

Agenda

Utah Supreme Court Advisory Committee Utah Rules of Appellate Procedure

Christopher D. Ballard , Chair Nathalie Skibine, Vice Chair

Location: Webex (see calendar appointment for instructions)

Date: September 2, 2021

Time: 12:00 to 1:30 p.m.

Welcome and introduction of new members		Chris Ballard, Chair Nathalie Skibine, Vice Chair
Discussion: Emeritus members		Nick Stiles
Action: Approval of June 3, 2021 minutes	Tab 1	Chris Ballard, Chair
Action: Rule 25	Tab 2	Clark Sabey
Action: Rule 11	Tab 3	Sarah Roberts
Action: Rule 12	Tab 4	Sarah Roberts
Discussion: Old/new business		Chris Ballard, Chair

Committee Webpage: https://www.utcourts.gov/utc/appellate-procedure/

2021 Meeting schedule:

October 7, 2021 November 4, 2021 December 2, 2021



Minutes

Supreme Court's Advisory Committee on the Utah Rules of Appellate Procedure

Administrative Office of the Courts 450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84114

Via WebEx Videoconference Thursday, June 3, 2021 12:00 pm to 1:30 pm

PRESENT

Christopher Ballard

Troy Booher—

Emeritus Member

Paul C. Burke—Chair

Patrick Burt

Tyler Green

R. Shawn Gunnarson

Michael Judd —

Recording Secretary

Margaret Lindsay – Guest

Alan Mouritsen

Debra M. Nelson-Guest

Kirstin Norman—Guest

Rodney Parker

Judge Jill Pohlman

Sarah Roberts—Staff

Clark Sabey

Nathalie Skibine

Scarlet Smith

Adam Trupp—Guest

Carol Verdoia—Guest

Christopher Williams

Mary Westby

EXCUSED

Lisa Collins

Judge Gregory Orme

Nick Stiles—Staff

1. Welcome, Approval of May 2021 Minutes

Paul Burke

Paul Burke welcomed the committee and thanked its members for their attendance. The committee reviewed the May 2021 minutes. The committee noted that a reference to a stretch of rules from "Rule 59 to 62" should actually refer to a stretch of rules from Rule 54 to 58, and the committee agreed that that correction should be made.

Mary Westby moved to approve the minutes from the May 2021 meeting with that change. Judge Jill Pohlman seconded that motion and it passed without objection by unanimous consent.

2. Action: Rules 54–58 (Child Welfare Rules)

Adam Trupp Carol Verdoia

Adam Trupp and Carol Verdoia guided the committee in a return to the proposed changes to Rules 54 to 58, which govern child-welfare appeals. Among the proposed changes discussed was a change to Rule 55(b) at the end of line 15 to provide that appellate counsel must be appointed within 14 days of the filing of the notice of appeal, and if not, trial counsel would have to proceed with appeal. Ms. Verdoia explained that the goal is to avoid letting cases languish, given the important interests associated with expediting these appeals, both for children and for parents. Mr. Trupp suggested that there appears to be general agreement about expediting the process of appointing counsel, and proposed that any such appointment take place within 30 days. Ms. Verdoia pointed out that with a proposed change delaying the filing of petition until transmission of record, some delay may already have been introduced into the appellate timeline for child-welfare cases. Ms. Verdoia and Mr. Trupp both expressed openness to a proposal of 21 days, splitting the difference between the two proposals.

Mary Westby moved to adopt the package of proposed changes presented by Christopher Ballard, with 21 days as the time allowed to appoint appellate counsel. Mr. Ballard seconded that motion.

Before any vote on that motion, the committee discussed the possibility of inverting those deadlines, with counsel being appointed within 14 days of notice of appeal and petition being due within 21 days of transmission of the record. Ms. Westby expressed hesitation about increasing the time for filing a petition to 21 days. The committee also discussed the relative

benefits of "14 days" and "15 days" in line 3 of the working document.

After that discussion, the committee voted on Ms. Westby's original motion regarding Mr. Ballard's addition, and that motion passed without objection by unanimous consent.

3. Action: Rules 15, 25, 43, 50

Paul Burke Sarah Roberts

The committee noted that public comment period on proposed changes to Rules 15, 25, 43, and 50 has passed. The only comment the committee received was a comment related to Rule 25. After discussion, the committee agreed that the issue raised in the comment is unlikely to prove problematic. The committee also discussed the rule regarding participation in oral argument and the timing of motions requesting such participation, recognizing that the court may not want to see motion practice on the eve of oral argument. The committee delved into timing and the appropriate method for such a request.

After discussion, Mr. Sabey moved to adopt amendment to Rule 25(h) as reflected on-screen at the committee's meeting. Mr. Parker seconded that motion and it passed without objection by unanimous consent.

4. Action: Rule 11

Paul Burke Sarah Roberts

Given that little time remained in the committee's meeting, Ms. Westby moved to table Rule 11. Mr. Gunnarson seconded that motion and it passed without objection by unanimous consent.

5. Action: Rule 12

Paul Burke Sarah Roberts

Similarly, Ms. Westby moved to table Rule 12. Mr. Gunnarson again seconded Ms. Westby's motion and it passed without objection by unanimous consent.

6. Discussion: Old / New Business

Paul Burke

None.

7. Adjourn

The committee's next meeting will take place in September. Mr. Gunnarson moved to adjourn, and there were no objections.

Rule 25. Amicus curiae briefsBrief of an amicus curiae or guardian ad litem. 1 (a) **Notice**. An amicus curiae in the Supreme Court or Court of Appeals must provide 2 notice to counsel of record for all parties to the appeal of its intent to file its brief at least 3 14 days before the brief's due date as provided in paragraph (d). 4 (1) Only one signatory to any amicus curiae brief filed jointly must notify the 5 parties of its intent to file that brief. 6 (2) An amicus curiae whose brief is requested by an appellate court need not 7 comply with this notice requirement. 8 (b) When permitted. A brief of an amicus curiae or of a guardian ad litem representing 9 a minor who is not a party to the appeal may be filed only by leave of court granted on 10 motion or at the request of the court. 11 (1) The following entities may file an amicus curiae brief without consent of the 12 parties or leave of court: 13 (A) a guardian ad litem; 14 (B) the State of Utah or any agency of the State of Utah by the Office of the 15 Utah Attorney General; 16 (C) any other State, Commonwealth, or Territory when submitted by its 17 Attorney General; or 18 (D) the United States of America when submitted by the United States 19 Department of Justice. 20 (2) Any other amicus curiae brief may be filed only if all parties have consented 21 to its filing, at the court's request, or by leave of court granted on motion. 22 23 (c) Motion for leave to file. The motion for leave may be accompanied by a proposed amicus brief, provided it complies with applicable rules and the number of copies 24 specified by Rule 26(b) are submitted to the court. If all parties do not consent to the 25

brief's filing, Aan amicus curiae may file a motion for leave to file the brief.

26

27	(1) The motion must shall identify the party or parties who have withheld
28	consent, identify the movant's interest, of the movant and shall and state the
29	reasons why a brief of an amicus curiae or the guardian ad litem brief is desirable
30	and why the matters asserted are relevant to the disposition of the case.
31	(2) The motion must not exceed 1,500 words. It must be submitted as one
32	document with the brief sought to be filed.
33	Except for a motion for leave to participate in support of, or in opposition to, a
34	petition for writ of certiorari filed pursuant to Rule 50(e), the motion for leave
35	shall be filed at least 21 days prior to the date on which the brief of the party
36	whose position as to affirmance or reversal the amicus curiae or guardian ad
37	litem will support is due, unless the court for cause shown otherwise orders.
38	(3) A pPartyies to the appeal proceeding may indicate their support for, or
39	opposeition to, the motion. Any responses of a party to a motion for leave shall
40	be by filinged an objection within 714 days after the motion is of served that
41	concisely states its reasons for withholding consentice of the motion.
42	Withholding consent is disfavored.
43 <u>(d)</u>	Time for filing. An amicus curiae brief, together with a motion under paragraph (c)
44 <u>wh</u>	en a party has withheld consent, must be filed:
45	(1) in a case before the Supreme Court when a petition for a writ of certiorari is
46	pending, 14 days after the petition is filed; or
47	(2) in a case before the Supreme Court for merits review, or before the Court of
48	Appeals, 14 days after the principal brief of the party being supported is filed. If
49	leave is granted, an amicus curiae or guardian ad litem shall file its brief within 7
50	days of the time allowed the party whose position the amicus curiae or guardian
51	ad litem will support, unless the order granting leave otherwise indicates.
52	(3) An amicus curiae that does not support either party must file its brief no later
53	than 7 days after the appellant's or petitioner's principal brief is filed.

54	(e) Length . An amicus curiae brief filed regarding a petition for writ of certiorari may
55	not exceed 4,000 words. Any other amicus curiae brief may not exceed 7,000 words.
56	Those limits will not be extended. Both limits exclude the table of contents, the table of
57	authorities, any appendix, and required certificates of counsel.
58	(f) Contents and form. An amicus curiae brief must comply with Rule 27. In addition,
59	the cover must identify the party or parties supported and must indicate whether the
60	brief supports affirmance or reversal. The brief must include:
61	(1) a table of contents;
62	(2) a table of authorities;
63	(3) unless included as part of a motion under paragraph (c)(1), a concise
64	statement of the identity of the amicus curiae and its interest in the case;
65	(4) a statement indicating whether counsel for the parties received timely notice
66	under paragraph (a);
67	(5) unless the amicus curiae is one listed in paragraph (b)(1), a statement that
68	indicates whether:
69	(A) a party's counsel authored the brief in whole or in part;
70	(B) a party or party's counsel contributed money that was intended to
71	fund preparing or submitting the brief; and
72	(C) a person – other than the amicus curiae, its members, or its counsel –
73	contributed money that was intended to fund preparing or submitting the
74	brief, and if so, identifies each such person; and
75	(6) an argument, which may be preceded by a summary and which need not
76	include a statement of the applicable standard of review.
77	(g) Responsive briefs. The time for responsive briefs under Rule 26(a) shall-rung from
78	the timely service of the amicus <u>curiae</u> or <u>guardian ad litem</u> brief or from the timely

86

87

Rule 35.

service of the brief of the party whose position the amicus curiae or guardian ad litem
supports, whichever is later.

(h) Oral argument. A motion of aWhile such requests are not favored, an amicus curiae
or guardian ad litem may file a letter requesting permissionmotion to participate in the
oral argument within 14 days after the notice of oral argument, will be granted when
circumstances warrant in the court's discretion.

(i) An amicus curiae brief may not be filed in support of a petition for rehearing under

Rule 11. The record on appeal.

1

2	(a) Composition of the record on appeal. The record on appeal consists of the original
3	papers documents and exhibits filed in or considered by in the trial court, including the
4	presentence report in criminal matters, the transcript of proceedings, if any, and the
5	record index. prepared by the clerk of the trial court, and the docket sheet, shall
6	constitutes the record on appeal in all cases. A copy of the record certified by the clerk
7	of the trial court to conform to the original may be substituted for the original as the
8	record on appeal. Only those papers prescribed under paragraph (d) of this rule shall be
9	transmitted to the appellate court.
10	(b) Preparing, paginationng, and indexing of the record.
11	(1) Preparing the record. Immediately upon filing of the notice of appealOn the
12	appellate court's request, the clerk of the trial court clerk shall will securely
13	fasten the record in a trial court case file, with collation prepare the record in the
14	following order:
15	(A) the <u>record</u> index prepared by the clerk ;
16	(B) the docket sheet;
17	(<u>CB</u>) all original <u>papers documents</u> in chronological order;
18	(PC) all published depositions in chronological order;
19	(ED) all transcripts prepared for appeal in chronological order;
20	(FE) a list of all exhibits offered in the proceeding; and
21	(GF) in criminal cases, the presentence investigation report.
22	(2) Pagination.
23	(A) The clerk shall mark the bottom right corner of every page of the
24	collated index, docket sheet, and all original papers as well as Using bates
25	numbering, the entire record must be paginated. the cover page only of all
26	published depositions and the cover page only of each volume of

transcripts constituting the record with a sequential number using one 27 series of numerals for the entire record. 28 (B) If the appellate court requests a supplemental record is forwarded to 29 the appellate court, the clerk shall collate same procedures as in (b)(2)(A) 30 apply, continuing bates numbering from the last page number of the 31 original record. the papers, depositions, and transcripts of the 32 supplemental record in the same order as the original record and mark the 33 bottom right corner of each page of the collated original papers as well as 34 the cover page only of all published depositions and the cover page only 35 of each volume of transcripts constituting the supplemental record with a 36 sequential number beginning with the number next following the number 37 of the last page of the original record. 38 (3) Index. The clerk shall prepare a A chronological index of the record must 39 accompany the record on appeal. For each document, deposition, or transcript, 40 The index shall must contain a reference to the date of filing and starting page of 41 the recordon which the paper, deposition or transcript was filed in the trial court 42 and the starting page of the record on which the paper, deposition or transcript 43 will be found. 44 (4) Examining the record. Clerks of the trial and a Appellate courts clerks 45 shall will establish rules and procedures for parties to checking out the record 46 after pagination. for use by the parties in preparing briefs for an appeal or in 47 preparing or briefing a petition for writ of certiorari. 48 (c) Duty of appellant. After filing the notice of appeal, the appellant, or in the event 49 that more than one appeal is taken, each appellant, shall comply with the provisions of 50 paragraphs (d) and (e) of this rule and shall take any other action necessary to enable 51 the clerk of the trial court to assemble and transmit the record. A single record shall be 52 transmitted. 53

<u>(d) Papers on appeal.</u>

(1) Criminal cases. All of the papers in a criminal case shall be included by the clerk of the trial court as part of the record on appeal.

- (2) Civil cases. Unless otherwise directed by the appellate court upon sua sponte motion or motion of a party, the clerk of the trial court shall include all of the papers in a civil case as part of the record on appeal.
- (3) Agency cases. Unless otherwise directed by the appellate court upon sua sponte motion or motion of a party, the agency shall include all papers in the agency file as part of the record.
- (ec) The transcript of proceedings; duty of appellant to order; notice to appellee if partial transcript is ordered.
 - (1) Request for transcript; time for filing. Within 104 days after filing the notice of appeal, or within 30 days of the notice of appeal where an indigent appellant has a statutory or constitutional right to counsel, the appellant shall must order the transcript(s) online at www.utcourts.gov, specifying the entire proceeding or parts of the proceeding to be transcribed that are not already on file. The appellant shall must serve on the appellee a designation of those parts of the proceeding to be transcribed. If the appellant desires a transcript in a compressed format, appellant shall include the request for a compressed format within the request for transcript. If no such parts of the proceedings are to be requested, within the same period the appellant shall must file a certificate to that effect with the clerk of the appellate court clerk and serve a copy of that certificate on the appellee.
 - (2) Transcript required of all evidence regarding challenged finding or conclusion. If the appellant intends to <u>urgeargue</u> on appeal that a finding or conclusion is unsupported by or is contrary to the evidence, the appellant <u>shall</u> <u>must</u> include in the record a transcript of all evidence relevant to such finding or

conclusion. Neither the court nor the appellee is obligated to correct appellant's 81 deficiencies in providing the relevant portions of the transcript. 82 (3) Statement of issues; Ccross-designation by appellee. If the appellant does not 83 order the entire transcript, the appellee may, within 194 days after the appellant 84 85 servicees of the designation or certificate described in paragraph (e)(1) of this rule, order the transcript(s) in accordance with (e)(1), and file and serve on the 86 appellant a designation of additional parts to be included. 87 (fd) Agreed statement as the record on appeal. In lieu of the record on appeal as 88 defined in paragraph (a) of this rule, the parties may prepare and sign a statement of 89 the case, showing how the issues presented by the appeal arose and were decided in the 90 91 trial court and setting forth only so many of the facts averred and proved or sought to 92 be proved as are essential to a decision of the issues presented. If the court deems - the 93 statement complete and accurate conforms to the truth, it, together with such additions 94 as the trial court may consider necessary fully to present the issues raised by the appeal₇ 95 shall will be approved by the trial court. The clerk of the trial court clerk shall will 96 transmit the statement to the clerk of the appellate court clerk within the time 97 prescribed by Rule 12(b)(2). The clerk of the trial court clerk shall will transmit the <u>record</u> index of the record to the clerk of the appellate court clerk upon the trial court's 98 99 approval of the statement by the trial court. (ge) Statement of evidence or proceedings when no report was made or when 100 transcript is unavailable. If no report of the evidence or proceedings at a hearing or 101 trial was made, or if a transcript is unavailable, or if the appellant is impecunious and 102 unable to afford a transcript in a civil case, the appellant may prepare a statement of the 103 evidence or proceedings from the best available means, including recollection. The 104 statement shall-must be served on the appellee, who may serve objections or propose 105 amendments within 104 days after service. The statement and any objections or 106 proposed amendments shall must be submitted to the trial court for resolution, and the 107 trial court clerk will conform the record to such resolution. for settlement and approval 108

and, as settled and approved, shall be included by the clerk of the trial court in the 109 record on appeal. 110 (hfg) Supplementing or Correction or modification ying of the record. 111 (1) If any difference dispute arises as to whether the record truly discloses what 112 occurred in the trial courtis complete and accurate, the difference dispute shall 113 may be submitted to and resolved settled by the at trial court. The trial court will 114 ensure that and the record made to conform to the truth accurately reflects the 115 proceedings before the trial court, including by entering any necessary findings 116 to resolve the dispute. 117 (2) If anything material to either party is omitted from or misstated or is omitted 118 from in the record by error of the trial court or court personnel, by accident, or 119 because the appellant did not order a transcript of proceedings that the appellee 120 needs to respond to issues raised in appellant's briefthe Brief of Appellant, the 121 parties by stipulation, the trial court, or the appellate court, either before or after 122 the record is transmitted, may direct that the omission or misstatement may be 123 corrected and, if necessary, that a supplemental record may be certified created 124 and forwarded and transmitted: 125 126 (A) on stipulation of the parties; (B) by the trial court before or after the record has been forwarded; or 127 (C) by the appellate court on a motion from a party. 128 (3) The moving party, or the court if it is acting on its own initiative, shall must 129 serve on the parties a statement of the proposed changes. Within 104 days after 130 service, any party may serve objections to the proposed changes. All other 131 questions as to the form and content of the record shall be presented to the 132 appellate court. 133

URAP012 Amend. February 6, 2020

- 1 Rule 12. Transmission of tting the record.
- 2 (a) Duty to prepare and file transcript; request for enlargement of time; notice to
- 3 appellate court.

26

(a)(1) Upon receipt of a request for a transcript On receiving a transcript request, 4 the clerk of the appellate court clerk shallwill assign the preparation of the 5 6 transcript preparation to the court reporter who reported the proceedings or, if 7 recorded on video or audio equipment, to an official court transcriber and notify the requesting party of the assignment. With appellate court approval, By 8 stipulation of the parties approved by the appellate court, the parties may 9 stipulate that a person other than an official court transcriber may transcribe a 10 recorded hearing. 11 (a)(2) A party requesting a transcript shallmust make satisfactory arrangements 12 for paying the fee to the reporter or transcriberand notify the clerk of the 13 appellate court of the date on which satisfactory arrangements were made. The 14 transcript shallmust be completed and filed within 30 days after that date. 15 16 (a)(3) The reporter or transcriber may request through the Transcript Management System from the clerk of the appellate court an enlargement of time 17 in which to file the transcript. The request for enlargement of time shall be in 18 19 writing and shallmust contain the elements stated in CJA 5-201(1). If filed prior to the expiration of before the transcript preparation period expires, the request 20 shallmust make a showing of good cause. If filed after the period expirationes of 21 the period, the request shallmust make a showing of extraordinary circumstances 22 beyond the control of the reporter or transcriber. The reporter or transcriber shall 23 provide a copy of the request to the parties. The clerk of the appellate court shall 24 provide written notice of the disposition of the request for enlargement of time to 25

the reporter or transcriber and the parties.

URAP012 Amend. February 6, 2020

(a)(4) Upon completion of On completing the transcript, the reporter and, if applicable, the transcriber shallmust certify that the transcript is a true and correct record of the court hearing or of the file provided by the clerk of the appellate court clerk. The reporter or transcriber shallmust prepare an index of its contents and file the electronic file through the transcript management program. The original hard copy of the transcript and index shallmust be filed with the clerk of the trial court. At the request of the person ordering the transcript or at the request of the appellate court, the reporter or transcriber shallmust file the transcript in a compressed format that places multiple complete pages of the original transcript upon each page of compressed transcript. The compressed transcript may be certified as a correct copy of the original.

(b) Transmittal of ing the record on appeal to the appellate court.

(b)(1) Transmittal ofing an index. Within 20 days from the date of the appellate court's request from the appellate court, the trial court, juvenile court, or government agency shallmust transmit a certified copy of the index prepared pursuant tounder Rule 11(b) to the clerk of the appellate court clerk. (b)(2) Transmittal of non-paginated record. Within 7 days from the date of request from the appellate court, the trial court, juvenile court, or government agency shall transmit the papers and any transcripts on file to the clerk of the appellate court. These papers may be sent "as is," without pagination, and will be used by the appellate court for purposes of preliminary review. If the appeal is not summarily dismissed, the record will be returned for indexing and pagination. (b)(32) Transmittal of ing a paginated record. Within 20 days from the date of the appellate court's request from the appellate court, the trial court,

URAP012 Amend. February 6, 2020

or government agency shallmust transmit the papers documents, transcripts, and 54 exhibits in the appeal to the appellate court. 55 (b)(43) Transmission of tting exhibits. Documents of unusual bulk or weight, and 56 physical exhibits other than documents, photographs, or binders, shallmust not 57 be transmitted by the trial court, juvenile court, or government agency unless 58 directed to do so by a party or by the clerk of the appellate court <u>clerk</u>. A party 59 must make advance arrangements with the clerks for the transportation and 60 receipt of transporting and receiving exhibits of unusual bulk or weight. 61 (b)(54) Examining the record. During the briefing period, the parties may obtain 62 a copy of the record on appeal from the appellate courts. If a digital record is 63 available, it may be shared with the parties electronically. 64 (b)(65) Checking out the record on appeal. If a physical record on appeal exists, 65 dDuring the briefing period, counsel for the parties who are members of the 66 Utah State Bar in good standing may, as officers of the court, check out the 67 record upon written request to the clerk of court of the court in possession of the 68 record on appeal. The record may be mailed by registered mail or other 69 reputable overnight carrier, return receipt requested, provided that counsel 70 requesting mailing makes advance arrangements with the clerk and pays the cost 71 72 of shipping. The record may be picked up in person by counsel, or his or her authorized agent. Counsel shallmust be responsible for promptly returning the 73 record to the court not later than when the party's brief is filed. 74 (c) Expedited ing the transmittal of parts of the record. If prior toto the appellate court 75 requires the record before the time the record is transmitted the record is required in the 76 appellate court, the clerk of the trial court clerk at the request of any party or of the 77 appellate court shallmust transmit to the appellate court such parts of the original 78 record as designated. 79