

Agenda

Utah Supreme Court Advisory Committee Utah Rules of Appellate Procedure

Paul C. Burke, Chair

Location: Webex (see calendar appointment for instructions)

Date: April 2, 2020

Time: 12:00 to 2:00 p.m.

Action: Welcome and approval of March 5, 2020 minutes	Tab 1	Paul C. Burke, Chair
Discussion: Legislative update (if any)		Paul C. Burke, Judge Jill Pohlman, Christopher Ballard
Discussion & Action: Rule 8	Tab 2	Clark Sabey
Discussion & Action: Rule 35 (and related Rules 36, 48)	Tab 3	Clark Sabey, Larissa Lee
Discussion & Action: Rule 3	Tab 4	Larissa Lee
DISCUSSION: Other business		Paul C. Burke

Committee Webpage: https://www.utcourts.gov/utc/appellate-procedure/

Meeting schedule:

May 7, 2020 September 3, 2020 June 4, 2020 October 1, 2020 July 2, 2020 November 5, 2020 August 6, 2020 December 3, 2020



Minutes

Supreme Court's Advisory Committee on the Utah Rules of Appellate Procedure

450 South State Street Salt Lake City, Utah 84114

Judicial Council Room Thursday, March 5, 2020 12:00 pm to 2:00 pm

PRESENT EXCUSED

Christopher Ballard Larissa Lee—Staff R. Shawn Gunnarson

Troy Booher— Alan Mouritsen

Emeritus Member Judge Gregory Orme

Paul C. Burke—Chair Rodney Parker
Patrick Burt Judge Jill Pohlman

Lisa Collins Clark Sabey
Tyler Green Nathalie Skibine
Michael Judd— Scarlet Smith
Recording Secretary Mary Westby

1. Welcome and Approval of February 2020 Minutes

Paul C. Burke

Paul C. Burke welcomed the committee and invited comments regarding the February 2020 minutes.

Tyler Green moved to approve the minutes from the February 2020 meeting. Judge Jill Pohlman seconded the motion. Judge Gregory Orme abstained from voting, as he was not present at the last meeting. It otherwise passed unanimously.

2. Discussion: Legislative Update (if any)

Paul C. Burke Judge Jill Pohlman Christopher Ballard

The Legislative Outreach Subcommittee reported that there were no updates related to legislative outreach. Mr. Burke noted that the committee welcomed the news that the current system of judicial selection and retention is likely to be preserved.

3. Discussion and Action: Remaining Advisory Committee Notes

Judge Gregory Orme

The committee turned first to Rule 3. Troy Booher wondered whether the second sentence of the remaining paragraph is necessary, given that the first sentence makes largely the same point regarding payment of fees in a cross-appeal. The committee reworked that paragraph into a single sentence and made other clarifying changes to the language.

Mr. Booher also noted that Rule 3(f) itself may not provide sufficiently clear guidance regarding fees for cross-appeals, and the committee noted that a return to the rule itself may be a good idea.

Judge Orme moved to adopt the new version of this committee note to Rule 3, as revised during the committee meeting. Patrick Burt seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

Judge Orme observed that the note to Rule 9 may have been useful when the most recent major reworking of that rule was put into place, in order to ease the transition to the new version, but the note is no longer needed for that purpose. Mary Westby pointed out that the reference to "Form 7" is outdated, as the relevant forms are now found on the Utah Judiciary's website. The committee reworked the existing note.

Judge Pohlman moved to adopt the new version of the committee note to Rule 9, as revised during the committee meeting. Scarlet Smith seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

The committee made a number of changes to the note accompanying Rule 21, in order to remove unnecessary language, to clarify the remaining language, and to make the note consistent with the language of the rule itself.

Mr. Green moved to adopt the new version of the committee note to Rule 21, as revised during the committee meeting. Ms. Westby seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

The committee turned to the note to Rule 27. Judge Orme noted that the paragraph describing "pica size" is unnecessary, as word processers are no longer new technology. The committee noted that a change to the rule itself may be needed, in order to insert a citation to the *Anders* case into the body of the rule.

Judge Orme moved to adopt the new version of the committee note to Rule 27, as revised during the committee meeting. Judge Pohlman seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

After discussion and a thorough comparison to the existing text of the note to the rule itself, the committee determined that the entire note accompanying Rule 33 now appears to be unnecessary.

Rodney Parker moved to remove this committee note, as revised during the committee meeting. Judge Pohlman seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

After discussion regarding the necessity of the rule and the context in which the rule is likely to arise, the committee determined that the note accompanying Rule 37 is likely to cause more problems than it solves.

Judge Pohlman moved to remove the committee note to Rule 37. Mr. Green seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

The amendment to the Rule 38 note is intended to clarify the relationship between the "appellate roster" now used and the contract method that preceded the roster. The committee discussed minor changes to the rule's text.

Mr. Parker moved to remove this committee note, as revised during the committee meeting. Ms. Westby seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

The amendment to the Rule 40 note will conform the note with the text of the Rule 21 note.

Mr. Parker moved to adopt the new version of the committee note to Rule 21, as revised during the committee meeting. Mr. Burt seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

Rule 41 may be due attention from the committee, as the rule deals largely with certification, then includes an embedded subparagraph related to pro hac vice admissions. The committee expressed interest in identifying a "new home" for that subparagraph within the rules.

Judge Orme moved to remove the committee note to Rule 41. Mr. Parker seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

4. Discussion and Action: Rule 8 Clark Sabey

Mr. Sabey guided the committee in resumed discussions of Rule 8. Ms. Lee explained that the draft rule being considered by the committee is an adaptation of the analogous federal rule. The committee discussed whether adapting the injunction standard is appropriate, given the directive given by the Supreme Court in the order being addressed.

The committee discussed whether the adoption of the "federal approach," which offers an appeal as of right for injunctions, is advisable, and whether that change can be made by rule.

The committee determined that given the complexity of the issues being considered, the best approach is for committee members to discuss these changes further informally and then present a more formal proposal to the committee.

5. Discussion and Action: Rule 35 (and Related Rules 36 and 48)

Larissa Lee Clark Sabey

Ms. Lee explained that she combined previous work done by the committee back into a single rule. The committee's goal in this revision is to abandon the attempt to police substantive and non-substantive changes.

After additional productive discussion of potential changes to the rule, the committee determined the best approach is to continue revisions and discussions at the next committee meeting.

6. Discussion:

Paul C. Burke

Other Business

None.

7. Adjourn

Mr. Burke adjourned the meeting. The committee is scheduled to meet again on April 2, 2020.

1	Rule 8. Stay or injunction pending appeal.
2	(a) Motion for stay.
3	(a)(1) Initial motion in the trial court. A party must ordinarily move first in the trial
4	court for the following relief:
5	(a)(1)(A) a stay of the judgment or order of a trial court without security pending
6	appeal or disposition of a petition under Rule 5; or
7	(a)(1)(B) approval of a bond or other security provided to obtain a stay of
8	judgment; or
9	(a)(1)(C) an order suspending, modifying, restoring, or granting an injunction
10	while an appeal is pending.
11	(a)(2) Motion in the appellate court.
12	(a)(2)(A) Except in the most extraordinary circumstances, an appellate court will
13	not act on a motion for a stay or for suspension, modification, restoration, or grant
14	of an injunction, unless the movant first requested relief in the trial court and that
15	court denied the request.
16	(a)(2)(B) The motion must include:
17	(a)(2)(B)(i) the reasons the trial court denied the request;
18	(a)(2)(B)(ii) the reasons for granting the relief requested and the facts
19	relied on;
20	(a)(2)(B)(iii) copies of affidavits or other sworn statements supporting
21	facts subject to dispute; and
22	(a)(2)(B)(iv) relevant parts of the record, including a copy of the trial
23	court's order.
24	(a)(2)(C) Any motion must comply with Rule 23.
25	Stay must ordinarily be sought in the first instance in trial court; motion for stay in
26	appellate court. Application for a stay of the judgment or order of a trial court pending appeal,
27	or disposition of a petition under Rule 5, or for approval of a supersedeas bond, or for an order

suspend	ling, modifying, restoring, or granting an injunction during the pendency of an appeal
must or	dinarily be made in the first instance in the trial court. A motion for such relief may be
made to	the appellate court, but the motion shall show that application to the trial court for the
relief so	ought is not practicable, or that the trial court has denied an application, or has failed to
afford t	he relief which the applicant requested, with the reasons given by the trial court for its
action.	The motion shall also show the reasons for the relief requested and the facts relied upon,
and if t	he facts are subject to dispute, the motion shall be supported by affidavits or other sworn
stateme	nts or copies thereof. With the motion shall be filed such parts of the record as are
relevan	t, including a copy of the order sought to be stayed. Any motion for stay shall be filed
under r	ule 23.
(b) Bor	nd requirement.
	(b)(1) Stay may be ordinarily conditioned upon giving of bond. For requests for relief
	to which Rule 62(d) of the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure applied below, Regelief available
	in the appellate court under this rule pending appeal maywill be conditioned upon the
	filing of a bond or other appropriate security in the trial court, unless there is no
	reasonable means of quantifying the security in monetary or other terms and the
	conditions of paragraph (b)(2) are met.
	(b)(2) Stay in cases not conditioned on giving of bond. Ordinarily a stay without a
	bond or other security will not be granted unless the movant demonstrates a likelihood of
	success on the merits or the case presents serious issues on the merits warranting
	appellate review and the appellant demonstrates:
	(b)(2)(A) a likelihood of irreparable harm to the appellant outweighing the harm
	to any other party, a significant harm to the public interest; or
	(b)(2)(B) an extraordinary circumstance that justifies issuing a stay.
	(b)(3) Injunctions. For requests for relief to which Rule 65A or 62(c) of the Utah Rules of
	Civil Procedure applied below, any relief available pending appeal is governed by those
	<u>rules.</u>

- 55 (c) **Stays in criminal cases**. Stays pending appeal in criminal cases in which the defendant has
- been sentenced are governed by Utah Code Ann. Section 77-20-10 and Rule 27, Utah. R. Crim.
- P. Stays in other criminal cases are governed by this rule.

URAP 035. Amend. March 26, 2020

1 Rule 35. Petition for rehearing.

(a) Petition for rehearing for rehearing permitted. A rehearing will not be granted 2 in the absence of a petition for rehearing. 3 (a)(1) **Petition.** A petition for rehearing requesting to alter a decision in a 4 manner that affects the substantive rights of the parties or any mandate or 5 6 rule of law established by the decision may be filed only in cases in which the court has issueds an opinion, memorandum decision, or 7 per curiam decision, or order resolving the appeal on the merits. No other 8 petitions for rehearing will be considered. 9 (ab)(2) **Time for filing**. A petition for rehearing may be filed with the clerk 10 within 14 days after the court issuance of es the opinion, memorandum 11 decision, or per curiam decision of the court an opinion, memorandum 12 decision, per curiam decision, or order resolving the appeal on the merits, 13 unless the time is shortened or enlarged by order. 14 (ae)(3) Contents of petition. The petition shall-must succinctly state and 15 explainwith particularity the points of law or fact which that the petitioner 16 claims the court has overlooked or misapprehended and shall contain such 17 argument in support of the petition as the petitioner desires. Counsel for The 18 petitioner must certify that the petition is presented in good faith and not for 19 delay. 20 (d) Oral argument. Oral argument in support of the petition will not be 21 permitted. 22 (ea)(4) **Response**. No response to a petition for rehearing will be received 23 unless requested by the court. Any response shall-must be filed within 14 24

25	days after the entry of the order requesting the response, unless otherwise
26	ordered by the court. A petition for rehearing will not be granted in whole or
27	in part in the absence of a request for a response.
28	$(\underline{fa})(\underline{5})$ Form of petition. The petition \underline{shall} must be in \underline{athe} form prescribed
29	by Rule 27(a), (b), and (d) with respect to contents of the cover and shall
30	must include a copy of the decision to which it is directed.
31	(g) Number of copies to be filed and served. An original and 6 copies shall
32	be filed with the court. Two copies shall be served on counsel for each party
33	separately represented.
34	(ha)(6) Length. Except by order of the court order, a petition for rehearing
35	and any response requested by the court shallmay not exceed 15 pages.
36	(i) Color of cover. The cover of a petition for rehearing shall be tan; that of
37	any response to a petition for rehearing filed by a party, white; and that of
38	any response filed by an amicus curie, green. All brief covers shall be of
39	heavy cover stock. There shall be adequate contrast between the printing and
40	the color of the cover.
41	(ja)(7) Action by court if granted. If a petition for rehearing is granted,
42	<u>t</u> The court may make a final disposition of <u>the cause</u> <u>a petition for rehearing</u>
43	without reargument, or may restore itthe case to the calendar
44	for reargument or resubmission, or may make such other orders as are
45	deemed appropriate under the circumstances of the particular case.
46	(ka)(8) Untimely or consecutive petitions. Petitions for rehearing that are
47	not timely presented under this rule and consecutive petitions for rehearing
48	will not be received refused by the clerk.

URAP 035. Amend. March 26, 2020

19	(1a)(9) Amicus curiae. An amicus curiae may not file a petition for
50	rehearing but may file a response to a petition if the court has requested a
51	response under paragraph (ea)(4) of this rule.
50	(b) Clarical array If a decision contains a nonsubstantive clarical array a norty
52	(b) Clerical error. If a decision contains a nonsubstantive clerical error, a party
53	may promptly advise the appellate clerk by letter, with a copy to all other parties,
54	identifying the paragraphs of the decision containing the error and stating or
55	suggesting how the error may be corrected. The body of the letter may not exceed
56	350 words. Any response must be made promptly and similarly limited. This
57	paragraph does not affect the court's authority to make nonsubstantive corrections
58	to a decision in the absence of a motion by a party or notice to the parties.

URAP036 Amend. Redline. March 27, 2020

Rule 36. Issuance of rRemittitur.

(a) Date of issuance.

1

2

(a)(1) In tThe Supreme Court will issue athe remittitur of the court shall issue 15 days 3 4 after the entry of the judgment is entered. If a petition for rehearing is timely filed, the remittitur of the court shall will issue five days after the entry of the order disposing of the 5 petition is entered. 6 7 (a)(2) In tThe Court of Appeals will issue athe remittitur of the court shall issue 8 immediately after the expiration of the time for filing a petition for writ of certiorari 9 expires. If a petition for writ of certiorari is timely filed, issuance of the remittitur by the 10 Court of Appeals will automatically be stayed issuing the remittitur until the Supreme 11 Court's disposition on the petition for writ of certiorari. If the Supreme Court denies the 12 petition, the Court of Appeals shall will issue its remittitur five days after entry of the 13 order denying the petition is entered. If the Supreme Court grants the petition, jurisdiction 14 of the appeal shallwill be transferred transfer to the Supreme Court, and the Court of 15 Appeals shall will close its file and transfer the record on appeal, if any, to the Supreme 16 Court. 17 (a)(3) The time for issuance of to issue the remittitur may be otherwise stayed, enlarged, or shortened by order of the court order. A certified copy of tThe court's opinion of the 18 19 court, any direction as to costs, and the record of the proceedings shall will constitute the remittitur. 20 21 (b) Stay, supersedeas, or injunction pending application for review to the Supreme Court of 22 the United States. A stay or supersedeas of the remittitur or an injunction pending application 23 for review to the United States Supreme Court may be granted on motion and for good cause. 24 Any motion for a stay of the remittitur or for approval of a supersedeas bond or for an order suspending, modifying, restoring, or granting an injunction during the pendency of the appeal 25 26 shallmust be filed in the Utah Supreme Court. Reasonable notice of the motion shallmust be given to all parties. The period of the stay, supersedeas, or injunction shall will be for such time 27 28 as the court ordereds, by the court up to and including the final disposition of the application for 29 review. A bond or other security on such terms as the court deems appropriate may be required 30 as a condition to the grant or continuance of relief under this paragraph. If the stay, supersedeas,

URAP036 Amend. Redline. March 27, 2020

31	or injunction is granted until the final disposition of the application for review, the party seeking
32	the review shallmust, within the time permitted for seeking the review, file with the clerk of the
33	court which that entered the decision sought to be reviewed, a certified copy of the notice of
34	appeal, petition for writ of certiorari, or other application for review, or shallmust file a
35	certificate that such application for review has been filed. Upon the filing of a copy of an order
36	of the United States Supreme Court dismissing the appeal or denying the petition for a writ of
37	certiorari, the remittitur shallwill issue immediately.

URAP048 Amend. Redline. March 27, 2020

1 Rule 48. Time for petitioni	ng.
-------------------------------	-----

- 2 (a) **Timeliness of petition**. A petition for a writ of certiorari must be filed with the Clerk of the
- 3 Supreme Court <u>clerk</u> within 30 days after the entry of the final decision by the Court of Appeals'
- 4 <u>final decision is entered</u>. The docket fee <u>shall must</u> be paid <u>when at the time of filing</u> the petition
- 5 is filed.
- 6 (b) **Refusal of petition**. The clerk will refuse to receive any petition for a writ of certiorari not
- 7 <u>timely filed or which is beyond the time indicated in paragraph (a) of this rule or which is not</u>
- 8 accompanied by the docket fee.
- 9 (c) **Effect of petition for rehearing**. The time for filing a petition for a writ of certiorari runs
- from the date the decision is entered by the Court of Appeals' final decision is entered, not from
- the date of the issuance of the remittitur is issued. If a petition for rehearing that complies with
- Rule 35(a) is timely filed by any party, the time for filing the petition for a writ of certiorari for
- all parties runs from the date of the denial of the petition for rehearing is denied or of the entry of
- a subsequent decision <u>onentered upon</u> the rehearing <u>or motion is entered</u>.
- 15 (d) **Time for cross-petition**.
- 16 (d)(1) A cross-petition for a writ of certiorari must be filed:
- 17 (d)(1)(A) within the time provided in Subdivisions (a) and (c) of this rule; or
- (d)(1)(B) within 30 days of the filing of the petition for a writ of certiorari.
- 19 (d)(2) Any cross-petition that is timely only pursuant tounder paragraph (d)(1)(B) of this
- 20 rule will not be granted unless a timely petition for a writ of certiorari of another party to
- 21 the case is granted.
- 22 (d)(3) The docket fee shallmust be paid when at the time of filing the cross-petition is
- 23 <u>filed</u>. The clerk <u>shall will</u> refuse any cross-petition not accompanied by the docket fee.
- 24 (d)(4) A cross-petition for a writ of certiorari may not be joined with any other filing. The
- 25 clerk of the court shall will refuse any filing so joined.
- 26 (e) Time Eextensions of time.
- 27 (e)(1) The Supreme Court, upon a showing of good cause, A party may file a motion
- 28 <u>tomay</u> extend the time for filing a petition or a cross-petition for a writ of certiorari upon

URAP048 Amend. Redline. March 27, 2020

29	motion filed not laterwithin than 30 days after the expiration of the time prescribed by
30	paragraph (a) or (c) of this rule expires. The Supreme Court will grant the motion only for
31	good cause or excusable neglect. Responses to such motions are disfavored and the court
32	may rule at any time after the filing of the motion is filed. No extension shall will exceed
33	30 days past the prescribed time or 14 days from the date of entry of the order granting
34	the motion is entered, whichever occurs later, and no more than one extension will be
35	granted.
36	(e)(2) The Supreme Court, upon a showing of good cause or excusable neglect, may
37	extend the time for filing a petition or a cross petition for a writ of certiorari upon motion
38	filed not later than 30 days after the expiration of the time prescribed by paragraph (a) or
39	(c) of this rule, whichever is applicable. No extension shall exceed 30 days past the
40	prescribed time or 14 days from the date of entry of the order granting the motion,
41	whichever occurs later, and no more than one extension will be granted.
42	(f) Seven copies of the petition for a writ of certiorari, one of which shall contain an original
43	signature, shall be filed with the Clerk of the Supreme Court.

URAP003 Amend. Redline. Draft: March 27, 2020

Rule 3. Appeal as of right:—how taken. 1 2 (a) Filing appeal from final orders and judgments the notice of appeal. (a)(1) Except as otherwise provided by law, Ana party may appeal may be taken final 3 order or judgment from a district or juvenile trial court to the appellate court with 4 jurisdiction over the appeal from all final orders and judgments, except as otherwise 5 6 provided by law, by filing a notice of appeal with the trial court clerk of the trial court within the time allowed by Rule 4. 7 (a)(2) An appellant's Ffailure of an appellant to take any step other than the timely filing 8 of a notice of appeal does not affect the validity of the appeal, but is ground only for such 9 action as the appellate court to act as it deemsconsiders appropriate, which may include 10 ing dismissal of ing the appeal or other sanctions short of dismissal, as well as and the 11 awarding of attorney fees. 12 13 (b) **Joint or consolidated appeals**. If two or more parties are entitled to appeal from a judgment or order and their interests are such as to make joinder practicable, they may file a joint notice of 14 15 appeal or may join in an appeal of another party after filing separate timely notices of appeal. Joint appeals may proceed as a single appeal with a single appellant. Individual appeals may be 16 17 consolidated by order of the appellate court upon its own motion or upon motion of a party, or by stipulation of the parties to the separate appeals. 18 (c) Party Designation of parties. The party taking the appeal shall be known as the appellant 19 and the adverse party as the appellee. Unless otherwise directed by the appellate court, The 20 appeal will not change the title of the action or proceeding shall not be changed in consequence 21 of the appeal, except where otherwise directed by the appellate court. In For original proceedings 22 in the appellate court, the party making the original application shall be known as the petitioner 23 and any other party as the respondent. 24 (d) Content of nNotice of appeal contents. 25

(d)(1) The notice of appeal shall-must:

(d)(1)(A) specify the party or parties taking the appeal;

26

27

URAP003 Amend. Redline.

Draft: March 27, 2020

28	$\underline{(d)(1)(B)}$ shall designate the judgment, or order, or part thereof, being appealed
29	from ;
30	(d)(1)(C) shall designate name the court from which the appeal is taken; and
31	(d)(1)(D) shall designate name the court to which the appeal is taken.
32	(e) Service of appeal. The party taking the appeal shall appellant must give
33	notice of the filing of a serve the notice of appeal by serving on each party to the judgment or
34	order in accordance with the requirements of the court from which the appeal is taken. If counsel
35	of record is served, the certificate of service shall must designate include the name of the party
36	represented by that counsel.
37	(f) Filing fee in civil appeals. At the time of When filing any notice of separate, joint, or cross
38	appeal in a civil case, the party taking the appeal or cross appeal shallmust pay the filing fee
39	established by law to the trial court clerk of the trial court the filing fee established by law. The
40	trial court clerk of the trial court shallmust accept a notice of appeal regardless of whether the
41	filing fee has been paid. Failure to pay the filing fee within a reasonable time may result in
42	dismissal.
43	(g) Docketing of appeal. Upon the
44	(g)(1) Transmitting notice of appeal to the appellate court. After an appellant filesing
45	of the the notice of appeal, the trial court clerk of the trial court shall must immediately
46	transmit a certified email a copy of the notice of appeal to the appellate court clerk. This
47	will include,-:
48	(g)(1)(A) showing the date the notice of appeal was filed of its filing; and
49	(g)(1)(B) the clerk'sa statement by the clerk indicating declaring whether the
50	filing fee was paid; and
51	(g)(1)(C) whether the cost bond required by Rule 6 was filed.
52	(g)(2) Docketing the appeal. Upo On receipt of ving the copy of the notice of appeal from
53	the trial court clerk, the appellate court clerk of the appellate court shall will enter the

URAP003 Amend. Redline. Draft: March 27, 2020

appeal upon on the docket. An appeal shall will be docketed under the title given to the	ıe
action in the trial court, with the appellant identified as such, but if the title does not	
contain the name of the appellant, such name shallwill be added to the title.	