Agenda Advisory Committee on Rules of Civil Procedure

March 24, 2010 4:00 to 6:00 p.m.

Administrative Office of the Courts Scott M. Matheson Courthouse 450 South State Street Judicial Council Room, Suite N31

Approval of minutes	Tab 1	Fran Wikstrom
Consideration of rules for final action: Rules		
58B, 64D and 64E	Tab 2	Tim Shea
Rule 6. Time	Tab 3	Tim Shea
Simplified Civil Procedures	Tab 4	Fran Wikstrom

Committee Web Page: http://www.utcourts.gov/committees/civproc/

Meeting Schedule

April 28, 2010 May 26, 2010 June 23, 2010 September 22, 2010 October 27, 2010 November 17, 2010

Tab 1

MINUTES

UTAH SUPREME COURT ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON THE RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE

Wednesday, February 24, 2010 Administrative Officer of the Courts

Francis M. Wikstrom, Presiding

PRESENT: Francis M. Wikstrom, Barbara L. Townsend, Honorable Anthony B. Quinn, Honorable Reuben Renstrom, W. Cullen Battle, James T. Blanch, Jonathan O. Hafen, Thomas R. Lee, Lincoln L. Davies, Leslie W. Slaugh, Anthony W. Schofield, Steven Marsden, David W. Scofield

TELEPHONE: Lori Woffinden, Honorable Lyle R. Anderson, Honorable Derrek P. Pullan

EXCUSED: Todd M. Shaughnessy, Honorable David O. Neuffer, Terrie T. Macintosh

STAFF: Timothy M. Shea, Sammi V. Anderson

I. INTRODUCTIONS.

Pursuant to Utah Supreme Court Rule 11-101(4), the following committee members formally introduced themselves: Jonathan O. Hafen, Honorable Reuben Renstrom, David W. Scofield, Steven Marsden, Anthony W. Schofield

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES.

Mr. Wikstrom called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m., and entertained comments from the committee concerning the January 27, 2010 minutes. No comments were made and Mr. Wikstrom asked for a motion that the minutes be approved. The motion was duly made and seconded, and unanimously approved.

III. SIMPLIFIED RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE.

The committee engaged in a lengthy discussion regarding Rule 26. The discussion centered upon the standard that should govern the scope of discovery, the definition of proportionality, where it will come into play and how it will be enforced, and, to a lesser extent, protective orders.

First, with regard to the scope of discovery under the revised Rule 26, Mr. Lee summarized the interim correspondence regarding what is relevant under Rule 26, *ie*, whether "relevance" under Utah R. Evid. 401 is really helpful or useful in these circumstances. Mr. Lee opined that it would be better to define "proportionality," which ought to govern the scope of

discovery. In other words, the standard of discoverability ought to be tied to proportionality standards, rather than requiring a party to make a motion to limit discovery based on proportionality.

Judge Pullan noted concerns about satellite litigation regarding what is proportional, *ie*, every answer to every interrogatory is "we decline to answer because the request is disproportionate," followed by a motion to compel. Judge Pullan emphasized the importance of early judicial involvement as to what is proportional. He expressed that the evidentiary standard of relevance is perhaps too broad and advocated moving proportionality into (b), so that scope of discovery is really rooted in proportionality. Mr. Lee talked about fact that "reasonableness" is already embodied in rules, along with some kind of cost-benefit analysis. It is necessarily a two-edged sword: we don't want discovery to be an abusive tactic, but it is still very helpful to get information out early to help settle cases. The committee has to figure out a way to balance the risks. Mr. Lee proposed putting into subsection (b) language like "for good cause and consistent with standards of proportionality in (c), courts can order additional discovery." Mr. Lee felt there ought to be reference to the definition of proportionality in subsection (b).

Mr. Wikstrom reminded the committee that the objective is to try and flip the default from "you get it," to "you don't get it, unless you can demonstrate need and proportionality." The hope is for every lawyer drafting a request or a response to think about how they are going to demonstrate proportionality. Mr. Wikstrom noted the concern is focused not on cases where the parties are equally positioned, but on cases where one party has more resources and more information, an example being the typical employment case. Mr. Lee pointed out the possibility of cost-shifting.

Judge Quinn explained that the one very good thing about the current standard is that it is self-executing. Courts rarely have to be involved. Judge Quinn doesn't see any way this is not going to generate litigation; the new standard gives parties hope that they can win, regardless of the side on which they fall. Judge Quinn is inclined to leave the scope alone and to limit discovery by proportionality and through the other tangible limitations already discussed, *eg*, number limitations on depositions and interrogatories. In other words, leave the scope/standard as is (calculated to lead to discovery of admissible evidence), and add proportionality and external limitations.

The committee moved to a discussion of proportionality and burdens. Mr. Slaugh inquired as to what party has the burden of asserting proportionality. Mr. Wikstrom suggested that the party seeking discovery be required to demonstrate proportionality in the face of an objection. Judge Pullan noted that the discovery standard currently in place is so broad that judges have little meaningful ability to restrict discovery. Judge Pullan agreed that the real work is going to be done with proportionality and potentially cost shifting. Judge Quinn analogized the scope issue to a target with a bulls eye, surrounded by concentric rings. The bulls eye represents information that is clearly, directly relevant to dispute. The surrounding rings represent more tangential information. The further away from the bulls eye a party gets, the greater the chances that costs of discovery will be shifted, or that the party might not get discovery at all if it cannot demonstrate proportionality.

Mr. Wikstrom suggested leaving the old standard in place, but adding "subject to a demonstration of proportionality." Mr. Lee suggested: "relevant to claims and defenses and consistent with principles of proportionality." Mr. Wikstrom reminded the Committee of the overall context: Initial disclosures will be much broader than they currently are. Each side will put their cards on the table up front and both sides will get very limited discovery. At that point, and only then, does the issue of additional discovery arise.

Mr. Davies queried at what point does proportionality kick in? At the outset? Does it govern all requests? Or only after limited discovery has been done? Mr. Wikstrom opined that it should be from the outset. To change the current culture, the mind set of the judiciary, lawyers and litigants must be changed. Mr. Marsden opined that it is the initial disclosures that will go the furthest in changing the culture. Mr. Wikstrom again emphasized that both sides will know at the outset all the facts, witnesses and documents that support the case. A party will need to be specific and persuasive in telling the court what additional discovery is needed and why and how it is proportionate. Judge Pullan agreed and noted that the initial disclosures would give him enough information to be comfortable making a proportionality decision. Judge Pullan also reminded the committee that each practice area can draft their own requirements for initial disclosures. The committee agreed to incorporate proportionality into the scope of discovery. With regard to subsection (b)(4) (Statement previously made about the action), the committee decided to revert back to the original language.

Second, the committee discussed defining the term "proportionality." Mr. Lee suggested defining the term instead of listing a host of factors and leaving the parties and courts to interpret them on their own. Mr. Hafen advocated defining the term "proportionality." Mr. Hafen stated that if the objective is to effect a shift, the new terms must be defined. Mr. Shea pointed out that 26(c) used to deal exclusively with protective orders and suggested addressing proportionality in 26(b). Judge Pullan summarized Judge Neuffer's efforts to define proportionality. Mr. Wikstrom suggested adopting Judge Neuffer's changes and adding a sentence at the end saying the party seeking discovery has the burden to show proportionality. Mr. Davies suggested adding "less burdensome, or less expensive" at the end of (i).

There was a motion to replace the draft proportionality factors with the Lee-Neuffer-Davies draft. Judge Pullan supported the change and noted that the laundry list of factors is more an explanation of the committee's discussions, perhaps better placed in the Advisory Committee notes. Judge Pullan expressed that the simplicity of the Neuffer language would make it easier to render a ruling than by referring to a whole list of factors. Mr. Slaugh advocated for leaving "unreasonably" before the word "cumulative." The committee agreed.

Mr. Lee then led a discussion regarding re-framing the definition to be affirmative, rather than negative. The committee voted in favor of an affirmative definition of proportional and the committee voted in favor of the term "proportional," as opposed to "proportionate." Mr. Lee proposed, consistent with Mr. Shea's earlier suggestion, that the language and analysis regarding proportionality be moved into subsection (b), and that subsection (c) be limited to protective orders.

The committee then moved to a brief discussion of protective orders and subpart (c). Mr. Marsden pointed out that protective orders are for confidential business information, personal information, etc. Mr. Hafen noted that the other facts, such as undue burden, oppression, annoyance, harassment, lent themselves more to proportionality. The committee then discussed that proportionality issues as they arise under 26(c) really apply to discovery requests that do not require a written response from a party, such as third-party discovery or notices of deposition. The committee reasoned that if dealing with regular written discovery between parties, one party would simply object and the party seeking discovery would have to demonstrate proportionality under subsection (b). Judge Quinn suggested an Advisory Note that the reference to proportionality does not imply that the burden is on any party other than the party seeking discovery.

The committee voted in favor of the following limitations: (A) one hundred fifty (150) days for initial fact discovery; and, (B) twenty (20) hours for depositions per side, allocated any way the party wishes, except that no party deposition can last more than seven (7) hours and no witness can be deposed for more than four (4) hours. The committee agreed to remove any specialty rules pertaining only to certain types of actions or certain sections within the bar. The committee believes the specialty bars should be called upon to customize their own set of initial disclosures at the appropriate time.

Tab 2



Administrative Office of the Courts

Chief Justice Christine M. Durham Utah Supreme Court Chair, Utah Judicial Council

MEMORANDUM

Daniel J. Becker State Court Administrator Myron K. March Deputy Court Administrator

To: Civil Procedures Committee

From: Tim Shea

Date: March 18, 2010

Re: Comments to published rules

The comment period for the following rules has closed, and they are ready for your final recommendations.

URCP 058B. Satisfaction of judgment. Amend. Simplify and clarify the process for entering a satisfaction of judgment. Provide the judgment debtor with a process to raise the issue.

URCP 064D. Writ of garnishment. Amend. Eliminate the requirement that the garnishee file answers to interrogatories with the court. Establishes deadline for hearing on objection to a writ.

URCP 064E. Writ of execution. Amend. Establishes deadline for hearing on objection to a writ.

We received just one comment, which is attached. My observations about the comment and suggested changes:

- I have set off the phrase "a copy of the garnishee's answers" with commas.
- Regarding notice of the hearing at least 5 days before the hearing, that is already required by Rule 6(d), but Rule 6(d) does allow the court to set a different time.
- Regarding serving the reply on the plaintiff (creditor), that is already required by Rule 5(a)(1): "[E]very written notice, appearance, demand, offer of judgment, and similar paper shall be served upon each of the parties".
- Regarding the proposal that the court conduct the evidentiary hearing only if the reply raises a matter permitted under the rule, I have added the phrase "if the reply raises a proper challenge or claim" for the committee to consider.

Additionally, I have received a telephone request from the clerks of the Third District Court that Rule 64D and 64E be made effective July 1, instead of November 1.

Finally, Rule 6 (behind Tab 3) was published for comment some time ago. In response to the comments, the committee decided not to recommend adopting the amendments until electronic filing was in place. Implementation of electronic filing is

proceeding district by district and is scheduled to be available statewide the first week of August. What is the committee's pleasure? The options are to abandon the changes, recommend approval effective November 1, or – to avoid catching folks unaware – republish the rule for comment with the notice that electronic filing will soon be available statewide.

Encl. Draft rules Comment Posted by Mark Olson January 29, 2010 11:25 AM

I have two comments concerning the proposed changes to Rule 64D(H)(1) and two suggestions to improve the existing rule.

The first sentence of Rule 64D(h)(1) seems to be grammatically incorrect. It may simply be a matter of putting commas before and after the new phrase "a copy of the garnishee's answers."

My second comment deals with the addition to Rule 64D(h)(2) of the phrase "as soon as possible and not to exceed 14 days." I understand and agree with the imposition of a hearing deadline, but I would also suggest that the court be required to mail to the parties notice of hearing 5 days in advance of the hearing date. We already occasionally encounter situations where we receive notice by mail or telephone to appear in court the following day (even the same day!), and I fear that imposition of a deadline will cause this to happen more frequently. Additionally, like most collection attorneys we practice throughout the state. It can be a tremendous hardship when we are required to appear at a hearing on very short notice.

The first of my additional suggestions to improve Rule 64D deals with subsection (h)(1). The current (as well as proposed) rule requires that the party replying to the garnishee interrogatories file the reply with the court and serve the garnishee. The rule should be amended to require the filing party to also serve the non-filing party. In practice the party filing the reply is generally the defendant. If my suggestion were to be implemented the defendant would be required to serve a copy of his reply on the plaintiff, which would allow the plaintiff to be better prepared when appearing at the subsequent hearing.

My second suggestion also deals with subsection (h). Subsections (h)(1)(A) through (h)(1)(D) list the grounds under which a reply may be made. A majority of garnishment hearings we attend are the result of replies which list grounds outside those enumerated in the rule (most are attempts to challenge the original judgment). Such challenges are dismissed by the court and constitute a waste of court resources. Therefore, I propose that the court be required to schedule a hearing only if the reply raises a challenge enumerated in subsections (h)(1)(A) through (h)(1)(D).

1 Rule 58B. Satisfaction of judgment.

2 (a) Satisfaction by owner or attorney acknowledgment. A judgment may be satisfied, 3 in whole or in part, as to any or all of the judgment debtors, by the owner thereof, or by 4 the owner's attorney of record of the judgment creditor where no assignment of the 5 judgment has been filed and such attorney executes such satisfaction within eight years 6 after the entry of the judgment, in the following manner: (1) by written instrument, duly 7 acknowledged by such owner or attorney; or (2) by filing an acknowledgment of such 8 satisfaction signed by the owner or attorney and entered on the docket of the judgment 9 in the county where court in which the judgment was first docketed entered, with the 10 date affixed and witnessed by the clerk after payment of the judgment. If the owner is 11 not the original judgment creditor, the owner or owner's attorney shall also file proof of 12 ownership. Every-If the satisfaction of a is for part of the judgment, or as to one or more 13 for fewer than all of the judgment debtors, it shall state the amount paid thereon or for 14 name the debtors who are released of such debtors, naming them.

(b) Satisfaction by order of court. When a judgment shall have been fully paid and not satisfied of record, or when the satisfaction of judgment shall have been lost, the <u>The</u> court in which <u>such the</u> judgment was <u>recovered first entered</u> may, upon motion and satisfactory proof, <u>authorize the attorney of the judgment creditor to satisfy the</u> <u>same, or may</u> enter an order declaring the <u>same judgment</u> satisfied and direct <u>satisfaction to be entered upon the docket</u>.

(c) Entry by clerk. Upon receipt of a satisfaction of judgment, duly executed and
 acknowledged, the clerk shall file the same with the papers in the case, and enter it on
 the register of actions. He shall also enter a brief statement of the substance thereof,
 including the amount paid, on the margin of the judgment docket, with the date of filing
 of such satisfaction.

(d) (c) Effect of satisfaction. When a judgment shall have been satisfied, in whole or
in part, or as to any judgment debtor, and such satisfaction entered upon the docket by
the clerk, such Satisfaction of a judgment, whether by acknowledgement or order, shall,
to the extent of such satisfaction, be discharged the judgment, and the judgment shall
cease to be a lien as to the debtors named and to the extent of the amount paid. In case
of partial satisfaction, if any <u>A writ of execution shall thereafter be issued on the</u>

32 judgment, such execution or a writ of garnishment issued after partial satisfaction shall 33 be endorsed with a memorandum of such include the partial satisfaction and shall direct 34 the officer to collect only the residue thereof balance of the judgment, or to collect only 35 from the judgment debtors remaining liable thereon. 36 (e) (d) Filing transcript certificate of satisfaction in other counties. When any After 37 satisfaction of a judgment-shall have, whether by acknowledgement or order, has been 38 entered on the judgment docket of the county where such in the court in which the 39 judgment was first docketed entered, a certified transcript of satisfaction, or a certificate 40 by the clerk showing such the satisfaction, may be filed with the clerk of the district court 41 in any other county where the judgment may have has been docketed entered. 42 Thereupon a similar entry in the judgment docket shall be made by the clerk of such

- 43 court; and such entry shall have the same effect as in the county where the same was
- 44 originally entered.
- 45

1 Rule 64D. Writ of garnishment.

(a) Availability. A writ of garnishment is available to seize property of the defendant
in the possession or under the control of a person other than the defendant. A writ of
garnishment is available after final judgment or after the claim has been filed and prior
to judgment. The maximum portion of disposable earnings of an individual subject to
seizure is the lesser of:

7 (a)(1) 50% of the defendant's disposable earnings for a writ to enforce payment of a
judgment for failure to support dependent children or 25% of the defendant's disposable
9 earnings for any other judgment; or

(a)(2) the amount by which the defendant's disposable earnings for a pay period
exceeds the number of weeks in that pay period multiplied by thirty times the federal
minimum hourly wage prescribed by the Fair Labor Standards Act in effect at the time
the earnings are payable.

(b) Grounds for writ before judgment. In addition to the grounds required in Rule64A, the grounds for a writ of garnishment before judgment require all of the following:

16 (b)(1) that the defendant is indebted to the plaintiff;

(b)(2) that the action is upon a contract or is against a defendant who is not a
resident of this state or is against a foreign corporation not qualified to do business in
this state;

(b)(3) that payment of the claim has not been secured by a lien upon property in thisstate;

22 (b)(4) that the garnishee possesses or controls property of the defendant; and

(b)(5) that the plaintiff has attached the garnishee fee established by Utah CodeSection 78A-2-216.

25 (c) Statement. The application for a post-judgment writ of garnishment shall state:

(c)(1) if known, the nature, location, account number and estimated value of the
 property and the name, address and phone number of the person holding the property;

28 (c)(2) whether any of the property consists of earnings;

29 (c)(3) the amount of the judgment and the amount due on the judgment;

30 (c)(4) the name, address and phone number of any person known to the plaintiff to31 claim an interest in the property; and

32 (c)(5) that the plaintiff has attached or will serve the garnishee fee established by
 33 Utah Code Section 78A-2-216.

(d) Defendant identification. The plaintiff shall submit with the affidavit or application
a copy of the judgment information statement described in Utah Code Section 78B-5201 or the defendant's name and address and, if known, the last four digits of the
defendant's social security number and driver license number and state of issuance.

(e) Interrogatories. The plaintiff shall submit with the affidavit or applicationinterrogatories to the garnishee inquiring:

40 (e)(1) whether the garnishee is indebted to the defendant and the nature of the41 indebtedness;

42 (e)(2) whether the garnishee possesses or controls any property of the defendant43 and, if so, the nature, location and estimated value of the property;

(e)(3) whether the garnishee knows of any property of the defendant in the
possession or under the control of another, and, if so, the nature, location and estimated
value of the property and the name, address and phone number of the person with
possession or control;

(e)(4) whether the garnishee is deducting a liquidated amount in satisfaction of a
claim against the plaintiff or the defendant, a designation as to whom the claim relates,
and the amount deducted;

(e)(5) the date and manner of the garnishee's service of papers upon the defendantand any third persons;

(e)(6) the dates on which previously served writs of continuing garnishment wereserved; and

(e)(7) any other relevant information plaintiff may desire, including the defendant's
position, rate and method of compensation, pay period, and the computation of the
amount of defendant's disposable earnings.

(f) Content of writ; priority. The writ shall instruct the garnishee to complete the steps
in subsection (g) and instruct the garnishee how to deliver the property. Several writs
may be issued at the same time so long as only one garnishee is named in a writ.
Priority among writs of garnishment is in order of service. A writ of garnishment of

62 earnings applies to the earnings accruing during the pay period in which the writ is 63 effective.

(g) Garnishee's responsibilities. The writ shall direct the garnishee to complete thefollowing within seven business days of service of the writ upon the garnishee:

66 (g)(1) answer the interrogatories under oath or affirmation;

67 (g)(2) serve the answers on the plaintiff; and

(g)(3) serve the writ, answers, notice of exemptions and two copies of the reply form
upon the defendant and any other person shown by the records of the garnishee to
have an interest in the property; and

71 (g)(4) file the answers with the clerk of the court.

The garnishee may amend answers to interrogatories to correct errors or to reflect a change in circumstances by serving and filing the amended answers in the same manner as the original answers.

75 (h) Reply to answers; request for hearing.

(h)(1) The plaintiff or defendant may file and serve upon the garnishee a reply to the answers, a copy of the garnishee's answers, and a request for a hearing. The reply shall be filed and served within 10 days after service of the answers or amended answers, but the court may deem the reply timely if filed before notice of sale of the property or before the property is delivered to the plaintiff. The reply may:

- 81 (h)(1)(A) challenge the issuance of the writ;
- 82 (h)(1)(B) challenge the accuracy of the answers;
- 83 (h)(1)(C) claim the property or a portion of the property is exempt; or
- 84 (h)(1)(D) claim a set off.

85 (h)(2) The reply is deemed denied, and, if the reply raises a proper challenge or

86 <u>claim, the court shall conduct an evidentiary hearing as soon as possible and not to</u>

87 <u>exceed 14 days</u>.

- 88 (h)(3) If a person served by the garnishee fails to reply, as to that person:
- 89 (h)(3)(A) the garnishee's answers are deemed correct; and
- 90 (h)(3)(B) the property is not exempt, except as reflected in the answers.

91 (i) Delivery of property. A garnishee shall not deliver property until the property is

92 due the defendant. Unless otherwise directed in the writ, the garnishee shall retain the

93 property until 20 days after service by the garnishee under subsection (g). If the 94 garnishee is served with a reply within that time, the garnishee shall retain the property 95 and comply with the order of the court entered after the hearing on the reply. Otherwise, 96 the garnishee shall deliver the property as provided in the writ.

97 (j) Liability of garnishee.

98 (j)(1) A garnishee who acts in accordance with this rule, the writ or an order of the 99 court is released from liability, unless answers to interrogatories are successfully 100 controverted.

101 (j)(2) If the garnishee fails to comply with this rule, the writ or an order of the court, 102 the court may order the garnishee to appear and show cause why the garnishee should 103 not be ordered to pay such amounts as are just, including the value of the property or 104 the balance of the judgment, whichever is less, and reasonable costs and attorney fees 105 incurred by parties as a result of the garnishee's failure. If the garnishee shows that the 106 steps taken to secure the property were reasonable, the court may excuse the 107 garnishee's liability in whole or in part.

(j)(3) No person is liable as garnishee by reason of having drawn, accepted, made or
 endorsed any negotiable instrument that is not in the possession or control of the
 garnishee at the time of service of the writ.

(j)(4) Any person indebted to the defendant may pay to the officer the amount of the
debt or so much as is necessary to satisfy the writ, and the officer's receipt discharges
the debtor for the amount paid.

(j)(5) A garnishee may deduct from the property any liquidated claim against theplaintiff or defendant.

116 (k) Property as security.

(k)(1) If property secures payment of a debt to the garnishee, the property need not be applied at that time but the writ remains in effect, and the property remains subject to being applied upon payment of the debt. If property secures payment of a debt to the garnishee, the plaintiff may obtain an order authorizing the plaintiff to buy the debt and requiring the garnishee to deliver the property.

(k)(2) If property secures an obligation that does not require the personalperformance of the defendant and that can be performed by a third person, the plaintiff

may obtain an order authorizing the plaintiff or a third person to perform the obligation and requiring the garnishee to deliver the property upon completion of performance or upon tender of performance that is refused.

127 (I) Writ of continuing garnishment.

(I)(1) After final judgment, the plaintiff may obtain a writ of continuing garnishment
 against any non exempt periodic payment. All provisions of this rule apply to this
 subsection, but this subsection governs over a contrary provision.

(I)(2) A writ of continuing garnishment applies to payments to the defendant from theeffective date of the writ until the earlier of the following:

133 (I)(2)(A) 120 days;

134 (I)(2)(B) the last periodic payment;

135 (I)(2)(C) the judgment is stayed, vacated or satisfied in full; or

136 (I)(2)(D) the writ is discharged.

(I)(3) Within seven days after the end of each payment period, the garnishee shallwith respect to that period:

139 (I)(3)(A) answer the interrogatories under oath or affirmation;

(I)(3)(B) serve the answers to the interrogatories on the plaintiff, the defendant and
any other person shown by the records of the garnishee to have an interest in the
property;

143 (I)(3)(C) file the answers to the interrogatories with the clerk of the court; and

144 (I)(3)(D) deliver the property as provided in the writ.

(I)(4) Any person served by the garnishee may reply as in subsection (g), butwhether to grant a hearing is within the judge's discretion.

(I)(5) A writ of continuing garnishment issued in favor of the Office of Recovery
Services or the Department of Workforce Services of the state of Utah to recover
overpayments:

- 150 (I)(5)(A) is not limited to 120 days;
- 151 (I)(5)(B) has priority over other writs of continuing garnishment; and

152 (I)(5)(C) if served during the term of another writ of continuing garnishment, tolls that 153 term and preserves all priorities uptil the expiration of the state's writ

term and preserves all priorities until the expiration of the state's writ.

1 Rule 64E. Writ of execution.

(a) Availability. A writ of execution is available to seize property in the possession or
under the control of the defendant following entry of a final judgment or order requiring
the delivery of property or the payment of money.

5 (b) Application. To obtain a writ of execution, the plaintiff shall file an application 6 stating:

7 (b)(1) the amount of the judgment or order and the amount due on the judgment or8 order;

9 (b)(2) the nature, location and estimated value of the property; and

(b)(3) the name and address of any person known to the plaintiff to claim an interestin the property.

(c) Death of plaintiff. If the plaintiff dies, a writ of execution may be issued upon the
 affidavit of an authorized executor or administrator or successor in interest.

14 (d) Reply to writ; request for hearing.

(d)(1) The defendant may reply to the writ and request a hearing. The reply shall be
filed and served within 10 days after service of the writ and accompanying papers upon
the defendant.

18 (d)(2) The court shall set the matter for an evidentiary hearing as soon as possible 19 and not to exceed 14 days. If the court determines that the writ was wrongfully obtained, 20 or that property is exempt from seizure, the court shall enter an order directing the 21 officer to release the property. If the court determines that the writ was properly issued 22 and the property is not exempt, the court shall enter an order directing the officer to sell 23 or deliver the property. If the date of sale has passed, notice of the rescheduled sale 24 shall be given. No sale may be held until the court has decided upon the issues 25 presented at the hearing.

26 (d)(3) If a reply is not filed, the officer shall proceed to sell or deliver the property.

(e) Mortgage foreclosure governed by statute. Utah Code Title 78B, Chapter 6, Part
9, Mortgage Foreclosure, governs mortgage foreclosure proceedings notwithstanding
contrary provisions of these rules.

Tab 3

1 Rule 6. Time.

2 (a) Computation. In computing any period of time prescribed or allowed by these 3 rules, by the local rules of any district court, by order of court, or by any applicable 4 statute, the day of the act, event, or default from which the designated period of time 5 begins to run shall not be included. The last day of the period so computed shall be 6 included, unless it is a Saturday, a Sunday, or a legal holiday, in which event the period 7 runs until the end of the next day that is not a Saturday, a Sunday, or a legal holiday. 8 When the period of time prescribed or allowed, without reference to any additional time 9 provided under subsection (e), is less than 11 days, intermediate Saturdays, Sundays 10 and legal holidays shall be excluded in the computation.

11 (b) Enlargement. When by these rules or by a notice given thereunder or by order of 12 the court an act is required or allowed to be done at or within a specified time, the court 13 for cause shown may at any time in its discretion (1) with or without motion or notice 14 order the period enlarged if request therefor is made before the expiration of the period 15 originally prescribed or as extended by a previous order or (2) upon motion made after 16 the expiration of the specified period permit the act to be done where the failure to act 17 was the result of excusable neglect; but it may not extend the time for taking any action 18 under Rules 50(b), 52(b), 59(b), (d) and (e), and 60(b), except to the extent and under 19 the conditions stated in them. 20 (c) Unaffected by expiration of term. The period of time provided for the doing of any

20 (c) endlected by expiration of term. The period of time provided for the doing of any 21 act or the taking of any proceeding is not affected or limited by the continued existence 22 or expiration of a term of court. The continued existence or expiration of a term of court 23 in no way affects the power of a court to do any act or take any proceeding in any civil 24 action that has been pending before it.

(d) Notice of hearings. Notice of a hearing shall be served not later than 5 days
before the time specified for the hearing, unless a different period is fixed by these rules
or by order of the court. Such an order may for cause shown be made on ex parte
application.

(e) Additional time after service by mail. Whenever a party has the right or is
 required to do some act or take some proceedings within a prescribed period after the
 service of a notice or other paper upon him and the notice or paper is served upon him

32	by mail, 3 days shall be added to the end of the prescribed period as calculated under
33	subsection (a). Saturdays, Sundays and legal holidays shall be included in the
34	computation of any 3-day period under this subsection, except that if the last day of the
35	3-day period is a Saturday, a Sunday, or a legal holiday, the period shall run until the
36	end of the next day that is not a Saturday, Sunday, or a legal holiday.
37	(a) Computing time. The following rules apply in computing any time period specified
38	in these rules, any local rule or court order, or in any statute that does not specify a
39	method of computing time.
40	(a)(1) Period stated in days or a longer unit. When the period is stated in days or a
41	longer unit of time:
42	(a)(1)(A) exclude the day of the event that triggers the period;
43	(a)(1)(B) count every day, including intermediate Saturdays, Sundays, and legal
44	holidays; and
45	(a)(1)(C) include the last day of the period, but if the last day is a Saturday, Sunday,
46	or legal holiday, the period continues to run until the end of the next day that is not a
47	Saturday, Sunday or legal holiday.
48	(a)(2) Period stated in hours. When the period is stated in hours:
49	(a)(2)(A) begin counting immediately on the occurrence of the event that triggers the
50	period;
51	(a)(2)(B) count every hour, including hours during intermediate Saturdays, Sundays,
52	and legal holidays; and
53	(a)(2)(C) if the period would end on a Saturday, Sunday, or legal holiday, the period
54	continues to run until the same time on the next day that is not a Saturday, Sunday, or
55	legal holiday.
56	(a)(3) Inaccessibility of the clerk's office. Unless the court orders otherwise, if the
57	clerk's office is inaccessible:
58	(a)(3)(A) on the last day for filing under Rule 6(a)(1), then the time for filing is
59	extended to the first accessible day that is not a Saturday, Sunday or legal holiday; or
60	(a)(3)(B) during the last hour for filing under Rule 6(a)(2), then the time for filing is
61	extended to the same time on the first accessible day that is not a Saturday, Sunday, or
62	legal holiday.

- 63 (a)(4) "Last day" defined. Unless a different time is set by a statute, local rule, or
- 64 <u>court order, filing on the last day means:</u>
- 65 (a)(4)(A) for electronic filing, the filing must be made before midnight; and
- 66 (a)(4)(B) for filing by other means, the filing must be made before the clerk's office is
- 67 <u>scheduled to close.</u>
- 68 (a)(5) "Next day" defined. The "next day" is determined by continuing to count
- 69 forward when the period is measured after an event and backward when measured
- 70 <u>before an event.</u>
- 71 (a)(6) "Legal holiday" defined. "Legal holiday" means the day for observing:
- 72 (a)(6)(A) New Year's Day;
- 73 (a)(6)(B) Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Day;
- 74 (a)(6)(C) Washington and Lincoln Day;
- 75 (a)(6)(D) Memorial Day;
- 76 (a)(6)(E) Independence Day;
- 77 (a)(6)(F) Pioneer Day;
- 78 (a)(6)(G) Labor Day;
- 79 (a)(6)(H) Columbus Day;
- 80 (a)(6)(I) Veterans' Day;
- 81 (a)(6)(J) Thanksgiving Day;
- 82 (a)(6)(K) Christmas; and
- 83 (a)(6)(L) any day designated by the Governor or Legislature as a state holiday.
- 84 (b) The court may extend any time period other than those stated in Rules 50(b),
- 85 52(b), 59(b), 59(d), 59(e) and 60(b). If the request to extend a time period is made
- 86 <u>before expiration of the period, as originally prescribed or as extended by a previous</u>
- 87 order, the order may be entered upon an ex parte application and a showing of good
- 88 cause. If the request to extend the time period is made after expiration of the period, the
- 89 request shall be made by motion and may be granted upon a showing of excusable
- 90 <u>neglect.</u>
- 91 (c) Notice of a hearing shall be served not less than 7 days before the day of the
- 92 hearing, unless a different period is stated by these rules or by order of the court. An

- 93 order to shorten the time period may be entered upon an ex parte application and a
- 94 showing of good cause.

Tab 4

1 Rule 1. General provisions.

(a) Scope of rules. These rules shall-govern the procedure in the courts of the state
of Utah in all actions, suits, and proceedings of a civil nature, whether cognizable at law
or in equity, and in all special statutory proceedings, except as governed by other rules
promulgated by this court or enacted by the Legislature and except as stated in Rule 81.
They shall be liberally construed and applied to secure achieve the just, speedy, and
inexpensive determination of every action.
(b) Effective date. These rules shall take effect on January 1, 1950; and thereafter all

9 laws in conflict therewith shall be of no further force or effect. They <u>These rules</u> govern 10 all proceedings in actions brought after they take effect and <u>also</u> all further proceedings 11 in actions then pending., except to the extent that <u>If</u>, in the opinion of the court, <u>their</u> 12 application <u>applying a rule</u> in <u>a particular an</u> action pending when the rules takes effect 13 would not be feasible or would work injustice, in <u>which event</u> the former procedure 14 applies.

- 15 Advisory Committee Notes
- 16

1 Rule 3. Commencement of action.

2 (a) How commenced. A civil action is commenced (1) by filing a complaint with the 3 court, or (2) by service of a summons together with a copy of the complaint in 4 accordance with Rule 4. If the action is commenced by the service of a summons and a 5 copy of the complaint, then the complaint, the summons and proof of service, must be 6 filed within ten days of such service. If, in a case commenced under paragraph (a)(2) of 7 this rule, the complaint, summons and proof of service are not filed within ten days of 8 service, the action commenced shall be deemed dismissed and the court shall have no 9 further jurisdiction thereof.

10 (b) Payment dishonored. If a check or other form of payment tendered as a filing fee 11 is dishonored, the party shall pay the fee by cash or cashier's check within 10 days after 12 notification by the court. Dishonor of a check or other form of payment does not affect 13 the validity of the filing, but may be grounds for such sanctions as the court deems 14 appropriate, which may include dismissal of the action and the award of costs and 15 attorney fees.

(b) Time of jurisdiction. The court shall have jurisdiction from the time of filing of the
 complaint or service of the summons and a copy of the complaint.

18 Advisory Committee Notes

19 Rule 3 constitutes a significant change from the prior rule. The rule retains service of 20 the ten-day summons as one of two means to commence an action, but the rule 21 requires that the summons together with a copy of the complaint be served on the 22 defendant pursuant to Rule 4. In so doing, the rule eliminates the requirement that a 23 copy of the complaint be deposited with the clerk for the defendant whose address is 24 unknown. The changes in Rule 3 must be read and should be interpreted in conjunction 25 with coordinate changes in Rule 4 and with a change in Rule 12(a) that begins the 26 running of the defendant's 20-day response time from the service of the summons and 27 complaint. 28 Paragraph (a). This paragraph eliminates the requirement that a copy of the

28 Paragraph (a). This paragraph eliminates the requirement that a copy of the
 29 complaint be deposited with the clerk for the defendant whose address is unknown.
 30 Paragraph (b) of the former rule, which permitted the plaintiff to deposit copies of the
 31 complaint with the clerk for defendants not otherwise served with a copy at the time of

- 32 the service of the summons, has also been eliminated. The rule requires, in effect, that
- 33 both the summons and the complaint be served pursuant to Rule 4. Under a coordinate
- 34 change in Rule 12(a), the defendant's time for answering or otherwise responding to the
- 35 complaint does not begin to run until service of the summons and complaint pursuant to
- 36 Rule 4.
- 37 Paragraph (b). This paragraph is substantially identical to paragraph (c) of the
- 38 former rule.

1

Rule 4. Process.

2 (a) Signing of summons. The summons shall be signed and issued by the plaintiff or 3 the plaintiff's attorney. Separate summonses may be signed and served.

4 (b)(i) Time of sService. In an action commenced under Rule 3(a)(1), the The 5 summons together with and a copy of the complaint shall be served no later than 120 6 days after the filing of the complaint is filed unless the court allows a longer period of 7 time for good cause shown. If the summons and complaint are not timely served, the 8 action shall be dismissed, without prejudice on application of any party or upon the 9 court's own initiative.

10 (b)(ii) In any action brought against two or more defendants, on which if service has 11 been timely obtained made upon one of them,

12 (b)(ii)(A) the plaintiff may proceed against those served, and

13 (b)(ii)(B) the others may be served or appear at any time prior to before trial.

14 (c) Contents of summons.

15 (c)(1) The summons shall contain the name of the court, the address of the court. 16 the names of the parties to the action, and the county in which it is brought. It shall be 17 directed to the defendant, state the name, address and telephone number of the 18 plaintiff's attorney, if any, and otherwise the plaintiff's address and telephone number. It 19 shall state the time within which the defendant is required to must answer the complaint 20 in writing, and shall notify the defendant that in case of failure to do so, judgment by 21 default will be rendered entered against the defendant for failure to answer the 22 complaint in writing. It shall state either that the complaint is on file with the court or that 23 the complaint will be filed with the court within ten days of service.

24 (c)(2) If the action is commenced under Rule 3(a)(2), the summons shall state that 25 the defendant need not answer if the complaint is not filed within 10 days after service 26 and shall state the telephone number of the clerk of the court where the defendant may 27 call at least 13 days after service to determine if the complaint has been filed.

28 (c)(3) (c)(2) If service is made by publication of the summons without the complaint, 29 the summons shall also briefly state the subject matter and of the action, the sum of 30 money or other relief demanded, and that the complaint is on file with the court.

(d) Method of Service. Unless waived in writing under paragraph (f), service of the
 summons and complaint shall be by one of the following methods:

(d)(1) Personal service. The summons and complaint may be served in any state or judicial district of the United States by the sheriff or constable or by the deputy of either, by a United States Marshal or by the marshal's deputy, or by any other person 18 years of age or older at the time of service and not a party to the action or a party's attorney. If the person to be served refuses to accept a copy of the process, service shall be sufficient if the person serving the same shall state the name of the process and offer to deliver a copy thereof. Personal service shall be made as follows:

(d)(1)(A) Upon any individual other than one covered by subparagraphs (B), (C) or
(D) below, by delivering a copy of the summons and the complaint to the individual
personally, or by leaving a copy delivering them to a person of suitable age and
discretion residing at the individual's dwelling house or usual place of abode with some
person of suitable age and discretion there residing, or by delivering a copy of the
summons and the complaint them to an agent authorized by appointment or by law to
receive service of process;

(d)(1)(B) Upon an infant (being a person under 14 years) a minor, by delivering a
copy of the summons and the complaint to the infant minor and also to the infant's
father, mother minor's parent or guardian or, if none can be found within the state, then
to any person having the care and control of the infant minor, or with whom the infant
minor resides, or in whose service the infant is employed;

(d)(1)(C) Upon an individual <u>a protected person</u> judicially declared to be of unsound mind or incapable of conducting the person's own affairs incapacitated, by delivering a copy of the summons and the complaint to the <u>protected</u> person and to the person's legal representative if one has been appointed and in the absence of such representative, to the individual, if any, who has care, custody or control of the person guardian or conservator;

(d)(1)(D) Upon an individual incarcerated or committed at a facility operated by the state or any of its political subdivisions, by delivering a copy of the summons and the complaint to the <u>person's guardian or conservator</u>, if one has been appointed, or to the person who has the care, custody, or control of the individual to be served, or to that person's designee or to the guardian or conservator of the individual to be served if one
 has been appointed, who shall, in any case, promptly deliver the process to the
 individual served;

65 (d)(1)(E) Upon any corporation not herein otherwise provided for, upon a partnership 66 or upon an unincorporated association or business entity which is subject to suit under a 67 common name, by delivering a copy of the summons and the complaint to an officer, a 68 managing or agent, general agent, or other agent authorized by appointment or by law 69 to receive service of process and, if the agent is one authorized by statute to receive 70 service and the statute so requires, required by law by also mailing a copy of the 71 summons and the complaint to the defendant entity and to any other person required by 72 statute to be served. If no such officer or agent can be found within the state, and the 73 defendant has, or advertises or holds itself out as having, an office or place of business 74 within the state or elsewhere, or does business within this state or elsewhere, then upon 75 the person in charge of such office or place of business;

(d)(1)(F) Upon an incorporated city or town, by delivering a copy of the summons
 and the complaint to the recorder;

(d)(1)(G) Upon a county, by delivering a copy of the summons and the complaint to
 the county clerk of such county;

(d)(1)(H) Upon a school district or board of education, by delivering a copy of the
summons and the complaint to the superintendent or business administrator of the
board;

(d)(1)(I) Upon an irrigation or drainage district, by delivering a copy of the summons
and the complaint to the president or secretary of its board;

(d)(1)(J) Upon the state of Utah, in such cases as by law are authorized to be
 brought against the state, by delivering a copy of the summons and the complaint to the
 attorney general and any other person or agency required by statute to be served; and

(d)(1)(K) Upon a department or agency of the state of Utah, or upon any public
 board, commission or body, subject to suit, by delivering a copy of the summons and
 the complaint to any member of its governing board, or to its executive employee or
 secretary.

92 (d)(1)(L) If the person to be served refuses to accept a copy of the process, service

93 is effective if the person serving the same states the name of the process and offers to

94 <u>deliver it.</u>

95 (d)(2) Service by mail or commercial courier service.

96 (d)(2)(A) The summons and complaint may be served upon an individual other than
97 one covered by paragraphs (d)(1)(B) or (d)(1)(C) by mail or commercial courier service
98 in any state or judicial district of the United States provided <u>if</u> the defendant signs a
99 document indicating receipt.

(d)(2)(B) The summons and complaint may be served upon an entity covered by
 paragraphs (d)(1)(E) through (d)(1)(I) by mail or commercial courier service in any state
 or judicial district of the United States provided <u>if the</u> defendant's agent authorized by
 appointment or by law to receive service of process signs a document indicating receipt.
 (d)(2)(C) Service by mail or commercial courier service shall be is complete on the

105 date the receipt is signed as provided by this rule.

(d)(3) Service in a foreign country. Service <u>of the summons and complaint</u> in a
 foreign country shall be made as follows:

(d)(3)(A) by any internationally agreed means reasonably calculated to give notice,
such as those means authorized by the Hague Convention on the Service Abroad of
Judicial and Extrajudicial Documents;

(d)(3)(B) if there is no internationally agreed means of service or the applicable
international agreement allows other means of service, provided that service is
reasonably calculated to give notice:

(d)(3)(B)(i) in the manner prescribed by the law of the foreign country for service in
that country in an action in any of its courts of general jurisdiction;

(d)(3)(B)(ii) as directed by the foreign authority in response to a letter rogatory orletter of request; or

(d)(3)(B)(iii) unless prohibited by the law of the foreign country, by delivery to the individual personally of a copy of the summons and the complaint or by any form of mail requiring a signed receipt, to be addressed and dispatched by the clerk of the court to the party to be served; or (d)(3)(C) by other means not prohibited by international agreement as may bedirected by the court.

124 (d)(4) Other service.

125 (d)(4)(A) Where the identity or whereabouts of If the person to be served are 126 unknown and cannot be ascertained cannot be served through reasonable diligence, 127 where or if service upon all of the individual parties is impracticable under the 128 circumstances, or where there exists good cause to believe that the person to be served 129 is avoiding service of process, the party seeking service of process may file a motion 130 supported by affidavit requesting an order allowing service by publication or by some 131 other means. The supporting affidavit shall set forth the efforts made to identify, locate 132 or serve the party to be served, or the circumstances which make it impracticable to 133 serve all of the individual parties.

134 (d)(4)(B) If the motion is granted, the court shall order service of process by 135 publication or by other means, provided that the means of notice employed shall be 136 reasonably calculated, under all the circumstances, to apprise notify the interested 137 parties of the pendency party of the action to the extent reasonably possible or 138 practicable. The court's order shall also specify the content of the process to be served 139 and the event or events as of which that constitutes completion of service shall be 140 deemed complete. Unless service is by publication, a copy of the court's order shall be 141 served upon the defendant with the process specified by the court.

(d)(4)(C) In any proceeding where summons is required to be published, the court shall, upon the request of the party applying for publication, designate the newspaper in which publication shall be made. The newspaper selected shall be a newspaper of general circulation in the county where such publication is required to be made and shall be published in the English language.

147 (e) Proof of Service.

(e)(1) If service is not waived, the <u>The</u> person effecting service shall file proof with the court. The proof of service must state the date, place, and manner of service. Proof of service made pursuant to paragraph (d)(2) shall include a receipt signed by the defendant or defendant's agent <u>authorized by appointment or by law to receive service</u> of process. If service is made by a person other than by an attorney, the sheriff or 153 constable, or by the deputy of either, by a United States Marshal or by the marshal's154 deputy, the proof of service shall be made by affidavit.

155 (e)(2) Proof of service in a foreign country shall be made as prescribed provided in 156 these rules for service within this state, or by the law of the foreign country, or by order 157 of the court. When service is made pursuant to paragraph (d)(3)(C), proof Proof of 158 service under paragraph (d)(3)(B)(iii) shall include a receipt signed by the addressee or 159 other evidence of delivery to the addressee satisfactory to the court.

(e)(3) Failure to make proof of service does not affect the validity of the service. Thecourt may allow proof of service to be amended.

162 (f) Waiver of Service; Payment of Costs for Refusing to Waive.

163 (f)(1) A plaintiff may request a defendant subject to service under paragraph (d) 164 person other than a minor or a protected person to waive service of a the summons and 165 complaint. The request to waive service and the summons and complaint shall be 166 mailed, e-mailed or delivered to the person upon whom service is authorized under 167 paragraph (d). It shall include a copy of the complaint. The request shall allow the 168 defendant at least <u>20-21</u> days from the date on which the request is sent to return the 169 waiver, or 30-28 days if addressed to a defendant person outside of the United States, 170 and shall be substantially in the form of the Notice of Lawsuit and Request for Waiver of 171 Service of Summons set forth in the Appendix of Forms attached to these rules.

(f)(2) A defendant who timely returns a waiver is not required to must respond to the
complaint until 45 within 42 days after the date on which the request for waiver of
service was mailed, e-mailed or delivered to the defendant, or 60-56 days after that date
if addressed to a defendant person outside of the United States.

(f)(3) A defendant who waives service of <u>a the summons and complaint</u> does not
thereby <u>make any other waiver</u> any objection to venue or to the jurisdiction of the court
over the defendant.

(f)(4) If a <u>defendant-person</u> refuses a request for waiver of service <u>submitted in</u>
 accordance with <u>made according</u> this rule, the court shall impose upon the defendant
 the costs subsequently incurred in effecting service.

182 Advisory Committee Notes

1 Rule 8. General rules of pleadings.

2 (a) Claims for relief. <u>A pleading which sets forth a claim for relief, whether an An</u>
3 original claim, counterclaim, cross-claim or third-party claim, shall contain (1) a <u>simple</u>,
4 short and plain:

5 (a)(1) statement of the claim facts showing that the pleader party is entitled to relief;

6 (a)(2) statement of the legal theory on which the claim rests; and

7 (2) a (a)(3) demand for judgment for the specified relief to which he deems himself
 8 entitled. Relief in the alternative or of several different types may be demanded.

9 (b) Defenses; form of denials. A party shall state in simple, short and plain terms his 10 any defenses to each claim asserted and shall admit or deny the averments upon which 11 the adverse party relies statements in the claim. If he is A party without knowledge or 12 information sufficient to form a belief as to about the truth of an averment, he a 13 statement shall so state, and this has the effect of a denial. Denials shall fairly meet the 14 substance of the averments statements denied. When a pleader intends in good faith to 15 deny only a part or a qualification of an averment, he shall specify so much of it as is 16 true and material and shall deny only the remainder. Unless the pleader intends in good 17 faith to controvert all the averments of the preceding pleading, he may make his denials 18 as specific denials of designated averments or paragraphs, or he may generally deny all 19 the averments except such designated averments or paragraphs as he expressly 20 admits; but, when he does so intend to controvert all its averments, he may do so by 21 general denial subject to the obligations set forth in Rule 11. A party may deny all of the 22 statements in a claim by general denial. A party may specify the statement or part of a 23 statement that is admitted and deny the rest. A party may specify the statement or part 24 of a statement that is denied and admit the rest. 25 (c) Affirmative defenses. An affirmative defense shall contain a simple, short and 26 plain:

- 27 (c)(1) statement of facts establishing the affirmative defense;
- 28 (c)(2) statement of the legal theory on which the defense rests; and
- 29 (c)(3) a demand for relief.
- 30 In pleading to a preceding pleading, a <u>A</u> party shall set forth affirmatively in a
- 31 <u>responsive pleading accord and satisfaction, arbitration and award, assumption of risk,</u>

contributory negligence, discharge in bankruptcy, duress, estoppel, failure of consideration, fraud, illegality, injury by fellow servant, laches, license, payment, release, res judicata, statute of frauds, statute of limitations, waiver, and any other matter constituting an avoidance or affirmative defense. When <u>If</u> a party has mistakenly designated <u>designates</u> a defense as a counterclaim or a counterclaim as a defense, the court, on terms, <u>if justice so requires, shall may</u> treat the pleadings as if <u>there the</u> <u>defense or counterclaim</u> had been <u>a properly designation designated</u>.

- (d) Effect of failure to deny. <u>Averments Statements in a pleading to which a</u>
 responsive pleading is required, other than those as to statements of the amount of
 damage, are admitted <u>when if not denied in the responsive pleading</u>. <u>Averments</u>
 <u>Statements in a pleading to which no responsive pleading is required or permitted shall</u>
 <u>be taken as are deemed denied or avoided</u>.
- 44 (e) Pleading to be concise and direct; c<u>C</u>onsistency.
- 45 (e)(1) Each averment of a pleading shall be simple, concise, and direct. No technical
 46 forms of pleading or motions are required.
- 47 (e)(2) A party may set forth two or more statements of state a claim or defense 48 alternately or hypothetically, either in one count or defense or in separate counts or 49 defenses. When two or more of statements are made in the alternative and one of them 50 if made independently would be is sufficient, the pleading is not made insufficient by the 51 insufficiency of one or more of the an alternative statements. A party may also state as 52 many separate legal and equitable claims or legal and equitable defenses as he has 53 regardless of consistency and whether based on legal or on equitable grounds or on 54 both. All statements shall be made subject to the obligations set forth in Rule 11. 55 (f) Construction of pleadings. All pleadings shall be so construed as to do substantial
- 56 justice.
- 57 <u>Advisory Committee Notes</u>
- 58 By requiring a party to plead the "facts" (rather than the former "claims") showing
- 59 that the party is entitled to relief, the committee does not intend to put in place the old
- 60 technical pleading requirements of fact pleading. Rather, the committee intends that the
- 61 pleadings, both claims and defenses, should provide more and earlier notice of the facts
- 62 <u>alleged by a party with less reliance on discovery. We don't mean Twombly.</u>

- Rule 16. Pretrial conferences, scheduling, and management conferences.
 (a) Pretrial conferences. In any action, the <u>The</u> court, in its discretion or upon motion
 of a party, may direct the attorneys for <u>and</u>, when appropriate, the parties and any
 unrepresented parties to appear before it for a conference or conferences before trial for
- 5 such purposes as:
- 6 (a)(1) expediting the disposition of the action;
- 7 (a)(2) establishing early and continuing control so that the case will not be protracted8 for lack of management;
- 9 (a)(3) discouraging wasteful pretrial activities;
- 10 (a)(4) improving the quality of the trial through more thorough preparation;
- 11 (a)(5) facilitating the settlement of the case; and
- 12 (a)(6) considering all matters as may aid in the disposition of the case-:
- 13 (b) Scheduling and management conference and orders. In any action, in addition to
- 14 any other pretrial conferences that may be scheduled, the court, upon its own motion or
- 15 upon the motion of a party, may conduct a scheduling and management conference.
- 16 The attorneys and unrepresented parties shall appear at the scheduling and
- 17 management conference in person or by remote electronic means. Regardless whether
- 18 a scheduling and management conference is held, on motion of a party the court shall
- 19 enter a scheduling order that governs the time:
- 20 (b)(1)-(a)(7) establishing the time to join other parties and to amend the pleadings;
- 21 (b)(2) (a)(8) establishing the time to file motions; and
- 22 (b)(3)-(a)(9) establishing the time to complete discovery-;
- 23 The scheduling order may also include:
- 24 (b)(4) modifications of the times for disclosures under Rules 26(a) and 26(e)(1) and
- 25 of the extent of discovery to be permitted (a)(10) extending fact discovery;
- 26 (b)(5) (a)(11) the date or dates for conferences before trial, a pretrial and final
 27 pretrial conferences, and trial; and
- 28 (b)(6) (a)(12) provisions for preservation, disclosure or discovery of electronically
 29 stored information;
- 30 (b)(7)-(a)(13) any agreements the parties reach for asserting claims of privilege or of
 31 protection as trial-preparation material after production; and

32 (b)(8) (a)(14) any other <u>appropriate</u> matters <u>appropriate in the circumstances of the</u>
 33 case.

(b) Unless the <u>an</u> order sets the <u>trial</u> date <u>of trial</u>, any party may and the plaintiff
shall, at the close of all discovery, certify to the court that the case is ready for trial. The
court shall schedule the trial as soon as mutually convenient to the court and parties.
The court shall notify parties of the <u>trial</u> date <u>of trial</u> and of any <u>final</u> pretrial conference.

38 (c) Final pretrial or settlement conferences. In any action where a final pretrial 39 conference has been ordered, it The court, in its discretion or upon motion, may direct 40 the attorneys and, when appropriate, the parties to appear for such purposes as 41 settlement and trial management. The conference shall be held as close to the time of 42 trial as reasonable under the circumstances. The conference shall be attended by at 43 least one of the attorneys who will conduct the trial for each of the parties, and the attorneys attending the pretrial, unless waived by the court, shall have available, either 44 in person or by telephone, the appropriate parties who have authority to make binding 45 46 decisions regarding settlement. 47 (d) Sanctions. If a party or a party's attorney fails to obey a scheduling or pretrial an 48 order, if no appearance is made on behalf of a party at a scheduling or pretrial or a 49 party's attorney fails to attend a conference, if a party or a party's attorney is 50 substantially unprepared to participate in the a conference, or if a party or a party's

51 attorney fails to participate in good faith, the court, upon motion or its own initiative, may

- 52 take any action authorized by Rule 37(b)(2).
- 53 Advisory Committee Notes
- 54

1 Rule 26. General provisions governing <u>disclosure and</u> discovery.

2 (a) Required dDisclosures; Discovery methods. This rule applies unless changed or
 3 supplemented by a rule governing disclosure and discovery in a practice area.

4 (a)(1) Initial disclosures. Except in cases exempt under <u>subdivision paragraph (a)(2)</u>
5 and except as otherwise stipulated or directed by order, a party shall, without awaiting
6 for a discovery request, provide to other parties:

7 (a)(1)(A) the name and, if known, the address and telephone number of:

8 (a)(1)(A)(i) each individual likely to have discoverable information supporting its
 9 claims or defenses, unless solely for impeachment, identifying the subjects of the
 10 information; and

(a)(1)(A)(ii) each fact witness the party may call in its case in chief and a summary of
 the expected testimony;

(a)(1)(B) a copy of, or a description by category and location of, all discoverable
documents, data compilations, electronically stored information, and tangible things in
the possession, custody, or control of the party supporting its claims or defenses, unless
solely for impeachment that the party may offer in its case in chief;

(a)(1)(C) a computation of any category of damages claimed by the disclosing party,
making available for inspection and copying as under Rule 34 and a copy of all
discoverable documents or other evidentiary material on which such computation is
based, including materials bearing on <u>about</u> the nature and extent of injuries suffered;
and

(a)(1)(D) for inspection and copying as under Rule 34 <u>a copy of</u> any insurance
agreement under which any person carrying on an insurance business may be liable to
satisfy part or all of a judgment which may be entered in the case or to indemnify or
reimburse for payments made to satisfy the judgment; and
(a)(1)(E) a copy of all documents to which a party refers in its pleadings.
Unless otherwise stipulated by the parties or ordered by the court, the (a)(1)(G) The

28 disclosures required by subdivision paragraph (a)(1) shall be made:

29 (a)(1)(G)(i) by the plaintiff within 14 days after service of the meeting of the parties

30 under subdivision (f) first answer to the complaint-; and

31	(a)(1)(G)(ii) by the defendant within 28 days after the plaintiff's first disclosure or
32	after that defendant's appearance, whichever is later.
33	Unless otherwise stipulated by the parties or ordered by the court, a party joined
34	after the meeting of the parties shall make these disclosures within 30 days after being
35	served. A party shall make initial disclosures based on the information then reasonably
36	available and is not excused from making disclosures because the party has not fully
37	completed the investigation of the case or because the party challenges the sufficiency
38	of another party's disclosures or because another party has not made disclosures.
39	(a)(2) Exemptions.
40	(a)(2)(A) The Unless otherwise ordered by the court or agreed to by the parties, the
41	requirements of subdivision paragraph (a)(1) and subdivision (f) do not apply to actions:
42	(a)(2)(A)(i) based on contract in which the amount demanded in the pleadings is
43	\$20,000 or less;
44	(a)(2)(A)(ii)-(a)(2)(A)(i) for judicial review of adjudicative proceedings or rule making
45	proceedings of an administrative agency;
46	(a)(2)(A)(iii) (a)(2)(A)(ii) governed by Rule 65B or Rule 65C;
47	(a)(2)(A)(iv) (a)(2)(A)(iii) to enforce an arbitration award;
48	(a)(2)(A)(v) (a)(2)(A)(iv) for water rights general adjudication under Title 73, Chapter
49	4 ; and
50	(a)(2)(A)(vi) in which any party not admitted to practice law in Utah is not
51	represented by counsel.
52	(a)(2)(B) In an exempt action, the matters subject to disclosure under subpart
53	<u>paragraph (</u> a)(1) are subject to discovery under subpart paragraph (b).
54	(a)(3) Disclosure of expert testimony.
55	(a)(3)(A) A party shall, disclose without waiting for a discovery request, provide to
56	other parties the identity of any person who may be used at trial to present evidence
57	under Rules 702, 703, or 705 of the Utah Rules of Evidence . and a copy of
58	(a)(3)(B) Unless otherwise stipulated by the parties or ordered by the court, this
59	disclosure shall, with respect to a witness who is retained or specially employed to
60	provide expert testimony in the case or whose duties as an employee of the party
61	regularly involve giving expert testimony, be accompanied by a written report prepared

62 and signed by the witness or party. An expert witness may not testify in a party's case-63 in-chief concerning any matter not contained in the report. The report shall contain the 64 subject matter on which the expert is expected to testify; the substance of the facts and 65 opinions to which the expert is expected to testify; a summary of the grounds for each 66 opinion; the qualifications of the witness, including a list of all publications authored by 67 the witness within the preceding ten years; the compensation to be paid for the study 68 and testimony; and a listing of any other cases in which the witness has testified as an 69 expert at trial or by deposition within the preceding four years.

70 (a)(3)(C) Unless otherwise stipulated by the parties or ordered by the court, the 71 disclosures (a)(3)(B) Disclosure required by subdivision paragraph (a)(3) shall be made 72 within 30-28 days after the expiration of fact discovery as provided by subdivision 73 paragraph (d) or, if the evidence is intended solely to contradict or rebut evidence on the 74 same subject matter identified by another party under paragraph (3)(B) (a)(3)(A), within 75 60-56 days after the disclosure made by the other party.

(a)(4) Pretrial disclosures. A party shall, without waiting for a discovery request,
 provide to other parties the following information regarding the evidence that it may
 present at trial other than solely for impeachment:

(a)(4)(A) the name and, if not previously provided, the address and telephone
number of each witness, <u>unless solely for impeachment</u>, separately identifying
witnesses the party <u>expects to present will call</u> and witnesses the party may call if the
need arises;

(a)(4)(B) the designation the name of witnesses whose testimony is expected to be
 presented by means transcript of a deposition and, if not taken stenographically, a copy
 of the transcript of the pertinent portions of the deposition testimony; and

(a)(4)(C) an appropriate identification of each document or other exhibit, including
summaries of other evidence, <u>unless solely for impeachment</u>, separately identifying
those which the party expects to <u>will</u> offer and those which the party may offer if the
need arises.

Unless otherwise stipulated by the parties or ordered by the court, the disclosures
 (a)(4)(D) Disclosure required by subdivision paragraph (a)(4) shall be made at least 30
 28 days before trial. Within 14 days thereafter, unless a different time is specified by the

41

93 court, At least 14 days before trial, a party may shall serve and file a list disclosing (i) 94 any objections and grounds for the objections to the use under Rule 32(a) of a 95 deposition designated by another party under subparagraph (B) and (ii) any objection, 96 together with the grounds therefor, that may be made to the admissibility of materials 97 identified under subparagraph (C) exhibits. Objections not so disclosed, other Other 98 than objections under Rules 402 and 403 of the Utah Rules of Evidence, shall be 99 deemed objections not listed are waived unless excused by the court for good cause 100 shown.

101 (a)(5) Form of disclosures. Unless otherwise stipulated by the parties or ordered by
 102 the court, all disclosures under paragraphs (1), (3) and (4) shall be made in writing,
 103 signed and served.

104 (a)(6) Methods to discover additional matter. Parties may obtain discovery by one or
105 more of the following methods: depositions upon oral examination or written questions;
106 written interrogatories; production of documents or things or permission to enter upon
107 land or other property, for inspection and other purposes; physical and mental
108 examinations; and requests for admission.

(b) Discovery scope and limits. Unless otherwise limited by order of the court in
 accordance with these rules, the scope of discovery is as follows:

111 (b)(1) In general. Parties may obtain discovery regarding discover any matter, not 112 privileged, which is relevant to the subject matter involved in the pending action, 113 whether it relates to the claim or defense of the any party seeking discovery or to the 114 claim or defense of any other party, including the existence, description, nature, 115 custody, condition, and location of any books, documents, or other tangible things and 116 the identity and location of persons having knowledge of any discoverable matter. It is 117 not ground for objection that the information sought will be inadmissible at the trial if the 118 information sought appears reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible 119 evidence. For good cause shown by the party seeking discovery, the court may order 120 broader discovery. Discovery and discovery requests must be proportional. Discovery 121 and discovery requests are proportional if: 122 (b)(1)(A) the likely benefits of the proposed discovery outweigh the burden or

123 <u>expense;</u>

- 124 (b)(1)(B) the discovery is consistent with the overall case management and will
- 125 <u>further the just, speedy and inexpensive determination of the case;</u>
- 126 (b)(1)(C) the discovery is reasonable, considering the needs of the case, the amount
- 127 in controversy, the complexity of the case, the parties' resources, the importance of the
- 128 issues, and the importance of the discovery in resolving the issues;
- 129 (b)(1)(D) the discovery is not unreasonably cumulative or duplicative;
- 130 (b)(1)(E) the information cannot be obtained from another source that is more
- 131 convenient, less burdensome or less expensive; and
- 132 (b)(1)(F) the party seeking discovery has not had sufficient opportunity to obtain the
- 133 information by discovery or otherwise, taking into account the parties' relative access to
- 134 the information.
- (b)(2) The party seeking discovery has the burden of showing proportionality. The
 court may enter orders described in Paragraph (c).
- 137 (b)(2) (b)(3) A party need not provide discovery of electronically stored information 138 from sources that the party identifies as not reasonably accessible because of undue 139 burden or cost. The party shall expressly make any claim that the source is not 140 reasonably accessible, describing the source, the nature and extent of the burden, the 141 nature of the information not provided, and any other information that will enable other 142 parties to assess evaluate the claim. On motion to compel discovery or for a protective 143 order, the party from whom discovery is sought must show that the information is not 144 reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. If that showing is made, the 145 court may order discovery from such sources if the requesting party shows good cause, 146 considering the limitations of subsection (b)(3). The court may specify conditions for the 147 discovery.
- (b)(3) Limitations. The frequency or extent of use of the discovery methods set forth
 in Subdivision (a)(6) shall be limited by the court if it determines that:
- (b)(3)(A) the discovery sought is unreasonably cumulative or duplicative, or is
 obtainable from some other source that is more convenient, less burdensome, or less
 expensive;
- (b)(3)(B) the party seeking discovery has had ample opportunity by discovery in the
 action to obtain the information sought; or

(b)(3)(C) the discovery is unduly burdensome or expensive, taking into account the
needs of the case, the amount in controversy, limitations on the parties' resources, and
the importance of the issues at stake in the litigation. The court may act upon its own
initiative after reasonable notice or pursuant to a motion under Subdivision (c).

159 (b)(4) Trial preparation: Mmaterials. Subject to the provisions of Subdivision (b)(5) of 160 this rule, a A party may obtain discovery of otherwise discoverable documents and 161 tangible things otherwise discoverable under Subdivision (b)(1) of this rule and prepared 162 in anticipation of litigation or for trial by or for another party or by or for that other party's 163 representative (including the party's attorney, consultant, surety, indemnitor, insurer, or 164 agent) only upon a showing that the party seeking discovery has substantial need of the 165 materials in the preparation of the case and that the party is unable without undue 166 hardship to obtain the substantially equivalent of the materials by other means. In 167 ordering discovery of such materials when the required showing has been made, the 168 court shall protect against disclosure of the mental impressions, conclusions, opinions, 169 or legal theories of an attorney or other representative of a party concerning the 170 litigation.

171 (b)(5) Statement previously made about the action. A party may obtain without the 172 required showing a statement concerning the action or its subject matter previously 173 made by that party. Upon request, a person not a party may obtain without the required 174 showing a statement concerning about the action or its subject matter previously made 175 by that person. If the request is refused, the person may move for a court order. The 176 provisions of under Rule 37(a)(4) apply to the award of expenses incurred in relation to 177 the motion. For purposes of this paragraph, a A statement previously made is (A) a 178 written statement signed or otherwise adopted or approved by the person making it, or 179 (B) a stenographic, mechanical, electrical, or other recording, or a transcription thereof, 180 which is a substantially verbatim recital of an oral statement by the person making it and 181 contemporaneously recorded.

182 (b)(5) Trial preparation: Experts.

(b)(5)(A) A party may depose any person who has been identified as an expert
 whose opinions may be presented at trial. If a report is required under subdivision
 (a)(3)(B), any deposition shall be conducted within 60 days after the report is provided.

(b)(5)(B) A party may discover facts known or opinions held by an expert who has
been retained or specially employed by another party in anticipation of litigation or
preparation for trial and who is not expected to be called as a witness at trial, only as
provided in Rule 35(b) or upon a showing of exceptional circumstances under which it is
impracticable for the party seeking discovery to obtain facts or opinions on the same
subject by other means.

192 (b)(5)(C) Unless manifest injustice would result,

(b)(5)(C)(i) The court shall require that the party seeking discovery pay the expert a
 reasonable fee for time spent in responding to discovery under Subdivision (b)(5) of this
 rule: and

(b)(5)(C)(ii) With respect to discovery obtained under Subdivision (b)(5)(A) of this
 rule the court may require, and with respect to discovery obtained under Subdivision
 (b)(5)(B) of this rule the court shall require, the party seeking discovery to pay the other
 party a fair portion of the fees and expenses reasonably incurred by the latter party in
 obtaining facts and opinions from the expert.

201 (b)(6) Claims of Privilege or Protection of Trial Preparation Materials.

(b)(6)(A) Information withheld. When <u>If</u> a party withholds <u>discoverable</u> information
 otherwise discoverable under these rules by claiming that it is privileged or <u>subject to</u>
 protection as trial preparation material prepared in anticipation of litigation or for trial, the
 party shall make the claim expressly and shall describe the nature of the documents,
 communications, or things not produced or <u>disclosed</u> in a manner that, without revealing
 <u>the</u> information itself <u>privileged or protected</u>, will enable other parties to <u>assess</u> the
 applicability of the privilege or protection evaluate the claim.

209 (b)(6)(B) Information produced. If a party produces information is produced in 210 discovery that is subject to a the party claims of is privileged or of protection as trial-211 preparation material prepared in anticipation of litigation or for trial, the producing party 212 making the claim may notify any receiving party that received the information of the 213 claim and the basis for it. After being notified, a receiving party must promptly return, 214 sequester, or destroy the specified information and any copies it has and may not use 215 or disclose the information until the claim is resolved. A receiving party may promptly 216 present the information to the court under seal for a determination of the claim. If the

receiving party disclosed the information before being notified, it must take reasonable
steps to retrieve it. The producing party must preserve the information until the claim is
resolved.

220 (c) Protective orders.

221 Upon motion by a (c)(1) A party or by the person from whom discovery is sought, 222 accompanied by may move for an order of protection from discovery. The movant shall 223 attach to the motion a copy of the request for discovery or the response which is at 224 issue and a certification that the movant has in good faith conferred or attempted to 225 confer with other affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. 226 and for good cause shown, the The court in which the action is pending or alternatively, 227 on matters relating to a deposition, the court in the district where the deposition is to be 228 taken may make any order which justice requires to protect a party or person from 229 discovery being conducted in bad faith or from annoyance, embarrassment, oppression, 230 or undue burden or expense, or to achieve proportionality, including one or more of the 231 following:

232 (c)(1)(c)(1)(A) that the discovery not be had;

233 (c)(2) (c)(1)(B) that the discovery may be had only on specified terms and
 234 conditions, including a designation of the time or place;

235 (c)(3) (c)(1)(C) that the discovery may be had only by a method of discovery other
 236 than that selected by the party seeking discovery;

237 (c)(4) (c)(1)(D) that certain matters not be inquired into, or that the scope of the
 238 discovery be limited to certain matters;

239 (c)(5) (c)(1)(E) that discovery be conducted with no one present except persons
 240 designated by the court;

241 (c)(6) (c)(1)(F) that a deposition after being sealed be opened only by order of the
 242 court;

243 (c)(7) (c)(1)(G) that a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or 244 commercial information not be disclosed or be disclosed only in a designated way;

245 (c)(8) (c)(1)(H) that the parties simultaneously file specified documents or 246 information enclosed in sealed envelopes to be opened as directed by the court;

- 247 (c)(1)(I) that a question about a statement or opinion of fact or the application of law
- 248 to fact not be answered until after designated discovery has been completed or until a
- 249 pretrial conference or other later time; or
- 250 (c)(1)(J) that the costs, expenses and attorney fees of discovery be allocated among
- 251 <u>the parties as justice requires</u>.
- (c)(2) If the protective order terminates a deposition, it shall be resumed only upon
 the order of the court in which the action is pending.
- (c)(3) If the motion for a protective order is denied in whole or in part, the court may,
 on such terms and conditions as are just, order that any party or person provide or
 permit discovery. The provisions of Rule 37(a)(4) applyies to the award of expenses
 incurred in relation to the motion.
- 258 (d) Sequence and timing of discovery.
- 259 (d)(1) Discovery shall be in two stages. Initial fact discovery shall be completed 260 within 150 days after the defendant's first disclosure is made and the parties shall follow 261 the limits established in Rules 30, 33, 34 and 36. Methods of discovery may be used in 262 any sequence and the fact that a party is conducting discovery shall not delay any other 263 party's discovery. Except for cases exempt under subdivision paragraph (a)(2), except 264 as authorized under these rules, or unless otherwise stipulated by the parties or ordered 265 by the court, a party may not seek discovery from any source before the parties have 266 met and conferred as required by subdivision (f). Unless otherwise stipulated by the 267 parties or ordered by the court, fact discovery shall be completed within 240 days after 268 the first answer is filed. Unless the court upon motion, for the convenience of parties 269 and witnesses and in the interests of justice, orders otherwise, methods of discovery 270 may be used in any sequence and the fact that a party is conducting discovery, whether 271 by deposition or otherwise, shall not operate to delay any other party's discovery that 272 party's initial disclosure obligations are satisfied. 273 (d)(2) To obtain discovery beyond the limits established by these rules, a party shall 274 file:
- 275 (d)(2)(A) before the close of the initial fact discovery, a stipulation of extended
 276 discovery and a statement signed by the parties and attorneys that the additional

277 discovery is necessary and proportional and that each party has reviewed and approved 278 a discovery budget; or 279 (d)(2)(B) before the close of the initial fact discovery and after reaching the limits of 280 initial discovery imposed by these rules, a motion for extended discovery and a 281 statement signed by the party and attorney that the additional discovery is necessary 282 and proportional and that the party has reviewed and approved a discovery budget. 283 (e) Supplementation of responses. Standard for disclosure or response; disclosure 284 or response by an organization; failure to disclose; initial and supplemental disclosures 285 and responses. A party who has made a disclosure under subdivision (a) or responded 286 to a request for discovery with a response is under a duty to supplement the disclosure 287 or response to include information thereafter acquired if ordered by the court or in the 288 following circumstances: 289 (e)(1) A party is under a duty to supplement at appropriate intervals disclosures 290 under subdivision (a) if the 291 (e)(1) A party shall make disclosures and responses to discovery based on the 292 information then known or reasonably available to the party. 293 (e)(2) If the party providing disclosure or responding to discovery is a corporation, 294 partnership, association, or governmental agency, the party shall act through one or 295 more officers, directors, managing agents, or other persons. 296 (e)(3) A party is not excused from making disclosures or responses because the 297 party has not completed investigating the case or because the party challenges the 298 sufficiency of another party's disclosures or responses or because another party has not 299 made disclosures or responses. 300 (e)(4) If a party fails to disclose or to timely supplement a disclosure or response to 301 discovery, that party may not use the undisclosed witness, document or material at any 302 hearing or trial unless the failure is harmless or the party shows good cause for the 303 failure. 304 (e)(5) If a party learns that in some material respect the information disclosed a 305 disclosure or response is incomplete or incorrect and if in some important way, the party 306 must timely provide the additional or corrective information if it has not otherwise been 307 made known to the other parties during the discovery process or in writing. With respect 308 to testimony of an expert from whom a report is required under subdivision (a)(3)(B) the 309 duty extends both to information contained in the report and to information provided 310 through a deposition of the expert. The supplemental disclosure or response must state

311 why the additional or correct information was not previously provided.

312 (e)(2) A party is under a duty seasonably to amend a prior response to an 313 interrogatory, request for production, or request for admission if the party learns that the 314 response is in some material respect incomplete or incorrect and if the additional or 315 corrective information has not otherwise been made known to the other parties during 316 the discovery process or in writing.

317 (f) Discovery and scheduling conference.

318 The following applies to all cases not exempt under subdivision (a)(2), except as
319 otherwise stipulated or directed by order.

(f)(1) The parties shall, as soon as practicable after commencement of the action, meet in person or by telephone to discuss the nature and basis of their claims and defenses, to discuss the possibilities for settlement of the action, to make or arrange for the disclosures required by subdivision (a)(1), to discuss any issues relating to preserving discoverable information and to develop a stipulated discovery plan. Plaintiff's counsel shall schedule the meeting. The attorneys of record shall be present at the meeting and shall attempt in good faith to agree upon the discovery plan.

327 (f)(2) The plan shall include:

328 (f)(2)(A) what changes should be made in the timing, form, or requirement for
 329 disclosures under subdivision (a), including a statement as to when disclosures under
 330 subdivision (a)(1) were made or will be made;

331 (f)(2)(B) the subjects on which discovery may be needed, when discovery should be
 332 completed, whether discovery should be conducted in phases and whether discovery
 333 should be limited to particular issues;

334 (f)(2)(C) any issues relating to preservation, disclosure or discovery of electronically
 335 stored information, including the form or forms in which it should be produced;

336 (f)(2)(D) any issues relating to claims of privilege or of protection as trial-preparation

337 material, including - if the parties agree on a procedure to assert such claims after

338 production - whether to ask the court to include their agreement in an order;

339 (f)(2)(E) what changes should be made in the limitations on discovery imposed
 340 under these rules, and what other limitations should be imposed;

341 (f)(2)(F) the deadline for filing the description of the factual and legal basis for
 342 allocating fault to a non-party and the identity of the non-party; and

343 (f)(2)(G) any other orders that should be entered by the court.

344 (f)(3) Plaintiff's counsel shall submit to the court within 14 days after the meeting and 345 in any event no more than 60 days after the first answer is filed a proposed form of 346 order in conformity with the parties' stipulated discovery plan. The proposed form of 347 order shall also include each of the subjects listed in Rule 16(b)(1)-(8), except that the 348 date or dates for pretrial conferences, final pretrial conference and trial shall be 349 scheduled with the court or may be deferred until the close of discovery. If the parties 350 are unable to agree to the terms of a discovery plan or any part thereof, the plaintiff 351 shall and any party may move the court for entry of a discovery order on any topic on 352 which the parties are unable to agree. Unless otherwise ordered by the court, the 353 presumptions established by these rules shall govern any subject not included within 354 the parties' stipulated discovery plan.

355 (f)(4) Any party may request a scheduling and management conference or order
 356 under Rule 16(b).

357 (f)(5) A party joined after the meeting of the parties is bound by the stipulated
358 discovery plan and discovery order, unless the court orders on stipulation or motion a
359 modification of the discovery plan and order. The stipulation or motion shall be filed
360 within a reasonable time after joinder.

361 (g) (f) Signing of discovery requests, responses, and objections. Every disclosure, 362 request for discovery, or response to a request for discovery or and objection thereto 363 made by a party to a request for discovery shall be in writing and signed by at least one 364 attorney of record or by the party if the party is not represented, whose address shall be 365 stated. The signature of the attorney or party constitutes is a certification that the person 366 has read the request, response, or objection and that to the best of the person's 367 knowledge, information, and belief formed after reasonable inquiry it is: (1) consistent 368 with these rules and warranted by existing law or a good faith argument for the 369 extension, modification, or reversal of existing law; (2) not interposed for any improper 370 purpose, such as to harass or to cause unnecessary delay or needless increase in the 371 cost of litigation; and (3) not unreasonable or unduly burdensome or expensive, given 372 the needs of the case, the discovery already had in the case, the amount in controversy, 373 and the importance of the issues at stake in the litigation under Rule 11. If a request, or 374 response, or objection is not signed, it shall be stricken unless it is signed promptly after 375 the omission is called to the attention of the party making the request, response, or 376 objection, and a party shall not be obligated does not need to take any action with 377 respect to it until it is signed.

If a certification is made in violation of the rule, the court, upon motion or upon its own initiative, shall impose upon the person who made the certification, the party on whose behalf the request, response, or objection is made, or both, an appropriate sanction, which may include an order to pay the amount of the reasonable expenses incurred because of the violation, including a reasonable attorney fee may take any action authorized by Rule 11 or Rule 37(b)(2).

384 (h)-(g) Deposition where in action pending in another state. Any party to an action or 385 proceeding in another state may take the deposition of any person within this state, in 386 the same manner and subject to the same conditions and limitations as if such action or 387 proceeding were pending in this state, provided that in order to obtain a subpoena the 388 notice of the taking of such. Notice of the deposition shall be filed with the clerk of the 389 court of the county in which the person whose deposition is to be taken resides or is to 390 be served, and provided further that all matters arising during the taking of such 391 deposition which by the rules are. Matters required to be submitted to the court shall be 392 submitted to the court in the county where the deposition is being taken.

393 (i) (h) Filing.

(i)(1) Unless otherwise Except as required by these rules or ordered by the court, a party shall not file with the court a disclosures, or a requests for discovery with the court or a response to a request for discovery, but shall file only the original certificate of service stating that the disclosures, or requests for discovery have or response has been served on the other parties and the date of service. Unless otherwise ordered by the court, a party shall not file a response to a request for discovery with the court, but shall file only the original certificate of service stating that the response has been served

- 401 on the other parties and the date of service. Except as provided in Rule 30(f)(1), Rule
- 402 <u>32 or unless otherwise ordered by the court, depositions shall not be filed with the court.</u>
- 403 (i)(2) A party filing a motion under subdivision (c) or a motion under Rule 37(a) shall
- 404 attach to the motion a copy of the request for discovery or the response which is at
- 405 issue.
- 406 Advisory Committee Notes
- 407 Paragraph (c). Protective orders. If a protective order is sought because the
- 408 discovery request is not proportional, the party seeking discovery has burden of
- 409 showing that the request meets the proportionality principles of Paragraph (b).

- 1 Rule 26A. Disclosure in domestic relations actions. 2 (a) Scope. This rule applies to domestic relations actions, including divorce, 3 temporary separation, separate maintenance, parentage and modification. This rule 4 does not apply to adoptions, enforcement of prior orders, cohabitant abuse protective 5 orders, child protective orders and civil stalking injunctions. 6 (b) Time for disclosure. Without waiting for a discovery request, petitioner in all 7 domestic relations actions shall disclose to respondent the documents required in this 8 rule within 40 days after service of the petition unless respondent defaults or consents 9 to entry of the decree. The respondent shall disclose to petitioner the documents 10 required in this rule within 40 days after respondent's answer is due. 11 (c) Financial Declaration. Each party shall disclose to all other parties a fully 12 completed court-approved Financial Declaration and attachments. Each party shall 13 attach to the Financial Declaration the following: 14 (c)(1) For every item and amount listed in the Financial Declaration, excluding 15 monthly expenses, the producing party shall attach copies of statements verifying the 16 amounts listed on the Financial Declaration that are reasonably available to the party. 17 (c)(2) For the two tax years before the petition was filed, complete federal and state 18 income tax returns, including Form W-2 and supporting tax schedules and attachments, 19 filed by or on behalf of that party or by or on behalf of any entity in which the party has a 20 majority or controlling interest, including, but not limited to, Form 1099 and Form K-1 21 with respect to that party. 22 (c)(3) Pay stubs and other evidence of all earned and un-earned income for the 12 23 months before the petition was filed. 24 (c)(4) All loan applications and financial statements prepared or used by the party 25 within the 12 months before the petition was filed. 26 (c)(5) Documents verifying the value of all real estate in which the party has an 27 interest, including, but not limited to, the most recent appraisal, tax valuation and 28 refinance documents. 29 (c)(6) All statements for the 3 months before the petition was filed for all financial 30 accounts, including, but not limited to checking, savings, money market funds,
- 31 certificates of deposit, brokerage, investment, retirement, regardless of whether the

- 32 account has been closed including those held in that party's name, jointly with another
- 33 person or entity, or as a trustee or guardian, or in someone else's name on that party's
- 34 <u>behalf.</u>
- 35 (c)(7) If the foregoing documents are not reasonably available or are in the
- 36 possession of the other party, the party disclosing the Financial Declaration shall
- 37 <u>estimate the amounts entered on the Financial Declaration, the basis for the estimation</u>
- 38 and an explanation why the documents are not available.
- 39 (d) Certificate of Service. Each party shall file a Certificate of Service with the court
- 40 certifying that he or she has provided the Financial Declaration and attachments to the
- 41 <u>other party in compliance with this rule.</u>
- 42 (e) Exempted agencies. Agencies of the State of Utah are not subject to these
- 43 disclosure requirements.
- 44 (f) Sanctions. Failure to fully disclose all assets and income in the Financial
- 45 <u>Declaration and attachments may subject the non-disclosing party to sanctions under</u>
- 46 Rule 37 including an award of non-disclosed assets to the other party, attorney's fees or
- 47 <u>other sanctions deemed appropriate by the court.</u>
- 48 (g) Failure of a party to comply with this rule does not preclude any other party from
- 49 obtaining a default judgment, proceeding with the case, or seeking other relief from the
- 50 <u>court.</u>
- 51 (h) Notice of the requirements of this rule shall be served on the Respondent and all
- 52 joined parties with the initial petition.
- 53 Advisory Committee Notes
- 54 (c)(3): Refer to statutory definition

1 Rule 29. Stipulations regarding <u>disclosure and</u> discovery procedure.

- 2 Unless the court orders otherwise, the <u>The</u> parties may by written stipulation
- 3 (1) provide that depositions may be taken before any person, at any time or place,
- 4 upon any notice, and in any manner and when so taken may be used like other
- 5 depositions, and
- 6 (2) modify the procedures provided by these rules for disclosure and discovery,
- 7 except that stipulations by filing, before the close of the initial fact discovery, a stipulated
- 8 notice of extended discovery and a statement signed by the parties and lawyers that the
- 9 additional discovery is necessary and proportionate and that each party has reviewed
- 10 and approved a discovery budget. Stipulations extending the time for or limits of
- 11 disclosure or discovery require the court approval of the court if they the extension
- 12 would interfere with the time set a court order for completion of discovery or with the
- 13 date of a hearing or trial.
- 14 Advisory Committee Notes
- 15

1 Rule 30. Depositions upon oral examination.

(a) When depositions may be taken; Wwhen leave required; no deposition of expert
witnesses. A party may depose a party or witness by oral or written questioning. A
witness may not be deposed more than once. A person who may present evidence
under Rules 702, 703, or 705 of the Utah Rules of Evidence may not be deposed.

6 (a)(1) A party may take the testimony of any person, including a party, by deposition

7 upon oral examination without leave of court except as provided in paragraph (2). The

8 attendance of witnesses may be compelled by subpoena as provided in Rule 45.

9 (a)(2) A party must obtain leave of court, which shall be granted to the extent
 10 consistent with the principles stated in Rule 26(b)(3), if the person to be examined is
 11 confined in prison or if, without the written stipulation of the parties:

(a)(2)(A) a proposed deposition would result in more than ten depositions being
 taken under this rule or Rule 31 by the plaintiffs, or by the defendants, or by third-party

14 defendants;

15 (a)(2)(B) the person to be examined already has been deposed in the case; or

(a)(2)(C) a party seeks to take a deposition before the time specified in Rule 26(d)
unless the notice contains a certification, with supporting facts, that the person to be
examined is expected to leave the state and will be unavailable for examination unless
deposed before that time. The party or party's attorney shall sign the notice, and the
signature constitutes a certification subject to the sanctions provided by Rule 11.

(b) Notice of <u>examination_deposition</u>; general requirements; special notice; non stenographic recording; production of documents and things; deposition of organization;
 deposition by telephone; <u>written questions</u>.

24 (b)(1) A The party desiring to take the deposition of any person upon oral 25 examination deposing a witness shall give reasonable notice in writing to every other 26 party to the action. The notice shall state the date, time and place for taking the 27 deposition and the name and address of each person to be examined witness, if 28 known, and, if If the name of a witness is not known, a general description sufficient the 29 notice shall describe the witness sufficiently to identify the person or state the particular 30 class or group to which the person belongs. If a subpoena duces tecum is to be served 31 on the person to be examined, the designation of the materials to be produced as set forth in the subpoena shall be attached to or included in the notice. The notice shall
 designate any documents and tangible things to be produced by a witness. The notice
 shall designate the officer who will conduct the deposition.

35 (b)(2) The party taking the deposition shall state in the notice shall designate the 36 method by which the testimony shall deposition will be recorded. Unless the court 37 orders otherwise, it With prior notice to the officer, witness and other parties, any party 38 may designate a recording method in addition to the method designated in the notice. 39 Depositions may be recorded by sound, sound-and-visual, or stenographic means, and 40 the party taking the deposition designating the recording method shall bear the cost of 41 the recording. The appearance or demeanor of witnesses or attorneys shall not be 42 distorted through recording techniques.

(b)(3) With prior notice to the deponent and other parties, any party may designate
another method to record the deponent's testimony in addition to the method specified
by the person taking the deposition. The additional record or transcript shall be made at
that party's expense unless the court otherwise orders.

47 (b)(4) Unless otherwise agreed by the parties, a (b)(3) A deposition shall be 48 conducted before an officer appointed or designated under Rule 28 and shall begin with 49 a statement on the record by the officer that includes (A) the officer's name and 50 business address; (B) the date, time and place of the deposition; (C) the name of the 51 deponent witness; (D) the administration of the oath or affirmation to the deponent 52 witness; and (E) an identification of all persons present. If the deposition is recorded 53 other than stenographically, the officer shall repeat items (A) through (C) at the 54 beginning of each unit of tape or other the recording medium. The appearance or 55 demeanor of deponents or attorneys shall not be distorted through camera or sound-56 recording techniques. At the end of the deposition, the officer shall state on the record 57 that the deposition is complete and shall set forth state any stipulations made by 58 counsel concerning the custody of the transcript or recording and the exhibits, or 59 concerning other pertinent matters.

60 (b)(5) (b)(4) The notice to a party <u>deponent witness</u> may be accompanied by a 61 request <u>made in compliance with under</u> Rule 34 for the production of documents and 62 tangible things at the <u>taking of the</u> deposition. The procedure of Rule 34 shall apply to 63 the request. The attendance of a nonparty witness may be compelled by subpoena

64 <u>under Rule 45. Documents and tangible things to be produced shall be stated in the</u>
65 subpoena.

66 (b)(6) (b)(5) A party may in the notice and in a subpoend name as the deponent 67 witness a public or private corporation, a partnership, an association, or a governmental 68 agency, and describe with reasonable particularity the matters on which examination 69 questioning is requested. In that event, and direct the organization so named shall to 70 designate one or more officers, directors, managing agents, or other persons who 71 consent to testify on its behalf and may set forth. The organization shall state, for each 72 person designated, the matters on which the person will testify. A subpoena shall advise 73 a nonparty organization of its duty to make such a designation. The persons so 74 designated shall testify as to matters known or reasonably available to the organization. 75 This Subdivision (b)(6) does not preclude taking a deposition by any other procedure 76 authorized in these rules. 77 (b)(7) The parties may stipulate in writing or the court may upon motion order that a 78 (b)(6) A deposition may be taken by remote electronic means. For the purposes of this 79 rule and Rules 28(a), 37(b)(1), and 45(d), a A deposition taken by remote electronic 80 means is considered to be taken at the place where the deponent witness is to answers 81 questions.

82 (b)(7) A party taking a deposition using written questions shall include the questions

- 83 with the notice or subpoena and serve them on:
- 84 (b)(7)(A) the parties;

85 (b)(7)(B) the witness if that person is not a party; and

- 86 <u>(b)(7)(C) the officer.</u>
- 87 (b)(7)(D) Within 14 days after the questions are served, a party may serve cross
- 88 guestions. Within 7 days after being served with cross questions, a party may serve
- 89 redirect questions. Within 7 days after being served with redirect questions, a party may
- 90 serve recross questions.
- 91 (b)(7)(E) The officer shall ask any written questions.
- 92 (c) Examination and cross-examination; record of examination; oath; objections.

93 (c)(1) Examination and cross-examination Questioning of witnesses may proceed as
94 permitted at the trial under the provisions of the Utah Rules of Evidence, except Rules
95 103 and 615. The officer before whom the deposition is to be taken shall put the
96 witnesses on oath or affirmation and shall personally, or by someone acting under the
97 officer's direction and in the officer's presence, record the testimony of the witness.

98 (c)(2) All objections made at the time of the examination to the gualifications of the 99 officer taking the deposition, to the manner of taking it, to the evidence presented, or to 100 the conduct of any party and any other objection to the proceedings shall be noted by 101 the officer upon the record of the deposition recorded, but the examination questioning 102 shall proceed, with and the testimony being taken subject to the objections. In lieu of 103 participating in the oral examination, parties may serve written questions in a sealed 104 envelope on the party taking the deposition, and the party taking the deposition shall transmit them to the officer, who shall propound them to the witness and record the 105 106 answers verbatim.

107

(d) Schedule and duration; motion to terminate or limit examination.

108 (d)(1) Any objection to evidence during a deposition shall be stated concisely and in 109 a non-argumentative and non-suggestive manner. A person may instruct a deponent 110 witness not to answer only when necessary to preserve a privilege, to enforce a 111 limitation on evidence directed by the court, or to present a motion for a protective order 112 under paragraph (4) Rule 26(c). Upon demand of the objecting party or witness, the 113 deposition shall be suspended for the time necessary to make a motion. The party 114 taking the deposition may complete or adjourn the deposition before moving for an 115 order to compel discovery under Rule 37. 116 (d)(2) Unless otherwise authorized by the court or stipulated by the parties, a

deposition is limited to one day of seven hours. The court must allow additional time
consistent with Rule 26(b)(2) if needed for a fair examination of the deponent or if the
deponent or another person, or other circumstance, impedes or delays the examination.
(d)(3) If the court finds that any impediment, delay, or other conduct has frustrated
the fair examination of the deponent, it may impose upon the persons responsible an
appropriate sanction, including the reasonable costs and attorney fees incurred by any
parties as a result thereof.

124 (d)(4) At any time during the taking of the deposition, on motion of a party or of the 125 deponent and upon a showing that the examination is being conducted in bad faith or in 126 such manner as unreasonably to annoy, embarrass, or oppress the deponent or party, 127 the court in which the action is pending or the court in the district where the deposition is 128 being taken may order the officer conducting the examination to cease forthwith from 129 taking the deposition, or may limit the scope and manner of the taking of the deposition 130 as provided in Rule 26(c). If the order made terminates the examination, it shall be 131 resumed thereafter only upon the order of the court in which the action is pending. Upon 132 demand of the objecting party or deponent, the taking of the deposition shall be 133 suspended for the time necessary to make a motion for an order. The provisions of Rule 134 37(a)(4) apply to the award of expenses incurred in relation to the motion.

(d) Limits. During initial fact discovery, each side (plaintiffs collectively, defendants
 collectively, and third-party defendants collectively) is limited to 20 hours of deposition
 by oral questioning. Oral questioning of a nonparty shall not exceed four hours, and oral
 questioning of a party shall not exceed seven hours. A deposition by written questioning
 shall not cumulatively exceed 15 questions, including discrete subparts, by the plaintiffs
 collectively, by the defendants collectively or by third-party defendants collectively.

141 (e) Submission to witness; changes; signing. If requested by the deponent or a party 142 before completion of the deposition, the deponent shall have 30-Within 28 days after 143 being notified by the officer that the transcript or recording is available, in which to 144 review the transcript or recording and, if there are changes in form or substance, to a 145 witness may sign a statement reciting such of changes to the form or substance of the 146 transcript or recording and the reasons given by the deponent for making them for the 147 changes. The officer shall indicate in the certificate prescribed by subdivision (f)(1) 148 whether any review was requested and, if so, shall append any changes timely made by 149 the deponent during the period allowed witness.

150 (f) Record of deposition; certification and delivery by officer; exhibits; copies.

(f)(1) The transcript or other recording of the deposition made in accordance with this rule shall be the record of the deposition. The officer shall record the deposition or direct another person present to record the deposition. The officer shall sign a certificate, to accompany the record of the deposition, that the witness was duly sworn 155 under oath or affirmation and that the transcript or other recording record is a true 156 record of the testimony given by the witness deposition. Unless otherwise ordered by 157 the court, the The officer shall keep a copy of the record. The officer shall securely seal 158 the record of the deposition in an envelope endorsed with the title of the action and 159 marked "Deposition of (name). Do not open." and shall promptly send the sealed record 160 of the deposition to the attorney or the party who arranged for the transcript or other 161 record to be made designated the recording method. If the party taking the deposition is 162 not represented by an attorney, the record of the deposition shall be sent to the clerk of 163 the court for filing unless otherwise ordered by the court. An attorney or party receiving 164 the record of the deposition shall store it under conditions that will protect it against loss, 165 destruction, tampering, or deterioration.

166 (f)(2) Documents Every party may inspect and copy documents and things produced 167 for inspection during the examination of the witness shall, upon and must have a fair 168 opportunity to compare copies and originals. Upon the request of a party, documents 169 and things produced for inspection shall be marked for identification and annexed 170 added to the record of the deposition and may be inspected and copied by any party. 171 except that, if If the person producing the materials desires witness wants to retain them 172 the originals, that person may (A) shall offer copies the originals to be copied, marked 173 for identification and annexed added to the record of the deposition and to serve 174 thereafter as originals, if the person affords to all parties fair opportunity to verify the 175 copies by comparison with the originals, or (B) offer the originals to be marked for 176 identification, after giving to each party an opportunity to inspect and copy them, in 177 which event the originals may be used in the same manner as if annexed to the record 178 of the deposition. Any party may move for an order that the originals be annexed to and 179 returned with the record of the deposition to the court, pending final disposition of the 180 case.

(f)(3) Unless otherwise ordered by the court or agreed by the parties, the officer shall retain stenographic notes of any depositions taken stenographically or a copy of the recording of any deposition taken by another method. Upon payment of reasonable charges therefor, the officer shall furnish a copy of the record of the deposition to any party or to the deponent witness. Any party or the deponent may arrange for a 186 transcription to be made from the recording of a deposition taken An official transcript of

- 187 <u>a recording made by non-stenographic means shall be prepared under Utah Rule of</u>
- 188 <u>Appellate Procedure 11(e)</u>.
- 189 (g) Failure to attend or to serve subpoena; expenses.

(g)(1)-If the party giving the notice of the taking of a deposition fails to attend and proceed therewith or fails to serve a subpoena upon a witness who fails to attend, and another party attends in person or by attorney <u>pursuant to the notice</u>, the court may order the party giving the notice to pay to <u>such the</u> other party the reasonable <u>costs</u>, expenses incurred by him and his attorney in attending, including reasonable attorney's fees and attorney fees incurred.

(g)(2) If the party giving the notice of the taking of a deposition of a witness fails to
serve a subpoena upon him and the witness because of such failure does not attend,
and if another party attends in person or by attorney because he expects the deposition
of that witness to be taken, the court may order the party giving the notice to pay to
such other party the reasonable expenses incurred by him and his attorney in attending,
including reasonable attorney's fees.
Advisory Committee Notes

203

1

Rule 31. Depositions upon written questions.

2 (a) Serving questions; notice.

3 (a)(1) A party may take the testimony of any person, including a party, by deposition
 4 upon written questions without leave of court except as provided in paragraph (2). <u>an</u>
 5 <u>opposing y</u>The attendance of witnesses may be compelled by the use of subpoena as
 6 provided in Rule 45.

7 (a)(2) A party must obtain leave of court, which shall be granted to the extent
8 consistent with the principles stated in Rule 26(b)(2), if the person to be examined is
9 confined in prison or if, without the written stipulation of the parties,

(a)(2)(A) a proposed deposition would result in more than ten depositions being
 taken under this rule or Rule 30 by the plaintiffs, or by the defendants, or by third-party
 defendants;

13 (a)(2)(B) the person to be examined has already been deposed in the case; or

14 (a)(2)(C) a party seeks to take a deposition before the time specified in Rule 26(d).

15 (a)(3) A party desiring to take a deposition upon written questions shall serve them 16 upon every other party with a notice stating (1) the name and address of the person 17 who is to answer them, if known, and if the name is not known, a general description 18 sufficient to identify him or the particular class or group to which he belongs, and (2) the 19 name or descriptive title and address of the officer before whom the deposition is to be 20 taken. A deposition upon written questions may be taken of a public or private 21 corporation or a partnership or association or governmental agency in accordance with 22 the provisions of Rule 30(b)(6).

(a)(4) Within 14 days after the notice and written questions are served, a party may
 serve cross questions upon all other parties. Within 7 days after being served with cross
 questions, a party may serve redirect questions upon all other parties. Within 7 days
 after being served with redirect questions, a party may serve recross questions upon all
 other parties. The court may for cause shown enlarge or shorten the time.

(b) Officer to take responses and prepare record. A copy of the notice and copies of
 all questions served shall be delivered by the party taking the deposition to the officer
 designated in the notice, who shall proceed promptly, in the manner provided by Rule

- 31 30(c), (e), and (f), attaching to the deposition the copy of the notice and the questions
- 32 received.
- 33 Advisory Committee Notes
- 34

1 Rule 33. Interrogatories to parties.

2 (a) Availability; procedures for use. Without leave of court or written stipulation, 3 During initial fact discovery, any party may serve upon any other party up to 15 written 4 interrogatories, not exceeding 25 in number including all discrete subparts, to be 5 answered by the party served or, if the party served is a public or private corporation, a 6 partnership, an association, or a governmental agency, by any officer or agent, who 7 shall furnish such information as is available to the party. Leave to serve additional 8 interrogatories shall be granted to the extent consistent with the principles of Rule 9 26(b)(3). Without leave of court or written stipulation, interrogatories may not be served 10 before the time specified in Rule 26(d).

11 (b) Answers and objections.

12 (b)(1) Each interrogatory shall be answered separately and fully in writing under 13 oath, or affirmation unless it is objected to, in which event the objecting If an 14 interrogatory is objected to, the party shall state the reasons for the objection and. Any 15 reason not stated is waived unless excused by the court for good cause. The party shall 16 answer to the extent the interrogatory any part of an interrogatory that is not 17 objectionable. An interrogatory is not objectionable merely because an answer involves 18 an opinion or argument that relates to fact or the application of law to fact. 19 (b)(2) The answering party shall serve the answers are to be signed by the person 20 making them, and the objections signed by the attorney making them and objections

21 within 28 days after service of the interrogatories.

(b)(3) The party upon whom the interrogatories have been served shall serve a copy
of the answers and objections, if any, within 30 days after the service of the
interrogatories. A shorter or longer time may be ordered by the court or, in the absence
of such an order, agreed to in writing by the parties subject to Rule 29.
(b)(4) All grounds for an objection to an interrogatory shall be stated with specificity.
Any ground not stated in a timely objection is waived unless the party's failure to object

28 is excused by the court for good cause shown.

29 (b)(5) The party submitting the interrogatories may move for an order under Rule

30 37(a) with respect to any objection to or other failure to answer an interrogatory.

(c) Scope; use at trial. Interrogatories may relate to any <u>discoverable</u> matters which
 can be inquired into under Rule 26(b), and the answers. <u>Answers</u> may be used to the
 extent as permitted by the Rules of Evidence.

An interrogatory otherwise proper is not necessarily objectionable merely because an answer to the interrogatory involves an opinion or contention that relates to fact or the application of law to fact, but the court may order that such an interrogatory need not be answered until after designated discovery has been completed or until a pretrial conference or other later time.

39 (d) Option to produce business records. Where If the answer to an interrogatory may 40 be derived or ascertained from found by inspecting the answering party's business 41 records, including electronically stored information, of the party upon whom the 42 interrogatory has been served or from an examination, audit, or inspection of such 43 business records, including a compilation, abstract, or summary thereof and the burden 44 of deriving or ascertaining finding the answer is substantially the same for the party 45 serving the interrogatory as for the party served both parties, it is a sufficient answer to 46 such interrogatory to specify the answering party may identify the records from which 47 the answer may be derived or ascertained and to afford to found. The answering party 48 must give the asking party serving the interrogatory reasonable opportunity to examine, 49 audit, or inspect such inspect the records and to make copies, compilations, abstracts, 50 or summaries. A specification shall be The answering party must identify the records in 51 sufficient detail to permit the interrogating asking party to locate and to identify, them as 52 readily as can the answering party served, the records from which the answer may be 53 ascertained.

- 54 Advisory Committee Notes
- 55

1 Rule 34. Production of documents and things and entry upon land for 2 inspection and other purposes.

3 (a) Scope. Any party may serve on any other party a request

4 (a)(1) Any party may serve on any other party a request to produce and permit the 5 requesting party making the request, or someone acting on his behalf, to inspect, copy, 6 test or sample any designated discoverable documents, or electronically stored 7 information or tangible things (including writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, 8 sound recordings, images, and other data or data compilations stored in any medium 9 from which information can be obtained, translated, if necessary, by the respondent into 10 reasonably usable form), or to inspect, copy, test or sample any designated tangible 11 things which constitute or contain matters within the scope of Rule 26(b) and which are 12 in the possession, custody or control of the responding party upon whom the request is 13 served; or. 14 (a)(2) Any party may serve on any other party a request to permit entry upon

designated land or other property in the possession or control of the <u>responding</u> party upon whom the request is served for the purpose of <u>inspection and inspecting</u>, measuring, surveying, photographing, testing, or sampling the property or any designated <u>discoverable</u> object or operation thereon, within the scope of Rule 26(b) on the property.

20 (b) Procedure and limitations.

21 (b)(1) The request shall set forth-identify the items to be inspected either by 22 individual item or by category, and describe each item and category with reasonable 23 particularity. During initial fact discovery, the request shall not cumulatively include more 24 than 25 distinct items or categories of items. The request shall specify a reasonable 25 date, time, place, and manner of making the inspection and performing the related acts. 26 The request may specify the form or forms in which electronically stored information is 27 to be produced. Without leave of court or written stipulation, a request may not be 28 served before the time specified in Rule 26(d). 29 (b)(2) The responding party upon whom the request is served shall serve a written

30 response within $\frac{30}{28}$ days after the service of the request. A shorter or longer time

31 may be directed by the court or, in the absence of such an order, agreed to in writing by

32 the parties, subject to Rule 29. The response shall state, with respect to each item or 33 category, that inspection and related activities acts will be permitted as requested. 34 unless or that the request is objected to,, including an objection to the requested form or 35 forms for producing electronically stored information, stating If the party objects to a 36 request, the party must state the reasons for the objection. If objection is made to part of 37 an item or category, the part shall be specified and inspection permitted of the 38 remaining parts. If objection is made Any reason not stated is waived unless excused by 39 the court for good cause. The party shall identify and permit inspection of any part of a 40 request that is not objectionable. If the party objects to the requested form or forms for 41 producing electronically stored information -- or if no form was specified in the request --42 the responding party must state the form or forms it intends to use. The party submitting 43 the request may move for an order under Rule 37(a) with respect to any objection to or other failure to respond to the request or any part thereof, or any failure to permit 44 45 inspection as requested. 46 (b)(3) Unless the parties otherwise agree or the court otherwise orders: 47 (c) Form of documents and electronically stored information.

48 (b)(3)(A) = (c)(1) A party who produces documents for inspection shall produce them 49 as they are kept in the usual course of business or shall organize and label them to 50 correspond with the categories in the request;

51 (b)(3)(B) if (c)(2) If a request does not specify the form or forms for producing 52 electronically stored information, a responding party must produce the information in a 53 form or forms in which it is ordinarily maintained or in a form or forms that are 54 reasonably usable.; and

55 (b)(3)(C) a (c)(3) A party need not produce the same electronically stored 56 information in more than one form.

57 (c) Persons not parties. This rule does not preclude an independent action against a

- 58 person not a party for production of documents and things and permission to enter upon
- 59 land.

60 Advisory Committee Notes

61

1 Rule 35. Physical and mental examination of persons.

2 (a) Order for examination. When the mental or physical condition (including the 3 blood group) or attribute of a party or of a person in the custody or under the legal 4 control of a party is in controversy, the court in which the action is pending may order 5 the party or person to submit to a physical or mental examination by a suitably licensed 6 or certified examiner or to produce for examination the person in the party's custody or 7 legal control, unless the party is unable to produce the person for examination. The 8 order may be made only on motion for good cause shown. and upon notice to the 9 person to be examined and to all parties and All papers related to the motion and notice 10 of any hearing shall be served on a nonparty to be examined. The order shall specify 11 the time, place, manner, conditions, and scope of the examination and the person or 12 persons by whom it the examination is to be made. The person being examined may 13 record the examination unless the party requesting the examination shows that the 14 recording would unduly interfere with the examination.

15 (b) Report of examining physician.

16 (b)(1) If requested by a party against whom an order is made under Rule 35(a) or 17 the person examined, the party causing the examination to be made shall deliver to the 18 person examined and/or the other party a copy of a detailed written report of the 19 examiner setting out the examiner's findings, including results of all tests made, 20 diagnosis and conclusions, together with like reports of all earlier examinations of the 21 same condition. After delivery the party causing the examination shall be entitled upon 22 request to receive from the party against whom the order is made a like report of any 23 examination, previously or thereafter made, of the same condition, unless, in the case of 24 a report of examination of a person not a party, the party shows that the report cannot 25 be obtained. The court on motion may order delivery of a report on such terms as are 26 just. If an examiner fails or refuses to make a report, the court on motion may take any 27 action authorized by Rule 37(b)(2). 28 (b)(2) (b) Waiver of privilege. By requesting and obtaining a report of the 29 examination so ordered or by taking the deposition of the examiner the examiner's

30 <u>report</u>, the party examined waives any privilege the party may have in that action or any 31 other involving the same controversy, regarding the testimony of every other person who has examined or may thereafter examine the party in respect of <u>about</u> the same mental or physical condition. Question: Delete all of (b) and instead: If the party requesting the examination wishes to call the examiner as a witness, the party shall disclose an expert report as required by Rule 26(a)(3).

36 (b)(3) This subdivision applies to examinations made by agreement of the parties,
 37 unless the agreement expressly provides otherwise. This subdivision does not preclude
 38 discovery of a report of any other examiner or the taking of a deposition of an examiner
 39 in accordance with the provisions of any other rule.

- 40 (c) Right of party examined to other medical reports. At the time of making an order 41 to submit to an examination under Subdivision (a), the court shall, upon motion of the 42 party to be examined, order the party seeking such examination to furnish to the party to be examined a report of any examination previously made or medical treatment 43 previously given by any examiner employed directly or indirectly by the party seeking 44 45 the order for a physical or mental examination, or at whose instance or request such 46 medical examination or treatment has previously been conducted. 47 (d) (c) Sanctions.
- (d)(1)-If a party or a person in the custody or under the legal control of a party fails to
 obey an order entered under <u>Subdivision paragraph</u> (a), the court on motion may take
 any action authorized by Rule 37(b)(2), except that the failure cannot be treated as
 contempt of court.
- 52 (d)(2) If a party fails to obey an order entered under Subdivision (c), the court on
 53 motion may take any action authorized by Rule 37(b)(2).
- 54

1 Rule 36. Request for admission.

2 (a) Request for admission.

3 (a)(1) A party may serve upon any other party a written request for the admission, 4 for purpose of the pending action only, of to admit the truth of any discoverable matters 5 within the scope of Rule 26(b) set forth in the request that, including the genuineness of 6 any document. The matter must relate to statements or opinions of fact or of the 7 application of law to fact, including the genuineness of any documents described in the request. Each matter shall be separately stated. During initial fact discovery, a party 8 9 may not request admission of more than 25 matters. A copy of the document shall be 10 served with the request unless it has already been furnished or made available for 11 inspection and copying. The request for admission shall contain a notice advising notify 12 the responding party to whom the request is made that, pursuant to Rule 36, the 13 matters shall-will be deemed admitted unless said request is responded to the party 14 responds within 30-28 days after service of the request or within such shorter or longer 15 time as the court may allow. Copies of documents shall be served with the request 16 unless they have been or are otherwise furnished or made available for inspection and 17 copying. Without leave of court or written stipulation, requests for admission may not be 18 served before the time specified in Rule 26(d).

19 (b) Answer or objection.

20 (b)(1) (a)(2) Each matter of which an admission is requested shall be separately set 21 forth. The matter is admitted unless, within thirty 28 days after service of the request, or 22 within such shorter or longer time as the court may allow, the responding party to whom 23 the request is directed serves upon the requesting party requesting the admission a 24 written answer or objection. addressed to the matter, signed by the party or by his 25 attorney, but, unless the court shortens the time, a defendant shall not be required to 26 serve answers or objections before the expiration of 45 days after service of the 27 summons and complaint upon him. If objection is made, the reasons therefor shall be 28 stated. The answer shall specifically deny the matter or set forth in detail the reasons 29 why the answering party cannot truthfully admit or deny the matter. A denial shall fairly 30 meet the substance of the requested admission, and when good faith requires that a 31 party qualify his answer or deny only a part of the matter of which an admission is

32 requested, he shall specify so much of it as is true and qualify or deny the remainder. 33 An answering party may not give lack of information or knowledge as a reason for 34 failure to admit or deny unless he states that he has made reasonable inquiry and that 35 the information known or readily obtainable by him is insufficient to enable him to admit 36 or deny. A party who considers that a matter of which an admission has been requested 37 presents a genuine issue for trial may not, on that ground alone, object to the request; 38 he may, subject to the provisions of Rule 37(c), deny the matter or set forth reasons 39 why he cannot admit or deny it.

40 (a)(3) The party who has requested the admissions may move to determine the 41 sufficiency of the answers or objections. Unless the court determines that an objection 42 is justified, it shall order that an answer be served. If the court determines that an 43 answer does not comply with the requirements of this rule, it may order either that the matter is admitted or that an amended answer be served. The court may, in lieu of 44 these orders, determine that final disposition of the request be made at a pretrial 45 46 conference or at a designated time prior to trial. The provisions of Rule 37(a)(4) apply to 47 the award of expenses incurred in relation to the motion.

48 (b)(2) Unless the answering party objects to a matter, the party must admit or deny 49 the matter or state in detail the reasons why the party cannot truthfully admit or deny. A 50 party may identify the part of a matter which is true and deny the rest. A denial shall 51 fairly meet the substance of the request. Lack of information is not a reason for failure to 52 admit or deny unless the information known or reasonably available is insufficient to 53 form an admission or denial. If the truth of a matter is a genuine issue for trial, the 54 answering party may deny the matter or state the reasons for the failure to admit or 55 deny. 56 (b)(3) If the party objects to a matter, the party shall state the reasons for the

57 objection. Any reason not stated is waived unless excused by the court for good cause.

58 The party shall admit or deny any part of a matter that is not objectionable. It is not

- 59 grounds for objection that the truth of a matter is a genuine issue for trial.
- 60 (c) Sanctions for failure to admit. If a party fails to admit the truth of any discoverable

61 matter set forth in the request, and if the requesting party proves the truth of the matter,

62 the requesting party may move for an order requiring the other party to pay the

- 63 reasonable expenses of proving the matter, including reasonable attorney fees. The
- 64 <u>court shall enter the order unless it finds that:</u>
- 65 (c)(1) the request was held objectionable;
- 66 (c)(2) the admission sought was not substantially important;
- 67 (c)(3) the responding party had reason to believe the truth of the matter was a
- 68 genuine issue for trial; or
- 69 (c)(4) there were other good reasons for the failure to admit.
- 70 (b) (d) Effect of admission. Any matter admitted under this rule is conclusively 71 established unless the court on motion permits withdrawal or amendment of the 72 admission. Subject to the provisions of Rule 16 governing amendment of a pretrial 73 order, the The court may permit withdrawal or amendment when if the presentation of 74 the merits of the action will be subserved thereby promoted and the party who obtained 75 the admission fails to satisfy the court that withdrawal or amendment will not prejudice 76 him in maintaining his action or defense on the merits the requesting party. Any 77 admission made by a party under this rule is for the purpose of the pending action only. 78 and <u>It</u> is not an admission by him for any other purpose, nor may it be used against him 79 in any other proceeding action. 80 Advisory Committee Notes
- 81

1	Rule 37. Failure to make or cooperate in <u>disclosure or discovery; sanctions.</u>
2	(a) Motion for order compelling <u>disclosure or discovery</u> . A party, upon reasonable
3	notice to other parties and all persons affected thereby, may apply for an order
4	compelling discovery as follows:
5	(a)(1) Appropriate court. An application for an order to a party may be made to the
6	court in which the action is pending, or, on matters relating to a deposition, to the court
7	in the district where the deposition is being taken. An application for an order to a
8	deponent who is not a party shall be made to the court in the district where the
9	deposition is being taken.
10	(a)(2) <u>(</u>a)(1) Motion.
11	(a)(2)(A) If a party fails to make a disclosure required by Rule 26(a), any other A
12	party may move to compel disclosure or discovery and for appropriate sanctions if
13	another party:
14	(a)(1)(A) makes an evasive, incomplete or insufficient disclosure or response to a
15	request for discovery;
16	(a)(1)(B) fails to disclose, fails to respond to a discovery request, fails to supplement
17	a disclosure or response or makes a supplemental disclosure or response without an
18	adequate explanation of why the additional or correct information was not previously
19	provided;
20	(a)(1)(C) objects to a request for discovery;
21	(a)(1)(D) impedes, delays, or frustrates the fair examination of a witness; or
22	(a)(1)(E) otherwise fails to make full and complete disclosure or discovery.
23	(a)(2) Appropriate court. A motion may be made to the court in which the action is
24	pending, or, on matters relating to a deposition, to the court in the district where the
25	deposition is being taken. A motion for an order to a nonparty witness shall be made to
26	the court in the district where the deposition is being taken.
27	(a)(3) The motion must include movant must attach a copy of the request for
28	discovery or the response at issue and a certification that the movant has in good faith
29	conferred or attempted to confer with the party not making the disclosure or discovery in

30 an effort to secure the disclosure <u>or discovery</u> without court action.

31 (a)(2)(B) If a deponent fails to answer a question propounded or submitted under 32 Rule 30 or 31, or a corporation or other entity fails to make a designation under Rule 33 30(b)(6) or 31(a), or a party fails to answer an interrogatory submitted under Rule 33, or 34 if a party, in response to a request for inspection submitted under Rule 34, fails to 35 respond that inspection will be permitted as requested or fails to permit inspection as 36 requested, the discovering party may move for an order compelling an answer, or a 37 designation, or an order compelling inspection in accordance with the request. The 38 motion must include a certification that the movant has in good faith conferred or 39 attempted to confer with the person or party failing to make the discovery in an effort to 40 secure the information or material without court action. When taking a deposition on oral 41 examination, the proponent of the question may complete or adjourn the examination 42 before applying for an order.

43 (a)(3) Evasive or incomplete disclosure, answer, or response. For purposes of this
44 subdivision an evasive or incomplete disclosure, answer, or response is to be treated as
45 a failure to disclose, answer, or respond.

46 (a)(4) Expenses and sanctions.

47 (a)(4)(A) If the motion is granted, or if the disclosure or requested discovery is 48 provided after the motion was filed, the court shall, after opportunity for hearing 49 response, require the party or deponent witness whose conduct necessitated the motion or the party or attorney advising such conduct or both of them to pay to the moving 50 51 party the reasonable expenses incurred in obtaining the order, including attorney fees, 52 unless the court finds that the motion was filed without the movant's first making did not 53 make a good faith effort to obtain the disclosure or discovery without court action, or 54 that the opposing party's nondisclosure, response, or objection was substantially 55 justified, or that other circumstances make an award of expenses unjust.

(a)(4)(B) If the motion is denied, the court may enter any protective order authorized under Rule 26(c) and shall, after opportunity for <u>hearing response</u>, require the moving party or the attorney or both of them to pay to the party or <u>deponent witness</u> who opposed the motion the reasonable expenses incurred in opposing the motion, including attorney fees, unless the court finds that <u>the making of</u> the motion was substantially justified or that other circumstances make an award of expenses unjust.

75

(a)(4)(C) If the motion is granted in part and denied in part, the court may enter any
 protective order authorized under Rule 26(c) and may, after opportunity for hearing
 <u>response</u>, apportion the reasonable expenses incurred in relation to the motion among
 the parties and persons in a just manner.

66 (b) Failure to comply with order.

(b)(1) Sanctions by court in district where deposition is taken. If a deponent fails to
be sworn or to answer a question after being directed to do so by Failure to follow an
order of the court in the district in which the deposition is being taken, the failure may be
considered a is contempt of that court.

(b)(2) Sanctions by court in which action is pending. If a party fails to obey an order entered under Rule 16(b) or if a party or an officer, director, or managing agent of a party or a person designated under Rule 30(b)(6) or 31(a) to testify on behalf of a party fails to obey an order to provide or permit discovery, including an order made under Subdivision (a) of this rule or Rule 35, unless <u>Unless</u> the court finds that the failure was substantially justified, the court in which the action is pending may take such action in regard to the failure to follow its orders as are just, including the following:

(b)(2)(A) deem the matter or any other designated facts to be established for the
 purposes of the action in accordance with the claim of the party obtaining the order;

80 (b)(2)(B) prohibit the disobedient party from supporting or opposing designated 81 claims or defenses or from introducing designated matters into evidence;

82 (b)(2)(C) strike pleadings or parts thereof, stay further proceedings until the order is
83 obeyed,:

84 (b)(2)(D) dismiss all or part of the action or proceeding or any part thereof, strike all

85 or part of the pleadings, or render judgment by default against the disobedient party on

86 <u>all or part of the action;</u>

- 87 (b)(2)(D) (b)(2)(E) order the party or the attorney to pay the reasonable expenses,
- 88 including attorney fees, caused by the failure;
- 89 (b)(2)(E)-(b)(2)(F) treat the failure to obey an order, other than an order to submit to
- 90 a physical or mental examination, as contempt of court; and
- 91 (b)(2)(F) (b)(2)(G) instruct the jury regarding an adverse inference.

92 (c) Expenses on failure to admit. If a party fails to admit the genuineness of any 93 document or the truth of any matter as requested under Rule 36, and if the party 94 requesting the admissions thereafter proves the genuineness of the document or the 95 truth of the matter, the party requesting the admissions may apply to the court for an order requiring the other party to pay the reasonable expenses incurred in making that 96 97 proof, including reasonable attorney fees. The court shall make the order unless it finds 98 that (1) the request was held objectionable pursuant to Rule 36(a), or (2) the admission 99 sought was of no substantial importance, or (3) the party failing to admit had reasonable 100 ground to believe that he might prevail on the matter, or (4) there was other good 101 reason for the failure to admit.

102 (d) Failure of party to attend at own deposition or serve answers to interrogatories or 103 respond to request for inspection. If a party or an officer, director, or managing agent of 104 a party or a person designated under Rule 30(b)(6) or 31(a) to testify on behalf of a 105 party fails (1) to appear before the officer who is to take the deposition, after being 106 served with a proper notice, or (2) to serve answers or objections to interrogatories 107 submitted under Rule 33, after proper service of the interrogatories, or (3) to serve a 108 written response to a request for inspection submitted under Rule 34, after proper 109 service of the request, the court on motion may take any action authorized by 110 Subdivision (b)(2).

The failure to act described in this subdivision may not be excused on the ground
that the discovery sought is objectionable unless the party failing to act has applied for a
protective order as provided by Rule 26(c).

(e) Failure to participate in the framing of a discovery plan. If a party or attorney fails
to participate in good faith in the framing of a discovery plan by agreement as is
required by Rule 26(f), the court on motion may take any action authorized by
Subdivision (b)(2).

(f) Failure to disclose. If a party fails to disclose a witness, document or other material as required by Rule 26(a) or Rule 26(e)(1), or to amend a prior response to discovery as required by Rule 26(e)(2), that party shall not be permitted to use the witness, document or other material at any hearing unless the failure to disclose is harmless or the party shows good cause for the failure to disclose. In addition to or in 123 lieu of this sanction, the court on motion may take any action authorized by Subdivision
 124 (b)(2).

125 (g) (c) Failure to preserve evidence. Nothing in this rule limits the inherent power of 126 the court to take any action authorized by <u>Subdivision paragraph</u> (b)(2) if a party 127 destroys, conceals, alters, tampers with or fails to preserve a document, tangible item, 128 electronic data or other evidence in violation of a duty. Absent exceptional 129 circumstances, a court may not impose sanctions under these rules on a party for failing 130 to provide electronically stored information lost as a result of the routine, good-faith 131 operation of an electronic information system.

132 Advisory Committee Notes

133