 the date of entry will be deemed to be the first day following the trial court's entry that is 7 8 not a Saturday, Sunday, or legal holiday. A timely appeal from an order certified under Rule 54(b), Utah Rules of Civil Procedure, that the appellate court determines is not final 9 may, in the appellate court's discretion, be considered by the appellate court as a petition 10 for permission to appeal an interlocutory order. The appellate court may direct the 11 appellant to file a petition that conforms to the requirements of paragraph (c) of this rule. 12 (b) Fees and filing of petition. The petitioner must file the petition with the appellate 13 court clerk and pay the fee required by statute and, pursuant to Rule 21, pay the fee 14 required by law, unless waived by the appellate court. at the time of electronic filing or 15 within seven days of filing by email, mail, or in person. The petitioner must serve the 16 petition on the opposing party and notice of the filing of the petition on the trial court. If 17 the appellate court issues an order granting permission to appeal, the appellate court 18 clerk will immediately give notice of the order to the respective parties and will transmit 19 the order to the trial court where the order will be filed instead of a notice of appeal. 20

Draft: December 7, 2023

# (c) Content of petition.

21

22

- (1) The petition must contain:
- 23 (A) A concise statement of facts material to a consideration of the issue presented 24 and the order sought to be reviewed;
- 25 (B) The issue presented expressed in the terms and circumstances of the case but 26 without unnecessary detail, and a demonstration that the issue was preserved in

- the trial court. Petitioner must state the applicable standard of appellate review and cite supporting authority;
- (C) A statement of the reasons why an immediate interlocutory appeal should be permitted, including a concise analysis of the statutes, rules or cases believed to be determinative of the issue stated; and
- 32 (D) A statement of the reason why the appeal may materially advance the termination of the litigation.
- (2) If the petition is subject to assignment by the Supreme Court to the Court of Appeals, the phrase "Subject to assignment to the Court of Appeals" must appear immediately under the title of the document, i.e. Petition for Permission to Appeal. Petitioner may then set forth in the petition a concise statement why the Supreme Court should decide the case.
- (3) The petitioner must attach a copy of the trial court's order from which an appeal
   is sought and any related findings of fact and conclusions of law and opinion. Other
   documents that may be relevant to determining whether to grant permission to appeal
   may be referenced by identifying trial court docket entries of the documents.
- (d) Page limitation. A petition for permission to appeal must not exceed 20 pages,
   excluding table of contents, if any, and the addenda.
- 45 (e) **Service in criminal and juvenile delinquency cases**. Any petition filed by a 46 defendant in a criminal case originally charged as a felony or by a juvenile in a 47 delinquency proceeding must be served on the Criminal Appeals Division of the Office 48 of the Utah Attorney General.
- (f) **Response**; **no reply**. No petition will be granted in the absence of a request by the court for a response. No response to a petition for permission to appeal will be received unless requested by the court. Within 14 days after an order requesting a response, any other party may oppose or concur with the petition. Any response to a petition for permission to appeal is subject to the same page limitation set out in paragraph (d) and must be filed

- in the appellate court. The respondent must serve the response on the petitioner. The petition and any response will be submitted without oral argument unless otherwise ordered. No reply in support of a petition for permission to appeal will be permitted
- 57 unless requested by the court.
- 58 (g) **Grant of permission**. An appeal from an interlocutory order may be granted only if it appears that the order involves substantial rights and may materially affect the final 59 decision or that a determination of the correctness of the order before final judgment will 60 better serve the administration and interests of justice. The order permitting the appeal 61 may set forth the particular issue or point of law that will be considered and may be on 62 such terms, including requiring a bond for costs and damages, as the appellate court may 63 determine. The appellate court clerk will immediately give the parties and trial court 64 notice of any order granting or denying the petition. If the petition is granted, the appeal 65 will be deemed to have been filed and docketed by the granting of the petition. All 66 proceedings after the petition is granted will be as and within the time required, for 67 appeals from final judgments except that no docketing statement under Rule 9 is required 68 unless the court otherwise orders, and no cross-appeal may be filed under Rule 4(d). 69
- (h) **Stays pending interlocutory review**. The appellate court will not consider an application for a stay pending disposition of an interlocutory appeal until the petitioner has filed a petition for interlocutory appeal.
- (i) **Cross-petitions not permitted**. A cross-petition for permission to appeal a non-final order is not permitted by this rule. All parties seeking to appeal from an interlocutory order must comply with paragraph (a) of this rule.
- (j) Record. If the petition is granted, the trial court will prepare and transmit the record
   under Rule <u>11</u> or <u>12</u>. Any transcript(s) must be ordered in compliance with Rule <u>11</u>.
  - Effective: 11/1/2023

Draft: January 3, 2024

- Rule 14. Review of administrative orders: how obtained; intervention. 1
- (a) Petition for review of order; joint petition. When a statute provides for judicial 2
- review by or appeal to the Supreme Court or the Court of Appeals of an order or decision 3
- of an administrative agency, board, commission, committee, or officer (hereinafter the 4
- term "agency" shall-includes agency, board, commission, committee, or officer), a party 5
- seeking review must file a petition for review with the clerk of the appellate court clerk 6
- 7 within the time prescribed by statute, or if there is no time prescribed, then within 30
- days after the date of the written decision or order. The petition must specify the parties 8
- seeking review and must designate the respondent(s) and the order or decision, or part
- 9
- thereof, to be reviewed. In each case, the agency must be named respondent. The State of 10
- 11 Utah is a respondent if required by statute, even if not designated in the petition. If two
- or more persons are entitled to petition for review of the same order and their interests 12
- 13 are such as to make joinder practicable, they may file a joint petition for review and may
- thereafter proceed as a single petitioner. The agency must electronically-file the record 14
- 15 within 210 days of the request of the appellate courts.
- (b) Filing fees. At the time of filing any petition for review or cross-petition for review, 16
- the The petitioner or cross-petitioner must, pursuant to Rule 21, pay the filing fee 17
- established by law, unless waived by the appellate court. The appellate court clerk must 18
- accept the petition or cross petition for review regardless of whether the filing fee has 19
- been paid. Failure to pay the required filing fee within seven days may result in dismissal 20
- of the petition or cross-petition. If a petition or cross-petition for review is filed by email, 21
- 22 by mail, or in person without payment of the filing fee, the required filing fee must be
- paid within seven days or the petition or cross-petition may be dismissed. 23
- 24 (c) Service of petition. The petitioner must serve the petition on the respondents and all
- 25 parties to the proceeding before the agency in a manner provided by Rule 21.
- (d) **Intervention**. Any person may file with the <del>clerk of the</del> appellate court clerk a motion 26
- 27 to intervene. The motion must contain a concise statement of the interest of the moving

Commented [AG1]: This needs to be changed to remove the requirement that agencies e-file the record.

#### URAP014. Amend. Redline

28 party and the grounds on which intervention is sought. A motion to intervene must be

- 29 filed within 40 days of the date on which the petition for review is filed.
- 30 (e) **Additional or Cross-Petition**. If a timely petition for review is filed by any party, any
- 31 other party may file a petition for review within 14 days after the date on which the first
- 32 petition for review was filed, or within the time otherwise prescribed by paragraph (a) of
- 33 this rule, whichever period last expires.
- 34 Effective: 11/1/2023

- 1 Rule 19. Extraordinary relief.
- 2 (a) **Petition for extraordinary relief.** When no other plain, speedy, or adequate remedy
- 3 is available, a person may petition an appellate court for extraordinary relief referred to
- 4 in Rule 65B of the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure.
- 5 (b) **Respondents.** The person or entity against whom relief is sought and all parties in
- 6 any related district court or agency action other than the petitioner are deemed
- 7 respondents for all purposes.
- 8 (c) **Filing and service.** The petition must be filed with the appellate <u>court</u> clerk and served
- 9 on the respondent(s). In the event of an original petition in the appellate court where no
- 10 action is pending in the district court or agency, the petition also must be served on all
- 11 persons or entities whose interests might be substantially affected.
- 12 (d) **Filing fee.** The petitioner must, pursuant to **r**Rule 21, pay the prescribed filing fee at
- 13 the time of filing to the appellate court clerk, unless waived by the court.
- 14 (e) **Contents of petition.** A petition for extraordinary relief must contain the following:
- 15 (1) a list of all respondents against whom relief is sought, and all others persons or
- entities, by name or by class, whose interests might be substantially affected;
- 17 (2) a statement of the issues presented and of the relief sought;
- 18 (3) a statement of the facts necessary to understand the issues presented by the
- 19 petition;
- 20 (4) a statement of the reasons why no other plain, speedy, or adequate remedy exists
- and why the relief should be granted;
- 22 (5) when the subject of the petition is an interlocutory order, a statement explaining
- 23 whether a petition for interlocutory appeal has been filed and, if so, summarize its
- status or, if not, why interlocutory appeal is not a plain, speedy, or adequate remedy;

- 25 (6) except in cases where the petition is directed to a district court, a statement
- 26 explaining why it is impractical or inappropriate to file the petition in the district
- 27 court;
- 28 (7) a discussion of points and authorities in support of the petition; and
- 29 (8) copies of any order or opinion or parts of the record that may be essential to
- understand the matters set forth in the petition.
- 31 (f) **Emergency relief.** When emergency relief is sought, the petitioner must file a separate
- 32 motion pursuant to Rule 23C explaining why emergency relief is requested. Any
- response to a motion filed under <u>Rule 23C</u> is governed by that rule and is separate from
- 34 any response to a petition filed under Rule 19.
- 35 (g) **Response.** No petition will be granted in the absence of a request by the court for a
- 36 response. No response to a petition will be received unless requested by the court.
- 37 (1) **Timing.** If requested, a respondent may file a response within 30 days of the court's
- request or within such other time as the court orders.
- 39 (2) **Joint Response.** Two or more respondents may respond jointly.
- 40 (3) **Contents.** The response must include, or respond to, as appropriate, the items in
- 41 paragraph (e).
- 42 (4) **Notice of non-participation.** If any respondent does not desire to appear in the
- proceedings or file a response, that respondent may advise the appellate court clerk
- and all parties by letter, but the allegations of the petition will not thereby be deemed
- 45 admitted.
- 46 (h) **Reply.** The petitioner may file a reply within 14 days after service of the response. A
- 47 reply must be limited to responding to the facts and arguments raised in the response.
- 48 (i) **Page and word limits.** A petition or response may not exceed 20 pages or 7,000 words.
- 49 A reply may not exceed 10 pages or 3,500 words. Headings, footnotes, and quotations

- count toward the page or word limit, but the cover page or caption, any table of contents 50 or authorities, signature block, certificates, and any attachments do not. 51
- (i) Certificate of compliance. A petition, response, and reply must include the filer's 52 53 certification that the document complies with:
- 54 (1) paragraph (i), governing the number of pages or words (the filer may rely on the word count of the word processing system used to prepare the document); and 55
- 56 (2) Rule 21(h), governing filings containing non-public information.
  - (k) Review and disposition of petition.

58

59

60

61

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

- (1) The court may deny a petition without a response. Where a response has been called for, the court will render a decision based on the petition and any timely response and reply, or it may require briefing or request further information, and may hold oral argument at its discretion.
- 62 (2) If the court determines that the petition was not appropriately filed in the appellate court, the court will refer the petition to the appropriate district court. Any review of 63 the district court's decision on the petition must be pursued by appeal rather than a refiling of the petition.
  - (3) A single judge or justice may deny the petition if it is frivolous on its face or fails to materially comply with the requirements of this rule or Rule 65B of the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure. A petition's denial by a single judge or justice may be reviewed by the appellate court upon specific request filed within seven days of notice of disposition, but such request may not include any additional argument or briefing.
- 71 (l) **Transmission of record.** In reviewing a petition for extraordinary relief, the appellate 72 court may order transmission of the record, or any relevant portion thereof.
- 73 (m) Issuing an extraordinary writ on the court's motion.

- Draft: January 3, 2024
- 74 (1) The appellate court, in aid of its own jurisdiction in extraordinary cases, may on 75 its own motion issue a writ directed to a judge, agency, person, or entity.
- (2) A copy of the writ will be served on the named respondents in the manner and by an individual authorized to accomplish personal service under <u>Rule 4</u> of the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure. In addition, copies of the writ must be transmitted by the appellate court clerk, by the most direct means available, to all persons or associations whose interests might be substantially affected by the writ.
  - (3) The respondent and the persons or entities whose interests are substantially affected may, within four days of the writ's issuance, petition the court to dissolve or amend the writ. The petition must be accompanied by a concise statement of the reasons for dissolving or amending the writ.

## 85 Effective May 1, 2023

81

82

83

84

86

### **Advisory Committee Note**

- The Utah Constitution enshrines the right to a writ of habeas corpus. Utah Const., art. I, 87 sec. 5; art. VIII, sec. 3; art. VIII, sec. 5. The Appellate Rules Committee recommended 88 repealing Rule 20 (Habeas Corpus Proceedings) because it was duplicative of Rule 19 89 (Extraordinary Relief) and potentially caused incarcerated individuals to forgo filing a 90 petition under the Post-Conviction Remedies Act (Utah Code Title 78B, Chapter 9). The 91 92 repeal is not intended to substantively affect a defendant's right to a writ of habeas corpus. Rule 19 of the Utah Rules of Appellate Procedure and Rules 65B and 65C of the 93 94 Utah Rules of Civil Procedure govern habeas corpus proceedings.
- 95 *Adopted May 1, 2023*

## Draft: December 8, 2023

# 1 Rule 48. Time for petitioning.

- 2 (a) Timeliness of petition. A petition for a writ of certiorari must be filed with the
- 3 Supreme Court clerk within 30 days after the Court of Appeals' final decision is issued,
- 4 and not from the date the remittitur is issued. The docket fee must be paid when the
- 5 petition is filed, pPursuant to rRule 21, the filing fee must be paid to the appellate court
- 6 <u>clerk, unless waived by the court.</u>
- 7 (b) Rejection of petition. The clerk will reject any petition for a writ of certiorari not
- 8 timely filed or accompanied by the docket fee.
- 9 (c) **Effect of petition for rehearing.** If a petition for rehearing that complies with <u>Rule</u>
- 35(a) is timely filed by any party, the time for filing the petition for a writ of certiorari for
- all parties runs from the date the petition for rehearing is denied or a subsequent decision
- on the rehearing is issued. A request filed under Rule 35(b) does not affect the time for
- filing a petition for a writ of certiorari, unless the Court of Appeals treats the request as a
- 14 petition for rehearing under <u>Rule 35(a)</u>.
- 15 (d) Time for cross-petition.
- 16 (1) A cross-petition for a writ of certiorari must be filed:
- 17 (A) within the time provided in either paragraphs (a) or (c) of this rule; or
- 18 (B) within 30 days of the filing of the petition for a writ of certiorari.
- 19 (2) Any cross-petition that is timely only under paragraph (d)(1)(B) will not be granted
- 20 unless a timely petition for a writ of certiorari of another party to the case is granted.
- 21 (3) The docket fee must be paid when the cross-petition is filed. The clerk will reject
- 22 any cross-petition not accompanied, pPursuant to rRule 21, the filing fee must be paid
- 23 <u>to the appellate court clerk, unless waived</u> by the <u>docket fee.court.</u>
- 24 (4) A cross-petition for a writ of certiorari may not be joined with any other filing. The
- 25 clerk will reject any filing so joined.

### (e) Time extensions.

26

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

- 27 (1) Before the time prescribed by paragraph (a) or (c) expires, the Supreme Court will 28 grant a party's request to extend the time for filing a petition or cross-petition, not to 29 exceed 30 days past the prescribed time.
  - (2) Within 30 days after the time prescribed by paragraph (a) or (c) expires, a party may file a motion to extend the time for filing a petition or cross-petition. The Supreme Court will grant the motion only upon a showing of good cause or excusable neglect. No extension may exceed 30 days past the prescribed time or 14 days from the date the order granting the motion is entered, whichever occurs later, and no more than one extension will be granted. The Supreme Court may rule at any time after the motion is filed.
- 37 *Effective* November 1, 2020

# 1 Rule 21. Filing and service.

- 2 (a) **Filing**. A document may be filed by email, by mail, or in person. Documents required
- 3 or permitted to be filed by these rules must be filed with the appellate <u>court</u> clerk.
- 4 (1) **How to file.** The appellate courts are transitioning to an e-filing system. Before
- 5 August 1, 2024, a document may be filed by submitting it through the appellate e-
- 6 lectronic filing system, by email, mail, or in person. Effective August 1, 2024, all
- 7 licensed attorneys must file through the appellate e-filing system. Unrepresented
- 8 parties may continue to file by email, mail, or in person. If electronically -filed or
- emailed, a document must be in a searchable PDF format of no more than <a href="#reven25">7seven25</a>
- megabytes. <u>Large PDF documents must be divided into <del>7</del>seven megabyte files.</u>
- Documents filed by email in the Supreme Court must be sent
- to <u>supremecourt@utcourts.gov</u>. Documents filed by email in the Court of Appeals
- must be sent to <u>courtofappeals@utcourts.gov</u>.
- 14 (2) <u>Timing.</u> Except as provided in paragraph (g):
- 15  $(\underline{A}_1)$  Documents other than briefs are timely:
- 16 (<u>i</u>A) if received by <u>electronic</u>-<u>filing or</u> email to the appropriate court by 11:59
- p.m. o<u>n</u>€ the due date; or
- 18 (iiB) if received by mail or hand delivery to the Appellate Clerks' Office before
- 5 p.m. o<u>n</u> the due date.
- 20 ( $B_2$ ) Briefs are timely:
- 21 (<u>i</u>A) if received by <u>electronic</u>-<u>filing or</u> email to the appropriate court by 11:59
- p.m. onf the due date;
- 23 (<u>ii</u>B) if postmarked by the due date; or
- 24 (iiiC) if received by hand delivery to the Appellate Clerks' Office before 5 p.m.
- 25 onf the due date.

- 26 (b) **Filing Fees**. If a statute or rule establishes a fee for the filing, the party must pay the
- 27 fee to the appellate <u>court</u> clerk no more than <u>7-seven</u> days after the filing, or the filing
- 28 may be stricken. If a party elects to e-file electronically, the party must pay the filing fee
- 29 <u>at the time of e-filing through the appellate electronic filing system.</u>
- 30 (c) **Service of all documents required**. All documents filed with the appellate court must,
- at or before the time of filing, be served on all other parties to the appeal or review. Service
- on a party represented by counsel must be made on counsel of record, or, if the party is
- 33 not represented by counsel, on the party at the last known address or email address
- provided to the appellate court. Any document required by these rules to be served on a
- party must be filed with the court and accompanied by proof of service.
- 36 (d) **Manner of service**. Service may be personal, by electronic filing, by mail, or by email.
- 37 Personal service includes delivery of the copy to a clerk or other responsible person at the
- office of counsel. Service by mail or email is complete on mailing or emailing. Service by
- 39 <u>electronic</u>-filing is complete on -acceptance by the electronic -filing system.
- 40 (e) Proof of service. Documents filed through the e-filing system need not include a
- 41 certificate or acknowledgement of service if all parties have contact information in the e-
- 42 <u>filing system. All other Dd</u>ocuments presented for filing must contain an
- acknowledgment of service by the person served or a certificate of service in the form of
- a statement of the date and manner of service, the names of the persons served, and the
- 45 addresses at which they were served. The certificate of service may appear on or be
- 46 affixed to the documents filed. If counsel of record is served, the certificate of service must
- 47 designate the name of the party represented by that counsel. <u>Electronically filed</u>
- 48 <u>documents do not need to contain a certificate or acknowledgement of service if all</u>
- 49 parties have contact information in the electronic filing system.
- 50 (f) Signature. All documents filed in the appellate court must be signed by counsel of
- record or by a party who is not represented by counsel. For documents electronically
- 52 <u>filed, or filed by email, the documents may be electronically signed as follows: /s/ name</u>
- of unrepresented party or name of counsel of record.

## 54 (g) Filing by inmate.

- (1) For purposes of this paragraph (g), an inmate is a person confined to an institution or committed to a place of legal confinement.
  - (2) Documents filed by an inmate are timely filed if they are deposited in the institution's internal mail system on or before the due date. Timely filing may be shown by a contemporaneously filed notarized statement or written declaration setting forth the date of deposit and stating that first-class postage has been, or is being, prepaid, or that the inmate has complied with any applicable requirements for legal mail set by the institution. Response time will be calculated from the date the documents are received by the court.
- (h) Filings containing other than public information and records. If a filing, including an addendum, contains non-public information, the filer must also file a version with all such information removed. Non-public information means information classified as private, controlled, protected, safeguarded, sealed, juvenile court legal, or juvenile court social, or any other information to which the right of public access is restricted by statute, rule, order, or case law.

70 Effective: 2/19/2020

### **Advisory Committee Note**

- Court records are public unless otherwise classified as private, controlled, protected, safeguarded, sealed, juvenile court legal, or juvenile court social by the Utah Code of Judicial Administration. The right of public access may be restricted by statute (including the Government Records Access and Management Act), rule, case law, or court order. If a filing contains information or records that are not public, the filer must file an unredacted version for the court and a version for the public that does not contain the nonpublic information.
- Note Adopted 2020

1 Rule 26. Filing and serving briefs.

(a) Time to file and serve briefs. The appellant must file and serve a principal brief 2 within 40 days after date of notice from the appellate court clerk pursuant to Rule 13. If a 3 motion for summary disposition of the appeal or a motion to remand for determination 4 of ineffective assistance of counsel is filed after the Rule 13 briefing notice is sent, an 5 appellant's principal brief must be filed and served within 30 days from the denial of 6 7 such motion. The appellee, or in cases involving a cross-appeal, the cross-appellant, must file and serve a principal brief within 30 days after service of the appellant's principal 8 brief. In cases involving cross-appeals, the appellant must file and serve the appellant's 9 reply brief described in Rule 24A(d) within 30 days after service of the cross-appellant's 10 principal brief. A reply brief may be filed and served by the appellant or the cross-11 appellant in cases involving cross-appeals. If a reply brief is filed, it must be filed and 12 served within 30 days after the filing and service of the appellee's principal brief or the 13 appellant's reply brief in cases involving cross-appeals. If oral argument is scheduled 14 fewer than 35 days after the filing of appellee's principal brief, the reply brief must be 15 16 filed at least 5-five days prior to oral argument. By stipulation filed with the court in accordance with Rule 21(a), the parties may extend each of such periods for no more than 17 30 days. A motion for enlargement of time need not accompany the stipulation. No such 18 stipulation will be effective unless it is filed prior to the expiration of the period sought 19 20 to be extended. 21 (b) **Number of copies**. For matters pending in the Supreme Court, eight paper copies of each brief, one of which shall contain an original signature, must be filed with the 22 Supreme Court Clerk. For matters pending in the Court of Appeals, six paper copies of 23 each brief, one of which shall contain an original signature, must be filed with the Court 24 of Appeals Clerk. If a brief was electronically-filed or filed by email, the required paper 25 copies of the brief must be delivered no more than seven days after filing. If a brief is 26 served by electronic filing or email, upon request two paper copies must be delivered to 27 28 counsel for each party separately requesting paper copies.

- Draft: January 3, 2024
- 29 (c) Consequence of failing to file principal briefs. If an appellant fails to file a principal
- 30 brief within the time provided in this rule, or within the time as may be extended by order
- of the appellate court, an appellee may move for dismissal of the appeal. If an appellee
- fails to file a principal brief within the time provided by this rule, or within the time as
- may be extended by appellate court order, an appellant may move that the appellee not
- 34 be heard at oral argument.
- 35 (d) Return of record to the clerk. Each party, upon filing its brief, must return the any
- 36 <u>physical records and exhibits</u> to the court clerk having custody pursuant to these rules. <u>If</u>
- 37 a party checks out the physical record from the appellate court clerk, then that party must
- return the physical record and all exhibits to the clerk when that party files its brief.
- 39 Effective: 2/19/2020

- 1 Rule 27. Form of briefs, motions, and other documents.
- 2 (a) **Form of briefs, motions, and other documents**. Except as otherwise provided in this
- 3 rule or by leave of court, all briefs, motions, and other documents must comply with the
- 4 following standards:
- 5 (1) Size, line spacing, and margins. All documents must be prepared on 8½ by 11
- 6 inch sized paper. The text must be double spaced, except for matter customarily single
- spaced and indented. Margins must be at least one inch on all sides. Page numbers
- 8 are required and may appear in the margins.
- 9 (2) **Typeface**. The type must be a plain, roman style with serifs. Italics or boldface may
- be used for emphasis. Cited case names must be italicized or underlined.
- 11 (3) **Typesize**. The typeface must be 13-point or larger for both text and footnotes.
- 12 (b) **Documents submitted by unrepresented parties**. An unrepresented party who does
- 13 not have access to a word-processing system must file typewritten or legibly handwritten
- briefs, motions, and other appellate documents. An unrepresented party must sign any
- document filed with the court. These documents must otherwise comply with the form
- requirements of this rule, and, if applicable, Rules 24 and 24A.
- 17 (c) Caption Cover page for briefs on the merits and petitions. The cover of each brief or
- 18 the first page of any other document must contain a caption that includes the following
- 19 information:
- 20 (1) Caption. For briefs on the merits and petitions: The cover of each brief or the first
- 21 page of a petition must contain a caption that includes the following information:
- (A) the number of the case in the appellate court (if available);
- 23 (B) the name of the appellate court;
- 24 (C) the full title given to the case in the court or agency from which the appeal
- 25 <u>was</u>is taken, as modified under Rule 3(g);

case may be)., or

	URAP027. Amend. Redline	Draft: January 3, 2024
26	(D) the designation of the parties both	as they appeared in the lower court or
27	agency from which the appeal is tak	en and as they appear in the appellate
28	proceeding;	
29	(E) the title or description of the document	ment (e.g., Brief of Appellant, Petition for
30	Permission to File Interlocutory App	eal, Petition for Rehearing, Petition for
31	Extraordinary Relief);	
32	(F) the nature of the proceeding in the	appellate court (e.g., Appeal, Petition for
33	Review) if not apparent from the title	or description of the document; and (e.g.,
34	Direct Appeal, Interlocutory Appeal, Po	etition for Review);
35	(G) the name of the court and judge, age	ncy, or board below from which the appeal
36	is taken and the case or proceeding num	nber. <del>; and</del>
37	(2H) €Counsel or unrepresented party is	nformation. The identifying and contact
38	information of the counsel or unrepresente	ed party filing the document must appear
39	on the bottom half in the lower right -corn	er of the cover page. The party or counsel
40	filing the document must appear in the low	er right of the cover. and opposing counsel
41	or party in the lower left of the cover.	
42	(Ai) eCounsel's information must include	de counsel's: <del>their</del>
43	(i) counsel's name,	
44	(ii) the Utah State Bar number of the	filing counsel;
45	(iii) counsel's mailing address,	
46	(iv) the email address of the filing co	<del>ounsel,</del> ;
47	(v) counsel's telephone number; and	<u>1</u>
48	(vi) and a designation as indicating t	he party counsel represents in the appeal
49	(e.g., eCounsel for Aappellant, pPet	itioner, aAppellee, or rRespondent <del>, as the</del>

51	(iiB) aAn unrepresented party's information must listinclude the party's:
52	(i) their-name,
53	(ii) mailing address <sub>7</sub> ;
54	(iii) email address (if any); and
55	(iv) telephone number (if any);7 and
56	(v) a designation asstatement identifying the party's designation in the appeal
57	(e.g., the aAppellant, pPetitioner, aAppellee, or rRespondent, as the case may
58	<u>be).</u>
59	(12d) First page For of mMotions and other appellate documents besidesother than
60	briefs and petitions:. Case and document information:
61	1. Caption. The first page of a motion or appellate document other than a brief or
62	petition must include a caption with the following information:
63	(A) the number of the case in the appellate court (if available);
64	(B) the name of the appellate court;
65	(C) the full title given to the case in the court or agency from which the appeal
66	was is taken, as modified under Rule 3(g);
67	(D) the designation of the parties both as they appeared in the lower court or
68	agency from which the appeal is taken and as they appear in the appellate
69	proceeding; and
70	(E) the title or description of the document (e.g., Motion to Dismiss, Docketing
71	Statement, Stipulation, Motion to Extend Time, Notice).; and(A) full title given to
72	the case in the court or agency from which the appeal was taken, as modified
73	<del>under Rule 3(g),</del>

74	2. Counsel or unrepresented party information. The identifying and contact
75	information of the counsel or unrepresented party filing the document must appear
76	in the upper left corner of the first page.
77	(F) counsel or party information in the upper left-hand corner, including(B) the
78	designation of the parties both as they appeared in the lower court or agency and
79	as they appear in the appeal
80	(i) counsel's (C) the name of the appellate court;
81	(D) the number of the case in the appellate court opposite the case title;
82	(E) the title or description of the document (e.g., Brief of Appellant, Petition for
83	Rehearing, Motion to Dismiss);
84	(F) the nature of the proceeding in the appellate court (e.g., Appeal, Petition for
85	Review, Extraordinary Writ);
86	(G) the name of the court and judge, agency, or board below.
87	(2) For motions and other appellate documents, counsel or party information
88	in the upper left-hand corner, including:
89	(A) Counsel's information must include counsel's:
90	(i) counsel's name <sub>7</sub> ;
91	(ii) the Utah State Bar number of the filing counsel,;
92	(iii) counsel's mailing address;
93	(iv) the email address of the filing counsel,
94	(v) counsel's telephone number, Utah State Bar number, and
95	(vi) a designation indicating which party counsel represents in the appeal (e.g.,
96	$\frac{\text{designation as attorney}_{\text{c}}\text{Counsel}}{\text{designation as attorney}_{\text{c}}\text{Counsel}}$ for $\frac{\text{a}}{\text{A}}$ ppellant, $\frac{\text{p}}{\text{P}}$ etitioner, $\frac{\text{a}}{\text{A}}$ ppellee, or
97	#Respondent)., aas the case may be, or

(B) A 98 99 -(B) (ii) aAn unrepresented party's information must include the party's: (i) must list the party's name, 100 101 (ii) mailing address; (iii) email address (if any); and 102 (iv) telephone number (if any); and 103 (v) a designation statement identifying the party's designation in the appeal 104 (e.g., as the aAppellant, pPetitioner, aAppellee, or rRespondent), as the case 105 may be. 106 (3) For briefs on the merits, the names of all counsel for the respective parties must 107 appear on the bottom half of the cover page. The party filing the document must 108 appear in the lower right and opposing counsel in the lower left of the cover. 109 110 (d) Additional requirements for briefs on the merits. 111 (1) Form of submission. Binding. Briefs must be printed on both sides of the page, and securely bound on the left margin with a compact-type binding so as not unduly 112 to increase the thickness of the brief along the bound side. Coiled plastic and spiral-113 type bindings are not acceptable. Hard copies of the briefs must be submitted on 20 lb. 114 bond standard paper. Except for the cover page, briefs must be printed double sided. 115 116 Briefs must not be stapled or bound along the left edge, but must be secured with a binder clip. 117 (2) Color of cover page. The cover page of appellant's opening brief must be blue; that 118 of appellee, red; that of intervenor, guardian ad litem, or amicus curiae, green; that of 119 any reply brief, or in cases involving a cross-appeal, the appellant's second brief, gray. 120 The cover pagea brief or petition must be of heavy card stock. There must be adequate 121 122 contrast between the printing and the color of the cover page. The color of the cover 123 page must be as follows:

<u>Document</u>	Cover Page Color
Opening Brief of Appellant or Petitioner	Blue
Brief of Appellee or Respondent	Red
Brief of Intervenor, Guardian ad Litem, or Amicus Curiae	<u>Green</u>
Reply Brief	<u>Gray</u>
Appellant's or Petitioner's Second Brief in a Case Involving a Cross-Appeal or Cross-Petition	<u>Gray</u>

(3) **Criminal appeals**. In criminal cases, the cover of the defendant's brief must also state whether the defendant is presently incarcerated in connection with the case on appeal and if the brief is an *Anders* brief. An *Anders* brief is a brief filed pursuant to *Anders v. California*, 386 U.S. 793 (1967), in cases where counsel believes no nonfrivolous appellate issues exist.

(4) **Effect of noncompliance**. The <u>appellate court</u> clerk will examine all briefs before filing. If the <u>a</u> briefs <u>areis</u> not prepared in accordance with these rules, the <u>clerk may lodge may choose to not file the briefs y will not be filed but willand <u>be returned them to be properly prepared notify the party of the deficiency</u>. The clerk will retain one copy of the noncomplying brief and, <u>after the party is notified</u>, the party must file a brief prepared in compliance with these rules within <u>5-five</u> days. The clerk may grant additional time for bringing a brief into compliance. This rule is not intended to permit significant substantive changes in briefs.</u>

# TAB 3

#### Draft: February 28, 2024

1	Rule 42.	Transfer of	case from	Supreme	Court to	Court of	App	eals	3
---	----------	-------------	-----------	---------	----------	----------	-----	------	---

- 2 (a) **Discretion of Supreme Court to transfer**. At any time before a case is set for
- 3 oral argument before the Supreme Court, the Court may transfer to the Court of
- 4 Appeals any case except those cases within the Supreme Court's exclusive
- 5 jurisdiction. The order of transfer shall be issued without opinion, written or oral,
- 6 as to the merits of the appeal or the reasons for the transfer.
- 7 (b) Conditional transfer order. The Supreme Court may conditionally transfer a
- 8 case, subject to a request that it be retained. If so, the A conditional transfer order
- 9 will inform permit the parties to that any of them may submit a letter of five pages
- 10 or less within seven days to the Supreme Court concerning the appropriateness of
- 11 retaining the case on its own docket or transferring the case to the Court of
- 12 Appeals. The order may be superseded by another order directing an immediate
- 13 <u>unconditional transfer if the Supreme Court deems such a transfer to be</u>
- 14 appropriate.
- 15 (1) A letter concerning retention must contain:
- 16 (A) The name of the case and the appellate case number
- 17 (B) The names of all parties involved in the case and the attorneys and firms
- representing the parties
- 19 (C) A concise statement of the issues presented on appeal
- 20 (D) A brief explanation of the reasons supporting retention or transfer; and
- 21 (E) A completed checklist for appellate jurisdiction
- 22 The order will specify the timing and contents of the letter and the timing of
- 23 <u>any response.</u>

48

Draft: February 28, 2024

- 24 (2) Any response to a timely letter concerning retention must be filed within five business days after service of the letter. The response may not exceed five 25 pages. 26 27 (3) If the Supreme Court elects to retain the case, it will issue an order rescinding the conditional order of transfer. 28 29 (4) If no timely request for retention is received or the Supreme Court declines a request to retain, the Clerk of the Supreme Court clerk will issue a notice to 30 the parties and the Court of Appeals informing them that the order of transfer 31 32 will stand. (5) Any letter submitted outside of the provisions of paragraph (b) will not be 33 34 considered. (bc) Notice of order of transfer. Upon entry of the an order of transfer or 35 conditional transfer the Clerk of the Supreme Court clerk shall will provide give 36 notice of entry of the order of transfer by mail to each party to the proceeding and 37 to the clerk of the trial court clerk. Upon entry of the order of transfer, the Clerk of 38 the Supreme Court shall transfer the original of the order and the case, including 39
- Court, and a written statement of all docket entries in the case up to and including the order of transfer, to the Clerk of the Court of Appeals.

  (de) Receipt of order of transfer by Court of Appeals. Upon receipt from the Clerk of the Supreme Court clerk of the original an unconditional order of transfer or a notice that a conditional order of transfer will stand from the Clerk of the Supreme Court, the Clerk of the Court of Appeals clerk shall enter the appeal upon the Court of Appeals docket. The Clerk of the Court of Appeals clerk shall

immediately give notice to each party to the proceeding and to the clerk of the trial

the record and file of the case from the trial court, all papers filed in the Supreme

URAP042. Amend. Redline

of the entry of the order of transfer.

61

62

63

64 65

66

Draft: February 28, 2024

court that the appeal has been docketed and that all further filings will be made 49 50 with the Clerk of the Court of Appeals clerk. The notice shall state the docket number assigned to the case in the Court of Appeals. 51 52 (ed) Filing or Ttransfer of appeal record. If the record on appeal has not been filed with the Clerk of the Supreme Court as of the date of the order of transfer, the 53 Clerk of the Supreme Court shall notify the clerk of the trial court that upon 54 completion of the conditions for filing the record by that court, the clerk shall 55 transmit the record on appeal to the Clerk of the Court of Appeals. If, however, 56 the record on appeal has already been <del>transmitted to and</del> filed with the <del>Clerk of</del> 57 58 the Supreme Court clerk as of the date of the entry of the order of transfer or notice, the Clerk of the Supreme Court shall transmit the record on appeal will be 59 transmitted to the Clerk of the Court of Appeals clerk within five days of the date 60

(<u>fe</u>) Subsequent proceedings before Court of Appeals. Upon receipt by the Clerk of the Court of Appeals <u>clerk</u> of the an order of transfer <u>or notice that a conditional order of transfer will stand and the entry thereof upon the docket of the Court of Appeals</u>, the case shall proceed before the Court of Appeals to final decision and disposition as in other appellate cases pursuant to these rules.

**Commented [NG1]:** This paragraph is probably not necessary but if the intention is to clarify the responsibilities between the courts (and (c) is left in), I would streamline it.

# TAB 4

1	Rule 8. Stay or injunction pending appeal.
2	(a) Motion for stay.
3 4	(1) <b>Initial motion in the trial court.</b> A party must ordinarily move first in the trial court for the following relief:
5 6	(A) a stay of the judgment or order without security pending appeal or disposition of a petition under Rule 5;
7 8	(B) approval of a bond or other security provided to obtain a stay of the judgment or order; or
9 10 11	(C) an order suspending, modifying, restoring, or granting an injunction while an appeal is pending, unless the trial court has already rejected the basis for the requested relief.
12	(2) Motion in the appellate court.
13	(A) The motion for a stay must include:
14	(i) the reasons the trial court denied the request;
15	(ii) the reasons for granting the relief requested and the facts relied on;
16	(iii) copies of affidavits or declarations, supporting facts subject to dispute; and
17	(iv) relevant parts of the record, including a copy of the trial court's order.
18	(B) Any motion must comply with Rule 23.
<ul><li>19</li><li>20</li><li>21</li></ul>	(C) Except in extraordinary circumstances, an appellate court will not act on a motion to stay a judgment or order or to suspend, modify, restore, or grant an injunction, unless the movant first requested a stay or opposed the injunction in
22	the trial court.
23	(3) Stays in criminal cases. Stays pending appeal in criminal cases in which the

defendant has been sentenced are governed by Utah Code section 77-20-302 and Rule

(B) an extraordinary circumstance that justifies issuing a stay.

(c) **Injunctions.** For requests for injunctive relief to which Rules 65A or 62 of the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure applied in the trial court, any relief available pending appeal is governed by those rules.

48 Effective May 1, 2023

44

45

46

47

49 **Advisory Committee Note** 

- Draft: February 22, 2024
- 50 "Declaration" refers to an unsworn declaration as described in Title 78B, Chapter 18a,
- 51 Uniform Unsworn Declarations Act.
- 52 <u>Note Aa</u>dopted 2022